

Statehood and the Law of Self-Determination

Developments in International Law

VOLUME 43

Statehood and the Law of Self-Determination

David Raič



Kluwer Law International
The Hague / London / New York

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 90-411-1890-X(HB)

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America
by Kluwer Law International,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.
kluwerlaw@wkap.com

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 2002 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programme of
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed in the Netherlands

Table of Contents

Table of Abbreviations	xiii
Acknowledgements	xix

INTRODUCTION	1
--------------	---

PART I: STATEHOOD

CHAPTER 1 THE CONCEPTS OF 'SUBJECT OF LAW' AND 'PERSONALITY' IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

§ 1. Introduction	9
§ 2. The meaning of 'subject of international law' and 'international personality'	10
§ 3. Conclusion	18

CHAPTER 2 THE STATE AS AN INTERNATIONAL LEGAL PERSON

§ 1. Introduction	19
§ 2. The notion of the State	20
§ 2.1. The State as a political and social organization	
§ 2.2. The State as a legal concept under international law: legal personality, attributes and legal criteria for statehood	21
§ 2.3. Sovereignty	25
§ 3. Recognition of States and the acquisition of international personality	28
§ 3.1. The constitutive theory	29
§ 3.2. The declaratory theory	32
§ 4. The theories on recognition revisited	33
§ 4.1. Evaluation of the constitutive theory	33

§ 4.2. Evaluation of the declaratory theory	38
§ 5. Collective, implied, constitutive and obligatory recognition of statehood and admission to membership in the United Nations	39
§ 6. Conclusions	48

CHAPTER 3 THE TRADITIONAL CRITERIA FOR STATEHOOD AND THE CONCEPT OF EFFECTIVENESS

§ 1. Introduction	49
§ 2. Statehood and the notion of effectiveness in international law	50
§ 2.1. <i>Raison d'être</i> and function of effectiveness	50
§ 2.1.1. Absence of a central organ with general powers of attribution and enforcement of rights and obligations	50
§ 2.1.2. Legal order	52
§ 2.1.3. Legal security	53
§ 2.2. Legal effects of effectiveness	53
§ 2.3. The meaning of effectiveness in the context of the formation of States	57
§ 3. The traditional criteria for statehood	58
§ 3.1. Permanent population	58
§ 3.2. Defined territory	59
§ 3.3. Government	62
§ 3.4. The capacity to enter into relations with other States	73
§ 3.5. Independence	74
§ 3.5.1. Formal independence	76
§ 3.5.2. Actual independence	78
§ 4. Recognition and the traditional criteria for statehood	82
§ 5. Retroactivity of recognition of statehood	83
§ 6. The moment of the commencement of statehood	85
§ 7. Conclusions	86

CHAPTER 4 THE OBLIGATION OF NON-RECOGNITION AND ADDITIONAL CRITERIA FOR STATEHOOD BASED ON LEGALITY

§ 1. Introduction	89
§ 2. The prohibition of premature recognition	92
§ 2.1. No recognition without 'permissive' recognition?	93

§ 2.2.	Non-fulfilment of the traditional criteria for statehood and recognition	95
§ 2.2.1.	Colonialism and state formation through national liberation wars: the requirement of effective government and the operation of the right of self-determination	95
	(a) Algeria	96
	(b) Guinea Bissau	98
	(c) Angola	99
	(d) The Congo	100
§ 2.2.2.	The formation of States and ineffective government in the post-colonial era	101
§ 2.3.	Observations	101
§ 3.	The meaning of the doctrine of obligatory non-recognition	105
§ 4.	The origin and development of the doctrine of obligatory non-recognition in practice	113
§ 5.	State practice in the field of non-recognition of claims to statehood	116
§ 5.1.	The era of the League of Nations	116
§ 5.2.	The era of the United Nations	122
§ 5.2.1.	Violation of the prohibition of the use of force, in particular the prohibition of aggression	122
§ 5.2.2.	Violation of the right of peoples to self-determination	128
	(a) The case of Southern Rhodesia	128
	(b) The South African Homeland territories	134
§ 5.2.3.	Violation of the prohibition of systematic racial discrimination including the prohibition of <i>Apartheid</i>	140
§ 6.	The character of the legal norms involved	141
§ 7.	The legal basis of the obligation of non-recognition	150
§ 8.	Modern criteria for statehood based on legality	151
§ 9.	Limits to the obligation of non-recognition	158
§ 10.	Non-recognition and the European Community Declaration on the Guidelines on the Recognition of New States in Eastern Europe and in the Soviet Union	165
§ 11.	Conclusions and observations	167

PART II: SELF-DETERMINATION

CHAPTER 5 THE EMERGENCE AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE PRINCIPLE OF SELF-DETERMINATION: FROM THE AMERICAN AND FRENCH REVOLUTIONS TO THE ERA OF DECOLONIZATION

