

The Rome Statute and Islamic Law

Brill's Arab and Islamic Laws Series

VOLUME 16

The Rome Statute and Islamic Law

*A Comparative Analysis with Special Reference
to Saudia Arabia*

By

Majed Handi Alsolami



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Alsolami, Majed Handi, author.

Title: The Rome Statute and Islamic law : a comparative analysis with special reference to Saudia Arabia / Majed Handi Alsolami.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill/Nijhoff, 2024. | Series: Brill's Arab and Islamic laws series, 1871-2894 ; volume 16 | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024032705 (print) | LCCN 2024032706 (ebook) |

ISBN 9789004711273 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004711730 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (1998 July 17) |

International criminal law (Islamic law) | Criminal justice, Administration of

(Islamic law) | Criminal jurisdiction—Saudi Arabia. | International criminal

law—Saudi Arabia. | Criminal justice, Administration of—Saudi Arabia.

Classification: LCC KBP4538 .A94 2024 (print) | LCC KBP4538 (ebook) |

DDC 345/.167—dc23/eng/20240716

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024032705>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024032706>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 1871-2894

ISBN 978-90-04-71127-3 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-71173-0 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004711730

Copyright 2024 by Koninklijke Brill bv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill bv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill bv via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements IX

Main Sources X

Cases XIII

PART 1

Preamble

1 Background 3

- 1 Introduction 3
- 2 The Main Book Questions 11
- 3 The Themes, Objectives, and Limitations of the Study 11
- 4 The Significance and Originality of the Study 13
- 5 Methodology 14
- 6 The Structure of the Study 22

2 A Brief Historical Overview of the Development of International Criminal Law 23

- 1 Introduction 23
- 2 An Overview of the Development of International Criminal Law 23
- 3 The Contentious Academic Arguments Surrounding the Court 29
- 4 Issues Raised by Some Arab/Islamic States about the Ratification of the Rome Statute 37
- 5 The Importance of the ICC 43
- 6 The Saudi Position with Regard to the ICC 45
- 7 Summary 48

PART 2

An Insight into the Sources/Principles of International Criminal Law and Islamic Criminal Law

3 Sources of the Rome Statute and Islamic Law: Commonalities and Differences 51

- 1 Introduction 51
- 2 The Sources of the Rome Statute 54
- 3 The Sources of Islamic Law 66

- 4 Mechanisms of Interpretation: Commonalities and Differences 84
- 5 The Nature of Islamic Criminal Law 88
- 6 Conclusion 102

- 4 A Macroscopic View of the Compatibilities and Incompatibilities between the Principles of Islamic Criminal Law and the Principles of the Rome Statute 104**
 - 1 Introduction 104
 - 2 The Principles of 'No Crime without Law' and 'No Punishment without Law' 108
 - 3 The Principle of Non-retroactivity 112
 - 4 A Person Shall Not Be Tried Twice for the Same Criminal Conduct (*ne bis in idem*) 117
 - 5 The Presumption of Innocence 121
 - 6 The Principle of Equality before the Law 126
 - 7 The Criminal Responsibility of Individuals 132
 - 8 Conclusion 166

PART 3

Comparative Approach

- 5 War Crimes 169**
 - 1 Introduction 169
 - 2 The Protection of Civilians 174
 - 3 The Protection of Prisoners of War 186
 - 4 The Destruction of Property 194
 - 5 The Protection of Humanitarian Assistance 198
 - 6 Using Prohibited Weapons 202
 - 7 Human Shields 207
 - 8 The Declaration of 'No Quarter' in War 209
 - 9 Protection of the Environment 211
 - 10 Conclusion 214

- 6 Crimes against Humanity 217**
 - 1 Introduction 217
 - 2 The Conditions for Crimes against Humanity as Stipulated in the Rome Statute 220
 - 3 Inhumane Acts that Fall within the Jurisdiction of the Rome Statute and Islamic International Law 224
 - 4 Conclusion 246

- 7 **The Crime of Genocide** 248
 - 1 Introduction 248
 - 2 The Element of Intent (*Mens Rea*) 250
 - 3 The Material Elements of Genocide (*Actus Rea*) and Categories of Genocide 255
 - 4 Conclusion 266

PART 4

Saudi Domestic Issues and the Reconciliatory Approach

- 8 **The Quest for Compatibility between Saudi Domestic Laws and the Rome Statute** 271
 - 1 Introduction 271
 - 2 An Overview of the Legal System of Saudi Arabia 273
 - 3 Saudi Domestic Provisions and the Rome Statute 281
 - 4 Inconsistencies with the Rome Statute 293
 - 5 Conclusion 305
- 9 **Conclusion** 309
 - 1 The Commonalities between the Other Tiers of Sources of Both Legal Systems 309
 - 2 Compatibility between General Principles of Law of Both Legal Systems 311
 - 3 Compatibility between the Jurisdiction of the Rome Statute and Islamic International Law 313
 - 4 How Can Saudi Domestic Law Be Reconciled with the Rome Statute? 316
 - 5 Recommendations 317
- Glossary** 319
- Bibliography** 321
- Index** 347

Acknowledgements

I must first and foremost thank Allah Almighty for his assistance and mercy in helping me complete this work despite the difficulties I have experienced during the efforts on this book. In this respect, I would like to say *alhamdulillah*.

