

STATE LAW AS ISLAMIC LAW IN MODERN EGYPT

STUDIES IN ISLAMIC LAW AND SOCIETY

EDITED BY

RUUD PETERS AND BERNARD WEISS

VOLUME 19



STATE LAW AS ISLAMIC LAW IN MODERN EGYPT

The Incorporation of the *Sharīʿa*
into Egyptian Constitutional Law

BY

CLARK B. LOMBARDI



BRILL
LEIDEN · BOSTON
2006

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A C.I.P. record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISSN 1384-1130
ISBN-13: 978-90-04-13594-9
ISBN-10: 90-04-13594-4

© Copyright 2006 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands
Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill Academic Publishers,
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers and VSP.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Brill provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910 Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

PRINTED IN THE NETHERLANDS

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	ix
Transliteration	xi
Introduction	1

PART I

CLASSICAL ISLAMIC LEGAL THEORY AND THE RISE OF COMPETING MODERNIST LEGAL THEORIES

Chapter One: The Formation of the Classical Sunnī Legal Tradition	11
I. The concept of the <i>sharīʿa</i>	12
II. The development of institutions that shaped interpretation of the <i>sharīʿa</i> : the <i>madhhabs</i>	13
III. The development of competing “orthodox” interpretations of the <i>sharīʿa</i>	17
IV. Imposing one interpretation of the <i>sharīʿa</i> in an “Islamic” state	18
Chapter Two: Developing <i>Fiqh</i> : Classical Sunnī Methods of Interpreting the <i>Sharīʿa</i>	20
I. Classical Sunnī assumptions about authority and epistemology	20
II. Using <i>ijtihād</i> to interpret the <i>sharīʿa</i>	21
III. Using <i>taqlīd</i> to interpret the <i>sharīʿa</i>	41
IV. Recapitulation: Classical methods of interpreting the <i>sharīʿa</i>	45
Chapter Three: When Was a Ruler’s Law Legitimate?: The Classical Theory of <i>Siyāsa Sharʿiyya</i>	47
I. The theory of <i>siyāsa sharʿiyya</i>	49
II. <i>Siyāsa sharʿiyya</i> in the Ottoman empire	54

Chapter Four: Political, Social, and Intellectual	
Developments in Nineteenth-Century Egypt	59
I. Social and political developments in nineteenth-century Egypt	60
II. The secularization of Egyptian state law	69
III. The emergence of Islamic modernism in Egypt	73
Chapter Five: Modernist Egyptian Legal Theories and	
Modernist Approaches to Drafting Islamic Legislation	78
I. “Neo-traditional” theories of Islamic law	80
II. Modernist theories calling for Muslims to interpret the <i>sharīʿa</i> and develop state law through utilitarian neo- <i>ijtihād</i>	83
III. Modernist theories calling for Muslims to interpret the <i>sharīʿa</i> and develop state law through comparative neo- <i>taqlīd</i>	92
IV. Conclusion: Competing methods of Islamic legal interpretation and of drafting Islamic codes	99
Chapter Six: Political Islamism in Twentieth-Century Egypt and the Competing Modernist Theories of Islamic Law	101
I. Islamist factions during Egypt’s Liberal Period, 1922–1952	101
II. Islamist factions under Nāṣir, 1952–1970	110
III. The fractured state of Islamism at the dawn of the Article 2 era	116
IV. Conclusion	118

PART II

ARTICLE 2 OF THE EGYPTIAN CONSTITUTION

Chapter Seven: Article 2 and the Attempt at	
Executive-Sponsored Islamization, 1970–1985	123
I. The adoption of Article 2 in 1971	124
II. The spread of Islamism after the adoption of Article 2	126
III. Sādāt’s Islamization policy and the amendment of Article 2 in 1980	129

IV. The political branches' retreat from their policy of top-down Islamization, 1980–1985	135
V. Article 2 litigation and the evolving judicial role in shaping Islamization	139
Chapter Eight: The Interpreters of Article 2: The Egyptian Courts and the SCC	141
I. The structure of the Egyptian court system and the role of the SCC	143
II. Constitutional review in the Egyptian legal system	143
III. Institutional and ideological concerns of the SCC	147
IV. Conclusion	158
Chapter Nine: Debates About the SCC's Jurisdiction over Article 2 Cases	159
I. Why might Article 2 cases be non-justiciable?	159
II. The SCC's 1985 Article 2 opinions	163
III. The ramifications of the doctrine of Article 2's non-retroactivity	172
Chapter Ten: The SCC's Substantive Article 2 Jurisprudence: An Overview	174
I. The earliest substantive Article 2 opinions	175
II. Later Article 2 opinions: articulating a theory of Islamic law and legal interpretation	178
III. Conclusion	199
Chapter Eleven: The SCC's Article 2 Jurisprudence as Applied: Case Studies	201
I. Five Article 2 cases	202
II. Non-Article 2 cases that required the Court to consider the principles of the <i>sharī'a</i>	253
III. Conclusion: The SCC's application of its theory of Islamic legal interpretation	256
Chapter Twelve: The Reception of the SCC's Article 2 Jurisprudence	259
I. Ambiguity in the SCC's theory of Islamic law and Islamic legal interpretation	259

II. The reaction of the Egyptian judiciary to the SCC's Article 2 jurisprudence	262
III. Academic reactions to the SCC's Article 2 jurisprudence	264
IV. Conclusion: The reception of the SCC's Article 2 jurisprudence	268
Conclusion	270
Bibliography	275
Index of Names	291
Index of Subjects	293