

Common Currents

Common Currents

Examining How We Manage the Ocean Commons

Edited by

H. Jordan Diamond, Holly Doremus and Hee Cheol Yang



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022007709>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISBN 978-90-04-51420-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-51421-8 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill nv via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

*This book is dedicated to Jane L. Scheiber – inspiring friend,
selfless mentor, and tireless supporter of the law of the sea*



Contents

Acknowledgments IX
List of Figures x
Notes on Contributors XI

Introduction 1
H. Jordan Diamond and Holly Doremus

PART 1

The Area

- 1 The Uncertain Limits of the Commons 19
Clive Schofield and Leonardo Bernard
- 2 Korea's Deep Seabed Activities and Domestic Legislation on the
Exploration for and Exploitation of Resources in the Deep Seabed Area
An Abortive Attempt and Moving Forward 46
Seokwoo Lee

PART 2

The Polar Regions

- 3 Governing the Ocean Commons
Lessons from the Antarctic 67
Karen N. Scott
- 4 Rethinking Governance for the Changing Arctic
A Perspective from China and South Korea 101
Young Kil Park

PART 3

Managing Fish as a Common Resource

- 5 The "Commons" Discourse on Marine Fisheries Resources, and the
Problematic of Hardin's "Tragedy" Concept 119
Harry N. Scheiber

- 6 Sustaining Wild Salmon in the North Atlantic
Progressions and Tribulations 135
David L. VanderZwaag

PART 4

Managing Biodiversity as a Common Resource

- 7 The Evolution of the Sargasso Sea Regime in International Law 153
David Balton and David Freestone
- 8 Equity Must Anchor the BBNJ Treaty 185
Autumn Bordner
- Index 207

Acknowledgments

This volume stems from a conference co-hosted by the Law of the Sea Institute at the University of California, Berkeley School of Law, the Ocean Law and Policy Institute at the Korea Institute of Ocean Science and Technology (KIOST), and Columbia Law School in September 2018. We wish to extend our gratitude in particular to Ms. Charity Lee and Joan Fargo for their collaboration on the conference, and to then-Berkeley Law students Charisa Gowen-Takahashi and Elizabeth Glusman for their research and drafting assistance. We also want to extend our heartfelt thanks to Autumn Bordner, who in addition to authoring the chapter on biodiversity in areas beyond national jurisdiction also contributed to the editing and compilation of this volume, and to now-retired KIOST Law of the Sea scholar Dr. Moon Sang Kwon for his tireless dedication to the peaceful manifestation of UN Convention on the Law of the Sea and strengthening development of the Law of the Sea Institute. Support for this effort was provided primarily through a KIOST project on Challenging Ocean Regime Conflicts and International Networking to Promote Securing Expanded Maritime Development Domain.

Figures

- 1.1 Baselines and claims to maritime jurisdiction. Source: Schofield and Arsana, IHO (International Hydrographic Organization), *A Manual on Technical Aspects of the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea—1982 (TALOS)*. Special Publication No. 51, (5th edition, Monaco: International Hydrographic Bureau, 2014), chapter 5, 3. 25
- 1.2 Delineating the outer limits of maritime zones through an envelope of arcs. Source: Schofield and Arsana, IHO (International Hydrographic Organization), *A Manual on Technical Aspects of the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea—1982 (TALOS)*. Special publication No. 51, (5th edition, Monaco: International Hydrographic Bureau, 2014), chapter 5, 3. 34

Notes on Contributors

1 Editors

H. Jordan Diamond

is the Co-Director of the Law of the Sea Institute (LOSI) and Executive Director of the Center for Law, Energy & the Environment (CLEE) at the School of Law, University of California, Berkeley. LOSI is an internationally recognized forum that facilitates in-depth, expert research and commentary on critical marine issues. CLEE develops pragmatic policy solutions to environmental and energy challenges in California and beyond. In both capacities, Jordan's work focuses on ensuring laws and policies are based on the best information available, developed through inclusive and transparent processes, and implemented through adaptive systems. Previously, Jordan co-directed the Ocean Program at the Environmental Law Institute. In 2013, Jordan received the ABA Section of Environment, Energy, and Resources *Distinguished Environmental Advocates: The Next Generation* award. In 2018, Governor Edmund G. Brown, Jr. appointed Jordan to the California Ocean Protection Council.

