

STATE FAILURE, SOVEREIGNTY AND EFFECTIVENESS

Developments in International Law

VOLUME 50

State Failure, Sovereignty and Effectiveness

Legal Lessons from the Decolonization
of Sub-Saharan Africa

by

GERARD KREIJEN

with a Foreword by

SIR ROBERT Y. JENNINGS, CBE, QC

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN / BOSTON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

The publication of this book was greatly facilitated by the financial assistance of *Loyens & Loeff* attorneys, tax lawyers, and civil law notaries and by the E.M. Meijers Institute of Legal Studies of the Leiden Law Faculty.

Layout and camera-ready copy:
Anne-Marie Krens – Oegstgeest – The Netherlands

Editor: Kate Elliott – Rooksbridge. Somerset - United Kingdom

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN 90 04 13965 6
© 2004 *Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands*

Brill Academic Publishers incorporates the imprint Martinus Nijhoff Publishers
<http://www.brill.nl>

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Brill Academic Publishers provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

Printed and bound in The Netherlands

To the three Js

CONTENTS

FOREWORD by Sir Robert Jennings	vii
1 INTRODUCTION	1
2 ON THE STATE AND STATE FAILURE	7
1. Introduction	7
2. The State in International law	8
2.1. Introduction	8
2.2. The State within the International Legal Order	8
2.3. Statehood and Legal Personality	11
2.4. Recognition	13
2.4.1. The Declaratory and Constitutive Schools of Recognition	15
2.5. The Criteria for Statehood	18
2.5.1. The Classical Criteria	18
(i) Permanent Population	19
(ii) Defined Territory	19
(iii) Government	20
(iv) The Capacity to Enter into Relations: Independence	21
2.5.2. Additional Criteria	23
2.6. The Principle of Effectiveness: Some Preliminary Comments	25
2.7. Sovereignty	26
2.7.1. A Brief Etymology	27
2.7.2. Some Basic Features of the Modern Concept	28
2.7.3. A Multi-faceted Concept: Relevant Facets	29
2.7.4. The Watershed between Traditional and Modern Doctrine	33
2.8. Application of the Criteria for Statehood: Questions of Continuity and Extinction	34
3. The Sociological and the Normative Conception of the State	38
3.1. Introduction	38
3.2. The Unity between Reality and Ideas	42
3.3. The Sociological Conception of the State	44
3.4. The Normative Conception of the State	46
3.5. The Empirical and the Juridical in Statehood	49
3.6. Legal-Formalism	53
3.7. Kelsen's Legal-Formalism	55
3.8. State Failure as a Test for the Authenticity of Values	57
4. State Failure	64
4.1. Introduction	64
4.2. Somalia	66

4.3. The Democratic Republic of the Congo	73
4.4. Liberia	78
4.5. Sierra Leone	81
4.6. On the Main Features of State Failure	86
4.6.1. On the Internal Features of State Failure	86
4.6.2. On the External Features of State Failure	88
4.6.3. Reduced Capacity: Additional Observations	90
4.7. The Essence of State Failure	91
4.7.1. The Failed State from the Perspective of the 'Is' and the 'Ought'	92
4.7.2. The Centre Cannot Hold	92
4.7.3. Cases not to be Considered as Genuine Cases of State Failure	93
4.7.4. The Essence of State Failure: A Lack of Capacity or Power	96
4.8. Adding Some Perspective	98
 3 AFRICAN INDEPENDENCE AND THE TRANSFORMATION OF SOVEREIGNTY	 101
1. Introduction	101
2. Positive and Negative Sovereignty	103
3. The Decline of Colonialism and the Expansion of International Society	111
3.1. Colonialism as a Feature of the pre-Second World War Order	111
3.2. The Outlawing of Colonialism	115
3.2.1. Colonialism Discredited	116
3.2.2. Evolutionary Decolonization in Response	121
3.3. Colonialism Abolished	123
3.3.1. The Political Storm in the UN	123
3.3.2. The Right to Self-Determination of Colonial Peoples	127
3.4. Precipitate Decolonization	134
4. The New Game of Negative Sovereignty	141
4.1. The Re-coining of Statehood	142
4.1.1. The Relaxing of the Traditional Criteria	142
4.1.2. Casual Recognition (at Entry)	143
4.1.3. The Abandonment of Effectiveness	147
4.1.4. The Re-coined State	148
4.2. Juridical Statehood	148
4.2.1. But is Juridical or Weak Statehood Really New?	152
4.3. Some Particularities of the New Game	154
4.3.1. A Title to Development	154
4.3.2. A Particularly Negative Game	157
4.3.3. Fail-safe Recognition (at Exit)	159
4.3.4. Putting the Horse behind the Cart	162
5. Juridical Statehood outside the Colonial Context: Why Africa is not 'Just Different'	163
6. Final Observations	167

