

Textual Evolution and Growth of the Enochic Theophany in the Book of the Watchers 1:1–9

Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism

Editors

René Bloch (*Institut für Judaistik, Universität Bern*)
Karina Martin Hogan (*Department of Theology, Fordham University*)

Associate Editors

Hindy Najman (*Faculty of Theology and Religion, University of Oxford*)
Eibert J.C. Tigchelaar (*Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies, KU Leuven*)
Benjamin G. Wright, III (*Department of Religion Studies, Lehigh University*)

Advisory Board

A. Angelini – A.M. Berlin – K. Berthelot – B. Eckhardt
Y. Furstenberg – E. Glas – S. Kattan Gribetz – G. Anthony Keddie
L. Lehmhaus – O. Malka – A. Manekin – F. Mirguet – J.H. Newman
A.K. Petersen – M.M. Piotrkowski – M. Popović – P. Pouchelle – I. Rosen-Zvi
C. Seeman – L.T. Stuckenbruck – L. Teugels – J.C. de Vos – S. Weisser

VOLUME 219

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/jsjs*

Textual Evolution and Growth of the Enochic Theophany in the Book of the Watchers 1:1–9

By

Alexander McCarron



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: McCarron, Alexander, author.

Title: Textual evolution and growth of the Enochic Theophany in the Book of the Watchers 1:1–9 / by Alexander McCarron.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2025. | Series: Supplements to the journal for the study of Judaism, 1384-2161 ; volume 219 | Includes bibliographical references. | Summary: "The Enochic Theophany in the Book of the Watchers 1:1-9 evolved and grew as it was translated into, and transmitted in, new and changing socio-linguistic and socio-religious contexts. This study explores how the Enochic theophany evolved in its Aramaic, Greek, Ethiopic and Latin versions, and focuses on the hermeneutical and text-critical implications of these features of textual evolution and growth. These features reveal how the text was read, interpreted, and re-signified as it was translated and transmitted. This study proposes a holistic methodology for exploring textual evolution and growth in fragmentary texts and in fragmentary textual traditions, and for understanding the Enochic theophany as a participant in an ongoing Theophanic and Enochic-Noahic discourse"—Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024046911 (print) | LCCN 2024046912 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004715882 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004715899 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Theophanies in the Bible. | Ethiopic book of Enoch—Criticism, interpretation, etc.

Classification: LCC BS1199.T45 M33 2025 (print) | LCC BS1199.T45 (ebook) | DDC 229/.913066—dc23/eng/20241025

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024046911>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024046912>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 1384-2161

ISBN 978-90-04-71588-2 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-71589-9 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004715899

Copyright 2025 by Alexander McCarron. Published by Koninklijke Brill BV, Plantijnstraat 2, 2321 JC Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill BV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

Koninklijke Brill BV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill BV via brill.com or copyright.com.

For more information: info@brill.com

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

For Bethany, Emily and Judah



Contents

Acknowledgements	XI
List of Figures and Tables	XIII
Abbreviations	XIV

Introduction: Textual Evolution and Growth of the Enochic Theophany in the Book of the Watchers 1:1–9 1

1	The Enochic Theophany in the Book of the Watchers	2
2	Reading the Seams in the Enochic Oracle and the Book of the Watchers	3
3	Scripture in the Enochic Theophany and Contemporary Scholarship	11
4	The Enochic Theophany, the Pseudepigrapha, and Textual Vitality	18
5	Traditionary Processes and the Evolution of the Enochic Theophany	24
6	The Methodology, Parameters and Scope of the Study	27

1 The Enochic Theophany in the Aramaic, Greek and Ethiopic Manuscripts and Fragments 46

1	4QEn ^a (4Q201) and 4QEn ^c (4Q204)	46
2	Codex Panopolitanus, the Epistle of Jude 14b–15 and the Latin Quotations	54
3	The Eth. I and Eth. II Manuscripts of Ethiopic Enoch	71

