

**PROSPECTS FOR CONSTITUTIONALISM IN
POST-COMMUNIST COUNTRIES**

LAW IN EASTERN EUROPE

*A series of publications issued by the
Institute of East European Law and Russian Studies
Leiden University Faculty of Law*

General Editor
W.B. SIMONS

Volume 50

PROSPECTS FOR CONSTITUTIONALISM IN POST-COMMUNIST COUNTRIES

Edited by

Levent Gönenç

Ankara University, Turkey



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

THE HAGUE / LONDON / NEW YORK

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 90-411-1836-5

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America
by Kluwer Law International,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.
kluwerlaw@wkap.com

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 2002 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programme of
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed in the Netherlands.

To my family and my wife...

CONTENTS

List of Tables	xiii
Acknowledgements	xv
Introduction	1
 Chapter 1. Conceptual Framework	
1.1. Introduction	3
A Legal Approach to Constitutions	4
A Political Approach to Constitutions	5
Comparative or Case Studies	7
1.2. Basic Definitions	8
Political System, Regime, Constitution	13
1.3. Constitutional Stability and Change	16
1.4. Conclusions	24
 Chapter 2. Political Culture	
2.1. Introduction	27
The Concept of Culture	27
Criticism of the Civic-Culture Approach	28
The Concept of Political Culture	31
Religion and Economics as the Determinants of Political Culture	33
Liberal Democratic Political Culture	34
2.2. Pre-Communist Political Culture and Constitutionalism	35
Germanic and Slavic Tribal Kingdoms	36
Medieval Constitutionalism in Europe	37
Comparing European Medieval Constitutionalism with Constitutionalism in Russia and the Balkans	41
2.2.1. First Stage of the First Great Transformation of European Political Culture	43
Renaissance and Reformation	44
The Rise of the Nobility in Eastern Europe	45
Autocracy in Muscovite Russia	47
2.2.2. Second Stage of the First Great Transformation of European Political Culture	49
Constitutional Models in the Age of the Enlightenment and Their Application in Eastern Europe and Russia	51
Enlightened Absolutism in Habsburg Lands and Russia	52
The Polish Constitution of 1791	53
The Ages of Napoleon and Conservatism, and Their Impact on Eastern Europe	55

2.2.3. The Age of Nationalism	57
The Revolution of 1830	58
The Revolution of 1848	59
The Romanian Constitution of 1866	61
The Bulgarian Constitution of 1879	63
2.2.4. The Impact of Liberal Constitutionalism in Russia	65
The Russian Constitution of 1906	67
2.2.5. The Second Great Transformation of European Political Culture	72
2.2.6. Liberal Democratic Constitutionalism in the Inter-War Years	72
2.2.7. Conclusions	77
2.3. Communist Political Culture and Constitutionalism	78
Communist Rejection of the Principle of Separation of Powers	83
Communist Rejection of the Principle of the Rule of Law	84
2.4. Post-Communist Political Culture and Constitutionalism	87
Popular Support for Democratic Norms and Principles and Conditions of Constitutional Changes within Regimes	88
Post-Communist Political Culture and Post-Communist Constitutions ..	97
2.5. Conclusions	101

Chapter 3. Constitution-Making

3.1. Introduction	103
Constitution-Making	103
3.2. Transition to Democracy	105
Revolution or Transition to Democracy	105
Modes of Transition	107
3.3. Constitution-Making	111
Elite Characteristics of Constitution-Making	111
Constituent or National Assemblies	113
Election of Constitution-Makers	113
Constitution-Making Style	115
Ratification of Constitutions	118
Timing of Constitution-Making	120
3.4. Transition to Democracy and Constitution-Making in Eastern Europe	122
3.4.1. Poland	125
The RTT and the Parliamentary Elections of 1989	128
The Parliamentary Elections of 1991 and the Adoption of the “Little Constitution” of 1992	129
The Parliamentary Elections of 1993	131
The Adoption of the Constitution of 1997	132
3.4.2. Hungary	134
The Resurgence of Civil Society	134
The RTT and the “September Pact”	135
The Parliamentary Elections of 1990 and 1994	136
3.4.3. Czechoslovakia	138
The Collapse of Communist Regime	138

