

## BELLIGERENT REPRISALS

# International Humanitarian Law Series

---

VOLUME 11

---

## *Editors-in-Chief*

Professor Christopher Greenwood  
Professor Timothy L.H. McCormack

## *Editorial Advisory Board*

Professor Georges Abi-Saab  
H.E. Judge George H. Aldrich  
Madame Justice Louise Arbour  
Professor Ove Bring  
Professor Antonio Cassese  
Professor John Dugard  
Professor Dr. Horst Fischer  
Dr. Hans-Peter Gasser  
Professor Leslie C. Green  
H.E. Judge Geza Herczegh  
Professor Frits Kalshoven  
Professor Ruth Lapidoth  
Professor Gabrielle Kirk McDonald  
H.E. Judge Theodor Meron  
Captain J. Ashley Roach  
Professor Jiri Toman

The International Humanitarian Law Series is a series of monographs and edited volumes which aims to promote scholarly analysis and discussion of both the theory and practice of the international legal regulation of armed conflict.

The series explores substantive issues of International Humanitarian Law including,

- protection for victims of armed conflict and regulation of the means and methods of warfare
- questions of application of the various legal regimes for the conduct of armed conflict
- issues relating to the implementation of International Humanitarian Law obligations
- national and international approaches to the enforcement of the law and
- the interactions between International Humanitarian Law and other related areas of international law such as Human Rights, Refugee Law, Arms Control and Disarmament Law, and International Criminal Law.

*The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.*

# BELLIGERENT REPRISALS

by

FRITS KALSHOVEN

Preface by  
JEAN PICTET †

Preface to the second edition by  
RUTH WEDGWOOD

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON

**A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.**

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 90 04 14386 6

© Copyright 2005 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Originally published by A.W. Sijthoff's Uitgeefmaatschappij N.V., Leiden, 1971.

Cover photograph: Dresden 1945.

© ANP, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill Academic Publishers, Martinus Nijhoff Publishers and VSP.

<http://www.brill.nl>

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Brill Academic Publishers provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

Printed and bound in The Netherlands.

# Contents

<i>Series Editors' Note</i>	VII
<i>Preface to the Second Edition</i>	IX
<i>Préface</i>	XIII
<i>Introduction</i>	XVII
<i>Abbreviations</i>	XXV

## I. GENERAL ASPECTS OF REPRISALS

1.1. <i>Historical outline</i>	1
1.2. <i>Reprisals in contemporary international law</i>	11
1.2.1. International law: its nature	11
1.2.2. Sanctions of international law	15
1.2.3. Reprisals as sanctions of international law	22
1.2.4. Reprisals and certain related concepts	26
1.2.5. Participants in reprisals	28
1.2.6. Reprisals and the standard of objectivity	29
1.2.7. Definition of reprisals	33
1.3. <i>Belligerent reprisals</i>	33
1.3.1. Armed conflict	33
1.3.2. Participants in belligerent reprisals	36
1.3.3. Law involved in belligerent reprisals	40
1.3.4. Special features of belligerent reprisals	42

## II. EVOLUTION OF THE LAW AS TO BELLIGERENT REPRISALS IN THE PERIOD PRIOR TO THE FIRST WORLD WAR

2.1. <i>The Conference of Brussels of 1874</i>	45
2.2. <i>The Oxford Manual</i>	51
2.3. <i>The Peace Conference of 1899</i>	56
2.4. <i>The Second Peace Conference of 1907</i>	63
2.5. <i>Conclusions</i>	66

## CONTENTS

### III. THE PERIOD BETWEEN THE FIRST AND SECOND WORLD WARS

3.1. <i>Prelude to the Conference of 1929</i>	69
3.1.1. The ICRC and the Red Cross Conference of 1921	69
3.1.2. The draft code of the International Law Association	74
3.1.3. Further preparations for the 1929 Conference	76
3.2. <i>The Diplomatic Conference of Geneva of 1929</i>	78
3.3. <i>The Tokyo project of 1934</i>	83
3.4. <i>The Disarmament Conference of 1932-1934</i>	90
3.5. <i>Conclusions</i>	106

### IV. REPRISALS IN THE SECOND WORLD WAR-I: BRITISH REPRISALS ORDERS, 1939-1940

4.1. <i>Description of the British measures</i>	115
4.1.1. Orders in Council establishing enemy export control, November 1939-July 1940	115
4.1.2. Order in Council establishing compulsory navicerting, 31 July 1940	121
4.2. <i>Legal aspects of the German conduct of warfare, 1939-1940</i>	126
4.2.1. German actions prior to the Order in Council of 27 November 1939	126
4.2.2. German actions between 27 November 1939 and 31 July 1940	138
4.3. <i>Legal nature of the British measures</i>	142
4.3.1. The Order in Council of 27 November 1939	142
4.3.2. The Order in Council of 31 July 1940	144
4.4. <i>Appraisal of the grounds advanced in justification of the         British measures</i>	147
4.4.1. The Order in Council of 27 November 1939	147
4.4.2. Extension of export control to other enemy States	156
4.4.3. The Order in Council of 31 July 1940	156
4.5. <i>Conclusions</i>	158

