

Episcopal Elections in the Churches

# Bologna Studies in Religious History

## *Advisory Board*

- Fernanda Alfieri, *Alma Mater Studiorum—University of Bologna*  
Eberhard Bons, *University of Strasbourg*  
Christophe Chalamet, *University of Geneva*  
Manuela Consonni, *The Hebrew University of Jerusalem*  
Rowan Dorin, *Stanford University*  
Hyacinthe Destivelle, *Dicastero per la promozione dell'unità dei cristiani, Rome*  
Alba Fedeli, *University of Hamburg*  
Frédéric Gugelot, *University of Reims*  
Atria Larson, *Saint Louis University*  
Susanna Mancini, *Alma Mater Studiorum—University of Bologna*  
Christoph Marksches, *Berlin-Brandenburgische Akademie der Wissenschaften*  
Renato Moro, *University of Roma Tre*  
Giuseppe Ruggieri, *FSCIRE, Bologna*  
Nora K. Schmid, *University of Oxford*  
Devin Stewart, *Emory College, Atlanta*  
Kirsi Stjerna, *California Lutheran University, Berkeley*  
Christoph Theobald, *Centre Sèvres, Paris*  
Roberto Tottoli, *University of Naples L'Orientale*

## *Editor-in-Chief*

Alberto Melloni, *Unimore—FSCIRE, Bologna-Palermo*

## *Executive Board*

Federico Ruoizzi (coordinator), Federico Alpi, Costanza Bianchi, Francesca Cadeddu,  
Fabrizio D'Avenia

## *Editorial Board*

Valentina Bottanelli, Gianmarco Braghi, Davide Dainese, Luca Ferracci, Enrico Galavotti,  
Anna Mambelli, Marianna Napolitano, Ivana Panzeca, Massimiliano Proietti, Laura Righi,  
Silvia Scatena

## *Editing*

Ilaria Bernini, Giancarlo Corda

## VOLUME 2

The titles published in this series are listed at [brill.com/bsrh](http://brill.com/bsrh)

# Episcopal Elections in the Churches

*Laws, Practices, Doctrines*

*Edited by*

Alberto Melloni  
Federico Ruozi



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON



Volume realised thanks to the contribution of UNESCO Chair on Religious Pluralism and Peace, Ministero dell'Università e della Ricerca (MUR), Ministero della Cultura (MiC), and Regione Emilia-Romagna.



Cover illustration: Christ the Vine. Angelos. 1425–1457. Public Domain.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>  
LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024040619>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: “Brill”. See and download: [brill.com/brill-typeface](http://brill.com/brill-typeface).

ISSN 2666-1675

ISBN 978-90-04-52209-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-71287-4 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004712874

Copyright 2025 by Alberto Melloni and Federico Ruozi. Published by Koninklijke Brill BV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill BV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schönningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

Koninklijke Brill BV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill BV via [brill.com](http://brill.com) or [copyright.com](http://copyright.com).

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

# Contents

Notes on Contributors VII

- 1 Introduction: "Ὁν ἔξελέξω: on the Procedures, Norms, Doctrines, and Implications of Episcopal Elections in the Christian Churches 1  
*Alberto Melloni*
- 2 The Institutionalisation of Church Ministry in the Second and Third Centuries 15  
*Georg Schöllgen*
- 3 Bishops and Emperors: Episcopal Elections and Bishop–Emperor Relationships from Constantine to Theodosius 29  
*Ramón Teja Casuso and Silvia Acerbi*
- 4 Procedures for the Election of the Bishop of Rome in Ostrogothic Italy 45  
*Rita Lizzi Testa*
- 5 "Nullus inuitis detur episcopus": The Prerequisites for Episcopal Elections in Late Antiquity and Their Consequences in the Medieval Church 66  
*Jürgen Miethke*
- 6 "Nullus inuitis detur episcopus": The Origin of a Formula in the Epistolary of Leo the Great 89  
*Davide Dainese*
- 7 Armenian Levites?: An Outline of the Evolution of Episcopal Elections in Armenia from the Eighth to the Thirteenth Century 112  
*Federico Alpi*
- 8 The Golden Age of Episcopal Elections (1100–1300) 154  
*Kenneth Pennington*
- 9 "Mais maintenant les mondains par envie/Ont usurpé la sainte election": The Concordat of Bologna (1516) and Its Critics 163  
*Gianmarco Braghi*

- 10 Election and Appointment of Bishops at the Council of Trent 189  
*Matteo Al Kalak*
- 11 Apostolic Succession and Church Freedom: the Oxford Movement's  
Political Discourse and the Church Temporalities Act of 1833 211  
*Luca Ferracci*
- 12 On the Appointment of Bishops in Vietnam 225  
*Enrico Galavotti*
- Index of Names 263

## Notes on Contributors

### *Silvia Acerbi*

graduated in classical studies from the University of Bologna (1993). She has been professor of ancient history at the University of Cantabria (Spain) since 2011. She specialised in the research of Byzantine Italy through the *Registrum Epistularum* of Gregory the Great, in political and ecclesiastical conflicts in the late-antique Mediterranean, in the study of the Roman papacy in the context of the Pentarchy and the great ecumenical councils of the fifth century. She is the author of five monographs and co-editor of five collective works.

