

The Entangled Enoch

Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha

Series Editors

Grant Macaskill
Annette Yoshiko Reed

VOLUME 28

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/svtp

The Entangled Enoch

2 Enoch and the Cultures of Late Antiquity

By

Grant Macaskill



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

This project was funded by a British Academy Mid-Career Fellowship, awarded 2020, of £131,002.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>
LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISBN 978-90-04-69508-5 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-69509-2 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004695092

Copyright 2024 by Grant Macaskill. Published by Koninklijke Brill BV, Leiden, The Netherlands.
Koninklijke Brill BV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis,
Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

Koninklijke Brill BV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for
re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill BV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

*In memory of Annabella (Annabal Louis) Macaskill, 1914–2021,
and Allan Louis Macaskill, 1941–2023*

*Mar chuimhneachan air Annabella MacAsgail, 1914–2021,
agus Ailean Louis MacAsgail, 1941–2023*

Pill o m' anam, gu d' shuaimhneas
SALM CXVI, 7



Contents

Acknowledgements XI

Grant Macaskill

- 1 **The Entangled Enoch** 1
 - Introduction 1
 - 1 Renewing the Imagination and Reconsidering Metaphors: on Trees, Rhizomes and the Ecology of Concepts 6
 - 2 Relocating and Refiguring Groups and Networks in the Rhizome of Antiquity 16
 - 2.1 *Complicating the Classification of Groups* 16
 - 2.2 *Reconsidering the Normativity of the Networks and Their Literatures* 19
 - 3 On Frontiers, Colonialism and Orientalism (with Some Insights from Nissology) 27
 - 4 The Distinctive Significance of Syria as Provenance 32
 - Conclusions and Prospects: towards the Entangled Enoch 38
 - Postscript: a Note on Translations and Transliteration 40

- 2 **Reviewing the Provenance of 2 Enoch** 41
 - 1 An Overview of Manuscripts and Recensions 42
 - 2 The First Stages of Academic Research into 2 Enoch: Modern Slavic Scholarship 46
 - 3 Reviewing the Debates in Non-Slavic Scholarship 52
 - 3.1 *R.H. Charles* 52
 - 3.2 *André Vaillant* 56
 - 3.3 *J.T. Milik* 61
 - 3.4 *Francis I. Andersen* 64
 - 3.5 *Christfried Böttrich* 66
 - 3.6 *Andrei Orlov* 75
 - 4 Further Contributions: Pines, Himmelfarb, Reed and Alexander 79
 - 5 The 5th Enoch Seminar: Naples 2009. No Longer Slavonic Only? 84
 - Conclusions 85
 - A Postscript to Chapter 2: Samaritan Contexts for 2 Enoch? 88

- 3 Reviewing the Date, Provenance and Composition History of the Parables of Enoch** 90
- Reviewing the Dating and Provenance of the Parables of Enoch 90
- 1 The Absence of the Parables from Qumran and the Lack of Early External (i.e., Manuscript and Citation) Evidence 94
- 2 The Similarities and Differences with Demonstrably Early Enoch Material 96
- 3 The Presence of Imagery and Language That Is Similar to That Encountered in the New Testament 103
- 4 The Possibility That the Parables Contains Allusions to Specific Historical Events 105
- 5 The Distinctive Representation of Social and Economic Factors, including the Identification of the Kings and the Mighty Ones 107
- 6 The Composition of the Parables of Enoch 109
- Conclusions 111
- 4 Storehouses and Measures**
- Parallel Patterns in Metrology and Meteorology in the Parables of Enoch and 2 (Slavonic) Enoch* 114
- 1 Storehouses, Treasuries and Measures: Documenting Parallels in the Parables of Enoch and 2 Enoch 116
- 1.1 *Storehouses and Treasuries* 119
- 1.2 *Measures* 122
- 1.3 *The Imagery of Storehouses and Measures within the Primary Enoch Literature* 125
- 2 Biblical Backgrounds 126
- 3 Parallels in the Dead Sea Scrolls 130
- 4 A Rabbinic Parallel in b.Ḥagigah 12b 132
- 5 Parallels in Sefer Hekhalot (3 Enoch) and the Hekhalot Literature 133
- 6 Parallels in Other “Pseudepigrapha” 139
- Concluding Synthesis 143
- 5 God, Enoch and the Secrets**
- Theology, Cosmology, Cosmogony, Eschatology* 147
- Introduction 147
- 1 The Distribution of “Secrets” in the Parables of Enoch and 1 Enoch 148

