

Sufism in Saudi Arabia Since 1979

Studies on Sufism

Edited by

Rachida Chih
Erik S. Ohlander
Florian Sobieroj

VOLUME 11

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/sufi*

Sufism in Saudi Arabia Since 1979

The Politics of Orthodoxy in Contemporary Islam

By

Besnik Sinani



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: The Prophet's Mosque (*Al-Masjid Al-Nabawī*), Medina, Saudi Arabia. iStock/Geofunny Setiawan.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2468-0087

ISBN 978-90-04-69710-2 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-74754-8 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004747548

Copyright 2026 by Koninklijke Brill BV, Plantijnstraat 2, 2321 JC Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill BV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill BV via brill.com or copyright.com.

For more information: info@brill.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

*To my late brother,
Alket Sinani*



Contents

Acknowledgments	XI
Introduction	1
1 Saudi Sufism in the Context of Wahhābī Dogma and State Power	6
2 Sufism as a Discursive Tradition	9
3 Classical and Contemporary Wahhābism	12
4 Sources Employed in This Book	16
1 The Standing Shrine	21
1 The Prophet's Tomb as Unfinished Reform	21
2 Ibn Taymiyya and Early Wahhābī Scholars on the Tomb of the Prophet	23
3 Modern-Day Wahhābī Teachings on the Tomb of the Prophet	27
4 Wahhābī Teachings on Tombs, <i>Istighātha</i> , and <i>Ziyāra</i> of the Tomb of the Prophet	29
5 Excessive Veneration of the Prophet: A Christian-Like Problem?	36
2 The Polemical Sufi Teacher	42
1 Muḥammad 'Alawī al-Mālikī: The Life of a Sufi Scholar in Saudi Arabia	42
2 Al-Mālikī's <i>Riḥlas</i> , <i>Isnāds</i> , and <i>Ijāzas</i>	44
3 Al-Mālikī's Students and Writings	47
4 The Intermediary Life of the Prophet (<i>al-ḥayāt al-barzakhiyya</i>) in <i>Mafāhīm</i>	48
5 Al-Mālikī's Textual Argumentation of Intercession	52
6 Re-Affirming Divine Sovereignty: The Charge of <i>ghuluww</i> and the Prophet's Attributes	59
7 Al-Mālikī on the Visitation and the Preservation of the Tomb of the Prophet	62
3 Facing the Wahhābī Orthodoxy	66
1 Wahhābī Orthodoxy and Saudi Political Rule	66
2 The Institutions of Wahhābī Orthodoxy	69
3 The Events of 1979 and the Appeal to Wahhābī Orthodoxy in Times of Crisis	72
4 Early Wahhābī Views on Sufism	75
5 Late Wahhābī Views on Sufism	76

- 6 Sufism as the Other 79
- 7 Refutation of al-Mālikī by the Committee of Senior Scholars 80
- 8 The Wahhābī Scholarly Refutation of al-Mālikī 84
- 9 The Refutation of *Mafāhīm* 88
- 10 The Refutation from al-Ṣaḥwa 90

- 4 The Memory of the Meccan School 94**
 - 1 Al-Mālikī as Heir of the Meccan School 95
 - 2 The Men of Meccan *Isnāds* Prior to the Establishment of the Saudi State 99
 - 3 The Meccan School in a Changing Political Environment 102
 - 4 Saudi Rule and the Public Demise of the Meccan School 103
 - 5 Wahhābism as Breaking the Chain of Connection to the Prophet 106
 - 6 The Regionalist Dimensions of the Debate on Sufism in Saudi Arabia 107
 - 7 The Regional Dimension of the Debate on Sufism in Saudi Arabia 110
 - 8 *Takfīr* in Wahhābī Teachings 112
 - 9 The Critique of *Takfīr* in *Mafāhīm* and the Response of Ṣāliḥ al-Shaykh 115
 - 10 Al-Mālikī's *Taḥdhīr* and the Modern Politicization of *Takfīr* in Saudi Arabia 118
 - 11 The Path towards the National Dialogue in 2003 124
 - 12 The Legacy of al-Mālikī 127

- 5 The Bā 'Alawī Sayyids in Modern Saudi Arabia 130**
 - 1 Narratives of Exile and Preaching in Bā 'Alawī Communal Consciousness 132
 - 2 'Alawī Gathering Spaces and Corresponding Ethics 136
 - 3 Female Ethical Concerns in Contemporary Bā 'Alawī Teachings 140
 - 4 'Alawī Blood Genealogies and Notions of Communal Balance 143
 - 5 An Exploration of the 'Alawī *Silsila* 148
 - 6 The 'Alawī Path of the Ancestors (*Salaf*) 151
 - 7 Biography and Prosopography as Tools of Tradition 158
 - 8 Aḥmad Mashhūr al-Ḥaddād: The Exemplary Caller unto God 165