2 The Aramaic Enochic Theophany in 4QEn^a (4Q201) and 4QEn^c (4Q204) 94

1	The Reconstruction and Restoration of the Aramaic Fragments of the Enochic Theophany	95
2	The Enochic Superscription in 4QEn ^a (BW 1:1)	107
3	The Enochic Preamble in 4QEn ^a (BW 1:2–3a)	114
4	The Descent of God in 4QEn ^a (BW 1:3b–4)	131
5	The Ends of the Earth in 4QEn ^a (BW 1:5–6)	150
6	God's Judgment in 4QEn ^c (BW 1:9)	159
7	Conclusion	166

- 3 **The Greek Enochic Theophany in Codex Panopolitanus (G^{CP})** 168
 - 1 The Enochic Superscription in G^{CP} (BW 1:1) and Deuteronomy 33:1 169
 - 2 The Enochic Preamble in G^{CP} (1:2–3a) and Balaam and Noah 181
 - 3 The Descent of God in G^{CP} (BW 1:3b–4) and the Hebrew Theophanies 197
 - 4 The Watchers and the Hidden Things in G^{CP} (BW 1:5) 206
 - 5 The High Mountains, the High Hills, and Seismic Destruction in G^{CP} (BW 1:6–7) 216
 - 6 The Fate of the Righteous and the Chosen in G^{CP} (BW 1:8) 225
 - 7 The Language of the Enochic Theophany in G^{CP} in Its Historical and Socio-Religious Context 229
 - 7.1 *The Fate of the Righteous in 1:1 and 1:8* 232
 - 7.2 *The Holy Words in BW 1:2* 236
 - 7.3 *The Schism in BW 1:7* 239
 - 8 Conclusion 244
- 4 **The Enochic Theophany (BW 1:9) in Codex Panopolitanus, the Epistle of Jude 14b–15 and the Latin Versions** 245
 - 1 The Relationship between the Greek and Latin Text-Types and Versions 247
 - 2 Parallels between G^{CP} and Jude 14b–15 251
 - 2.1 *The Initial Introductory Particle* 254
 - 2.2 *The Aspectual Variant in the Initial Verb of Movement* 256
 - 2.3 *The Interpolation of κύριος in Jude* 261
 - 2.4 *The Syntactical Construction Used for God's Myriads* 265
 - 2.5 *The Inflected Form of ἐλέγχω and Verbal Changes in G^{CP}* 272
 - 2.6 *The Noun Complement of the Judgment* 275
 - 2.7 *The 'Hard Words' of the Ungodly Sinners* 280
 - 3 Conclusion 283
- 5 **The Enochic Theophany in the Eth. 1 Manuscripts and the Greek Vorlage of the Ethiopic** 284
 - 1 The Translation of G^{Eth} into Ethiopic and the G^{CP} Text-Type 285
 - 2 Tana 9 and the Enochic Theophany in the Eth. 1 Manuscripts 289
 - 3 The Language of the Earliest Recoverable Stratum of the Ethiopic Enochic Theophany 297
 - 3.1 *Ethiopic Enoch 1:1 – Enochic Superscription* 298
 - 3.2 *Ethiopic Enoch 1:2–3a – Enochic Preamble* 302
 - 3.3 *Ethiopic Enoch 1:3b–4 – The Beginning of the Enochic Theophany* 316

3.4	<i>Ethiopic Enoch 1:5 – The Fear of Humanity and the Shaking of the Watchers</i>	323
3.5	<i>Ethiopic Enoch 1:6–7 – The Destruction of the High Mountains, High Hills, and the Earth</i>	328
3.6	<i>Ethiopic Enoch 1:8 – The Fate of the Righteous and Chosen Ones</i>	335
3.7	<i>Ethiopic Enoch 1:9 – God's Judgment</i>	342
3.8	<i>The Eth.^{EIS} and the G^{CP} Text-type</i>	348
4	Conclusion	349
6	Textual Evolution and Growth in the Enochic Theophany in the Eth. I and Eth. II Manuscripts	351
1	Lexical Manipulation – the Splitting and Flooding of the Earth in Ethiopic Enoch 1:7a	352
2	Lexical Replacement – the Judgment of 'All Flesh' in Ethiopic Enoch 1:9d	363
3	Interpolations in the Enochic Theophany	374
4	Conclusion	378
	Concluding Remarks	380
	Appendix 1: BW 1:1–9 in Codex Panopolitanus Critical Text and Translation	385
	Appendix 2: Ethiopic Enoch 1:1–9 (Eth.^{EIS}) Critical Text and Translation	396
	Bibliography	419
	Index of Ancient Texts	450
	Index of Modern Authors	474
	Index of Subjects	481

