

**INTERNATIONAL  
AND  
COMPARATIVE  
CRIMINAL  
LAW  
SERIES**

## ***Editorial Board***

*Series Editor*

### ***M. Cherif Bassiouni***

President, International Human Rights Law Institute, DePaul University  
President, International Institute of Higher Studies in Criminal Sciences, Siracusa,  
Italy, President, International Association of Penal Law, DePaul University  
Professor of Law, DePaul University, Chicago, IL, USA

#### ***Diane Amann***

Professor of Law  
University of California  
School of Law  
Davis, CA, USA

#### ***Christopher L. Blakesley***

J.Y. Sanders Professor of Law  
Louisiana State University Law Center  
Baton Rouge, LA, USA

#### ***Roger S. Clark***

Board of Governors Professor  
The State University of New Jersey  
School of Law  
Camden, NJ, USA

#### ***John Dugard***

Member, International Law  
Commission, Geneva; Emeritus  
Professor of Law, University of  
Witwatersrand, South Africa; and  
Professor of Public International Law,  
University of Leiden,  
The Netherlands

#### ***Albin Eser***

Professor of Criminal Law, Albert  
Ludwig University; Director, Max-  
Planck Institute for International and  
Comparative Criminal Law  
Freiburg, i. B., Germany

#### ***Alfredo Etcheberry***

Professor of Criminal Law,  
National University of Chile;  
President, Chilean Lawyers'  
Association, Santiago, Chile

#### ***Jordan Paust***

Professor of Law  
University of Houston Law Center  
Houston, TX, USA

#### ***Mario Pisani***

Professor of Criminal Procedure  
Faculty of Law, University of Milan  
Milan, Italy

#### ***William Michael Reisman***

Myers S. McDougal Professor of Law  
and Jurisprudence, Yale Law School  
New Haven, CT, USA

#### ***Leila Sadat***

Professor of Law  
Washington University in St. Louis  
School of Law  
St. Louis, MO, USA

#### ***Michael P. Scharf***

Professor of Law  
New England School of Law  
Boston, MA, USA

#### ***Kuniji Shibahara***

Professor Emeritus  
University of Tokyo, Faculty of Law  
Tokyo, Japan

#### ***Brigitte Stern***

Professor of International Law  
University of Paris I  
Panthéon, Sorbonne  
Paris, France

#### ***Otto Trifflerer***

Professor of International Criminal  
Law and Procedure, Faculty of Law,  
University of Salzburg  
Salzburg, Austria

STATES' RESPONSES TO  
ISSUES ARISING FROM  
THE ICC STATUTE:  
Constitutional,  
Sovereignty, Judicial  
Cooperation and  
Criminal Law

**EDITED BY ROY S. LEE**



*Transnational Publishers*

Published and distributed by Transnational Publishers, Inc.  
Ardsley Park  
Science and Technology Center  
410 Saw Mill River Road  
Ardsley, NY 10502

---

Phone: 914-693-5100  
Fax: 914-693-4430  
E-mail: info@transnationalpubs.com  
Web: www.transnationalpubs.com

Lee, Roy S. K., 1938–  
States' responses to issues arising from the ICC Statute:  
constitutional, sovereignty, judicial cooperation, and criminal  
law / Roy S. Lee  
p.cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-57105-155-4

1. Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (1998)
2. International Criminal Court. 3. International criminal courts. I. Title.

KZ6312.S73 2005  
345'.01—dc22

2005041781

Copyright © 2005 by Transnational Publishers, Inc.

All rights reserved. This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that copying permitted by U.S. Copyright Law in Section 107, "fair use" in teaching and research, Section 108, certain library copying, and except in published media by reviewers in limited excerpts), without written permission from the publisher.

Manufactured in the United States of America

## CONTENTS

---

<i>Foreword</i> .....	xvii
<i>Preface</i> .....	xxi
Chapter 1 States' Responses: Issues and Solutions .....	1
<i>Roy S. Lee</i>	
Chapter 2 Implementing the Rome Statute: Canada's Experience .....	47
<i>Robert Hage</i>	
Chapter 3 Ratification and Adaptation: The French Perspective .....	57
<i>Olivier Barrat</i>	
Chapter 4 Germany: Methods and Techniques Used to Deal with Constitutional, Sovereignty and Criminal Law Issues .....	65
<i>Hans-Peter Kaul</i>	
Chapter 5 The Netherlands' Legislative Measures to Implement the ICC Statute .....	83
<i>Harry Verweij and Martijn Groenleer</i>	
Chapter 6 South Africa's Implementation of the Rome Statute .....	105
<i>Hennie Strydom</i>	
Chapter 7 Political and Legal Considerations in Sweden Relating to the Rome Statute for the International Criminal Court .....	121
<i>Håkan Friman</i>	
Chapter 8 Implementation of the ICC Statute in the United Kingdom .....	147
<i>Elizabeth Wilmshurst</i>	
Chapter 9 Argentina's Draft Law to Implement the Rome Statute .....	165

