

Courts and Diversity

Brill's Asian Law Series

Series Editors

Matthias Vanhullebusch, *Shanghai Jiao Tong University*
Weidong Ji, *Shanghai Jiao Tong University*
Jiaxiang Hu, *Shanghai Jiao Tong University*

Editorial Board

Shaheed Sardar Ali, *University of Warwick*
Charles Booth, *University of Hawaii at Manoa*
William Butler, *Pennsylvania State University*
Simon Chesterman, *National University of Singapore*
Andrew Harding, *National University of Singapore*
Martin Lau, *School of Oriental and African Studies*
Penelope Nicholson, *University of Melbourne*
Raul Pangalangan, *International Criminal Court*
Jeong-Ho Roh, *Columbia University*

VOLUME 12

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/asla

Courts and Diversity

Twenty Years of the Constitutional Court of Indonesia

Edited by

Bertus de Villiers, Saldi Isra and Pan Mohamad Faiz



BRILL | NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON



This is an open access title distributed under the terms of the CC BY-NC-ND 4.0 license, which permits any non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided no alterations are made and the original author(s) and source are credited. Further information and the complete license text can be found at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

The terms of the CC license apply only to the original material. The use of material from other sources (indicated by a reference) such as diagrams, illustrations, photos and text samples may require further permission from the respective copyright holder.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: De Villiers, B. (Bertus), editor. | Isra, Saldi, editor. | Faiz, Pan Mohamad, editor.

Title: Courts and diversity : twenty years of the constitutional court of Indonesia / edited by Bertus de Villiers, Saldi Isra, and Pan Mohamad Faiz.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill/Nijhoff, 2024. | Series: Brill's Asian law series, 2214-6547 ; volume 12 | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024001520 (print) | LCCN 2024001521 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004691681 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004691698 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Constitutional courts--Indonesia. | Indonesia. Mahkamah Konstitusi. | Cultural pluralism.

Classification: LCC KNW2620 .C68 2024 (print) | LCC KNW2620 (ebook) | DDC 347.598/035--dc23/eng/20240129

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024001520>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024001521>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2214-6547

ISBN 978-90-04-69168-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-69169-8 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004691698

Copyright 2024 by Bertus de Villiers. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands. Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schönningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress. Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

	List of Figures, Maps and Tables	VII
	Notes on Contributors	VIII
1	Constitutionalism and Diversity: Setting the Scene	1
	<i>Bertus de Villiers</i>	
2	Indonesia's Diversity: A Brief Constitutional Perspective	17
	<i>I D.G. Palguna and Bisariyadi</i>	
3	The Indonesian Constitutional Court: An Overview	55
	<i>Saldi Isra and Pan Mohamad Faiz</i>	
4	The Law of Diversity and Indonesia's Village Law: Creating Procedures for Completeness in Diverse Societies	95
	<i>Tove H. Malloy</i>	
5	The Constitutional Court of Indonesia as a Post-Conflict Institution	118
	<i>Christie S. Warren</i>	
6	Religious Rights: Testing the Limits of Tolerance	145
	<i>Ann Black</i>	
7	The Recognition of Customary Land Rights at the Constitutional Court of Indonesia: A Critical Assessment of the Jurisprudence	173
	<i>Yance Arizona and Miriam Cohen</i>	
8	The 'Right' to Free, Prior and Informed Consent: Evolving Customary International Law	195
	<i>George Barrie</i>	
9	Collective Decision-Making versus Individual Rights: A Reflection on the 'Noken' Electoral System of Papua and the Operation of Native Title in Australia	228
	<i>Bertus de Villiers</i>	

- 10 Constitutional Approaches to Diversity and Non-discrimination in
Multi-level States: Indonesian and South African Jurisprudential
Perspectives 260
Nico Steytler
- 11 The Australian Experience: Constitutional Courts –
The Rule of Law 283
Robert French AC
- Index 295

Figures, Maps and Tables

Figures

- 3.1 Recapitulation of law review decisions (2003–2022) 69
- 3.2 Recapitulation of decisions on authority disputes between state institutions 73
- 3.3 Recapitulation of legislative election dispute decisions 79
- 3.4 Recapitulation of presidential election dispute decisions (requests rejected) 80
- 3.5 Recapitulation of regional head election dispute decisions 82

