

HUMAN RIGHTS AND MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORK

A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE SOCIO-LEGAL STATUS OF
FILIPINA MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORKERS IN CANADA AND
HONG KONG

THE RAOUL WALLENBERG INSTITUTE
HUMAN RIGHTS LIBRARY
VOLUME 24

HUMAN RIGHTS AND MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORK

A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE SOCIO-LEGAL STATUS
OF FILIPINA MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORKERS IN CANADA
AND HONG KONG

BY

MARIA DEANNA P. SANTOS

THE RAOUL WALLENBERG INSTITUTE HUMAN RIGHTS LIBRARY
VOLUME 24

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN/BOSTON
2005

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 90 04 14527 3

© 2005 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill Academic Publishers,
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers and VSP.

<http://www.brill.nl>

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Brill Academic Publishers provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers MA 01923, USA.

Fees are subject to change.

Printed and bound in The Netherlands.

Dedicated to my parents, Presca and Reynaldo Santos

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xi
ABSTRACT.....	xiii
LIST OF TABLES.....	xv
LIST OF ACRONYMS	xvii
PROLOGUE	xix
CHAPTER 1.	
INTRODUCTION AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK.....	1
1. Statement of the Research Problem.....	1
2. The Linkages between Human Rights and Migration	1
3. Migrant Domestic Workers: Most Exploited, Least Protected	4
4. In Search of an Effective Regime for the Protection of the Rights of Migrant Domestic Workers	6
5. Reasons for the Comparative Dimension of the Study	8
6. Research Questions.....	9
7. Expected Findings	10
8. Brief Review of Literature.....	10
9. The Significance of the Dissertation and its Original Contribution to Legal Scholarship and Public Policy	16
10. Data, Sources and Research Methodology	18
11. Terminology	18
12. The Outline of the Dissertation.....	19
13. The Context	21
13.1. Historical Overview of Philippine Migration	22
13.2. Labour Export Policy.....	23
13.3. Factors Contributing to Philippine Labour Migration	26
13.4. Shortcomings of Philippine State Protection	27
13.5. Recent Trends in Philippine Labour Emigration	30
14. The General Benefits of the Dissertation.....	31
CHAPTER 2.	
THE THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS RELATING TO THE SITUATION OF FILIPINA MDWS.....	33
1. A Survey of Alternative Approaches to International and Domestic Law	33
1.1. Critical Legal Theory.....	33
1.2. Critical Race Theory.....	35
1.3. Feminist Legal Theory.....	38
1.4. Intersectionality Theories	40
1.5. Dependency Theory.....	42
1.6. Postcolonial Theory.....	44

CONTENTS

2. The Third World Approaches to International Law (TWAIL) School as the Most Promising Explanatory Resource	46
2.1. What is ‘Third World Approaches to International Law’ (TWAIL)?.....	46
2.2. Why Use TWAIL in this Dissertation?.....	55
CHAPTER 3.	
INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS NORMS AND MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORKERS	57
1. Rationale for the Chapter.....	57
2. International Migration in Context: Human Rights Wronged?.....	58
3. Brief History and Nature of the International Human Rights Regime.....	60
4. Migrant Workers in International Human Rights Law	64
4.1. Beginnings: The International Labor Organization	64
4.2. The Migrant Workers’ Convention: A Long and Difficult Road	65
4.3. Migrant Workers and Regional Human Rights Protection	70
5. Migrant Domestic Workers: Excluded from the International Human Rights Regime?.....	71
5.1. Modes of Exclusion.....	71
5.2. The United Nations Special Rapporteur on Migrant Workers’ Rights.....	71
5.3. Other United Nations and Intergovernmental Organizations	73
6. Country Case Study: Canada.....	74
7. Filipina Migrant Domestic Workers and Human Rights: An Illusion?	78
CHAPTER 4.	
“GOOD ENOUGH TO WORK, GOOD ENOUGH TO STAY”?	
CANADA’S LIVE-IN CAREGIVER PROGRAM AND ITS QUESTIONABLE FEATURES.....	81
1. Canada and Migration: A Brief Overview.....	81
2. The Live-in Caregiver Program (LCP).....	82
3. Filipinas in the LCP: Diasporic Trends or Institutional Racialization?	85
4. Working Towards a Common Good: A Closer Look at Some NGOs in Toronto Assisting MDWs.....	87
5. The LCP and Administrative Discretion.....	91
5.1. Charter Guarantees in General.....	92
5.2. Charter Guarantees as Applied to the LCP	94
5.3. Conflicting Applications of LCP Policy	95
5.4. Three Cases: Melca, Leticia and Marisa.....	96
5.5. Some Proposed Alternatives.....	99
6. The LCP and Human Rights	100
6.1. Violations of the Equality and Non-Discrimination Principles	101
6.2. A ‘Dehumanizing’ Program?.....	103
6.3. Labor Rights and Migrant Domestic Workers in Canada.....	104

