

THE LAW AND PRACTICE OF THE INTERNATIONAL
COURT, 1920–1996

VOLUME I
THE COURT AND THE UNITED NATIONS

**THE LAW AND PRACTICE
OF THE INTERNATIONAL COURT,
1920–1996**

THIRD EDITION

**VOLUME I
THE COURT AND THE UNITED NATIONS**

by

SHABTAI ROSENNE



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

THE HAGUE / BOSTON / LONDON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 90-411-0264-7 (Set)

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Law International,
675 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1997 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

To Esther

CONTENTS

Contents	vii
Preface	xxiii
Acknowledgments	xxix
Note on documents and abbreviations	xxx

VOLUME I

The Court and the United Nations

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

I.1. The political and legal in the settlement of disputes	1
I.2. Arbitration and judicial settlement compared	10
I.3. The dissolution of the Permanent Court	16
I.4. An appreciation	19

CHAPTER 2 THE ESTABLISHMENT AND CONSTITUTION OF THE COURT

I.5. The outbreak of the War	41
I.6. Early inter-Allied discussions	45
I.7. The Dumbarton Oaks proposals	51
I.8. The Washington Committee of Jurists	55
I.9. The San Francisco Conference	57
I.10. The International Court of Justice—A new Court	66
I.11. The United Nations Preparatory Commission	71
I.12. The opening of the new Court	72
I.13. The functional continuity of the two Courts	74
I.14. Problems of interpretation	77
I.15. Political interpretation	80
I.16. Judicial interpretation	83
I.17. State practice	89
I.18. <i>Travaux préparatoires</i>	90
I.19. Non-judicial precedents	93
I.20. Amending the Statute	95

CHAPTER 3 THE POLITICAL AND INSTITUTIONAL ROLE OF THE COURT

I.21. The Permanent Court and the League of Nations	99
I.22. The Court and the United Nations	104
I.23. Charter and Statute	106
I.24. The Court as a principal organ	110
I.25. The Court and the General Assembly	121
I.26. The Court and the Security Council	127
I.27. The Court as principal judicial organ	138
I.28. The Court and other judicial organs	140
I.29. The organs and the Court	144
I.30. Litispence, political and legal	149
I.31. The specialized agencies and the Court	155
I.32. The International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea	160
I.33. The political function of judicial settlement	162
I.34. The judicial role of the Court	171
I.35. The attitudes of States towards judicial settlement	178
I.36. Same: The Western attitude	183
I.37. Same: The Marxist-Socialist attitude	187
I.38. The synthesis	194

CHAPTER 4 THE POST-ADJUDICATION PHASE

I.39. The character of the post-adjudication phase	201
I.40. The views of the Court	206
I.41. Underlying characteristics of the problem	208
I.42. The obligation of compliance	211
I.43. Compliance with incidental and interlocutory decisions	214
I.44. Compliance with final decisions	216
I.45. Scope of the obligation to comply—the <i>Socobel</i> case	221
I.46. The theoretical qualification of non-compliance	227
I.47. The role of self-help	232
I.48. Methods to secure compliance	236
I.49. The <i>Corfu Channel</i> case	241
I.50. Institutional measures to give effect to a judgment	249

I.51. The role of the Security Council	252
I.52. The role of other organs	258
I.53. Complaint of Iran's failure to comply with indication of provisional measures (1951)	260
I.54. The <i>Arbitral Award of King of Spain</i> case (1960–63)	265
I.55. The judgment on the merits in the <i>Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua</i> case	269
I.56. The <i>Burkina Faso/Mali</i> case	273
I.57. The <i>Chad/Libya</i> case	274
I.58. An international force and judgment enforcement	276

CHAPTER 5 ADVISORY OPINIONS

I.59. The experience of the League of Nations	279
I.60. Comparison of Covenant and Charter	286
I.61. The principal organs: the General Assembly	300
I.62. Reception of advisory opinions by the General Assembly	309
I.63. The principal organs: the Security Council	322
I.64. Same: the Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC)	327
I.65. Same: the Trusteeship Council	332
I.66. The Secretary-General	333
I.67. Other United Nations organs	335
I.68. The specialized agencies	339
I.69. Same: the International Labour Organization	342
I.70. Same: World Health Organization	344
I.71. Same: UNESCO	345
I.72. Same: the International Maritime Organization	347
I.73. Same: the World Bank	347
I.74. The International Atomic Energy Agency	349
I.75. The request	351

