

Immovable Truth

Commentaria

SACRED TEXTS AND THEIR COMMENTARIES:
JEWISH, CHRISTIAN AND ISLAMIC

Founding Editors

Grover A. Zinn
Michael A. Signer (ob.)

Editors

Frans van Liere
Lesley Smith
E. Ann Matter
Thomas E. Burman
Robert A. Harris
Walid Saleh
Celia Chazelle

VOLUME 15

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/comm*

Immovable Truth

*Divine Knowledge and the Bible
at the University of Vienna (1384–1419)*

By

Edit Anna Lukács



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

This publication has received the financial support of the Foundation DDr. Franz-Josef Mayer-Gunthof of the Austrian Academy of Sciences.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>
LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2023040241>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 1874-8236

ISBN 978-90-04-68277-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-68624-3 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004686243

Copyright 2024 by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill nv via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements	VII
Abbreviations	IX
Introduction	1
1 The Bible at the University of Vienna	1
2 The <i>complexe significabile</i> : Adam Wodeham	6
3 Syllogisms and the Communication of Properties: Robert Holcot	13
4 Antecedent Necessity: Thomas Bradwardine	18
5 The University of Vienna in Its Replies	21
1 Henry Totting of Oyta's Commentary on Psalms 1–50	24
1 Henry Totting of Oyta	24
1.1 <i>Biographical Sketch</i>	24
1.2 <i>The Commentary on Psalms 1–50</i>	27
2 General Features of Divine Cognition	30
2.1 <i>Knowledge as Life in God (Ps 17:47)</i>	30
2.2 <i>Time and Eternity (Ps 43:7 and Ps 49:1)</i>	34
2.3 <i>Cognovi omnia volatilia caeli et pulchritudo agri mecum est (Ps 49:11)</i>	39
3 Psalm 34:28: the Common Viennese Project	42
3.1 <i>Building Blocks (Anselm, Cur Deus Homo)</i>	42
3.2 <i>The Pattern of Necessities</i>	45
3.3 <i>Trinity, Contingency, and Syllogistic Argumentation</i>	49
3.4 <i>Divine Deception: Wodeham, Holcot, Halifax in Ps 34:28</i>	52
3.5 <i>From the Absolute Literal Sense to Absolute Revelation</i>	62
4 The Ultimate Answer	69
4.1 <i>Oyta against Holcot</i>	69
4.2 <i>Human Freedom: the First Viennese Theologians against Thomas Bradwardine (1)</i>	71
4.3 <i>The Other Necessity: Scandals</i>	78
5 Conclusion	83
2 Henry of Langenstein's Commentary on Genesis	86
1 Henry of Langenstein	86
1.1 <i>A Short Biographical Note</i>	86
1.2 <i>The Commentary on Genesis and the Treatise on Fatal Necessity</i>	89

1.3	<i>The Structure of the Treatise on Fatal Necessity</i>	95
1.4	<i>A Most Complex Apology: the First Viennese Theologians against Thomas Bradwardine (2)</i>	98
2	Metaphysics	105
2.1	<i>The complexe significabile and Fatalism</i>	105
2.2	<i>Praesentialiter esse: Pantheism at the University of Vienna</i>	110
2.3	<i>Realms, Archetypes, Flow, and Fixity</i>	115
2.4	<i>Speculative Grammar as a Solution to the Problem of Future Contingents</i>	118
3	Logic	126
3.1	<i>Logic's Bestiary</i>	126
3.2	<i>Moshe Taku and Vienna's Jewish Community in the Fourteenth Century</i>	135
4	Conclusion	147
3	Lambert of Geldern's Commentary on the Twelve Minor Prophets	149
1	Lambert of Geldern	149
1.1	<i>A New Figure among the Biblical Commentators</i>	149
1.2	<i>A Major Commentary on the Twelve Minor Prophets</i>	152
2	Prophets and Divine Lies	160
2.1	<i>"The Truth of Faith Is Confirmed by the Prophets"</i>	160
2.2	<i>The "Nude Natures" of the Soul of Christ (On Zephaniah, Part 1)</i>	164
2.3	<i>A New English Source: Richard FitzRalph (On Haggai, Part 1)</i>	172
3	The Non-degree of Viennese Theology	180
3.1	<i>The Irrevocable Transition into the Past (On Haggai, Part 2)</i>	180
3.2	<i>"God Is Worse Than the Devil" (On Zephaniah, Part 2)</i>	185
4	Conclusion	192
	Conclusions	195
	Appendix	199
	Bibliography	205
	Index nominum	223
	Index rerum	225
	Index locorum Biblicorum	228
	Index manuscriptorum	229