Acknowledgements

This study is a revision of my doctoral dissertation which was completed in the Faculty of Oriental Studies at the University of Oxford from Michaelmas term in 2017 until its successful defense in Hilary term in early 2022. This dissertation was then revised during 2023 and the first half of 2024 in preparation for publication.

Over the course of this journey, I benefited from the guidance, wisdom and support of countless scholars, friends and family. The doctoral dissertation was completed under the supervision of Hindy Najman who provided guidance and insight that ensured that this project stayed on track in its final stages. This support and mentorship helped me to produce a dissertation that was more methodologically and conceptually robust, and more responsive to developments in other arenas in scholarship, than would otherwise have been the case. I thank Hindy for all her help and support, and for every time she went above and beyond to help this dissertation and book come into fruition.

I am grateful to those who read and critiqued chapters of the dissertation during my time at Oxford including Alison Salvesen and David G.K. Taylor, whose feedback during the Transfer and Confirmation of Doctoral Status helped improve the final submission. In addition, I would like to thank Loren T. Stuckenbruck and James C. VanderKam who served as the final examiners. Their questions, recommendations, and suggestions pushed me to sharpen and hone my methodology and analysis of the materials.

During this project's formative period, papers based on aspects of the research were presented at conferences including the SBL International meeting in Rome and the SBL Annual meeting in San Diego in 2019, and at a series of workshops and seminars hosted by the Faculty of Theology in Oxford and as part of the Groningen-Leuven-Oxford network. Whilst the dissertation was being revised for publication, papers were also presented at a Fellowship for Biblical Studies meeting in Sydney and as part of the Enoch Seminar's *Enoch Studies in the 2020s* online conference organized by Gabriele Boccaccini and Joshua Scott. I thank those whose questions and feedback helped guide my thinking and consequently contributed to the improvement of the dissertation and book including Eibert J.C. Tigchelaar, Arjen Bakker, Daniel Schumann, Yael Fisch, Jeremiah Coogan, Ralph Lee, Ian Young, amongst many others. Furthermore, I am grateful to Alessandro Bausi and the organizers of the Fourth Hiob Ludolf Centre Summer School in Ethiopian and Eritrean Manuscript Studies held in Addis Ababa in 2019 for the opportunity to participate and learn in their program.

The Covid-19 pandemic provided many challenges and restrictions during my doctoral research. I am thankful to those who provided support that minimized this disruption to my studies and research including Hindy Najman, my fellow doctoral candidates, and the broader Old Testament/Hebrew Bible academic community in Oxford. Moreover, I am grateful to the staff at the Bodleian Library, British Library, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, and the Hill Museum and Manuscript Library who answered many questions and assisted with their physical and/or digital manuscript collections.

This project is indebted to the work of countless Enochic scholars from the past and present. Some aspects of this project would not have been possible without the ongoing work of Loren T. Stuckenbruck, Ted M. Erho, amongst many others involved in the study and digitalization of the manuscripts of Ethiopic Enoch, and I particularly thank them for their dedicated work. Loren provided additional information on several manuscripts of Ethiopic Enoch, and confirmed the manuscript attestation of several readings, for which I am grateful. In addition, I am thankful to Ian Young and John Barton who supervised earlier projects focused on the Enochic Book of the Watchers, during an Honours year at the University of Sydney, and a MPhil in Theology at Oxford respectively. Their critical and gentle guidance helped shape my approach to the Enochic literature.

I would like to thank the anonymous reviewers who read and critiqued my initial manuscript. Their feedback highlighted areas for further thinking that not only improved the book, but also helped me to turn the work into a book rather than a dissertation. A special thanks goes to Karina Martin Hogan and René Bloch for accepting this study for publication in the Brill Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism series, and to Karina for her detailed proofreading and feedback during the revision process. Moreover, I would like to thank those at Brill who helped during the production of this book.