CHAPTER 6 THE MEMBERS OF THE COURT

I.76. Introductory	363
I.77. The qualifications of Members of the Court	366

I.78. The frequency of elections	372
I.79. Nomination of candidates	373
I.80. Withdrawal of candidacies	378
I.81. The system of election	379
I.82. Procedure in the General Assembly	381
I.83. Procedure in the Security Council	384
I.84. <i>Meeting and Ballot</i>	387
I.85. The avoidance of a deadlock	388
I.86. Elections to fill occasional vacancies	389
I.87. Term of office of Members of the Court	390
I.88. Appraisal of the electoral system	393
I.89. The solemn declaration of a Member of the Court	399
I.90. The President and Vice-President	401
I.91. The precedence of the Members of the Court	407
I.92. Resignation of a Member of the Court	408
I.93. Removal from office of a Member of the Court	409
I.94. Incompatibilities	410
I.95. Attendance of members of the Court and the quorum	420
I.96. Chambers of the Court	421
I.97. Diplomatic privileges and immunities	426

CHAPTER 7 THE REGISTRAR AND THE REGISTRY

I.98. The Registrar	431
I.99. Deputy-Registrar	435
I.100. Removal from office	436
I.101. The Registry staff	437
I.102. Privileges and immunities	440
I.103. The duties of the Registry	441
I.104. The publications of the Court	444
I.105. Relations with the press	447

Chapter 8 FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

I.106. The League system	449
I.107. The Statute of 1945	451
I.108. The Court's expenditure	453
I.109. Unforeseen expenditure	457

I.110. The Court's income	458
I.111. Salaries of the Members of the Court	460
I.112. The revision of 1950	461
I.113. The revision of 1961	465
I.114. The revision of 1967	465
I.115. The revision of 1971	466
I.116. The revision of 1973	467
I.117. The revision of 1976	469
I.118. The revision of 1980	472
I.119. The revision of 1985	473
I.120. The revision of 1990	473
I.121. The revision of 1993–94	474
I.122. The review of 1995	475
I.123. Education grant	477
I.124. Relocation grant	478
I.125. Members retained to finish a case	478
I.126. Special allowance for President and Vice-President	480
I.127. Judges <i>ad hoc</i>	481
I.128. Pensions of Members of the Court	484
I.129. The Judges' pension plan of 1946	485
I.130. The revised pension plan of 1960	488
I.131. The revised pension plan of 1963	489
I.132. The revised pension plan of 1980	490
I.133. The review of 1995	491
I.134. Financing the pensions	494
I.135. The Registrar's salary	496
I.136. Registry staff salary	498
I.137. Tax equalization—staff assessment	499
I.138. Travel and subsistence allowance	503
I.139. Witnesses and experts	504
I.140. Appraisal of budgetary arrangements	504
I.141. Registrar's pension	508
I.142. Registry staff's pension	508
I.143. The Court's property	508
I.144. The seat of the Court	509
I.145. Official mail, postal services and common services	512
I.146. The Secretary-General's Trust Fund	514

VOLUME II

Jurisdiction

CHAPTER 9 JURISDICTION: GENERAL CONCEPTS

II.147. The concept of <i>dispute</i> : justiciability	517
II.148. Jurisdiction and competence	528
II.149. Meaning of <i>jurisdiction</i>	536
II.150. Mutuality and reciprocity as elements of jurisdiction	541
II.151. Jurisdiction and propriety	546
II.152. Discretion based on parties to the case: essential parties	552
II.153. Jurisdiction and the seisin of the Court	560
II.154. The consensual basis of jurisdiction	563
II.155. The form of consent	573
II.156. The temporal factor in jurisdiction	579
II.157. Consent by conduct	583
II.158. Withdrawal of consent	586
II.159. Jurisdiction to decide <i>ex aequo et bono</i>	587
II.160. The <i>non ultra petita</i> rule	594
II.161. Jurisdiction over incidental matters	596
II.162. Jurisdiction to control proceedings	602

CHAPTER 10 QUALIFICATION TO BE A PARTY IN A CASE

II.163. Introductory	605
II.164. Members of the United Nations	614
II.165. Non-members of the United Nations as parties to the Statute	616
II.166. Consequences of being a party to the Statute	620
II.167. Withdrawal from the United Nations, suspension and expulsion	623
II.168. States not parties to the Statute	628
II.169. Security Council Resolution 9 (1946)	630
II.170. Same Continued: Rules, Article 36 (1946) and 41 (1978)	635

II.171. Public international organizations	638
II.172. Non-governmental international organizations	653
II.173. Individuals	654