- 6 Authority, Accommodation, and Pedagogy in Contemporary Saudi Sufism 169**
 - 1 Knowledge and Authority in Contemporary Sufi Teaching in Saudi Arabia 170

2	Contemporary Traditionalist Construction of Authority	172
3	The New Media and the New Spaces of Traditionalist Expansion	175
4	Wahhābī Attacks against al-Jifrī and the New Spaces of Religious Contestation	178
5	The Search for Sectarian Coexistence after the National Dialogue	183
6	‘Abdullāh Fad‘aq as the Public Face of Saudi Sufism	187
7	Sufi Pedagogy in Contemporary Saudi Arabia	190
8	Hadith Study in Contemporary Sufi Gatherings in the Ḥijāz	191
9	Emulating, Connecting with, and Attaining a Vision of the Prophet	194
10	The Pedagogical, Spiritual, and Cultural Dimension of Ḥijāzī <i>Nashīd</i>	196
7	The <i>Majlis</i> is Closed	199
1	The Rise of MBS and International Anti-Revolutionary Ecumenism	199
2	The Politics Traditionalism: Is There One?	204
3	The Reconfiguration of the Role of Religion in KSA	209
4	The Wahhābization of a Shrinking Religious Field at the Expense of Religious Pluralism	211
	Conclusions	216
	Bibliography	219
	Index	236

Acknowledgments

As I bring the writing of this book to a close, I reflect upon the numerous debts I have incurred along the way. This book is derived from the doctoral dissertation I completed at the Freie Universität Berlin, under the guidance of Ulrike Freitag. From our first meeting over coffee in Jeddah, Saudi Arabia, to our ongoing discussions of the chapters in Berlin, I have been fortunate to have had a dedicated mentor who generously shared her time, expertise, contacts, and profound knowledge of the histories and religious cultures of both the Hejaz and Hadramawt. She taught me how to critically examine my assumptions and discern meaningful details in research data. Her role as a supervisor has exceeded all expectations, and she has exemplified the qualities of a passionate educator and a collegial scholar. I am deeply grateful for everything she has provided.

I am profoundly indebted to Birgit Krawietz, whose guidance since the early stages of my doctoral studies has been invaluable. She emphasized the importance of engaging with pre-modern sources, which form the foundation of many of the polemical works analyzed in this study. The dissertation has greatly benefited from her meticulous comments on each chapter, as well as her insightful recommendations regarding literature and theoretical frameworks. I am equally grateful to Mark Sedgwick for his detailed feedback on both the conceptualization and interpretation of texts, and for sharing his extensive knowledge of the various manifestations of Sufism.

The Berlin Graduate School of Muslim Cultures and Societies provided generous funding for my doctoral studies and offered the ideal environment for the completion of my dissertation. It also fostered a vibrant community of researchers, whose friendship, insights, and ideas have enriched my work. I am grateful to the School's former Directors, Gudrun Krämer and Konrad Hirschler, former Managing Directors Bettina Gräf, and Lars Ostermeier, as well as to all the staff and students who have contributed tirelessly to the realization of the School's vision.

Though I am unable to name all the individuals in Saudi Arabia whose generosity, hospitality, and patience have supported me throughout this project, I must express my profound gratitude for them. During my numerous visits to Mecca, Ḥabīb 'Ubaydullāh al-'Aṭṭas demonstrated through his hospitality and grace a living representation of the highest ideals of the 'Alawiyya order. His soothing presence is greatly missed. I am also thankful to Sayyid 'Abdullāh Fad'aq for allowing me to attend his learning circle and graciously sharing his views. I owe much to Sayyid Aḥmad and Sayyid 'Alawī, the son and nephew of

Muḥammad ‘Alawī al-Mālikī, for welcoming me into their gatherings and gifting me the books of Sayyid al-Mālikī. I am equally grateful to Ḥabīb Muḥammad al-Saqqāf, Ḥabīb ‘Adnān al-Ḥaddād, and Ḥabīb Fayṣal al-Kāf for granting me access to their ḥadīth, sira, and fiqh classes. I am deeply thankful to Dr. ‘Ādil Abū al-‘Alā and his family for their warmth and hospitality. Although my meeting with Shaykh Muḥammad al-‘Umda occurred late in my time in Saudi Arabia, the time spent with him was invaluable. My brief but impactful encounter with Shaykh Muḥammad Sa‘īd al-Kaḥīl (d. 2012), the late Imām of the Khālīd b. Walīd Mosque in Ḥomṣ and shaykh of the Shādhilī order there, remains a blessed and enduring presence in my life. This encounter, like many others, was facilitated through the friendship of Sidi Malek Alloush, who is solely responsible for igniting my love of nashīd singing and so much more. I also owe much to Sayyid Ibrāhīm b. Sumayt, Sayyid Muḥammad al-Kāf, and Sayyid Aḥmad al-Kāf, whose invaluable insights, rare books, contacts, and friendship I deeply cherish.

