

THE LAW OF ARMS CONTROL

Developments in International Law

VOLUME 41

GUIDO DEN DEKKER

THE LAW OF ARMS CONTROL

International Supervision and Enforcement



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

THE HAGUE / BOSTON / LONDON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 90-411-1624-9

Published by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America
by Kluwer Law International,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.
kluwerlaw@wkap.com

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 2001 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands.

Table of contents

Preface	v
Table of contents	vii
List of abbreviations	xvi

Chapter 1 - General introduction to the study

1. INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY AND PROBLEMS ADDRESSED	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Main questions and purposes of the study	2
2. OVERVIEW OF CONTENTS	4
3. METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH	5
4. HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN ARMS CONTROL PRIOR TO THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE UN	
4.1 Introduction	6
4.2 Arms control agreements before WW I	7
4.3 The impact of WW I on arms control	11
4.4 The legality of war and the emergence of substantive arms control law	11

PART I THE LAW OF ARMS CONTROL

Chapter 2 - The place of the law of arms control in the international system

1. Introduction	16
2. ORIGINS OF AND INCENTIVES FOR ARMS CONTROL IN THE INTERNATIONAL SYSTEM	
2.1 The international system and military power	16
2.2 The (political) concept of arms control	21
2.3 The changing scope of 'arms control'	23
3. THE SECURITY CONTEXT OF ARMS CONTROL	
3.1 The interrelationship between national and international security	27
3.2 The interrelationship between arms control and security	29
3.3 The interrelationship between law and politics in the field of arms control	33

4. THE LAW OF ARMS CONTROL: DEFINITION	
4.1 The law of arms control as a special branch of international law	35
4.2 The substantive law of arms control	37
4.3 The institutional law of arms control	39
4.4 The common ultimate objective of the arms control process	40
5. INTERNATIONAL LAW APPLICABLE TO THE BEHAVIOUR OF STATES WITH REGARD TO THEIR NATIONAL ARMAMENTS OUTSIDE THE LAW OF ARMS CONTROL	
5.1 The applicability of rules of international law to the law of arms control	42
5.2 The law of arms control and the laws of war	44

Chapter 3 - Special characteristics of the law of arms control

1. Introduction	49
2. CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SOURCES OF ARMS CONTROL LAW	
2.1 The sources of international law	49
2.2 The importance of treaties in arms control law	50
2.3 Classification of arms control treaty law	51
2.4 Arms control law as part of peace treaties or ceasefire arrangements: dictated arms control law	52
2.5 Arms control treaties voluntarily entered into by the States Parties: consensual arms control law	53
2.5.1 Unilateral arms control measures	54
2.5.2 Bilateral arms control treaties	55
2.5.3 Multilateral arms control treaties	56
2.5.4 Treaties, Acts and Documents accessory to arms control treaties	58
2.5.5 'Politically binding' documents concerned with arms control	60
2.6 Customary international law in the field of arms control	62
2.6.1 Arms control and the nature of customary international law	62
2.6.2 The absence of an established body of 'customary arms control law'	62
2.7. General principles of law relating to arms control	66
2.7.1 Arms control and the nature of general principles of law	66
2.7.2 General principles of arms control law and politics	67
2.8 Subsidiary sources for the determination of arms control law	71
3. CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SCOPE OF SUBSTANTIVE AND INSTITUTIONAL ARMS CONTROL LAW	
3.1 The scope of substantive arms control law	72
3.1.1 Substantive nuclear arms control law	73
3.1.2 Substantive chemical arms control law	76
3.1.3 Substantive biological arms control law	77

3.1.4 Substantive conventional arms control law	77
3.1.5 Substantive arms control law relating to future weapons	79
3.1.6 Substantive arms control law not related to a particular category of weapons	80
3.2 The scope of institutional arms control law	80
4. CHARACTERISTICS OF THE PRACTICE OF ARMS CONTROL LAW	84
5. CONCLUDING REMARKS ON PART I	86

PART II

INTERNATIONAL SUPERVISION OF THE LAW OF ARMS CONTROL: THEORY

Chapter 4 - The international legal framework of supervision in the law of arms control