Maps

- 1.1 Current map of Indonesia 20
- 1.2 Federal Indonesia, 1948–1949 28
- 1.3 Indonesia in 1950 32

Tables

- 7.1 Constitutional Court ruling number 35/PUU-X/2012 180
- 7.2 The Constitutional Court ruling number 95/PUU-XII/2014 183

Notes on Contributors

Yance Arizona

is a lecturer at the Department of Constitutional Law, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia. He accomplished his PhD studies the Van Vollenhoven Institute for Law, Governance and Society, Leiden University, the Netherlands. Prior to his PhD, Yance obtained a master's in constitutional law from the University of Indonesia and Master of Arts from International Institute for the Sociology of Law, Spain. He has published many articles regarding the constitution, agrarian and natural resources, and indigenous communities' rights in Indonesia. Currently, he is the chair of the Centre for Democracy, Constitution and Human Rights at the Faculty of Law, Universitas Gadjah Mada.

George Barrie

is Emeritus Professor of the University of Johannesburg. Previously he was State Advocate of the High Court of South Africa; Senior Law Adviser of the Department of Foreign Affairs; Dean of the Faculty of Law of the Rand Afrikaans University and a Visiting Professor at the Free University of Brussels. From 1995 to 1999 he served on the National Advisory Council of Correctional Services. He is the author of *Topical International Law* and numerous articles in legal journals. He was on the International Advisory Board of the *South African Journal of International Law*.

Bisariyadi

is a researcher at the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Indonesia who assists judges at the Court and conducts research to help the Judge in dealing with constitutional cases. Bisar has spent fifteen years at the Court soon after graduating from Law School at Universitas Indonesia for his Bachelor degree (2003). During his years at the Court, he was awarded a scholarship to have a Master of Laws at Melbourne University (2010). Bisar is also keen to write and publish scholarly articles on constitutional and human rights issues. His essays published in nationally accredited Law Reviews as well as a number of short pieces as a contributor in the Court's monthly bulletin. He manages a compilation of his writing where you can read and download from bisariyadi.wordpress.com. He is available for writing and research projects. You can reach him at bisariyadi@mahkamahkonstitusi.go.id.

Ann Black

is a Professor of Law at the TC Beirne School of Law, The University of Queensland, Australia, and Executive Director (Comparative Law) of its Centre for Public, International and Comparative Law. Her research analyses the intersection of law, religion and secularism, including the operation of Sharia in the Sultanate of Brunei Darussalam and in secular Australia. In addition to journal articles and chapters, her publications include *Modern Perspective of Islamic Law* (with Nadir Hosen & Hossein Esmaeili), *Law and Legal Institutions of Asia* (with Gary Bell) and *Religious Freedom in Secular States* (with Jahid Hossain Bhuiyan).

Miriam Cohen

is an Associate Professor and Canada Research Chair on Human Rights and International Reparative Justice at Université de Montréal Faculty of Law. She is the award-winning author of “Realizing Reparative Justice for International Crimes: From Theory to Practice” (Cambridge University Press), recipient of the 2022 Scholarly Book Award of the Canadian Council on International Law and the First Prize of the Legal Competition of the Quebec Bar Foundation. Dr. Cohen is the founder of the *Human Rights and International Justice Laboratory*, funded by the *Canada Foundation for Innovation* (CFI) and the *Government of Quebec*. She has previously worked in legal advisory roles at the International Court of Justice and the International Criminal Court, and she has appeared as Counsel before the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea and the Supreme Court of Canada. Recipient of several awards, fellowships and grants, including major research grants from the *Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada* (SSHRC), Dr. Cohen is the author of over 40 papers and monographs on human rights and international law published in English, French, Portuguese and Spanish, in leading law journals and books around the world. She holds graduate degrees from Harvard Law School, Cambridge University, Université de Montréal and Leiden University, where she obtained her PhD in international law. She is both an international lawyer (member of the Quebec Bar) and an accredited mediator.