While I did not recognize it at the time, this project began during my MA at New York University. Marion H. Katz introduced me to the field of academic Islamic Studies, and it was through her book on the *mawlid* that I first learned about Muḥammad ‘Alawī al-Mālikī. Michael Gilsean introduced me to literature on the Bā ‘Alawīs and the study of genealogies. I am profoundly grateful to both of them for their guidance. In the summer of 2018, I had the privilege of attending the Üsküdar University’s Sufi Studies Program in Istanbul, where I benefited greatly from the teachings of distinguished scholars such as Carl Ernst, Sachiko Murata, William Chittick, and James Morris. I am immensely grateful to Cangüzel Zülfikar, a dear mentor, for her support during this experience.

A significant portion of the preparation for this book took place during a one-year fellowship at the Leibniz-Zentrum Moderner Orient in Berlin. The Contested Religions Unit at the center provided a valuable platform for engaging with my evolving thoughts on major paradigm shifts in modern Muslim thought. I am grateful to Abdoulaye Sounaye and all the members of the unit for their generous contributions to my work.

Further revisions of my dissertation occurred after I began working at the Center for Islamic Theology at Tübingen University. Had I met Ruggero Vimercati Sanseverino earlier, my approach to this project might have been very different. I owe him a profound debt for raising my awareness of the intrinsic relationship between Sufism and the Muslim tradition of prophethood. I am deeply grateful to the Center’s Director, Lejla Demiri, for her friendship and support. Parts of this book were presented in an earlier version at Prof. Demiri’s Senior Seminar, and I appreciate the valuable feedback from all the

participants. Upon arriving in Tübingen, my wife Odeta and I were embraced with tremendous warmth and friendship by Amina Nawaz, Mujaddad Zaman, Erdal Toprakyan, Claire Gallien, Hossam Ouf, Mahmoud Abdallah, Kübra Kisa, Zehra Gürler, Ertul Ortabas, Zeynep Taskiran, Lea Schlenker, Abdullah Rıdvan Gökbek, and Serkan Ince. For their friendship, we will always be grateful.

My friend Yusuf Lenfest first introduced me to the Sufi gatherings of Jeddah in 2014, and in many ways, he is the one responsible for my embarking on this project. His comments on the first draft of this text have greatly improved every aspect of it. The time we spent together in Jeddah remains one of the fondest memories of my time there. Isa Robert Martin became my companion in seeking out Sufi gatherings around the Hejaz, and I could not have asked for a better partner. It was only after I left Jeddah that I realized that he had been more than just a friend; he had been the *ṣuḥba*. At a time when I was far from my family, Reahan and Saima Raja, along with their children Hajar and Ibrahim, welcomed me as one of their own. For the countless days spent in their living room and the laughter around their dining table, I will always be grateful.

I owe a deep debt of gratitude to Omar Anchassi, who read an earlier version of the manuscript in its entirety. His suggestions have significantly enhanced the quality of the text. Jonathan Brown has been extremely generous in recommending important literature, and providing clarifications on various concepts that are central to the scholarship of some of the scholars discussed in this book. Rezart Beka has been an unfailing source of friendship and essential literature. Stephane Lacroix and Aaron Rock-Singer have shared their valuable friendship and deep knowledge of modern Islamic trends. I have been fortunate to engage with a number of brilliant scholars, and although we have not always agreed, I have always learned from them. My deepest gratitude goes to Usaama al-Azami, Walaa Quisay, Farah al-Sharif, and Yahya Birt.

No words can adequately express my gratitude to my parents, Perparim and Tatiana Sinani, whose love, sacrifice, and unwavering support have shaped my life. They represent the ideal to which I aspire. Among the divine gifts I have received, meeting my wife, Odeta, stands out as one of the greatest. I consider her not only my partner but also my friend, though I can never match her boundless generosity. She has always been there for me, even in my absence, and has done more than merely uphold the fort of our family; she has represented for us the very meaning of home and family. If there is any regret I feel about embarking on this project, it is the time I have spent away from our sons, Omar and Enes, who are the greatest joy of my life.