	<i>Silvia A. Fernández de Gurmendi</i>	
Chapter 10	Implementation of the Rome Statute in Brazil . . . . <i>Sylvia Helena Steiner</i>	179
Chapter 11	Italian Implementation of the Rome Statute and Related Constitutional Issues. . . . . <i>Roberto Bellelli</i>	215
Chapter 12	Ratification and Implementation of the Rome Statute in Liechtenstein . . . . . <i>Jonathan Houston</i>	247
Chapter 13	Japan's View on the International Criminal Court and Some of Its Issues of Implementation. . . . . <i>Naoko Saiki</i>	259
Chapter 14	Ratification of the Statute of the International Criminal Court by Mexico. . . . . <i>Socorro Flores Liera</i>	275
Chapter 15	Some Critical Remarks on the Rome Statute. . . . . <i>Lijun Yang</i>	281
Index	. . . . .	305

## DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<i>Foreword</i>		xvii
<i>Preface</i>		xxi
Chapter 1	States' Responses: Issues and Solutions . . . . .	1
	<i>Roy S. Lee</i>	
	I. General Approaches. . . . .	3
	II. Sovereignty and Constitutional Issues. . . . .	9
	1. Nature of the Court's Jurisdiction . . . . .	11
	2. Effect on National Criminal Jurisdiction . . . . .	12
	3. Independence of the Court. . . . .	14
	4. Investigative Power of the Prosecutor . . . . .	14
	5. Immunities of Head of State, Government Officials and Members of Parliament . . . . .	16
	6. Surrender of Nationals to the ICC . . . . .	18
	7. Statutory Limitation . . . . .	19
	8. Life Imprisonment . . . . .	20
	9. Ne Bis in Idem . . . . .	20
	10. Civilian and/or Military Tribunals . . . . .	21
	III. Criminalization of the Statute Crimes in National Law. . . . .	21
	1. Extension of Jurisdiction . . . . .	24
	2. Special Features of the Statute Crimes: Contents and Thresholds. . . . .	25
	A. The Crime of Genocide. . . . .	25
	B. Crimes Against Humanity . . . . .	26
	C. War Crimes. . . . .	27
	3. Implementing the Statute Crimes. . . . .	29
	4. Crimes against the Administration of Justice of the International Criminal Court . . . . .	35
	IV. Cooperation with and Judicial Assistance to the ICC . . . . .	35
	1. Full Cooperation with the Court. . . . .	35
	2. Arrest and Surrender . . . . .	37
	3. Investigation and Collection of Evidence. . . . .	40
	4. Protection of Witnesses . . . . .	40

	5. Enforcement of Forfeiture Orders and Fines . . . . .	41
	V. Conclusions. . . . .	42
Chapter 2	Implementing the Rome Statute: Canada's Experience . . . . .	47
	<i>Robert Hage</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	47
	II. Canada's Implementation Experience . . . . .	48
	III. Incorporating the ICC Crimes. . . . .	49
	1. Definition of Crimes. . . . .	50
	2. Jurisdiction . . . . .	51
	3. Temporal Scope . . . . .	52
	IV. Mandatory Obligations . . . . .	52
	1. Arrest and Surrender . . . . .	53
	2. Other Forms of Assistance . . . . .	54
	V. Choice for Implementing States . . . . .	54
	VI. Conclusion . . . . .	55
Chapter 3	Ratification and Adaptation: The French Perspective . . . . .	57
	<i>Olivier Barrat</i>	
	I. The Ratification Procedure . . . . .	58
	1. Constitutional Revision . . . . .	58
	A. The Decision of the Constitutional Council . . . . .	59
	B. The Constitutional Revision Procedure. . . . .	60
	2. Ratification and Its Effects . . . . .	61
	II. Adaptation of the ICC Statute under National Law. . . . .	62
	1. Obligation under the Statute. . . . .	62
	2. Organization of Complementarity . . . . .	63
Chapter 4	Germany: Methods and Techniques Used to Deal with Constitutional, Sovereignty and Criminal Law Issues . . . . .	65
	<i>Hans-Peter Kaul</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	65
	II. Constitutional and Sovereignty Issues. . . . .	69
	III. The German Legislative Concept Regarding the Rome Statute . . . . .	73
	IV. Key Features of the New Code of Crimes against International Law . . . . .	74
	V. Concluding Observations . . . . .	78