Pan Mohamad Faiz

is a Constitutional Law Expert. He works as a Senior Expert Assistant to Justice at the Indonesian Constitutional Court. Faiz received his Doctor of Philosophy in Constitutional Law from TC Beirne School of Law, the University of Queensland, Australia. Currently, he lectures in constitutional law on Legal Theory, Law and Constitution, Comparative Constitutional Law, Constitutional Court, Procedural Law of the Constitutional Court, and Election

Dispute Resolutions at several universities, among others, the University of Brawijaya, Universitas Gadjah Mada, and the University of Indonesia. Faiz is also an External Research Fellow at the Center for Public, International and Comparative Law at the University of Queensland. Faiz serves as Secretary of the Research and Publication Department at the Association of Constitutional Law and State Administrative Law Lecturers, and Coordinator at the Association of Indonesian Legal Journal Management. In addition, Faiz has attended professional training in the ProCuria Program for Legal Officers from The Hague University of Applied Science, The Netherlands (2017) and Leadership in Court Governance from the Singapore Judicial College (2017). He also passed the Education and Training Program for Researchers (Advanced Level) held by the Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI). Faiz is also known for his academic writings on legal and constitutional issues that have become references for many law students and academics. Currently, Faiz is the Editor-in-Chief of *Constitutional Review*, a Scopus-indexed international journal published by the Center for Research and Case Analysis of the Indonesian Constitutional Court.

Robert Shenton French AC

served as Chief Justice of Australia from 1 September 2008 until 29 January 2017. He is a graduate of the University of Western Australia in science and law. He served as a Judge of the Federal Court of Australia from November 1986 until his appointment as Chief Justice of the High Court on 1 September 2008. Since his retirement as Chief Justice, Mr French has been appointed as a Non-Permanent Justice of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal (May 2017), as an International Judge of the Singapore International Commercial Court (January 2018) and as a Judge of the Court of Appeal of the Dubai International Financial Centre (June 2019). He was elected as Chancellor of the University of Western Australia in December 2017.

Saldi Isra

is a Constitutional Law Professor at the Faculty of Law of Andalas University in Padang, West Sumatra, and the Deputy Chief Justice of the Constitutional Court of Indonesia. Prior to his appointment to the Constitutional Court in 2017, he was Director of the Center for Constitutional Studies (PUSaKO) at the Faculty of Law of Andalas University from 2005–2017. He chaired the Faculty of Law's Doctoral Program from 2011–2016. Saldi is a prolific writer, having contributed more than 600 articles to Indonesian national newspapers, including the *Kompas* daily, *Media Indonesia* and *The Jakarta Post*. He is the author of over 20 books and some 50 articles published in national and international scientific journals. His international academic activities have included: External

Examiner for Ph.D. in Law at Maastricht University (December 2017); Constitutional Dialogue at the State Administrative Tribunal in Perth in collaboration with Curtin University, Germany's Max Planck Foundation and Andalas University (Australia, March 2017); Participant in the Joint Study for Legislative Practice in Japan (Osaka, February 2017); Joint Study on Legislation in the Netherlands (November 2016); Visiting Scholar at Gakushuin University (Tokyo, October 2011); Participant in Rule of Law Forum in Dallas, Washington and New York (USA, September–October 2009); Chevening Fellowship at University of Birmingham (UK, January–April 2006); Participant in Law and Governance in Developing Countries at Van Vollenhoven Institute Faculty of Law, Leiden University, (September–December 2003); and Researcher of the Indonesian-Netherlands Studies on Decentralization of the Indonesian Rechtsstaat in collaboration with several Indonesian universities and the Van Vollenhoven Institute of Leiden University (2003–2007).

Tove H. Malloy

is a Professor of European Studies at the Europa-Universität Flensburg, Germany, and an External Lecturer at Roskilde University, Denmark. She formerly served as the Director of the European Centre for Minority Issues in Flensburg, Germany, and was a member of the Council of Europe's Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, where she was elected Gender Equality Rapporteur (2011–2018). Her background is in political theory, specializing in the political and legal aspects of national and ethnic minority rights in international relations and international law, particularly in the European context. She is the author of *National Minority Rights in Europe* (OUP, 2005) and has co-edited a number of volumes on minority rights protection and non-territorial autonomy as well as two textbooks. She serves as consultant with the Council of Europe, the OSCE and the Raoul Wallenberg Institute. She holds a PhD in Government from Essex University, UK.