- 2 God in the Parables of Enoch 155
- 3 The Book of the Secrets of Enoch 164
- 4 God and Cosmos in 2 Enoch: Eclectic Philosophy and Elements of Platonism 169
 - 4.1 *Negative Language, Measurement, and the Categorical Uniqueness of the Lord* 171
 - 4.2 *Creation in 2 Enoch: Being and Non-being, Visibility and Non-visibility, Nothing Itself* 181
- 5 Comparing the Parables and 2 Enoch to Sefer Hekhalot 186
 - Conclusions 190

- 6 God, Wisdom and Humanity in the Parables of Enoch and 2 Enoch 194**
 - 1 Wisdom and Creation outside the Parables of Enoch and 2 Enoch: Some Framing Considerations 195
 - 2 Wisdom in the Parables of Enoch 208
 - 3 God, Wisdom and the Creation of Man in 2 Enoch 215
 - 3.1 *"I Commanded My Wisdom to Create Humanity"* 222
 - Conclusions 234

- 7 Bodily Ascents and Ontological Transformations 237**
 - Introduction 237
 - 1 Problematizing "Monotheism" as a Context for "Deification" 237
 - 2 Visionary Ascent in the Aramaic Enoch Literature and Other Apocalypses 241
 - 3 Ascent and Ontological Transformation in the Parables of Enoch: an Embodied Turn? 243
 - 4 Bodily Ascent and Ontological Transformation in 2 Enoch 252
 - 5 Parallels between 2 Enoch and Manichaean or Mandaean Apocalypses 266
 - Conclusions 271

- 8 Practical and Symbolic Liturgy, Votive Offerings, and the Cult of the One God in 2 Enoch 273**
 - Introduction 273
 - 1 2 Enoch and Practical Worship 274
 - 1.1 *Enoch's Instruction before His Ascent* 274
 - 1.2 *Enoch's Instructions after His Ascent and Return* 278
 - 2 Votive Offerings and Reciprocity: 2 Enoch 61:4&5 291
 - Conclusions 298

9	Animal Offerings and Ritual Theorizing in 2 Enoch	300
1	Sacrificial Practice and Theorizing in Antiquity: Framing 2 Enoch in Its Potential Contexts	301
2	Philo of Alexandria	308
3	2 Enoch: the Head of the Altar and the Sacrificial Knife	310
4	Binding the Sacrifice by Four Legs	314
5	Theorizing Sacrifice in 2 Enoch: on Divine Sufficiency and the Human Condition	323
	Conclusions: Reconsidering 2 Enoch in the Contours of Antiquity	325
10	Concluding Synthesis: The Entangled Enoch	328
1	Complicating Models and Culturing Rhizomes	328
2	The Significance of Groups within the Cultural Rhizome	332
3	Reviewing the Provenance of the Parables of Enoch and 2 Enoch	334
4	Common Patterns in the Parables of Enoch and 2 Enoch	336
5	Coloration and Context, Cultures and Fashions	338
6	Devotional Practices, Divine Reciprocity and the Logics of Sacrifice in 2 Enoch and Late Antiquity	341
7	Towards an Account of Transmission	344
8	The Pseudepigrapha and the Literate Liminal: Programmatic Implications	345
	Concluding Comments	349
	Bibliography	351
	Index of Modern Authors	375
	Index of Ancient Sources	379

Acknowledgements

This monograph is the principal output of a British Academy Mid-Career Fellowship, which ran through the academic year 2021–2022. I am deeply grateful to the British Academy for this award and for all that it has made possible. In particular, I would like to thank Ken Emond, Charles Hamilton and Helen Langan for their help in the administrative process associated with the award. Historically, the research that led me to this project was also funded by the British Academy, through the Postdoctoral Fellowship that I held at the beginning of my career (which enabled me to publish an edition of the Slavonic Texts of 2 Enoch) and then through a small research grant on the Enoch literature and Contemporary Theology, principally associated with Philip Esler. My debt to the Academy, then, is enormous, and I am sincerely thankful for the support that it has provided to my work, to my career and to my subject area. During the process of application for this fellowship, Loren Stuckenbruck and John Collins played crucial roles and I am likewise indebted to them.

