

European Yearbook on Human Rights 2024

Edited by

Philip Czech, Lisa Heschl, Karin Lukas,
Manfred Nowak and Gerd Oberleitner



BRILL | NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2566-137X

ISBN 978-90-04-70837-2 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-70838-9 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004708389

Copyright 2025 by Philip Czech, Lisa Heschl, Karin Lukas, Manfred Nowak and Gerd Oberleitner. Published by Koninklijke Brill BV, Plantijnstraat 2, 2321 JC Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill BV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill BV via brill.com or copyright.com.

For more information: info@brill.com

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Preface IX
List of Figures and Tables XII
Notes on Contributors XIII

PART 1

Human Rights Developments in EUROPE and Beyond

- 1 Advancing the Protection of Fundamental Rights through AI Regulation: How the EU and the Council of Europe Are Shaping the Future 3
Francesco Paolo Levantino and Federica Paolucci
- 2 AI Surveillance and Human Rights – The Perils and Promises of the AI Act 38
Michalina Marcia
- 3 A Human Rights-Based Approach to Artificial Intelligence in Healthcare: A Proposal for a Patients’ Rights Impact Assessment Tool 66
Hannah Van Kolschooten
- 4 Overlooked Instruments: The European Protection of Human Rights in the Climate Crisis 99
Paulina Rundel
- 5 Non-governmental and National Human Rights Institutions’ Interventions before the European Court of Human Rights in Cases Relating to the Environment and the Climate 135
Elisabeth Lambert
- 6 The COVID-19 Pandemic and the European Court of Human Rights – The Grand Chamber Decision in *Communauté Genevoise D’action Syndicale (CGAS) v. Switzerland* 169
Ronagh McQuigg
- 7 Health Cases before European Courts: From Non-refoulement to Subsidiary Protection through Health Lens 188
Kamilla Galicz

- 8 The Temporary Protection Directive and the Question of Derogation under the 1951 Refugee Convention 219
Elias Faller
- 9 Human Rights in Exceptional Times: Trends in Derogations Regimes among the Council of Europe's Members, and the Responses of the European Court of Human Rights 244
Stéphanie Lagoutte
- 10 Venturing into 'Mega-politics' at Strasbourg: The New Right to a Same-Sex Registered Partnership 278
Helen Fenwick
- 11 Medically Assisted Reproduction and the ECtHR – The Evolving Case Law in an Evolving Field 317
Marianna Iliadou
- 12 Child Rights Strategic Litigation: Exploring Recent Cases to Advance the Rights of Children Deprived of Their Liberty for Migration-Related Reasons 358
Chiara Altafin
- 13 Regulating Business and Human Rights in the EU: The Need for a Continued Interplay between Soft- and Hard-Law Instruments 388
Signe Andreassen Lysgaard and Gabrielle Holly
- 14 An Assessment of the Tusk Government's First Actions in Rebuilding the Rule of Law 418
Agnieszka Bień-Kacala
- 15 Accountability for Human Rights Violation in Contested State-Like Entities – The Case of Transnistria 445
Natalia Cwicinskaja

PART 2***Jurisprudence by the Courts***

- 16 The Court of Justice of the European Union and Human Rights in
2023 485
Alfred Benny Auner
- 17 The Case Law of the ECtHR in 2023: The Proceduralisation of the
ECHR 523
Lorenzo Acconciamesa
- Index 561

Preface

We are greatly honoured to present the latest edition of the *European Yearbook on Human Rights*, a compilation of cutting-edge scholarship and comprehensive analyses addressing some of the most pressing human rights issues of our time. As editors, we are privileged to curate a collection that reflects the evolving landscape of human rights within Europe and beyond, offering critical insights into and fostering a deeper understanding of the multifaceted challenges and opportunities in the field.

This edition covers a wide range of topics, each addressing significant and contemporary human rights concerns. Contributions cover, *inter alia*, the intersection of climate change and human rights and exploring legal frameworks and policy and juridical responses aimed at safeguarding environmental justice; the implications of AI on privacy, surveillance and autonomy, emphasising the need for robust regulatory mechanisms to protect individuals' rights in the digital age; the recognition of same-sex parental and reproductive rights, cornerstones of gender equality examined through the lens of recent legislative changes and societal debates on non-discrimination; the relationship between business and human rights, exploring the accountability mechanisms for corporate actions and the pursuit of sustainable and ethical business practices; the rights of refugees and protection seekers and the urgent need for human-rights based approaches to new challenges and protection in the field of asylum and migration; the role of non-state entities in the protection of human rights and the potential of NGOs to intervene in cases brought to human rights courts, to select just a few.