I D.G. Palguna

is an expert in international law and constitutional law. He is presently a lecturer at the Faculty of Law of Udayana University in Bali (Indonesia), where he also lectures at the Notary Masters Program, the Masters in Government Law Program and the Doctoral Program at the Postgraduate School. He served as a member of the Election Supervisory Committee for Bali Province in Indonesia's historic 1999 general election and in the same year he was elected by the Bali Provincial Legislative Assembly as one of Bali's Regional Representatives in the People's Consultative Assembly (MPR). At the MPR, he first served as Secretary

of the Ad Hoc Committee II of the MPR Working Committee (1999–2000) and then became a member of the Ad Hoc Committee I (2000–2002), which was tasked with drafting amendments to Indonesia's 1945 Constitution. In 2003, a year before the expiration of his term as a member of the MPR, he was elected as one of three justices appointed by the House of Representatives to Indonesia's newly formed Constitutional Court. Thus, he became part of the nine-member bench for the Constitutional Court's first period (2003–2008). Later, after a gap of six years, he was again selected as a Constitutional Justice (2015–2020), this time as one of three justices chosen by the President. Palguna has authored numerous books, including *Pengaduan Konstitusional: Upaya Hukum terhadap Pelanggaran Hak-hak Konstitusional Warga Negara* (Constitutional Complaint: Legal Remedies for Violations of Citizens' Constitutional Rights, 2013), *Mahkamah Konstitusi dan Dinamika Politik Hukum di Indonesia* (The Constitutional Court and Political Dynamics of Law in Indonesia, 2020).

Nico Steytler

is the Director of the Community Law Center at the University of the Western Cape, a research and advocacy institute that works to uphold the democratic values and human rights outlined in South Africa's Constitution. He has been actively involved in the development of the new constitutional order over the past decade. He served as a technical advisor to the Constitutional Assembly during the drafting of the 1996 Constitution (1995–1996) and advised the Western Cape Provincial Legislature on the development of a provincial constitution (1996–1997). In recognition of his contributions, he was appointed the South African Research Chair in Multi-Level Government, Law and Policy by the National Research Foundation (2013–2017). His primary research focus lies in intergovernmental relations and local government. His research interests are Constitutional design and the multi-level government system, comparative federalism, and local government.

Bertus de Villiers

is a Visiting Professor of the Law School of the University of Johannesburg and a Member of the State Administrative Tribunal of Western Australia. He is a Fellow of the Alexander von Humboldt Stiftung (Germany). He specializes in the areas of minority and indigenous rights, decentralization, human rights, and land reform. Professor De Villiers has undertaken research and lectured on constitutional and political developments in various countries, including Ethiopia, Sudan, South Sudan, Indonesia, and the Philippines. He received in 2016 the Alexander von Humboldt Stiftung award for *Innovative Research Networking*. During his career, Prof. De Villiers contributed to the South African

constitution drafting process by providing advice and research. He also served on the Commission for the Demarcation of the Provinces. In recent years, he has been cooperating with the Constitutional Court of Indonesia since 2017 as a visiting academic. His most recent works include *Indigenous Rights in the Modern Era – Regaining What Has Been Lost* (Brill, 2023); *Navigating the Unknown – Essays on Selected Case Studies about the Rights of Minorities* (Brill, 2022); and as co-editor of *Litigating the Rights of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples in Domestic and International Courts* (Brill, 2021).

Christie S. Warren

is Professor of the Practice of International and Comparative Law and Director of the Center for Comparative Legal Studies & Post-Conflict Peacebuilding at William & Mary Law School. Her areas of expertise include Comparative Law, Comparative Constitutional Law, Post-Conflict Justice and the Rule of Law, Public International Law, International Human Rights Law and Islamic Law. She has designed, implemented, monitored and assessed academic, constitutional, judicial and legal development and training projects in more than 58 countries throughout Africa, Central and East Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean, Central and Eastern Europe, the Middle East, Russia and the Newly Independent States, the Balkans and East Timor. Her research and publications are in the fields of Comparative Constitutional Law, Post-Conflict Reconstruction and Islamic Law. Warren served as the 1998–1999 Supreme Court Fellow at the Supreme Court of the United States and the 2010 Senior Expert in Constitutional Issues on the Mediation Support Unit Standby Team within the United Nations Department of Political Affairs. She was named the 2016–2017 Fulbright-Schuman Distinguished Chair at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy and served as a 2019 Visiting Professor of Constitutional Law at the Universidad Autónoma de Madrid and a 2021 Visiting Professor of International Law at Sapienza University in Rome. She is the recipient of the Administration of Justice Award from the Supreme Court Fellows Alumni Association, given “In Recognition of Significant Contributions to the International Administration of Justice.”