I would also like to thank Professor Surya Subedi, QC, OBE, DCL, & DPhil (Oxford) for his support and valuable encouragement. Special thanks must also go to Professor Elies van Sliedregt for her assistance.

Special thanks go to my parents: my father, Handi, may Allah rest his soul, and my mother, Hamda, who has been praying and wishing every success for me. I would also like to thank my wife, Nouf Alsolami, and my children, Abdulelah, Yazid, Areen, and Salman. I am indebted to all of you. I offer you my warm and sincere thanks and gratitude for your smiles and for providing joy in my life.

Main Sources

1 Chronological

The Holy Book of Islam: The Quran.

2 International Treaties

The Hague Convention of 29 July 1899, entered into force on 4 September 1900.

The Hague Convention (IV) of 18 October 1907: Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its Annex and Regulations Concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land, entered into force on 26 January 1910.

The Versailles Convention, known as The Treaty of Peace, 28 June 1919, entered into force on 10 January 1920.

The Slavery Convention of 25 September 1926, entered into force on 9 March 1927.

The Charter of the United Nations of 1945.

Charter of the League of Arab States, 22 March 1945.

The Statute of The International Court of Justice, 24 October 1945.

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 10 December 1948.

The Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, 9 December 1948, entered into force on 12 January 1951.

The Geneva Convention (I) for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field of 12 August 1949, 75 UNTS 31, entered into force on 21 October 1950.

The Geneva Convention (II) for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of the Armed Forces at Sea, 12 August 1949, 75 UNTS 85, entered into force on 21 October 1950.

The Geneva Convention (III) Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, 12 August 1949, 75 UNTS 135, entered into force on 21 October 1950.

The Geneva Convention (IV) Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Times of War, 12 August 1949, 75 UNTS 287, entered into force on 21 October 1950.

Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II) 8 June 1977, 1125 UNTS 609.

Agreement for the Prosecution and Punishment of Major War Criminals of the European Axis and Establishing the Charter of the International Military Tribunals (1951) UNTS 279.

- The Charter of the International Military Tribunal: Annex to the Agreement for the Prosecution and Punishment of the Major War Criminals of the European Axis, London Agreement 15 March 1951.
- International Convention on Economic Social and Cultural Rights of 16 December 1966, entered into force on 3 January 1976.
- International Convention on Civil and Political Rights of 16 December 1966, entered into force on 23 March 1976.
- Convention on the Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitations to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity, New York, 26 November 1968, entered into force on 11 November 1970.
- Convention on the Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitations to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity, GA Res 2391 (XXIII), 26 November 1968, entered into force on 11 November 1970, in accordance with Article VIII.
- The Vienna Convention of Treaties of 23 May 1969, entered into force on 27 January 1980.
- International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid, 30 November 1973, entered into force on 18 July 1976.
- International Convention against the Taking of Hostages (New York) 1316, 17 December 1979, entered into force on 3 June 1983.
- Riyadh Arab Agreement for Judicial Co-operation, League of Arab States, 6 April 1983.
- The Convention against Torture and other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 10 December 1984, entered into force on 26 June 1987.
- The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child of 20 November 1989, entered into force on 2 September 1990.
- The Cairo Declaration on Human Rights in Islam, 4th Session Agenda Item 5, 31 July to 5 August 1990 United Nations Doc A/CONF.157/PC/62/Add 18 (1993).
- Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (1992), proclaimed by the General Assembly Resolution 47/133, A/RES/47/133 of 18 December 1992.
- Statute of the International Tribunal for the Prosecution of Persons Responsible for Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of the Former Yugoslavia since 1993.
- The Suppression of Terrorism Convention of Arab Countries, April 1998.
- The European Convention of Human Rights 1998.
- The Rome Statute of The International Criminal Court, 17 July 1998, entered into force on 1 July 2002.
- The United Nations Convention on Jurisdictional Immunities of States and their Property, 2 December 2004 (not yet in force).
- Arab Charter on Human Rights, 22 May 2004, reprinted in 12 Int'l Hum. Rts. Rep 893, 22 May 2004, entered into force on 15 March 2008.

The International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance 2006.

The Elements of Crimes of the Rome Statute adopted at the 2010 Review Conference are replicated from the Official Records of the Review Conference of the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, Kampala, 31 May–11 June 2010.

Statutes of the International Committee of the Red Cross, 3 October 2013.

