

Enforcing International Judgments Domestically

Nijhoff Law Specials

VOLUME 113

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/nlsp

Enforcing International Judgments Domestically

The Case of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights

By

Ayla do Vale Alves and Lucas Lixinski



BRILL | NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Lixinski, Lucas author | Vale Alves, Ayla do author

Title: Enforcing international judgments domestically : the case of the
Inter-American Court of Human Rights / author Ayla do Vale Alves &
Lucas Lixinski.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill Academic Publishers, Inc, 2025. |
Series: Nijhoff Law Specials ; volume 113 | Includes bibliographical
references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2025032119 | ISBN 9789004738065 hardback | ISBN
9789004741829 epub

Subjects: LCSH: Inter-American Court of Human Rights | International human
rights courts | International and municipal law | Jurisdiction
(International law) | Conflict of laws--Jurisdiction | Judicial
assistance | Human rights--America | Human rights--Latin America

Classification: LCC KDZ579.I5 E57 2025 | DDC 341.4/8--DC23/ENG/20250724

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2025032119>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 0924-4549

ISBN 978-90-04-73806-5 (paperback)

ISBN 978-90-04-74182-9 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004741829

Copyright 2025 by Ayla do Vale Alves and Lucas Lixinski. Published by Koninklijke Brill BV, Plantijnstraat
2, 2321 JC Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill BV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis,
Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

Koninklijke Brill BV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for
re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill BV via brill.com or copyright.com.

For more information: info@brill.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgments	VII
1 Introduction	1
2 Implementation and Enforcement of International (Human Rights) Judgments	8
1 Farsightedness in Implementation and Compliance	9
1.1 <i>Reparations Mandates</i>	13
1.2 <i>Domestic Entrenchment Doctrines</i>	20
2 Branches of Government and Scholarly Toolkits	22
2.1 <i>Foreign Relations Law and Demystifying the State</i>	25
2.2 <i>The Conflict of Laws Style and Technical Foregrounding</i>	28
2.3 <i>Parliaments and Relative Scholarly Neglect</i>	32
3 A Typology of Implementation and Enforcement in Latin America	35
1 Methodology	43
1.1 <i>Methodological Choices</i>	45
1.2 <i>On Sewing and Legal Analysis</i>	46
2 Executive Branch and Foreign Affairs	51
2.1 <i>Centralized v Diffuse Authority</i>	52
2.2 <i>Clarity of Rules for Implementation</i>	56
2.3 <i>Dependence on Shifts in Local Politics</i>	63
2.4 <i>Directness of Connection to IACtHR</i>	68
3 Judicial Branch and Private International Law Technique	73
3.1 <i>Centralized v Diffuse Authority</i>	74
3.2 <i>Clarity of Rules for Implementation</i>	79
3.3 <i>Dependence on Shifts in Local Politics</i>	82
3.4 <i>Directness of Connection to IACtHR</i>	85
4 Legislative Branch and the Forgotten Intermediary	89
4.1 <i>Centralized v Diffuse Authority</i>	90
4.2 <i>Clarity of Rules for Implementation</i>	94
4.3 <i>Dependence on Shifts in Local Politics</i>	97
4.4 <i>Directness of Connection to IACtHR</i>	101
5 Stitching (or Velcroing) Lessons from Branches Together	104

4	Impacts on the Problem and the Field	107
1	Legitimacy Impacts	108
2	Impacts on Victims and Strategy-Building	110
3	An Optimal Model of International (Human Rights) Judgment Enforcement in Domestic Law?	113
4	Lessons beyond International Human Rights Adjudication	120
5	Conclusions	124
	Appendix: Latin American State Practice and Primary Sources in Enforcing Inter-American Court Judgments	127
	Index	259

Acknowledgments

This small book has been a labor of love for both of us. We first met through a common acquaintance, Dr. Vassilis Tzevelekos, who is Lucas's long-time friend and collaborator from their time together at the European University Institute. Ayla was one of Vassilis's students at the University of Liverpool, and wanted to pursue a Ph.D. in cultural heritage law. Vassilis recommended Ayla reach out to Lucas, and she eventually did her Ph.D. at UNSW Sydney, under the supervision of Lucas, Associate Professor Noam Peleg, and Professor Fleur Johns. So, to Vassilis for the collegiality and introductions, and to Noam and Fleur for the joint intellectual enterprise, our thanks.

Ayla started working on this project as a Research Assistant to what was meant to be an article. But Lucas felt she brought so much to the table that they ought to write it together. The topic was sufficiently far from Ayla's Ph.D. to make it workable within the constraints of a then live supervisory relationship (so Lucas would not run the risk of plagiarizing Ayla's research, mindful of the difference in power dynamics). What then restarted as a joint article gradually morphed into a joint book.

In preparing and workshopping this manuscript, we benefitted tremendously from the input of multiple audiences. We will not list everyone who gave us input by name, lest we leave people out. We duly acknowledge some particularly insightful and original feedback that led to specific changes to our argument in the book itself. But from an institutional perspective we are thankful to David Kosař and Lucas Carlos Lima for organizing dedicated workshops with their research groups where we could discuss this work. We were lucky to have a glimpse into the very special communities they have created and keep alive. Emerson Gabardo also facilitated opportunities to discuss this work as the writing came to a close. We are deeply thankful to audiences in Belo Horizonte (Brazil), Brno (Czechia), Curitiba (Brazil), San Juan (Puerto Rico), and Wellington (Aotearoa/New Zealand) for their input, and for giving us the opportunity to articulate, often as much to each other as to the audience, (parts of) the book's argument.