§ 1. Introduction	171
§ 2. Political and philosophical foundations	172
§ 2.1. The American and French Revolutions: democratic political theory	172
§ 2.2. Nationalism	176
§ 3. From a political principle to a legal right	177
§ 3.1. Woodrow Wilson and 'Wilsonian self-determination'	177
§ 3.2. Vladimir Ilyich Lenin and self-determination	184
§ 3.3. Self-determination in the aftermath of World War I	188
§ 3.3.1. Versailles	188
§ 3.3.2. The League of Nations	193
§ 3.3.3. National self-determination as a gift	196
§ 3.4. The United Nations and decolonization	199
§ 3.4.1. The liberation of colonial peoples and territories: towards a right of self-determination	199
§ 3.4.2. The subject of the right of self-determination and the principle of territorial integrity	206
§ 3.4.3. Implementation and legal status of self-determination	210
§ 3.4.4. Decolonization and statehood	219
§ 4. Reflections and conclusions: <i>raison d'être</i> and core meaning of political self-determination	220

CHAPTER 6 THE POST-COLONIAL ERA: INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL SELF-DETERMINATION

§ 1. Introduction	226
§ 2. Self-determination beyond decolonization	227
§ 2.1. The continuing character of self-determination and its internal dimension	228
§ 2.2. The meaning of internal self-determination and its surplus value	237
§ 3. The subject of internal self-determination	242

§ 3.1. The territorial definition: the entire population of existing States	244
§ 3.2. The 'ethnic' definition: subgroups within existing States	247
§ 3.3. Minorities	265
§ 4. Internal self-determination as a right under international law	272
§ 5. The right of external self-determination: meaning and exercise	289
§ 6. The principles of territorial integrity and <i>uti possidetis</i>	293
§ 7. Conclusions and observations	305

CHAPTER 7 SECESSION

§ 1. Introduction	308
§ 2. Theoretical approaches to a right of secession	309
§ 3. Acknowledgment of a right of secession	313
§ 3.1. Recognition of a right of secession under national law or approval by the central government	313
§ 3.2. International instruments, doctrine and judicial decisions	316
§ 3.2.1. International instruments	316
§ 3.2.2. Doctrine	324
§ 3.2.3. Judicial decisions and opinions	328
§ 3.2.4. Observations	332
§ 3.3. Successful secessions and international practice	332
§ 3.3.1. Bangladesh	335
§ 3.3.2. Croatia	342
(a) History	342
(b) Secession and/or dissolution of the SFRY?	356
(c) Entitlement to unilateral secession?	361
§ 3.3.3. Acknowledgement of the existence of a qualified right of unilateral secession under international law	362
§ 4. Cumulative criteria for a right of unilateral secession	366
§ 4.1. Minority-people	366
§ 4.2. Territorial bond	367
§ 4.3. A direct or indirect violation of the right of internal self-determination	367

§ 4.4. Exhaustion of all effective judicial remedies and realistic political arrangements for the purpose of realizing the right of internal self-determination	370
§ 4.4.1. The catalytic agent: widespread and serious violations of individual human rights	372
§ 5. Unsuccessful unilateral secessions: the cases of the Chechen Republic of Ichkeria, the Republic of Abkhazia and the Republic of Serbian Krajina	372
§ 5.1. The Chechen Republic of Ichkeria	373
§ 5.2. The Republic of Abkhazia	379
§ 5.3. The Republic of Serbian Krajina	386
§ 6. Conclusion: the norms of territorial integrity and secession revisited	394

PART III: STATEHOOD AND SELF-DETERMINATION

CHAPTER 8 THE FORMATION OF STATES AND THE OPERATION OF THE LAW OF SELF-DETERMINATION

§ 1. Introduction	401
§ 2. Recognition of statehood despite the existence of an ineffective government: modern state practice and the role of the right of self-determination	402
§ 2.1. The cases of Georgia and Moldova	402
§ 2.1.1. The Republic of Georgia	402
§ 2.1.2. The Republic of Moldova	405
§ 2.2. Observations	406
§ 2.3. External self-determination and the statehood criterion of 'government': juridical and empirical statehood	408
§ 2.4. The special case of the Republic of Bosnia-Herzegovina	414
§ 3. The law of self-determination and the criteria for statehood: the unlawful proclamation of independence	418
§ 3.1. The prohibition of abuse of the right of self-determination: the requirement of fulfilment of the conditions of the qualified right of secession	419
§ 3.2. Respect for the right of internal self-determination of peoples	423

§ 4. The proper subject of the right of unilateral secession as a criterion for statehood	425
§ 5. The formation of States, self-determination and recognition	426
§ 6. Conclusions	437

PRÉCIS

§ 1. The formation of States, traditional criteria for statehood and recognition	439
§ 2. The obligation of non-recognition of statehood: the introduction of the notion of legality in the law of statehood and additional criteria for statehood	441
§ 3. The law of self-determination	443
§ 4. Statehood and self-determination	449
§ 5. The modern law of statehood	451

Bibliography	453
Table and Index of Cases	481
Index	485