While the *European Yearbook on Human Rights 2024* remains a critical resource for tracking and analysing human rights developments in Europe and beyond, there have been considerable changes on our side. This edition marks the first time the *Yearbook* is being published by Brill, following a transition from our previous publisher, Intersentia. We extend our heartfelt thanks to Intersentia for their unwavering support and collaboration over the years. As we embark on this new chapter with Brill, we look forward to a fruitful partnership and continued excellence in bringing crucial human rights issues to the forefront.

As we navigate an increasingly complex world, this edition of the *European Yearbook on Human Rights* serves as a vital resource for scholars, practitioners,

policymakers and advocates. It is our hope that the rigorous analyses and diverse perspectives presented herein will contribute to the ongoing discourse and inspire meaningful action towards the realisation of human rights for all.

Lisa Heschl, Philip Czech, Karin Lukas, Manfred Nowak and Gerd Oberleitner

This publication is supported by



PARIS
LODRON
UNIVERSITY
SALZBURG

Austrian Human Rights
Institute



Global Campus
of Human Rights



unesco

Chair

UNIVERSITY OF GRAZ

European Training and Research Centre for
Human Rights and Democracy



**VIENNA FORUM FOR
DEMOCRACY AND HUMAN RIGHTS**



CEU : CENTRAL
: EUROPEAN
: UNIVERSITY



Co-funded by
the European Union

Figures and Tables

Figures

- 3.1 Patients' rights impact assessment for medical AI 89

Tables

- 3.1 Phase 1 – Product selection 91
- 3.2 Phase 2 – Procedural safeguards 94
- 3.3 Phase 3 – Assessing rights 95

Notes on Contributors

Lorenzo Acconciamesa

works as an assistant lawyer at the Registry of the European Court of Human Rights. He holds a Ph.D. in public international law from the 'Human Rights: Evolution, Protection and Limits' programme of the University of Palermo, Italy, and the École Doctorale de Droit de la Sorbonne, Université Paris 1, Panthéon-Sorbonne. His research fields are international human rights law, with special emphasis on the international protection of vulnerable individuals, the interpretation of international law, and international procedural law.

Chiara Altafin

is a research manager at the headquarters of the Global Campus of Human Rights in Venice, where she has also been a teaching fellow for the European Master's in Human Rights and Democratisation since September 2015. She holds a Ph.D. in International Law and an LL.M. in Comparative, European and International Laws, both from the European University Institute (EUI), and a Master's in Rule of Law, Democracy and Human Rights from LUISS University. She graduated cum laude at the Law Department of Roma Tre University and has been admitted to the Italian Bar.

Alfred Benny Auer

joined in the Department of Public Law, University of Salzburg as Postdoctoral Researcher in January 2023. Previously, he was a senior scientist at the Austrian Human Rights Institute, University of Salzburg and worked as an associate focused on family law. Regarding fundamental rights, he is focused on freedom of speech in the digital age. Besides that, his research interests are Austrian constitutional law, administrative law (especially trade and procedural law) and the interrelationship between EU and national law.

Agnieszka Bień-Kacala

is Professor of Constitutional Law at the Institute of Legal Sciences of the University of Szczecin, Poland. She is Leader of the Research Group on Gender and Constitution in Poland. She has also served as Principal Investigator within the Polish NSC grant entitled Illiberal Constitutionalism in Poland and Hungary. Her latest co-authored (with Timea Drinóczi) book on illiberal constitutionalism was published by Routledge in 2022.

Philip Czech

holds Dr. iur. and Dr. phil. degrees. Since 2002 he has been Senior Researcher at the Austrian Institute for Human Rights. He is the editor of the *Newsletter Menschenrechte*, a periodical reporting in German on the current case law of the European Court of Human Rights. His fields of interest are the case law of the ECtHR and its transposition in Austria, asylum and migration law, the freedom of reproductive choice and family law, as well as human rights in the penitentiary system.

Natalia Cwicinskaja

is Assistant Professor of International Law and International Organisations at Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznan. Her areas of interest include statehood, recognition in international law, the creation of states, human rights law and unrecognised entities. Together with Piotr Okesky she is editor of *Moldova: In search of its own place in Europe* (Oficyna Wydawnicza Epigram, 2013).