1. Introduction	88
2. UNILATERAL SUPERVISION, DIPLOMATIC SUPERVISION AND SUPERVISORY MECHANISMS IN ARMS CONTROL LAW	
2.1 The notion of supervision at the international level	89
2.2 Unilateral and diplomatic supervision	89
2.3 The legal basis for the exercise of unilateral and diplomatic supervision	90
2.4 International supervision	92
2.5 The legal basis for the exercise of international supervision	93
2.6 Supervision and types of rules	97
2.7 The <i>rationale</i> of supervision in arms control law	99
3. THE PROCESS OF INTERNATIONAL SUPERVISION	
3.1 Different phases of the process of international supervision	101
3.1.1 Monitoring	102
3.1.2 Verification	104
3.1.3 Dispute settlement	107
3.1.4 Correction/enforcement	110
3.1.5 The interpretative element	112
3.2 Treaty-specific and treaty non-specific arms control supervision	112
4. SUPERVISORY MECHANISMS IN ARMS CONTROL LAW: METHODS OF SUPERVISION	
4.1 The institutional design of methods of supervision	115
4.2 Monitoring methods	117
4.3 Verification methods	122
4.3.1 Methods of stage 1 of the verification process (fact-finding)	122
4.3.2 Methods of stage 2 of the verification process (review)	128

4.3.3 Methods of stage 3 of the verification process (assessment)	129
4.4 Methods of non-judicial dispute settlement	130
4.5 Methods of judicial dispute settlement	134
4.6 Methods of correction/enforcement	135
4.7 Methods of the interpretative element	139
5. SUPERVISORY MECHANISMS IN ARMS CONTROL LAW: SUPERVISING BODIES	
5.1 The ‘institutionalisation’ of supervisory mechanisms through the establishment of international bodies	141
5.2 A note on the powers and composition of supervising organisations	147
5.3 The relationship between the powers of supervising organisations and powers of unilateral supervision	151
5.4 The objects of supervision as exercised by supervising organisations	154
6. SUPERVISION AND COMPLIANCE	
6.1 Potential motives for non-compliance with arms control treaties	157
6.2 A note on the question of effectiveness of supervisory mechanisms	158
7. CONCLUDING REMARKS	161

PART IIA

INTERNATIONAL SUPERVISION OF THE LAW OF ARMS CONTROL: SELECTED TREATIES

Chapter 5 - General features of supervisory mechanisms in multilateral arms control treaties

1. Introduction	162
2. MONITORING	
2.1 Monitoring provisions in global arms control treaties that apply to uninhabited territories	163
2.2 Monitoring provisions in other global arms control treaties	165
2.3 Monitoring provisions in regional arms control treaties	168
2.3.1 Monitoring provisions in Nuclear Weapon Free Zone Treaties	168
2.3.2 Monitoring provisions in the CFE Treaty	170
3. VERIFICATION	
3.1 Verification provisions in global arms control treaties that apply to uninhabited territories	172
3.2 Verification provisions in other global arms control treaties	175
3.3 Verification provisions in Nuclear Weapon Free Zone Treaties	183
3.3.1 Institutional design of the Tlatelolco Treaty	183
3.3.2 Methods of verification in the Tlatelolco Treaty	185
3.3.3 Institutional design of the Rarotonga Treaty	188

3.3.4 Methods of verification in the Rarotonga Treaty	189
3.3.5 Institutional design of the Pelindaba Treaty	192
3.3.6 Methods of verification in the Pelindaba Treaty	193
3.3.7 Institutional design of the Southeast Asia Nuclear Weapon Free Zone Treaty	195
3.3.8 Methods of verification in the Southeast Asia Nuclear Weapon Free Zone Treaty	196
3.4 Verification provisions in the CFE Treaty	199
3.4.1 Institutional design of the CFE Treaty	199
3.4.2 Methods of verification in the CFE Treaty	200
4. DISPUTE SETTLEMENT	
4.1 Dispute settlement provisions in global arms control treaties that apply to uninhabited territories	203
4.2 Dispute settlement provisions in other global arms control treaties	204
4.3 Dispute settlement in regional arms control treaties	206
4.3.1 Dispute settlement provisions in Nuclear Weapon Free Zone Treaties	206
4.3.2 Dispute settlement provisions in the CFE Treaty	208
5. CORRECTION/ENFORCEMENT	
5.1 Provisions on correction/enforcement in global arms control treaties that apply to uninhabited territories	208
5.2 Provisions on correction/enforcement in other global arms control treaties	209
5.3 Provisions on correction/enforcement in regional arms control treaties	210
5.3.1 Provisions on correction/enforcement in Nuclear Weapon Free Zone Treaties	210
5.3.2 provisions on correction/enforcement in the CFE Treaty	212
6. THE INTERPRETATIVE ELEMENT	213
7. CONCLUDING REMARKS ON THE GENERAL FEATURES OF SUPERVISORY MECHANISMS	215
7.1 General features of monitoring provisions in arms control treaties	215
7.2 General features of verification provisions in arms control treaties	216
7.3 General features of dispute settlement provisions in arms control treaties	217
7.4 General features of correction/enforcement in arms control treaties	218