More broadly, my work at the University of Aberdeen is supported by the Kirby Laing Foundation and the development of this project would not have been possible without their generosity in funding my position. Along with the Foundation itself, I want to extend thanks to Katy Hockey and J. Thomas Hewitt, who successively held the Kirby Laing Postdoctoral Fellowship before their appointment to permanent positions at the University and whose collegial support made the development of this project possible. J. Thomas was particularly involved in helping with doctoral supervision during the period of my research leave; without that assistance, I could not have completed the work within the funded period. I also want to thank Graeme Benvie, who acts as the principal liaison between the University and the Foundation and whom we consider to be a vital member of our department.

The department of Divinity at the University of Aberdeen is a remarkably collegial and supportive place to be and the project has benefited immeasurably from that context. I want to thank all colleagues in the department, but especially Tom Greggs, Philip Ziegler and Paul Nimmo, who played specific administrative roles in the department that were connected to this submission. In the School of Divinity, History, Philosophy and Art History—the bigger unit in which we are embedded—Paula Sweeney and Beth Lord (as successive Heads of School) and Robert Frost (as internal reviewer) also played important roles in the development and administration of my research. In the wider University, Sir Iain Torrance has been both practically and intellectually supportive, with his characteristic wisdom. I am sincerely grateful to all.

Some of my doctoral students were especially impacted by this study and were patient with me during the period of leave. I pass on thanks in particular to Melissa Tan, Rachel Danley, Hongchang Cho, Robert Costello, Michael de Fazio, Lisa Igram, Nick Mackison, Eric Russ, Cindy Cheshire, Olga Vasiloglou, Kyongmo Kim, Chris Lane, Brett Daane, Paloma Herrera, Daniel Thorpe, Andrew Wade and Andrew McNeil. Jonathan Berglund, as well as being patient with my circumstances as a supervisor, also collated and formatted the cumulative bibliography and deserves special thanks.

I continue to owe thanks to colleagues at the University of St Andrews, where the seeds of this research developed. David Moffitt, Elizabeth Shively (now at Baylor), Madhavi Nevader, T.J. Lang, Bill Tooman and Matt Sharp have all been crucial conversation partners at some point in its development and the library team have continued to be as helpful as ever, facilitating access to the collections there (and often extending loan periods beyond their normal limits). In the wider research community in Scotland, Matt Novenson, at the University of Edinburgh, has been a helpful dialogue partner. Across the U.K., Ivor Davidson, George van Kooten, George Brooke, Catrin Williams, Philip Esler and John Barclay have played important roles in working through some of the issues. Richard Bauckham kindly shared a draft of his forthcoming work on the Son of Man, which contained a useful engagement with the Parables of Enoch. Internationally, I am continually grateful to Christfried Böttrich, Basil Lourié and Andrei Orlov for their generosity as conversation partners, fellow students in this particular stream of Enoch's wisdom. I am also indebted, as always, to Alexander Panayotov, for helping me to source secondary literature; he has continued to be a close friend since our days as postdoctoral fellows in St Andrews.

Two people are owed special thanks for their role in the development of this book. The first is the songwriter/recording artist Rie Sinclair. Conversations with Rie—whom I know through the work of the Centre for Autism and Theology—were the key factor in nurturing my sense that the work of Deleuze and Guattari has particular heuristic value to the study of the pseudepigrapha in late antiquity. The second is Annette Yoshiko Reed. As co-editor of the SVTP series, Annette provided the first stage of critical review on the monograph and then coordinated the peer review process after the initial revisions had been made. The book is generally richer and, at specific points, is more nuanced and careful because of Annette's input and her incredible diligence as an editor.

I am grateful also to the anonymous reviewers who gave helpful pointers to relevant research and caught some residual errors in transliteration. At Brill, Marjolein van Zuylen, Laura Morris and Suzanne Mekking have all been

wonderfully supportive in the process of taking this project from proposal to completion and Dirk Bakker deserves several awards for his diligence in the copy-editing and production processes.

Finally, I want to thank my family. The end of the project coincided with an extended period of illness for my wife, Jane, and this is a time that we will remember as difficult but blessed. During the last months of the fellowship, my father's health declined after his 25 year journey with cancer. He passed away shortly before the final edits were completed. His own mother had passed away just two years previously, at the age of 106, as I was about to begin the study. Those two deaths coincided with the project's beginning and end in ways that I cannot help but dwell upon and that represent something important to me about the passing of generations, the technological changing of the world and the fragile survival of Gaelic language and culture.

Grant Macaskill

Aberdeen, November 2023