The RTT and the Parliamentary Elections of 1990	139
The Parliamentary Elections of 1992 and the Break-up of the Federation	141
3.4.4. Bulgaria	143
Transition through Reform	143
The RTT	144
The 1990 Elections to the Constituent Assembly	144
3.4.5. Romania	146
The Collapse of Communist Regime in Romania	147
The Parliamentary Election of 1990	148
The Adoption of the Constitution of 1991	149
3.4.6. Albania	150
The End of Communist Rule	150
The Parliamentary Elections of 1991 and the Adoption of a Provisional Constitution	151
The Referendum of 1994	152
3.5. Conclusions	153
3.6. Transition to Democracy and Constitution-Making in the Former USSR ...	155
3.6.1. USSR	157
3.6.2. The Russian Federation	159
3.6.3. Baltic Republics	164
Estonia	165
Lithuania	169
Latvia	171
3.6.4. Ukraine	173
3.6.5. Transcaucasia	178
Armenia	178
Azerbaijan	182
Georgia	185
3.6.6. Moldova	187
3.6.7. Belarus	190
3.6.8. Central Asia	192
Kazakhstan	193
Kyrgyzstan	198
Tajikistan	202
Turkmenistan	205
Uzbekistan	206
3.7. Conclusions	207

Chapter 4. Effectiveness

4.1. Introduction	209
4.2. Definition of Effectiveness	210
Functions of Constitutions	211
4.3. Rights and Liberties in Post-Communist Constitutions	215
Rights, Human Rights, Legal Rights and Constitutional Rights	216

Liberal and Socialist Conceptions of Human Rights	218
4.3.1. Civil Liberties	222
An Example: The Right to Life	223
Other Civil Liberties in Post-Communist Constitutions	227
4.3.2. Political Rights	233
An Example: Freedom of Expression and Right to Information	234
Other Political Rights in Post-Communist Constitutions	242
4.3.3. Conclusions	244
4.3.4. Social and Economic Rights	245
4.3.5. Protection of Rights and Liberties at the National Level	248
Constitutional Review	250
Structure and Authority of Constitutional Courts	252
Constitutional Courts and Other State Agencies	254
Ombudsman	259
4.3.6. The Gap Between the Constitution on Paper and Reality	261
4.3.7. International Mechanisms to Protect Individual Liberties	264
4.3.8. Constitutional Conditions of Effective Demo-Protection	267
4.4. Executive-Legislative Relations in Post-Communist Constitutions	269
From Communist Constitutional Systems to Post-Communist Constitutional Systems	269
Defining the Types of Liberal Democratic Constitutional Systems	270
Defining Constitutional Powers of Presidents	276
4.4.1. Post-Communist Pure Presidential Systems:	
Azerbaijan, Georgia, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan	280
Popular Election of the President	281
Fixed Terms for Both the President and the Assembly	282
The Accountability of the Cabinet to the President	284
Legislative, Appointive and Emergency Powers of Presidents	287
4.4.2. Post-Communist President-Parliamentary Systems:	
Armenia, Belarus, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Russia, Turkmenistan and Ukraine	291
The Popular Election of the President	293
Fixed Term for the President, No Fixed Term for the Assembly	294
Accountability of the Cabinet Both to the President and the Assembly	297
Legislative, Appointive and Emergency Powers of Presidents	300
4.4.3. Assessing the Presidential System	305
4.4.4. Post-Communist Premier-Presidential (Semi-Presidential) Systems:	
Poland, Romania, Lithuania and Moldova	308
Popular Election of the President	309
Fixed Term for the President, No Fixed Term for the Assembly	310
Cabinet's Accountability to the Assembly	312
Legislative, Appointive and Emergency Powers of Presidents	314
4.4.5. Assessing the Semi-Presidential System	316

4.4.6. Post-Communist Parliamentary Systems:
 Albania, Czech Republic, Estonia, Latvia and Hungary 318
 The Head of State (President) and the Chief Executive
 (Prime Minister) are Elected by the Assembly 318
 The Cabinet Is Accountable to the Assembly 321
 Fixed Term for the President, No Fixed Term for the Cabinet and the
 Assembly 321
 Legislative, Appointive and Emergency Powers of Presidents 324
 4.4.7. Post-Communist Parliamentary “with” President Systems:
 Bulgaria and Slovakia 327
 4.4.8. Assessing the Parliamentary System 329
 4.4.9. Republic or Monarchy 331
 4.4.10. Constitutional Conditions of Effective Demo-Power 333
 4.5. Legislature 340
 4.6. The Referendum 347
 4.7. Functions of Constitutions in Multi-National Political Systems 353
 Legal Solutions to Ethno-National Problems 355
 Political Solutions to Ethno-National Problems 357
 Federalism in Russia 358
 4.8. Conclusions 363

Chapter 5. Constitutional Change and Consolidation of Democracy

5.1. Causes of Constitutional Change 365
 Forms of Constitutional Change 370
 Processes of Constitutional Change 371
 Actors of Constitutional Change 374
 5.2. Constitutional Change and Consolidation of Democracy 377
 Defining Consolidation of Democracy 377
 Conclusions 380

Bibliography 383

Index 419

About the Author 437