### V. REPRISALS IN THE SECOND WORLD WAR-II

5.1. <i>German reprisal bombardment of London, September-         November 1940</i>	161
5.1.1. The facts	161
5.1.2. Legal character of the British and German bombing actions, May-November 1940	167

## CONTENTS

5.1.3. Appraisal of the alleged character as a reprisal of the bombardment of London	170
5.2. <i>Reprisals against prisoners of war</i>	178
5.2.1. The shackling of prisoners of war	178
5.2.2. The Commando Order	184
5.2.3. The killing of German prisoners of war held by the French Forces of the Interior	193
5.3. <i>Reprisals against the civil population in occupied territory</i>	200
5.4. <i>Conclusions</i>	210

## VI. DEVELOPMENTS AFTER THE SECOND WORLD WAR

6.1. <i>Judicial decisions relating to the Second World War</i>	216
6.1.1. Discussion between prosecution and defence in Trial of Major War Criminals, Nuremberg	217
6.1.2. The Hostages Case	219
6.1.3. The Einsatzgruppen and High Command Cases	230
6.1.4. The Ardeatine Cave Cases	233
6.1.5. The Rauter Case	242
6.1.6. The Falkenhausen Case	255
6.1.7. The Dostler Case	260
6.2. <i>Attempts at codification: success and failure</i>	263
6.2.1. The Conventions of Geneva of 1949	263
6.2.2. The Convention of The Hague of 1954	272
6.2.3. The Draft Rules of the International Committee of the Red Cross	277
6.2.4. The Draft Code of Offences Against the Peace and Security of Mankind	287
6.3. <i>Belligerent reprisals in contemporary international practice</i>	289
6.3.1. Armed non-belligerent reprisals	289
6.3.2. Reprisals and punishment of war crimes	294
6.3.3. Reprisal executions by the Vietcong	295
6.3.4. The hostages in Stanleyville	305
6.3.5. The destruction of houses in Israel-occupied Arab territory	315
6.4. <i>Conclusions</i>	321

## VII. RESULTS AND PERSPECTIVES

7.1. <i>The law in force concerning belligerent reprisals</i>	333
7.1.1. Prohibitions in force	333
7.1.2. Norms regulating the recourse to belligerent reprisals	339

## CONTENTS

7.1.3. The retaliatory use of means of warfare: the issue of NBC weapons	344
7.1.4. Retaliatory attacks on non-military objectives: the protection of the civil population in enemy territory	353
7.2. <i>The relation of belligerent reprisals to certain other concepts</i>	362
7.2.1. Reciprocity	362
7.2.2. Tu quoque	364
7.2.3. Military necessity	365
7.3. <i>The character and function of belligerent reprisals</i>	367
7.3.1. A misconception: belligerent reprisals as an alleged factor in changing the laws of war	367
7.3.2. An inconsistency: belligerent reprisals and international adjudication of wartime events	369
7.3.3. An alternative: belligerent reprisals and individual punishment of war crimes	370
7.3.4. A substitute: belligerent reprisals and outside supervision	372
7.3.5. Final appraisal: merits and demerits of belligerent reprisals in an anachronistic world-order	375
<i>Index of Names</i>	379
<i>Subject Index</i>	382

# Abbreviations

<b>AJIL</b>	<b>American Journal of International law</b>
<b>Annuaire</b>	<b>Annuaire de l'Institut de droit international</b>
<b>Annual Digest</b>	<b>Annual Digest and Reports of Public International Law Cases</b>
<b>BYIL</b>	<b>British Yearbook of International Law</b>
<b>Cmd.</b>	<b>(British) Command Papers</b>
<b>ICRC</b>	<b>International Committee of the Red Cross</b>
<b>I.C.J.</b>	<b>International Court of Justice</b>
<b>I.M.T.</b>	<b>International Military Tribunal, Nuremberg</b>
<b>I.M.T. Vol. ...</b>	<b>Trial of the Major War Criminals before the International Military Tribunal, Nuremberg, 14 November 1945-1 October 1946; official text in the English language, published at Nuremberg, Germany, by the Secretariat of the Tribunal, Vols. I-XLII</b>
<b>IRRC</b>	<b>International Review of the Red Cross</b>
<b>N.R.G.</b>	<b>De Martens, Nouveau Recueil Général</b>
<b>Off. J.</b>	<b>League of Nations Official Journal</b>
<b>POW</b>	<b>Prisoner(s) of War</b>
<b>R.d.C.</b>	<b>Académie de droit international, Recueil des Cours</b>
<b>RDILC</b>	<b>Revue de droit international et de législation comparée</b>
<b>RGDIP</b>	<b>Revue générale de droit international public</b>
<b>RICR</b>	<b>Revue internationale de la Croix-Rouge</b>
<b>U.N.T.S.</b>	<b>United Nations Treaty Series</b>
<b>U.N.W.C.C.</b>	<b>United Nations War Crimes Commission</b>