Chapter 6 - General features of supervisory mechanisms in global arms control treaties featuring international organisations: OPCW, IAEA, CTBTO

i. Introduction	219
I. THE CWC AND THE OPCW	

1. A brief note on history	220
1.1 The 1925 Geneva Protocol	220
1.2 Decoupling chemical and biological weapons	222
2. SUBSTANTIVE LAW IN THE CWC	
2.1 Objectives and purposes of the CWC: the CWC preamble	222
2.2 Article I - general obligations	223
2.3 The problem of dual use of chemicals	224
2.4 Schedule 1, 2, 3 chemicals and facilities	226
3. THE SUPERVISORY MECHANISM OF THE CWC: THE SUPERVISING BODY	
3.1 The OPCW	227
3.1.1 The Conference of the States Parties (CSP)	229
3.1.2 The Executive Council (EC)	230
3.1.3 The Technical Secretariat (TS)	232
4. THE SUPERVISORY MECHANISM OF THE CWC: METHODS OF SUPERVISION	
4.1 Monitoring provisions in the CWC	233
4.1.1 Declarations on ownership or possession (Art. III)	234
4.1.2 Plans, Declarations and information relating to destruction	236
4.1.3 Declarations with respect to chemicals and facilities used for activities not prohibited under the Convention (Art. VI)	237
4.1.4 Exchange of information: information to and from the TS	238
4.1.5 Information relating to assistance and protection against chemical weapons	239
4.1.6 Monitoring methods in the context of inspections	240
4.2 Verification provisions in the CWC	240
4.2.1 Stage 1 of the verification process: fact-finding	242
4.2.1.1 Fact-finding with respect to chemical weapons	242
4.2.1.2 Fact-finding with respect to CWPF and other facilities	245
4.2.1.3 Methods of additional fact-finding	253
4.2.1.4 Fact-finding in regard to assistance and protection against chemical weapons	258
4.2.2 Stage 2 of the verification process: review	259
4.2.3 Stage 3 of the verification process: assessment	261
4.3 Provisions on dispute settlement in the CWC	264
4.4 Provisions on correction/enforcement in the CWC	266
4.5 The interpretative element in the CWC	268
II. THE IAEA SAFEGUARDS SYSTEM AND THE NPT	
1. A brief note on history	270
1.1 The failure to outlaw nuclear weapons	270
1.2 Atoms for Peace and beyond	271
2. THE IAEA	
2.1 Objectives and functions	272
2.2 Institutional structure of the IAEA	272