Elias Faller

is a research and teaching assistant and a Ph.D. candidate at the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy at the University of Graz (UNI-ETC). In his teaching and research he focuses on human rights law and international refugee law. He is a member of the 'Promoting Academic Freedom in Ukraine' Erasmus project and participates in national fora on the promotion of human rights in Austria. He graduated from the law school of the University of Graz and also holds a BA in translation (German-Arabic).

Helen Fenwick

is Professor of Law at Durham University, Joint Director of the University of Durham Human Rights Centre (until 2012), and a Human Rights Consultant to Doughty Street Chambers. She specialises in human rights, especially in relation to the European Convention on Human Rights and discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation. Her monographs include *Media Freedom under the Human Rights Act* (Oxford University Press, 2006) and *Civil Liberties and Human Rights* (Routledge, 2017). She co-authored a number of journal articles including 'Protecting free speech and academic freedom in universities' in *Modern Law Review* (2018) 81(5), 'Finding "East"/ "West" divisions in Council of Europe states on treatment of sexual minorities' in *European Human Rights Law Review* (2019) 3, and 'Keeping Control of personal information in the digital age: efficacy and equivalence of tortious and GDPR/DPA relief' in *Law Quarterly Review* (2022) 138(3).

Kamilla Galicz

is a Ph.D. candidate in law at the Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies in Pisa. Prior to starting her Ph.D. studies, she gained professional experience first as a country-of-origin information specialist at the Hungarian Immigration and Asylum Office and then as a trainee lawyer at a prestigious law firm in Budapest with a large Italian- and English-speaking clientele. She has published a number of articles and participated in Italian and international conferences on diverse topics, such as asylum, immigration and populism, the protection of fundamental rights in emergency contexts and social rights in the EU. Her doctoral research focuses on the connections between health cases, the principle of *non-refoulement* and the right to asylum. She spent a five-month-long research period at the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy (University of Graz) from October 2023 to February 2024. Her recent articles include 'The never-ending story of judicial review in composite administrative proceedings: latest developments in the field of asylum' in *Diritto, Immigrazione e Cittadinanza* (2023) 1 and 'One Health, One Society: Il diritto alla salute quale presupposto per il diritto di asilo' in *Corti Supreme e Salute, Sezione Speciale – One World, One Health ... Which Law?* (2022) 3.

Lisa Heschl

is Senior Scientist at the European Training and Research Centre on Human Rights and Democracy at the University of Graz (Uni-ETC). She received her Ph.D. in law from the University of Graz and holds a European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation (E.MA). Her research focuses on the European migration and asylum policy and legislation, the extraterritorial application of international and European refugee and human rights law and its relationship with European border policies.

Gabrielle Holly

is Chief Adviser on Business and Human Rights at the Danish Institute for Human Rights, leading the team's work on legal and regulatory developments relevant to fostering business respect for human rights. She is a business and human rights specialist and an experienced commercial disputes practitioner, having practised over the last decade at Magic Circle firms in Australia and the UK and advising companies and states on business and human rights and public international law. Gabrielle was formerly a researcher in business and human rights at the British Institute of International and Comparative Law. She has published research papers on human rights due diligence in supply chains, mandatory due diligence laws and implementation of the 'smart mix',

and the role of transnational tort in providing access to remedy under the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights. Gabrielle is an Australian-qualified lawyer and holds a Master of Laws with Distinction from the London School of Economics and Political Science and a combined Bachelor of Laws/Bachelor of Arts with Honours from the University of Western Australia.

Marianna Iliadou

joined the University of Sussex as Lecturer in Law in August 2022, having previously been a Teaching Fellow in Medical Law and Ethics at Durham University. She holds a Ph.D. in Law from Durham University, where she explored surrogacy and its possible protection under the umbrella of the European Convention of Human Rights. Marianna's doctoral research was funded by the *Modern Law Review*, and she was also recipient of the prestigious Helen Reece Award. She conducts research at the intersection of medical law, family law and human rights, with her research including, among others, medically assisted reproduction and legal parenthood, the human rights and reproductive justice frameworks, domestic and international surrogacy practices within and beyond Europe.