CHAPTER 11 TREATIES AND CONVENTIONS IN FORCE

II.174. Treaties in force	657
II.175. The special agreement	663
II.176. The compromissory clause	665
II.177. General treaties for the pacific settlement of disputes	668
II.178. The framework agreement	672
II.179. Treaties concluded before 1945	677
II.180. Matters provided for in the Charter of the United Nations	692
II.181. The general theory of <i>forum prorogatum</i>	695
II.182. <i>Forum prorogatum</i> ; early developments	698
II.183. The discussions of 1934–1936	702
II.184. The time for formal agreement	705
II.185. Agreement by successive acts	707
II.186. Agreement reached in course of pleading	714
II.187. Absence of tacit consent	718
II.188. The state organs competent to give consent	721
II.189. Evaluation of <i>forum prorogatum</i>	724

CHAPTER 12 COMPULSORY (OPTIONAL CLAUSE) JURISDICTION

II.190. The origins	727
II.191. The Statute: Article 36, paragraphs 2 and 3	732
II.192. ' <i>Ipso facto</i> and without special agreement'	735
II.193. 'Any other State'	738
II.194. 'Accepting the same obligation'	740
II.195. 'Legal disputes'	742
II.196. Declarations made before 1945	745
II.197. Form of declaration	751
II.198. Statute, Article 36, Paragraph 4	753
II.199. Reciprocity	759

II.200. Reservations and conditions	766
II.201. Objective reservation of domestic jurisdiction	774
II.202. Subjective reservation of domestic jurisdiction	778
II.203. Temporal conditions: terminology	782
II.204. Temporal limitations	785
II.205. Application of temporal limitations	790
II.206. The temporal element of jurisdiction <i>ratione personae</i>	798
II.207. Special reservations	802
II.208. The war exclusion clause	805
II.209. Interpretation of declarations	809
II.210. Modification and amendment of a declaration	815
II.211. Denunciation of a declaration	817
II.212. The juridical qualification of the system of compulsory	822
II.213. Evaluation	831

CHAPTER 13 TREATMENT OF MATTERS OF JURISDICTION

II.214. The importance of matters of jurisdiction	837
II.215. Jurisdiction as to the jurisdiction	846
II.216. Meaning of 'dispute as to jurisdiction'	852
II.217. The consequences of raising a matter of jurisdiction	862
II.218. Time for raising a matter of jurisdiction	864
II.219. The evolution of preliminary objections	865
II.220. Rules of 1936/1946, Article 62	873
II.221. The change of 1972/1978 (1978 Rules, Article 79)	880
II.222. The isolation of matters of jurisdiction by the Court	889
II.223. The isolation of matters of jurisdiction by the parties	895
II.224. Suspension of proceedings on the merits	896
II.225. Successive objections	898
II.226. Agreement of parties to defer objections	901
II.227. Priorities of objections	902
II.228. Pre-judicatory proceedings	905
II.229. The non-exhaustive character of preliminary	

objection proceedings	909
II.230. Distinction between objection and defence	915
II.231. Character of the decision on preliminary objection	917
II.232. Disposal of objections: termination and joinder	922
II.233. Matters of jurisdiction raised by the Court	928

CHAPTER 14 THE TITLE OF JURISDICTION

II.234. Meaning of the term	933
II.235. Language	937
II.236. Validity in time of the title of jurisdiction	941
II.237. The retroactive effect of a title of jurisdiction	943
II.238. Multiple titles of jurisdiction	952
II.239. Added titles of jurisdiction	961
II.240. Successive titles of jurisdiction	968
II.241. Termination of the title of jurisdiction	974
II.242. Registration under Charter, Article 102	981

CHAPTER 15 ADVISORY JURISDICTION

II.243. General concepts	985
II.244. 'Arising within the scope of their activities'	995
II.245. Legal question	999
II.246. The Court's discretion	1013
II.247. Discretion based on the Court's judicial character	1014
II.248. Discretion based on the Court's status as a principal organ	1020
II.249. Jurisdiction in special advisory proceedings	1029
II.250. Judicial interpretation of an advisory opinion	1038
II.251. Revision of an advisory opinion	1046
II.252. The treatment of preliminary questions in advisory proceedings	1048
II.253. Appraisal	1055

VOLUME III Procedure

CHAPTER 16 ELEMENTS OF INTERNATIONAL PROCEDURAL LAW

III.254. The basic approach	1063
III.255. The Statute and Rules of Court	1071
III.256. The function of the proceedings	1079
III.257. Evidence and the burden of proof	1082
III.258. The equality of the Parties	1092