2.2.1 General Conference	273
2.2.2 Board of Governors	273
2.2.3 Secretariat	274
3. SAFEGUARDS AS A SUPERVISORY MECHANISM	
3.1 General aspects of the safeguards system	274
3.2 Monitoring provisions in INFCIRC/153	281
3.2.1 National system of accounting for and control of nuclear material	282
3.2.1.1 Records system	282
3.2.1.2 Provision of information	284
3.2.1.3 Reports system	285
3.3 Verification provisions in INFCIRC/153	286
3.3.1 Stage 1 of the verification process: fact-finding	286
3.3.2 Stages 2 and 3 of the verification process: review and assessment	293
3.4 Provisions on dispute settlement	294
3.5 Provisions on correction/enforcement	295
3.6 The interpretative element	297
4. ENHANCING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE SAFEGUARDS SYSTEM: THE '93+2' PROGRAMME	
4.1 Inducements to strengthen the system	297
4.2 The Model Additional Protocol	300
4.2.1 Objectives of the Model Additional Protocol	301
4.2.2 Monitoring provisions in the Model Additional Protocol	302
4.2.3 Verification provisions in the Model Additional Protocol	303
III. THE CTBT AND THE CTBTO	
1. A brief note on history	306
1.1 The development of nuclear weapons	306
1.2 Test ban and non-proliferation	306
2. THE SCOPE OF THE SUBSTANTIVE LAW IN THE CTBT	308
3. THE SUPERVISORY MECHANISM OF THE CTBT: THE SUPERVISING BODY	
3.1 The CTBTO	310
3.1.1 The Conference of the States Parties (CSP)	311
3.1.2 The Executive Council (EC)	312
3.1.3 The Technical Secretariat (TS)	314
4. THE SUPERVISORY MECHANISM OF THE CTBT: METHODS OF SUPERVISION	316
4.1 Monitoring provisions in the CTBT	317
4.1.1 NTMs	317
4.1.2 International Monitoring System (IMS)	317
4.1.3 The IMS and assessments regarding compliance	320
4.1.4 Confidence-Building Measures	321
4.2 Verification provisions in the CTBT	321
4.2.1 Stage 1 of the verification process: fact-finding	322
4.2.2 Stage 2 of the verification process: review	327

4.2.3 Stage 3 of the verification process: assessment	328
4.3 Provisions on dispute settlement in the CTBT	328
4.4 Provisions on correction/enforcement in the CTBT	329
4.5 The interpretative element in the CTBT	330
ii. CONCLUDING REMARKS	331

PART III

ENFORCEMENT OF THE LAW OF ARMS CONTROL

Chapter 7 - Supervisory mechanisms in arms control treaties and enforcement under general international law

1. Introduction: co-operation and enforcement	333
2. VIOLATIONS OF ARMS CONTROL LAW: NATURE AND SIGNIFICANCE	
2.1 Criteria for categorising violations	334
2.2 The significance of violations of substantive arms control law	335
2.3 The significance of violations of institutional arms control law	338
3. REACTIONS TO VIOLATIONS: THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN REMEDIES IN SUPERVISORY MECHANISMS AND REMEDIES AVAILABLE UNDER GENERAL INTERNATIONAL LAW	
3.1 Introduction: possible concurrence of reactions to violations	340
3.2 Supervisory mechanisms in arms control treaties and reactions to violations pursuant to the law of State responsibility	341
3.2.1 Non-military countermeasures as reactions to violations	341
3.2.2 Restrictions on the employment of countermeasures due to the existence of a treaty regime	344
3.2.3 Restrictions on the employment of countermeasures 'in kind' due to the existence of a treaty regime	350
3.3 Supervisory mechanisms in arms control treaties and general law of treaties reactions to breaches of treaty	353
3.3.1 Introduction	353
3.3.2 Withdrawal, termination or suspension of the operation of a treaty	353
3.3.2.1 Withdrawal from a treaty	354
3.3.2.2 Termination or suspension of a treaty as a consequence of its material breach	356
3.3.3 Breach of prohibitions of use: the effect of inter-State armed conflict on the validity and operation of arms control treaties	360
3.4 Supervisory mechanisms in arms control treaties and the role of the Security Council in enforcing compliance	364

4. CONCLUDING REMARKS	369
5. CONCLUDING REMARKS ON THE ROLE OF INTERNATIONAL LAW IN ARMS CONTROL	370

Chapter 8 - Summary and conclusions

1. The law of arms control	373
2. Special characteristics of the law of arms control	374
3. International supervision of the law of arms control	375
4. International organisations as supervisors in arms control law	376
5. Some common characteristics of supervisory mechanisms in arms control treaties	378
6. Enforcement of the law of arms control	379

REFERENCES	381
(Bibliography, Official Documents, Table of Cases)	

<i>Annex figure 1: Model for the General Analysis of Supervisory Mechanisms in Arms Control Treaties</i>	397
--	-----

INDEX	398
-------	-----