Stéphanie Lagoutte

is Senior Researcher at the Danish Institute for Human Rights. She holds a Ph.D. in law from the University of Paris 1, Panthéon-Sorbonne, and one from the University of Aarhus. She has worked at and published articles about the European Court of Human Rights, the right to respect for family life, religious freedom, etc. Most of her recent work focuses on the duties and role of the state in human rights protection. She is the co-editor of two journal special issues on the State Actors of the National Human Rights System (*Nordic Journal of Human Rights*, 2019) and on Governmental Human Rights Focal Points (*Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights*, 2021). She has taught at the Global Campus' Arab Master on Democratisation and Human Rights since 2015. Her new research project focuses on human rights in exceptional times and looks into the response of international and domestic human rights mechanisms to emergency situations.

Élisabeth Lambert

is a CNRS research director in legal sciences working in the Law & Social Change (Nantes University) research unit. She specialises in issues involving the enforcement of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights, access to justice and the possibilities for victims to obtain redress for violations of their rights. From January 2017 to July 2018, she was a professor at an Australian

university (Perth). In recent years, her field of investigation has been environmental health (the right to a healthy and ecologically sustainable environment/pesticide regulation). She has repeatedly been called upon to advise the Council of Europe. She authored three monographies: *Les effets des arrêts de la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme* (Bruylant, 1999), *The execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights* (Conseil de l'Europe, 2008) and *Prendre au sérieux le droit à l'alimentation saine et durable* (Peter Lang, 2024).

Francesco Paolo Levantino

is a Ph.D. candidate in international and European human rights law at the Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies in Pisa and Visiting Researcher within the Research Group on Law, Science, Technology and Society (LSTS) of the Vrije Universiteit Brussel (VUB). His research project focusses on the use of AI and biometric-based tools, such as emotion recognition, in law enforcement. In 2020, he obtained the European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation (EMA), writing his thesis on the human rights implications of facial recognition technology during his time as a visiting student at the KU Leuven Centre for Public Law. In 2018 he graduated *summa cum laude* in law from the University of Palermo. His thesis on substantive criminal law delved into the profound impact that the adoption of pre-emptive counterterrorism measures had on the structure of certain criminal offences, for which he received a special commendation.

Karin Lukas

is Professor of Legal Studies at the Central European University (CEU). She is an expert on the interactions between different human rights systems and institutions with a focus on the wider Europe as well as in the translation of human rights standards into activities of business, trade, development cooperation and climate change. She has acted as a consultant for various national and international organisations such as the UN Development Programme, MIGA (World Bank Group) the Austrian Ministry for Foreign Affairs and companies in various sectors, and was appointed a member of the European Committee of Social Rights of the Council of Europe in 2011 (until 2022).

Signe Andreassen Lysgaard

is Chief Adviser on Business and Human Rights at the Danish Institute for Human Rights. She is a political scientist from the University of Copenhagen and has more than a decade of experience in advising companies, financial institutions, governments and civil society organisations across sectors and geographies on corporate respect for human rights. Her current work focuses

on scaling up respect for human rights across the financial sector including by way of regulation. She engages in policy developments, project level collaborations with financial institutions and research activities. She served on the EU Platform on Sustainable Finance (2020–2022) and continues to serve as an expert advisor to a number of external bodies, including as a member of the EU Financial Reporting Advisory Group Sustainability Reporting Technical Expert Group (EFRAG SRTEG) and the Principles for Responsible Investment (PRI) Human Rights Technical Expert Group.

Michalina Marcia

is a Ph.D. candidate at the University of Wrocław and conducts research on the influence of artificial intelligence on criminal proceedings and defence rights. Since December 2021 she has been Research Assistant at the Digital Justice Center which was established as a part of the ‘Excellence Initiative – Research University’ that focuses on interdisciplinary research concerning the impact of new technologies on criminal justice systems. Since February 2023 she has collaborated as an expert at the GRAI – Working Group on AI in Poland in the AI and Ethics Subgroup, concentrating particularly on legal and constitutional aspects.