Chapter 5	The Netherlands' Legislative Measures to Implement the ICC Statute . . . . .	83
	<i>Harry Verweij and Martijn Groenleer</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	83
	II. Issues Relating to Ratification . . . . .	84
	III. Issues Raised During the Implementation Stage . . . . .	86
	IV. Issues Relating to Cooperation and Enforcement under the Implementation Act . . . . .	87
	1. Surrender Procedures . . . . .	89
	2. Other Forms of Cooperation . . . . .	90
	3. Enforcement of Sentences . . . . .	91
	V. Issues Relating to the International Crimes Act . . . . .	91
	1. Guiding Principles . . . . .	92
	2. The Crimes Covered . . . . .	93
	3. Key Elements . . . . .	94
	A. Universal Jurisdiction . . . . .	95
	B. Command responsibility and Superior Orders . . . . .	96
	C. Statute of Limitation . . . . .	97
	D. Immunity . . . . .	97
	E. Penalties . . . . .	98
	F. Reparations for Victims . . . . .	98
	VI. Netherlands as the Host State: Specific Responsibilities . . . . .	99
	1. Headquarters Agreement with the Court . . . . .	99
	2. Relations with the Agreement on Privileges and Immunities of the ICC . . . . .	100
	3. Operational Assistance under the Implementation Act . . . . .	101
	A. Suspects in Transit . . . . .	101
	B. Application for Asylum . . . . .	101
	C. Detention . . . . .	102
	VII. Conclusions: Challenges Ahead . . . . .	102
Chapter 6	South Africa's Implementation of the Rome Statute . . . . .	105
	<i>Hennie Strydom</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	105
	II. Jurisdiction and the Institution of Prosecution . . . . .	106
	III. International Law and the Amnesty Decision . . . . .	110

IV. Cooperation with the ICC . . . . .	114
V. The Conclusion of Agreements with the ICC . . . . .	117
VI. Extradition . . . . .	118
VII. Conclusion . . . . .	120
 Chapter 7 Political and Legal Considerations in Sweden Relating to the Rome Statute for the International Criminal Court . . . . .	       121
<i>Håkan Friman</i>	
I. Introduction . . . . .	121
II. The Swedish Ratification Process . . . . .	122
1. Requirements for Ratification . . . . .	122
2. Implementation of Treaty Obligations . . . . .	123
3. The Process Towards Ratification . . . . .	124
4. A Memorandum . . . . .	124
5. Translation of the Statute . . . . .	125
6. The Referral Process . . . . .	125
7. A Fast-Track Ratification Process . . . . .	126
III. Constitutional Questions . . . . .	127
1. Compatibility with the Swedish Constitution . . . . .	127
2. Transfer of Decision-Making Powers to an International Body . . . . .	128
3. Immunities . . . . .	129
4. Extradition and Expulsion of Swedish Nationals . . . . .	130
5. Pardon and Revision . . . . .	132
IV. Cooperation with the Court . . . . .	132
1. Cooperation in Accordance with the Statute . . . . .	132
2. The Legislative Process . . . . .	134
3. General or Special Legislation . . . . .	135
4. Arrest and Surrender . . . . .	135
5. Other Forms of Legal Assistance . . . . .	137
6. Enforcement of Sentences and Other Decisions . . . . .	139
V. Criminal Law and Criminal Jurisdiction . . . . .	139
1. A Separate Legislative Project . . . . .	139
2. Genocide, Crimes against Humanity and War Crimes . . . . .	141
3. Criminal Jurisdiction and Statute of Limitations . . . . .	142
4. Principles and Jurisprudence of the Court . . . . .	143