3 Saudi Domestic Legislation

Saudi Basic Law of Governance issued by Royal Decree No. (A/91) 27 Sha'ban 1412 H (1 March 1992) published in 3397 2 Umm Al-Qura Gazette Ramadan 1412 H on 5 March 1992.

Saudi Criminal Procedure Law issued by Royal Decree No. M/3 on 22/1/1435 H. The Law of Board of Grievances created by Royal Decree No. 2/13/8759 17-9-1374 H. This was later replaced by a new law issued by Royal Decree No. 78 19-9-1428 H.

The Saudi Shura Council Law issued by Royal Decree No. A/91 27/8/1412 H.

The Law of Council of Ministers in Saudi Arabia issued by Royal Decree No. A/12 3/12/1414 H.

The Saudi Judiciary law of Saudi Arabia issued by Royal Decree No. M/78 19/9/1428 H.

The Saudi Anti-Cyber Crime Law issued by Royal Decree No. M/17 26 March 2007.

Cases

- Nicaragua v. United States of America* (Judgment of 27 June 1986).
- Barbera, Messegue and Jabardo v. Spain* (1988) Series A No. 146 (77).
- Case Concerning Maritime Delimitation and Territorial Questions between Qatar and Bahrain, the Judgment of The International Court of Justice about Maritime Delimitation and Territorial Questions between Qatar and Bahrain (Judgment of July 1994); see Report of the ICJ, 112, Judgment of July 1994.
- Prosecutor v. Du[ko tadi]* (ICTY. IT-94-1-T 7 May 1997).
- Prosecutor v. Kambanda* (ICTR 97-23-S, Judgment, 4 September 1998).
- Prosecutor v. Akayesu* (ICTR-96-4-T, Judgment, 25 September 1998).
- Prosecutor v. Kayishema and Ruzindana* (ICTR-95-1-T, Judgment, 21 May 1999).
- Prosecutor v. Blagoje Simić, Milan Simić, Miroslav Tadić, Stevan Todorović, Simo Zarić* (ICTY Trial Chamber, 27 June 1999).
- Prosecutor v. Du[ko tadi]* (ICTY IT-94-1-A 15 in the Appeal Chamber, July 1999).
- Judgment Tadic (ICTY. IT-94-1, Appeals Chamber, 15 July 1999).
- Prosecutor v. Rutaganda* (ICTR 96-3-T, 6 December 1999).
- Prosecutor v. Kupreskic* (ICTY. IT-95-16-T, Judgment 24 January 2000).
- Prosecutor v. Bagilishema* (ICTR T. Ch. 17, June 2001).
- Prosecutor v. Radislav Krstic* (ICTY IT-98-33-T, Judgment, 2 August 2001).
- Prosecutor v. Mladen Naletilic, aka "Tuta" and Vinko Martinovic, aka "Štela"* (ICRY IT-98-34-T, Judgment, 31 March 2003).
- Prosecutor v. Krstic* (ICTY: No: IT-98-33-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment 134, 19 April 2004).
- Prosecutor v. Uganda* (ICC-02/04-01/05-2005) Pre-Trial Chamber II of The International Criminal Court on 28 October 2005.
- Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo, Lubanga* (ICC 01/04-01/06-803-TEN 332, February 2007) (342), Confirmation Decision of The Pre-Trial Chamber.
- Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo* No: (ICC-01/04/-01/06, 29 January 2007).
- Prosecutor v. Ahmad Muhammad Harun (Ahmad Harun) & Ali Muhammad Al Abd Al-Rahman (Al Kushayb)* (ICC-02/05-01/07-1-Corr) Decision on the Prosecution's Application under Article 58(7) of the Statute, Pre-Trial Chamber 1, 27 April 2007 (93-94).
- Prosecutor v. Katanga et al.*, Judgment (ICC-01/04-01/07-717.2008).
- Prosecutor v. Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir* (ICC-02/05-01/09.2009).
- Prosecutor v. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo* (ICC-01/05-01/08. 2009) Pre-Trial Chamber, Situation in The Central African Republic, 15 June 2009.

Prosecutor v. Germain Katanga and Mathieu Ngudjolo Chui, No. (ICC-10/04-01/07, September 2009) (526), (Decision of The Pre-Trial Chamber I on the Confirmation of Charges).

Prosecutor v. Muammar Mohammed Abuminyar Gaddafi, Saif Al-Islam Gaddafi (ICC-01/11-2011).

Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo (0.29 MB | (ICC-01/04-01/06-2881, 14 May 2012).

Prosecutor v. Bemba (Pre-Trial Chamber II case No. ICC-01/05-01/08.2009, Judgment, 21 March 2016).

Prosecutor v. Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo, International Criminal Court No. (ICC-01/05-01/08 A 8 June 2018), https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2018_02984.PDF, Pre-Trial Chamber I, Katanga decision (ICC-01/04-01/07-717).