CHAPTER 17 THE BENCH

III.259. Terminology	1097
III.260. Disqualification and abstention of a Member of the Court in a particular case (recusal)	1101
III.261. The composition of the bench	1109
III.262. Chambers of the Court	1112
III.263. Special chambers	1116
III.264. <i>Ad hoc</i> chambers	1118
II .265. The Chamber of Summary Procedure	1122
III.266. The concept of judge <i>ad hoc</i>	1123
III.267. The appointment of the judge <i>ad hoc</i>	1130
III.268. Qualifications of judge <i>ad hoc</i>	1135
III.269. Parties in the same interest	1138
III.270. The problem of imbalance	1140
III.271. Non-appointment of judge <i>ad hoc</i>	1142
III.272. Judge <i>ad hoc</i> in intervention cases	1143
III.273. Judges <i>hoc</i> in advisory cases	1152
III.274. The president of the bench	1156
III.275. Assessors	1161
III.276. Experts appointed by the Court	1163

CHAPTER 18 REPRESENTATION OF THE PARTIES

III.277. The agent	1165
III.278. The agent's functions	1173
III.279. Time for the appointment of the agents	1176
III.280. The address for service	1178
III.281. A party's delegation	1179

III.282. Counsel and advocates	1180
III.283. Experts of the parties	1182
III.284. Witnesses called by a party	1184
III.285. Representatives in advisory cases	1185
III.286. Representatives: privileges and immunities	1185

CHAPTER 19 THE INSTITUTION OF CONTENTIOUS PROCEEDINGS

III.287. The seising of the Court	1189
III.288. Condition of prior diplomatic negotiations	1198
III.289. Requirement of prior attempt at arbitration	1204
III.290. The non-exhaustion of local remedies	1206
III.291. The link of the dispute with the title of jurisdiction	1209
III.292. The interest of the applicant state	1212
III.293. Methods of instituting proceedings	1219
III.294. Notification of institution of proceedings	1224
III.295. The Court's general list	1226
III.296. The title of the case	1230
III.297. Notification of special agreement	1233
III.298. Application instituting proceedings	1234
III.299. The relations of the litigating states	1240
III.300. Institution of incidental and derivative proceedings	1245

CHAPTER 20 THE WRITTEN PROCEEDINGS AND RELATED MATTERS

III.301. The President's consultations	1249
III.302. Joinder, hearing in common, and consolidation of cases	1251
III.303. The written pleadings	1260
III.304. Submissions in written pleadings	1265
III.305. Counter-claims	1272
III.306. Pleadings in incidental proceedings	1277
III.307. Documents in support	1278
III.308. Affidavits and declarations	1282
III.309. Language of written pleadings	1283

III.310. Correction of errors in a pleading	1286
III.311. Confidentiality of written pleadings	1287
III.312. The order of the written pleadings	1291
III.313. The fixing of time-limits	1296
III.314. Case ready for hearing	1301
III.315. New documents: Rules, Article 56	1302
III 316. Costs	1313

CHAPTER 21 THE ORAL PROCEEDINGS

III.317. The significance of the oral proceedings	1317
III.318. Date of oral proceedings	1327
III.319. Preparations in the Registry	1331
III.320. The hearing	1332
III.321. Questions to the parties	1339
III.322. The language of oral proceedings	1340
III.323. Hearing of witnesses and experts	1342
III.324. Statute, Article 49: obtaining evidence by the Court	1360
III.325. Statute, Article 50: experts appointed by the Court	1364
III.326. Witnesses called by the Court	1371
III.327. Submission of evidence by a third State	1372
III.328. The final submissions	1375
III.329. The closure of the hearing	1378
III.330. Evaluation	1379

CHAPTER 22 PROCEEDINGS IN CHAMBERS

III.331. The invocation of a standing chamber	1385
III.332. The invocation of an <i>ad hoc</i> chamber	1388
III.333. The procedure in chambers	1392
III.334. The judgment of a chamber	1394

CHAPTER 23 ABSENCE OF APPEARANCE

III.335. Failure to appear before the Court	1401
---	------

III.336. Non-appearance and provisional measures of protection	1414
III.337. Aspects of procedure	1415
III.338. The resolution of the Institute of International Law	1416

CHAPTER 24 PROVISIONAL MEASURES OF PROTECTION

III.339. Statute, Article 41, and Rules of Court, Articles 73 to 78	1419
III.340. The procedure	1429
III.341. The special function of the President	1435
III.342. The time for the request	1436
III.343. Fresh request	1438
III.344. Urgency	1439
III.345. The duration of provisional measures	1441
III.346. The case-law	1443
III.347. The role of the Security Council	1459