4	THE ABANDONMENT OF EFFECTIVENESS	171
1.	Introduction	171
2.	The Swing of the Pendulum	172
3.	Dissolving the Unity between Reality and Ideas	178
3.1.	Introduction	178
3.2.	Effectiveness in International Law: General Discussion	179
3.2.1.	The <i>Unstaatlichkeit</i> of the International Legal Order and the <i>besondere Wirklichkeitsnähe</i> of International Law	179
3.2.2.	The Duality of Effectiveness	189
3.2.3.	Effectiveness and Power	192
3.2.4.	Effectiveness and Recognition	201
3.2.5.	Effectiveness and Responsibility	203
4.	Effectiveness and the Unity between Reality and Ideas	207
4.1.	The Inevitable Relationship between the 'Is' and the 'Ought'	207
4.2.	The Relationship between the 'Is' and the 'Ought' as an Expression of the Unity between Reality and Ideas	209
4.3.	Effectiveness: The Unifying Factor	210
4.4.	Unexpected Support: Kelsen's Normative Theory	211
4.4.1.	Kelsen and the Principle of Effectiveness	212
4.4.2.	'The World of the "Ought" Remains a Mystery'	222
4.4.3.	National Courts and Revolutionary Change of the Basic Norm	225
5.	Statehood, State Failure, and the Abandonment of Effectiveness	230
5.1.	Introduction	230
5.2.	Level One: The State as an Expression of Positive International Law	232
5.3.	Level Two: The State as the Enforcer of International Law	233
5.4.	Linking Levels One and Two	236
5	SOME ILLUSTRATIONS OF THE CONSEQUENCES OF INHERENT WEAKNESS	237
1.	Introduction	237
2.	How Weak States Fail	238
2.1.	Compensating for a Lack of Substance by Stressing Form	238
2.2.	Sørensen's Insecurity Containers	242
2.2.1.	Introduction	243
2.2.2.	The Interplay between the Internal and the External	244
2.2.3.	The Herz-Hobbesian Security Dilemma	247
2.3.	From Weak Statehood to State Failure	252
2.4.	The Failure to Respond	258
3.	The Evasion of the Normative Character of International Law	262
3.1.	State Failure as a Threat to International Constitutionalism	263
3.2.	The Erosion of Accountability	266
3.2.1.	The Setting	267
3.2.2.	The Central Argument	269

3.2.3. The Irresponsibility of the Failed State	270
(i) The Draft Articles on State Responsibility: Some General Remarks	271
(ii) The Problem of Attribution	273
(iii) Material Impossibility	282
3.3. The Cascading of Responsibility	289
4. Some Additional Observations	291
 6 A LITTLE ORDER	 295
1. Introduction	295
2. Restoring the Unity between Reality and Ideas	296
2.1. A Brief Note of Pessimism	296
2.2. Outlining the Foundations	297
2.3. Some Non-viable Options	301
2.3.1. Humanitarian Intervention	301
2.3.2. Allowing Secession	302
2.3.3. Giving War a Chance	304
3. Reviving the UN Trusteeship System for Failed States	308
3.1. Trust: Some General Observations	308
3.2. International Trusteeship	310
3.2.1. The Mandates System of the League of Nations	311
3.2.2. The International Trusteeship System of the UN	312
3.2.3. International Territorial Administration	318
3.3. Some Tentative Considerations on a UN Trusteeship for Failed States	322
3.3.1. Why a UN Trusteeship May Work	323
3.3.2. Why a UN Trusteeship May Not Work	324
3.3.3. The Main Legal Obstacles and the Requirement of Consent	326
4. Withdrawal of Recognition	329
4.1. Introduction	329
4.2. The Case of Somalia	331
4.3. The Absence of Government	334
4.4. Withdrawal of Recognition in International Law	338
4.4.1. Withdrawal of Recognition: General Considerations	339
4.4.2. An Inquiry into Legal Doctrine	340
4.4.3. Withdrawal of Recognition: Additional Considerations	349
(i) Effect and Nature of the Act of Withdrawal	349
(ii) Individual or Collective Withdrawal of Recognition?	352
4.5. Withdrawing Recognition from Somalia: A Hypothetical Case	353
4.5.1. The Somali Paradox	353
4.5.2. The Advantages and Disadvantages of Withdrawal: Some Tentative Considerations	356
4.5.3. Putting Things into Perspective	360
5. Self-Determination: The Final Hurdle	363

7	CONCLUSIONS	367
1.	The Decolonization of Sub-Saharan Africa	367
2.	Recognition	368
3.	Sovereignty	369
4.	Effectiveness	371
5.	State Failure	374
5.1.	How It Came About	374
5.2.	What It Essentially Is	375
5.3.	What Can Be Done About It?	376
6.	The General Perspective: Why Hobbes was Right	377
	INDEX	385

His face is turned towards the past. Where we perceive a chain of events, he sees one single catastrophe which keeps piling wreckage upon wreckage and hurls it in front of his feet. The angel would like to stay, awaken the dead, and make whole what has been smashed. But a storm is blowing from Paradise; it has got caught in his wings with such violence that the angel can no longer close them. The storm irresistibly propels him into the future to which his back is turned, while the pile of debris before him grows skyward. This storm is what we call progress.

W. Benjamin, *Illuminations* (1973)

All men dream: but not equally. Those who dream by night in the dusty recesses of their minds wake in the day to find that it was vanity: but the dreamers of the day are dangerous men, for they may act their dreams with open eyes, to make it possible.

T.E. Lawrence, *Seven Pillars of Wisdom* (1926)

We cannot strengthen international law by ignoring the realities that determine the operation of power.

Ch. de Visscher, *Theory and Reality in Public International Law* (1968)