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 5.

SOME ARE LESS EQUAL THAN OTHERS: THE SOCIO-LEGAL STATUS OF FILIPINA

MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORKERS IN HONG KONG	111
1. The Context of Migration to Hong Kong	111
2. Exodus of Filipina MDWs to Hong Kong and the General Attitude Towards Them	115
3. Hong Kong and Its Compliance with International Human Rights Standards ..	117
4. The Human Rights Implications of Hong Kong's Policy on Migrant Domestic Workers.....	121
5. The Legal Rights of Migrant Domestic Workers in Hong Kong.....	124
5.1. The Employment Ordinance.....	124
5.2. "New Conditions of Stay"	125
5.3. Two-week Rule	125
5.4. Non-eligibility for Permanent Residence	126
6. Types of Abuses and Ineffective Remedies.....	128
7. Other Types of Human Rights Violations and NGO Assistance	129

CHAPTER 6.

A COMPARATIVE SURVEY OF THE SITUATION OF FILIPINA MIGRANT DOMESTIC

WORKERS IN CANADA AND HONG KONG.....	135
1. Overview / Introduction.....	135
2. Some Common Issues Facing Filipina Migrant Domestic Workers in Canada and in Hong Kong.....	138
2.1. The Commodification and Devaluation of Domestic Work	138
2.2. Gender Equality and the Displacement of Misery to Third World (especially Filipina) Women.....	140
2.3. Citizenship Rights and Temporary Status	141
2.4. Racialization	145
2.5. Live-in Situation.....	148
2.6. Inadequacy of Remedies.....	151
2.7. Family Separation and Reunification	153
2.8. Equality and Labor Rights	154
2.9. Matters of Agency	155
2.10. Organizational Advocacy	156
2.11. Governmental Regulation.....	157
2.12. Implications of Globalization	158
3. Conclusion.....	160

CHAPTER 7.

EXPLAINING THE INTERNATIONAL AND DOMESTIC ILL-TREATMENT OF FILIPINA

MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORKERS: A TWAIL ANALYSIS.....	163
1. What is the TWAIL Human Rights Optic?.....	163
2. Application of the TWAIL Human Rights Optic to the Situation of Filipina Migrant Domestic Workers in Canada and Hong Kong.....	165

CONTENTS

2.1. Colonial History and Status	166
2.2. Sovereignty Question	169
2.3. Multidimensional Injustice	171
2.4. Remedial Measures.....	172
2.5. Summary of Arguments.....	173
3. The Contributions of the Dissertation to Existing Scholarship.....	174
3.1. Contributions to the TWAIL Scholarship.....	174
3.2. Contributions to the Other Critical Theories	175
CHAPTER 8.	
THE HUMAN RIGHTS OF MIGRANT DOMESTIC WORKERS: <i>QUO VADIS?</i>	177
1. Summary.....	177
2. The Limitations of the Dissertation	181
3. Conclusions and Recommendations	181
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	191
INDEX.....	213
ANNEXES	223