Holly Doremus

is the James H. House and Hiram H. Hurd Professor of Environmental Regulation at the University of California, Berkeley, Co-Director of the Law of the Sea Institute, and Co-Faculty Director of the University of California, Berkeley, Institute for Parks, People, and Biodiversity. She is an elected Fellow of the American Association for the Advancement of Science. She holds a B.S. in biology from Trinity College (Hartford, CT), Ph.D. in plant physiology from Cornell University, and J.D. from University of California, Berkeley. Her scholarship focuses on biodiversity protection, the intersection between property rights and environmental regulation, and the interrelationship of environmental law and science.

Hee Cheol Yang

is currently a Principal Research Scientist and Director General for the Ocean Law and Policy Institute at the Korea Institute of Ocean Science and Technology. He received his Ph.D in international law of the sea and Chinese law from the National Taiwan University in 2006. His specialties are maritime boundary delimitation, marine scientific research, deep seabed, and other issues relating to the ocean. He has been serving as an expert government consultant on various issues of marine affairs including issues relating to the law

of the sea and maritime delimitation of Korea, ocean legal regimes and policy, and various marine science and technology policies and governances.

2 Authors

David Balton

served as the Deputy Assistant Secretary for Oceans and Fisheries in the Department of State, attaining the rank of Ambassador in 2006. He coordinated U.S. foreign policy concerning oceans and fisheries, as well as issues relating to the Arctic and Antarctica, and oversaw U.S. participation in international organizations dealing with these issues. Ambassador Balton functioned as the lead U.S. negotiator on a wide range of agreements and chaired numerous international meetings. During the U.S. Chairmanship of the Arctic Council (2015–2017), he served as Chair of the Senior Arctic Officials. He also co-chaired Arctic Council Task Forces that produced the 2011 Arctic Search and Rescue Agreement and the 2013 Arctic Oil Pollution Agreement. He separately chaired negotiations to produce an Arctic fisheries agreement. Ambassador Balton received an A.B. from Harvard College and a J.D. from Georgetown University. He appeared with the National Symphony Orchestra (juggling oranges).

Leonardo Bernard

is a Lecturer with the Australian National Centre for Ocean Resources and Security (ANCORS) at the University of Wollongong, Australia. Leo has written extensively on law of the sea issues such as the continental shelf; maritime boundary disputes; and on the application of historic rights under international law. Leo is the co-author of *Promoting Compliance: The Role of Dispute Settlement and Monitoring Mechanisms in ASEAN Instruments* (2016); as well as the co-editor for *East China Sea: How to Build Confidence and Promote Cooperation* (2018) and *Beyond Territorial Disputes in the South China Sea: Legal Framework for the Joint Development of Hydrocarbon Resources*. Leo is also a regular guest lecturer in maritime delimitation subjects and short-courses at the National University of Singapore, Law School.

Autumn Bordner

is an Interdisciplinary Researcher focused on empire and environmental justice in Oceania. She is the co-founder of the Allies for Micronesia Project, a non-profit organization working to address the unique justice challenges facing U.S.-affiliated islands in the Micronesian region. Autumn is an associate

at Blue Ocean Law, a Ph.D. student at the University of Melbourne investigating ways in which climate justice can be achieved within colonial legal systems, and a former Oceans Fellow at the Center for Law, Energy, and the Environment at the School of Law, University of California, Berkeley. She holds a J.D. from Stanford Law School, an M.S. from Stanford University, and a B.A. from Columbia University.

David Freestone

is a Professorial Lecturer and Visiting Scholar at George Washington University Law School, Washington, D.C. He is Co-rapporteur of the ILA Committee on Sea level Rise and International Law and the Executive Secretary of the Sargasso Sea Commission. He is founding Editor of the International Journal of Marine and Coastal Law (now in its 37th year). From 1996–2008 he worked at the World Bank in Washington, D.C., retiring in 2008 as Deputy General Counsel/Senior Adviser. He is the 2007 Winner of the Elizabeth Haub Gold Medal for Environmental Law.