	VI. Offenses against the Integrity of the Court . . . .	144
	VII. Final Remarks . . . . .	144
Chapter 8	Implementation of the ICC Statute in the United Kingdom . . . . .	147
	<i>Elizabeth Wilmshurst</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	147
	II. The ICC Offenses . . . . .	148
	III. Extra-Territoriality . . . . .	151
	IV. Cooperation with a the ICC: Arrest and Surrender . . . . .	153
	V. Immunities . . . . .	156
	VI. Assistance in Relation to Investigation or Prosecution . . . . .	158
	1. The Identification and Whereabouts of Persons or the Location of Items. . . . .	158
	2. The Taking of Evidence, Including Testimony under Oath, and the Production of Evidence, Including Expert Opinions and Reports Necessary to the Court . . . . .	159
	3. The Questioning of Any Person Being Investigated or Prosecuted. . . . .	159
	4. Service of Documents, Including Judicial Documents . . . . .	159
	5. Facilitating the Voluntary Appearance of Persons as Witnesses or Experts before the Court. . . . .	159
	6. The Temporary Transfer of Persons in Custody, for the Purposes of Identification or for Obtaining Testimony or Other Assistance . . . . .	159
	7. The Examination of Places or Sites, Including the Exhumation and Examination of Grave Sites; and the Execution of Searches and Seizures . . . . .	160
	8. The Provision of Records and Documents, Including Official Records and Documents. . . . .	160
	9. The Protection of Victims and Witnesses and the Preservation of Evidence . . . . .	160
	10. The Identification, Tracing and Freezing or Seizure of Proceeds, Property and Assets and Instrumentalities of Crimes for the Purpose of Eventual Forfeiture, without Prejudice to the Righth of Bona Fide Third Parties . . . . .	160

	11. Any Other Type of Assistance which Is Not Prohibited by the Law of the Requested State, with a View to Facilitating the Investigation and Prosecution of Crimes within the Jurisdiction of the Court . . . . .	161
	VII. National Security . . . . .	161
	VIII. Enforcement of Sentences and Orders by the Court . . . . .	161
	1. Sentences . . . . .	161
	2. Orders . . . . .	162
	IX. Order in Council . . . . .	162
	X. Conclusion . . . . .	163
Chapter 9	Argentina's Draft Law to Implement the Rome Statute . . . . .	165
	<i>Silvia A. Fernández de Gurmendi</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	165
	II. Granting Constitutional Rank to the Rome Statute . . . . .	166
	III. Immunities and Surrender of Suspects to the ICC . . . . .	167
	IV. The Principle of Complementarity . . . . .	169
	V. Enhancing the Basis of Jurisdiction . . . . .	170
	VI. General Principles of Criminal Law . . . . .	171
	VII. Definition of Crimes . . . . .	172
	VIII. The Cooperation Regime with the ICC . . . . .	174
Chapter 10	Implementation of the Rome Statute in Brazil . . . . .	179
	<i>Sylvia Helena Steiner</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	179
	II. The Duty to Prosecute or to Surrender . . . . .	183
	1. Universal Jurisdiction . . . . .	183
	2. Extradition and Surrender . . . . .	185
	III. Eliminating Barriers to Local Trials and Constitutionality . . . . .	188
	1. Immunities . . . . .	188
	2. Criminal Justice and Constitutional Issues . . . . .	192
	A. The Penalty of Life Sentence . . . . .	193
	B. Individualization of Penalty . . . . .	196
	C. Statute of Limitation . . . . .	198
	D. Amnesty, Collective Pardon, Individual Pardon, Bail . . . . .	200
	E. The Institution of the Jury . . . . .	201

IV.	Implementation of the Statute Crimes . . . . .	202
1.	Crimes of Genocide . . . . .	203
2.	Crimes against Humanity . . . . .	204
3.	War Crimes . . . . .	206
V.	Conclusion . . . . .	210
Chapter 11	Italian Implementation of the Rome Statute and Related Constitutional Issues. . . . .	215
	<i>Roberto Bellelli</i>	
I.	Italian Ratification of the Rome Statute . . . . .	215
II.	The Obligation to Implement the Statute . . . . .	216
1.	Substantive Criminal Matters . . . . .	216
2.	International Cooperation . . . . .	217
3.	Implementing Solutions. . . . .	219
A.	Implementation First and Then Ratification . . . . .	219
B.	Simultaneous Ratification and Implementation . . . . .	220
C.	Ratification First and Then Implementation . . . . .	220
III.	Previous Relevant Treaties . . . . .	221
1.	Relationship with Statute . . . . .	221
2.	Italian Implementation of Previous Relevant Treaties. . . . .	222
IV.	Constitutional Issues Raised by the Statute . . . . .	223
1.	The General Clause Contained in Article 11 of the Italian Constitution . . . . .	224
2.	Common Constitutional Issues . . . . .	225
A.	Immunities . . . . .	225
B.	The Obligation to Surrender . . . . .	231
C.	The Role of the Court in the Enforcement of Sentences . . . . .	235
3.	Specific Issues for the Italian Legal System . . . . .	237
A.	The Direct Investigation Power the Prosecutor on the Territory of State Parties . . . . .	237
B.	Divergences of the Statute Penalties and Italian Systems of Penalties . . . . .	240
4.	Article 70 Offenses . . . . .	241
5.	Discretionary Prosecution . . . . .	241
6.	Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitations . . . . .	242
V.	The Procedure for Implementation . . . . .	243
1.	The 1999 Draft Delegation Law. . . . .	243