CHAPTER 25 TERMINATION OF PROCEEDINGS

III.348. Rules, Articles 88 and 89	1463
III.349. Removal from the general list	1466
III.350. Termination of the proceedings by the parties jointly	1467
III.351. Termination of the proceedings by the applicant	1471
III.352. Discontinuance of preliminary objection proceedings	1477
III.353. Discontinuance of provisional measures proceedings	1478
III.354. Removal from list by the Court	1478

CHAPTER 26 INTERVENTION BY THIRD STATES

III.355. Statute, Articles 62 and 63	1481
III.356. The background	1483
III.357. The San Francisco Conference	1487
III.358. Articles 62 and 63: problems of interpretation	1488

III.359. Rules of Court 1922 to 1972	1498
III.360. Rules of Court (1978), Articles 81 to 86	1500
III.361. The Application of the Rules	1510
Article 81	1510
Article 82	1513
Article 83	1514
Article 84	1515
Articles 85 and 86	1515
III.362. Jurisdiction <i>ratione personae</i> in matters of intervention	1517
III.363. Jurisdiction <i>ratione materiae</i> in matters of intervention	1518
III.364. The 'incidental' character of intervention	1520
III.365. The link of jurisdiction	1526
III.366. The non-party intervener	1542
III.367. Intervention in <i>ad hoc</i> chamber proceedings	1551

CHAPTER 27 THE DECISION

III.368. The Court's decision-making	1557
III.369. The deliberation	1569
III.370. The authoritative text: the Court's bilingualism	1572
III.371. The secrecy of the deliberations	1576
III.372. Individual opinions	1579
III.373. The judgment	1585
III.374. The operative provisions	1587
III.375. The reasons in point of law: Statute Article 38	1590
III.376. General principles of law	1601
III.377. Subsidiary means: Article 38, paragraph 1 (<i>d</i>): judicial decisions	1606
III.378. Same: teachings of publicists	1615
III.379. Resolutions of the General Assembly	1616
III.380. Decision <i>ex aequo et bono</i>	1619
III.381. Orders	1620
III.382. Other decisions	1622
III.383. Correction of errors	1622
III.384. Critique of statements of law	1623

III.385. Statute: Article 59	1627
III.386. 'In respect of that particular case'	1634
III.387. Declaratory judgments	1636
III.388. The protective function of Article 59: the absent State	1637
III.389. Article 59 as a bar to third party intervention	1643
III.390. Criticism of application of Article 59	1646
III.391. The <i>res judicata</i>	1655
III.392. The judgment and third parties	1661
III.393. Preliminary objection judgments and later phases	1664

CHAPTER 28 INTERPRETATION AND REVISION OF JUDGMENT

III.394. General Observations	1669
III.395. Interpretation: Statute, Article 60	1673
III.396. 'Final and Without Appeal'	1677
III.397. Revision of Judgment: Statute, Article 61 and Rules, Article 99	1681

CHAPTER 29 THE EXTRA-JUDICIAL FUNCTION

III.398. Nature of the practice	1687
III.399. International agreements	1694
III.400. Agreements between a government and a private concern	1700
III.401. Contracts between private concerns	1706
III.402. Unilateral invocation of the extra-judicial function	1706
III.403. Evaluation	1707

CHAPTER 30 ADVISORY PROCEEDINGS

III.404. Statute, Articles 65 and 66; Rules of Court, Part IV	1711
Rules, Article 102	1715
Rules, Article 103	1718
Rules, Article 104	1719

Rules, Article 105	1720
Rules, Article 106	1721
Rules, Article 107	1721
Rules, Articles 108, 109	1722
III.405. The bench	1722
III.406. The seisin of the Court	1725
III.407. Accompanying documents	1727
III.408. Right of participation in advisory proceedings	1728
III.409. Principal features of the advisory procedure	1733
III.410. Hearing in common of two advisory proceedings	1740
III.411. Individuals	1741
III.412. Provisional measures in advisory proceedings	1746
III.413. The role of the Secretary-General	1748
III.414. The advisory opinion	1751
III.415. The legal effect of an advisory opinion	1754
Tables	1761
Table I. Times for provisional measures	1762
Table II. Participation in advisory proceedings	1764

VOLUME IV

The Charter of the United Nations, Statute and Rules of Court. Indexes

The Charter of the United Nations	1767
The Statute of the Court	1803
The 1978 Rules of Court	1823
Addendum to Chapter 10, § II.171	1867
Table of Cases	1871
Index of Names	1891
Articles of Statute cited	1899
Articles of Rules of 1936/1946 cited	1903
Articles of Rules of 1978	1905
General index	1907