Ronagh McQuigg

is Reader at the School of Law, Queen’s University Belfast, Northern Ireland. Her research interests are in the area of international human rights law. She has published five sole-authored books – *International Human Rights Law and Domestic Violence* (Routledge, 2011), *Bills of Rights: A Comparative Perspective* (Intersentia, 2014), *The Istanbul Convention, Domestic Violence and Human Rights* (Routledge, 2017), *Criminal Justice Responses to Domestic Abuse in Northern Ireland* (Routledge, 2022) and *The European Convention on Human Rights and the COVID-19 Pandemic* (Routledge, 2024). She is also a co-editor (with Vanessa Bettinson) of *Criminalising Coercive Control: Challenges for the Implementation of Northern Ireland’s Domestic Abuse Offence* (Routledge, 2023). In addition, she has published various journal articles and chapters in edited books. She holds LL.B., LL.M. and Ph.D. degrees, all from Queen’s University Belfast and is a qualified solicitor and Senior Fellow of the Higher Education Academy. She currently teaches in the areas of Land Law and Family Law.

Manfred Nowak

is Professor of Human Rights and Scientific Director of the Vienna Master of Arts in Human Rights at Vienna University as well as Secretary General of the Global Campus of Human Rights in Venice. He has acted as an independent

expert for various institutions including the UN (e.g. as UN Independent Expert leading the UN Global Study on Children Deprived of Liberty, UN expert on enforced disappearances, UN Special Rapporteur on Torture) and the EU (e.g. Vice-Chair of the EU Fundamental Rights Agency in Vienna). He was director of the Netherlands Institute of Human Rights at the University of Utrecht, founder and co-director of the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights at the University of Vienna, and has held visiting chairs at the University of Lund, the Graduate Institute in Geneva, and Stanford University.

Gerd Oberleitner

is UNESCO Chair in Human Rights and Human Security at the Faculty of Law, University of Graz, and Director of the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy at the University of Graz. He has been a lecturer at the Centre for the Study of Human Rights of the London School of Economics and Political Science and Visiting Professor at the European Inter-University Centre, Venice, the Université du Québec à Montréal, the Universities of Ljubljana and Bochum and Rutgers University. He teaches in the Global Campus of Human Rights.

Federica Paolucci

is currently pursuing her Ph.D. in Constitutional Law, Curriculum in European and International Law, at Bocconi University. Additionally, she is the Coordinator of the LL.M. programme in Law of Internet Technology, Instructor in the Fundamentals of IT Law at the same university, and Teaching Assistant in EU Law at the SciencesPo Summer School. She is a visiting researcher of the TILT Centre (Institute for Law, Technology and Society) at Tilburg University. Her research primarily revolves around safeguarding fundamental rights in the context of artificial intelligence, particularly delving into the realm of biometric technologies. Her Ph.D. dissertation zeroes in on ensuring effective access to justice and remedies under the AI Act, with a specific focus on the implementation of face recognition systems within the law enforcement domain. Alongside Professors Finocchiaro, Pollicino and Donati, she is co-editing the upcoming volume entitled 'Artificial Intelligence Act', which is slated for release in 2024.

Paulina Rundel

LLM is a university assistant (prae doc) and a Ph.D. candidate in the Department of European, International and Comparative Law at the University of Vienna. Her research focuses on the intersection between Human Rights and Climate Litigation in International and European law. In addition, she assists Professor

Dr August Reinisch, the Special Rapporteur of the International Law Committee on the topic 'Settlement of disputes to which international organisations are parties'. Prior to this, Paulina studied law at the Humboldt University in Berlin and at King's College London, and afterwards worked at the legal department of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees and the United Nations Office for Outer Space Affairs in Vienna. She is a member of the Members' Consultative Committee on 'ELI Climate Justice – New Challenges for Law and Judges' at the European Law Institute.

Hannah van Kolschooten

is a researcher and a lecturer at the Law Centre for Health and Life (LCHL), University of Amsterdam. She is currently teaching and coordinating the course in International and European Health Law in the Health Law master's programme at the University of Amsterdam. She is also a Ph.D. fellow at the Amsterdam Institute for Global Health and Development (AIGHD) and an affiliated member of the Amsterdam Centre for European Law and Governance (ACELG). The topic of her Ph.D. research is EU regulation of algorithmic decision-making in public health and health care and focusses on safeguarding patients' rights. Hannah received an LL.M. in Health Law (*cum laude*, 2018) and an LL.M. in Information Law (*cum laude*, 2019) from the University of Amsterdam. She also studied at the University of Stellenbosch for a semester. In the 2023 Spring semester, she was Visiting Researcher in residence at Harvard Law School and the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics. In the 2024 Spring term, she was a Visiting Researcher in residence at Università di Verona.