	2. The Drafts Pending before the Parliament . . . . .	244
	3. Governmental Drafts . . . . .	244
	VI. Conclusion . . . . .	245
Chapter 12	Ratification and Implementation of the Rome Statute in Liechtenstein . . . . .	247
	<i>Jonathan Houston</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	247
	II. Constitutional Procedures for Ratification and Implementation . . . . .	248
	1. Ratification of Treaties . . . . .	248
	2. Passage of Implementing Legislation . . . . .	249
	3. Adaptation of Constitutional Amendments . . . . .	250
	III. Practical Aspects of Ratification and Implementation . . . . .	250
	1. Responsible Government Offices . . . . .	250
	2. Consultations with Authorities and Interested Groups . . . . .	251
	3. Relationship with Cooperation Legislation for the ICTY and ICTR . . . . .	251
	4. Foreign Models . . . . .	251
	5. Implementation of Crimes . . . . .	253
	IV. Constitutional Immunities of the Prince . . . . .	254
	1. Compatibility of the Rome Statute with the Liechtenstein Constitution . . . . .	254
	2. Legal Basis of the Immunity Question . . . . .	254
	3. Possible Solutions . . . . .	255
	A. Constitutional Application . . . . .	255
	B. Constitutional Interpretation . . . . .	256
	C. Probabilities and Rationality . . . . .	258
Chapter 13	Japan's View on the International Criminal Court and Some of Its Issues of Implementation . . . . .	259
	<i>Naoko Saiki</i>	
	I. Introduction . . . . .	259
	II. Pre-Conditions for the ICC to Exercise Jurisdiction . . . . .	260
	III. Admissibility: The Principle of Complementarity . . . . .	261
	IV. Crimes within the Jurisdiction of the Court . . . . .	263
	1. Crimes of Genocide . . . . .	263
	2. Crimes against Humanity . . . . .	264

3.	War Crimes . . . . .	265
4.	The Crime of Aggression . . . . .	266
5.	Punishment of the ICC Crimes . . . . .	266
V.	General Principles of Criminal Law . . . . .	268
1.	Statute of Limitations (Article 29 of the Rome Statute) . . . . .	268
2.	Superior Responsibility (Article 28 of the Rome Statute) . . . . .	269
3.	Irrelevance of Official Capacity (Article 27 of the Rome Statute) . . . . .	269
VI.	International Cooperation and Judicial Assistance . . . . .	270
1.	Gathering of Evidence and Other Judicial Cooperation . . . . .	271
2.	Extradition of Japanese Nationals . . . . .	272
VII.	Conclusion . . . . .	273
Chapter 14	Ratification of the Statute of the International Criminal Court by Mexico . . . . .	275
	<i>Socorro Flores Liera</i>	
I.	Introduction . . . . .	275
II.	Political Issues . . . . .	275
III.	Constitutional Issues . . . . .	276
1.	Ne Bis in Idem . . . . .	276
2.	Surrender of Persons . . . . .	276
3.	Immunities of Certain Public Officials . . . . .	277
4.	Exclusion of the Accused from Certain Procedure before the International Criminal Court . . . . .	277
5.	Life Imprisonment . . . . .	277
IV.	The Draft Constitutional Amendment . . . . .	278
Chapter 15	Some Critical Remarks on the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court . . . . .	281
	<i>Yang Lijun</i>	
I.	Acceptance and Exercise of Jurisdiction . . . . .	283
II.	The Complementarity Principle . . . . .	287
III.	The Crimes within the Jurisdiction of the ICC . . . . .	290
1.	Crimes against Humanity . . . . .	290
2.	War Crimes . . . . .	293
3.	Aggression . . . . .	294
IV.	The Prosecutor and Judges . . . . .	297
1.	The Prosecutor's Power to Initiate Litigations . . . . .	297

2. Election of Judges . . . . .	299
V. International Cooperation and Judicial Assistance . . . . .	299
VI. Other Issues in the Rome Statute . . . . .	301
Index . . . . .	305