### *Matteo Al Kalak*

is professor of modern history at the University of Modena and Reggio Emilia. He has conducted research on religious history with particular attention to the religious non-conformism. His publications include various monographs and scientific articles on the Inquisition, the Council of Trent, and the confraternities between the Middle Ages and the modern age. Among his recent monographs: *Fuoco e fiamme: Storia e geografia dell'inferno* (Turin, 2024); *Eating God: A History of the Eucharist* (London, 2024).

### *Federico Alpi*

received a Ph.D. in Armenian studies at the University of Pisa in 2015. He worked at the Universities of Bologna and of Modena and Reggio Emilia, with research periods in Yerevan and Oxford. Currently a research fellow at the University of Florence, he is also member of FSCIRE.

### *Gianmarco Braghi*

(Ph.D., Trinity College Dublin) is assistant professor of history of Christianity and churches at the Department of Cultures and Societies of the University of Palermo, where he acts as Deputy Principal Investigator of ITSERR, Italian Strengthening of the European RI RESILIENCE (Religious Studies Infrastructure: Tools, Innovation, Experts, Connections and Centers), a project funded by the National Recovery and Resilience Plan (PNRR)—Identifier: IR0000014, Unique Project Code: B53C22001770006. He is a member of FSCIRE, where he coordinates the Giuseppe Alberigo European School for Advanced Religious Studies.

*Davide Dainese*

is professor of history of Christianity at the University of Bologna. His research interests are Patristics (more precisely, the history of exegesis, gnosticism, and the Alexandrian tradition) and a number of deep-rooted diachronical themes (conciliar history, political theology, use of Church Fathers during the modern and contemporary eras, wars of religion).

*Luca Ferracci*

is research fellow at the Department of Education and Humanities of the University of Modena and Reggio Emilia. He coordinates the international edition of the multi-volume work *A History of the Desire for Christian Unity: Ecumenism in the Churches (19th–21st Century)*, published by Brill and in Italian by Il Mulino.

*Enrico Galavotti*

is associate professor of history of Christianity at the University of Chieti-Pescara. He is a member of the scientific committees of the international journal of theology *Concilium*, the national edition of Aldo Moro's works and the Istituto per la Storia dell'Azione Cattolica e del Movimento cattolico in Italia (ISACEM). He is a member of the doctoral college in historical studies from the Middle Ages to the contemporary age at the University of Teramo and of the Italian Doctoral School Of Religious Studies.

*Rita Lizzi Testa*

studied in Florence, London, and Princeton. She taught at the University of Turin and is now professor of Roman History at the University of Perugia. She is editor and co-editor of many volumes on the conflict and dialogue among pagans and Christians in the Roman Empire. Her more recent book is *Christian Emperors and Roman Elites in Late Antiquity* (London, 2022).

*Jürgen Miethke*

studied history and theology at the universities of Göttingen (1958–1960) and West Berlin (1960–1967) and has been professor of medieval and modern history at the University of Heidelberg from 1984 to 2003. His publications include: *Ockhams Weg zur Sozialphilosophie* (Berlin, 1969); *De potestate papae: Die päpstliche Amtskompetenz* (Tübingen, 2000); *Studieren an mittelalterlichen Universitäten: Chancen und Risiken* (Leiden, 2004); *Politische Scholastik—Spätmittelalterliche Theorien der Politik* (2021); *Wilhelm von Ockham: Die Amtsvollmacht von Papst und Klerus, III.1 Dialogus* (4 vols., Freiburg i.Br., 2015–2020).

*Kenneth Pennington*

is Kelly-Quinn professor emeritus of ecclesiastical and legal history at the Catholic University of America Washington, DC. He is editor of the *Bulletin of Medieval Canon Law* and of *Studies in Medieval and Early Modern Canon Law*.

*Georg Schöllgen*

is professor emeritus of ancient church history and patrology at the Catholic Theological Faculty of the University of Bonn. He has been a member of the Patristic Commission of the German Academies of Sciences since 2002, a full member of the humanities class of the North Rhine-Westphalia Academy of Sciences since 2005, and deputy chairman of the Patristic Commission of the German Academies of Sciences.

*Ramón Teja Casuso*

graduated in classical philology and ancient history from the University of Salamanca (1972). He earned an honoris causa degree from the University of Bologna (2002). He is professor emeritus at the University of Cantabria since 2015. His research activity focused especially on the history of Rome and the Roman Empire in late antiquity and on Christianity as a social phenomenon in antiquity and its relations with Judaism and paganism. He is author of more than 160 publications (books, conference papers, and articles in scientific journals) in Spanish, Italian, French, German, and English.