My time at Oxford, the dissertation, and this book would never have materialized without the love, support and infinite patience of my wife Bethany. Bethany provided constant and abundant encouragement amidst all the challenges of completing the dissertation whilst resident in Oxford and during Covid lockdowns in Sydney, and throughout the relentless rewriting and revision of this project, as it morphed and developed into what it became. The love and joy provided by our two young children, Emily and Judah, motivated me throughout the revision. This book is dedicated to them in gratitude for everything.

Figures and Tables

Figures

1	4QEn ^a 1 i a, line 1 (Plate 904, Frag 1 – B-366853)	109
2	4QEn ^a 1 i a, line 2 (Plate 904, Frag 1 – B-366853)	118
3	4QEn ^a 1 i b, line 1 (Plate 904, Frag 2 – B-366855)	121
4	4QEn ^a 1 i a, line 3 (Plate 904, Frag 1 – B-366853)	122
5	4QEn ^a 1 i b, line 2 (Plate 904, Frag 2 – B-366855)	125
6	4QEn ^a 1 i a, line 4 (Plate 904, Frag 1 – B-366853)	126
7	4QEn ^a 1 i a, line 5 (Plate 904, Frag 1 – B-366853)	133
8	4QEn ^a 1 i b, line 4 (Plate 904, Frag 2 – B-366855)	143
9	4QEn ^a 1 i b, line 4 (Plate 904, Frag 2 – B-366855)	144
10	4QEn ^a 1 i a, line 1 and 2 (Plate 904, Frag 3 – B-366857)	148
11	4QEn ^a 1 i b, line 4 (Plate 904, Frag 2 – B-366855)	154
12	4QEn ^c 1 i a, line 1 (Plate 199, Frag 6 – B-359528)	161
13	4QEn ^c 1 i a, line 1 (Plate 199, Frag 6 – B-359528)	161

Tables

1	4QEn ^a 1 i a (Book of the Watchers 1:1)	108
2	4QEn ^a 1 i a (Book of the Watchers 1:2a)	115
3	4QEn ^a 1 i a & 1 i b (Book of the Watchers 1:2b)	120
4	4QEn ^a 1 i a & 1 i b (Book of the Watchers 1:2c)	125
5	4QEn ^a 1 i a & 1 i b (Book of the Watchers 1:3b)	132
6	4QEn ^a 1 i a & 1 i b (Book of the Watchers 1:4b–c)	141
7	4QEn ^a 1 i a & 1 i b (Book of the Watchers 1:5b)	151
8	4QEn ^a 1 i b (Book of the Watchers 1:6a?)	155
9	4QEn ^c 1 i a (Book of the Watchers 1:9)	160
10	BW 1:1a – Λόγος ἐϋλογίας Ἐνώχ	171

Abbreviations

The abbreviations and sigla utilized in this study usually follow *The SBL Handbook of Style*, 2nd ed. (Atlanta, SBL Press, 2014). The sigla used in the reconstructions and edited text of the Aramaic, Greek and Ethiopic versions of the Book of the Watchers 1:1–9 can be found in Chapter 1 and Appendices 1 and 2. Some additional abbreviations that are frequently used include:

BW	Book of the Watchers
DJD	Discoveries in the Judaean Desert
DSD	Dead Sea Discoveries
EMML	Ethiopian Manuscript Microfilm Library
EOTC	Ethiopic Orthodox Tewahədo Church
Eth. ^{EIS}	Hypothetical Earliest Identifiable Stratum of the Ethiopic Version based on the Eth. 1 manuscripts
G ^{Eth}	Hypothetical Greek Vorlage of the Ethiopic Version
G ^{Jude}	Enochic quotation preserved in the Greek Epistle of Jude 14b–15
G ^{Syn}	Greek text-type preserved in Chronography of Syncellus
HMML	Hill Museum & Monastic Library, Collegeville, MN
IAA	Israel Antiquities Authority
MS	Manuscript
MSS	Manuscripts
NT	New Testament
OT	Old Testament