Seokwoo Lee

is Professor of International Law, Inha University Law School, Korea (2003–present). He was Chairman of the Foundation for the Development of International Law in Asia (DILA) (2012–2017). He is the Co-Editor-in-Chief of the Asia-Pacific Journal of Ocean Law and Policy (APJOLP) and Asian Yearbook of International Law (Asian YBIL), the Executive Editor of the Korean Journal of International and Comparative Law (KJICL), the Co-Series Editor of the book series entitled Maritime Cooperation in East Asia, and the Associate Editor of Brill Research Perspectives in the Law of the Sea, all published by Brill. He has authored more than 100 publications in English in addition to his more than 90 publications in Korean. His representative recent book publication in English is: *The Making of International Law in Korea: From Colony to Asian Power* (Brill/Nijhoff, 2016). He holds a D.Phil. (Oxford), LL.M.S (NYU, Minnesota, and Korea University), and LL.B. (Korea University).

Young Kil Park

is Director of the Law of the Sea Research Division at the Korea Maritime Institute (KMI) and leads the Yeosu Academy of the Law of the Sea. Previously he was a visiting scholar at the R.I. Transportation Research Center, University of Rhode Island and the Stockton Center for International Law, Naval War College. He has also served as Head for the Polar Policy Research Center and the Maritime Territory Research Center at the KMI. His academic interests cover the law of the sea, maritime security, and Arctic governance.

Harry N. Scheiber

is Chancellor's Distinguished Professor and Stefan Riesenfeld Professor of Law and History, Emeritus, at the School of Law, University of California, Berkeley. He brought the Law of the Sea Institute to University of California, Berkeley and co-directed it with David Caron from 2002–2013 and then directed it from 2013–2016. He is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, honorary life fellow and former president of the American Society for Legal History, and twice a Guggenheim Fellow. He has published over 100 articles and is author or editor of twenty-eight books in the fields of ocean law, marine fisheries management, history of American constitutional law, and law and economic policy.

Clive Schofield

is Head of Research at the WMU-Sasakawa Global Ocean Institute, World Maritime University (WMU) in Malmö, Sweden and is a Professor with the Australian Centre for Ocean Resources and Security (ANCORS), University of Wollongong (UOW), Australia. He holds a Ph.D in Geography from the University of Durham, UK and an LL.M in international law from the University of British Columbia. His research interests relate to international boundaries and particularly maritime boundary delimitation and marine jurisdictional issues. Clive is an Observer on the Advisory Board on the Law of the Sea (ABLOS) and is a member of the International Law Association's Committee on International Law and Sea Level Rise. He is a Distinguished Fellow of the Law of the Sea Institute at the School of Law, University of California, Berkeley, is a Global Associate, Centre for International Law (CIL), National University of Singapore and is a Fellow of the Royal Geographical Society. He has provided advice to governments engaged in boundary negotiations and in dispute settlement cases before the International Court of Justice (ICJ) and recently served as an independent expert witness in the international arbitration case between the Philippines and China.

Karen N. Scott

is a Professor of Law at the University of Canterbury in New Zealand, President of the Australian and New Zealand Society of International Law (ANZSIL) and Editor-in-Chief of *Ocean Development and International Law* (ODIL). Karen is on the board of seven journals including the *Brill Research Perspectives on the Law of the Sea* and the *Australian Yearbook of International Law*. She researches and teaches in the areas of public international law, law of the sea and international environmental law and has published over 100 edited books, journal articles and book chapters in these areas. Karen is a

University Proctor and she was Head of the School of Law at the University of Canterbury between 2015 and 2018. She previously taught at the University of Nottingham in the UK.

David L. VanderZwaag

is Professor of Law and Canada Research Chair in Ocean Law and Governance at the Marine & Environmental Law Institute, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University. He is a Member of the IUCN World Commission on Environmental Law (WCEL) and was co-chair of WCEL's Specialist Group on Oceans, Coasts and Coral Reefs (2004–2017). He has published over 150 papers in the marine and environmental law field. His most recent co-edited book publications include: *Research Handbook on Ocean Acidification Law and Policy* (Edward Elgar 2021); *Research Handbook on Polar Law* (Edward Elgar 2020); *Aquaculture Law and Policy: Global, Regional and National Perspectives* (Edward Elgar 2016); *Routledge Handbook of National and Regional Ocean Policies* (Routledge 2015); and *Polar Oceans in an Era of Environmental Change* (Edward Elgar 2014).