Acknowledgements

This book has been written for the Austrian Science Fund Project V356-G19 “Oxford Theology at the University of Vienna, 1385–ca. 1420” conducted between 2014 and 2018 at the Austrian Institute for Historical Research of the University of Vienna. Most of my discoveries were possible only thanks to the knowledge preserved and taught at the Institute, especially to the critical approach to catalogues and manuscripts I learnt there. I thank the then-Institute Director, Thomas Winkelbauer for institutional support, Martin Scheutz and Margareth Lanzinger for their help *sine qua non*, and Gerhard Lindauer for books. I remain indebted to Thomas Prügl from the Institute of Theology at Vienna for his initial, yet decisive impulse, which led me to open up commentaries on the Bible. My warmest thanks go to the Editorial Board of Brill’s series “Commentaria” for embracing my enterprise, Marcella Mulder for assistance, and Claudia Rapp and the Foundation Dr. Franz-Josef Mayer-Gunthof of the Austrian Academy of Sciences for their support of the publication.

Between 2014 and 2018, I visited many libraries in Austria, at Vienna and in the countryside, and worked through more than 10,000 folios at the Austrian National Library. My investigation in this book relies on the latter. For it is the Austrian National Library that includes the collections of the Collegium ducale, the University of Vienna’s college, to which Henry of Langenstein, Henry Toting of Oyta, and Lambert of Geldern donated their biblical commentaries, immense pieces of the intellectual tradition of Europe—not just eastern or western Europe, but Europe as a whole. I have utterly enjoyed the power of human thought and the logic of intellectual community I sensed in this tradition. If it is ever possible to increase my beliefs in this regard, even more than before, I believe in rationality, argumentation, and freedom of choice, all things the medieval university institutionalized, debated, and generalized in society.

My gratefulness to Tamás Visi stands out. Tamás once taught me and others Hebrew at Budapest in challenging conditions, for free; and recently, he suggested to me to look further into Moshe Taku. Both moments proved most fruitful for this book. I would also like to express my gratitude to colleagues who have shared their knowledge of Jewish culture with me: Ursula Ragacs, Klaus Davidowicz, David I. Shyovicz, Dana Eichhorst, and my friend at Berlin, Annett Martini. I thank Tristan Sharp, Simona Vucu, Martin Roland, Michael Pölzl, and Klára Harrer for discussions at Toronto and Vienna, Harald Berger for his brilliant suggestions and encouragements, and Martin Dekarli for help and support over the years. I thank the Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies for a splendid year. I remain indebted to Luke DeWeese, Stephen Pow, and

Joshua Hey for having helped me to write in English. Finally, it is with a quiet gladness that I notice: I still have to thank, and for so much, György Geréby.

I could not have finished this book without the support of Christine Glaßner and my colleagues at the Department of Codicology and Palaeography of the Institute for Medieval Research at Vienna.

I could not have written this book without the friendship of Christoph Egger.

Abbreviations

a.	article
AFA	<i>Acta Facultatis Artium Universitatis Viennensis</i>
AFTh	<i>Acta Facultatis Theologiae Universitatis Viennensis</i>
BSB	Bayerische Staatsbibliothek
c.	chapter
CCCM	Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum Series Latina
cod.	codex
cor.	corollary
dist.	distinction
MIÖG	<i>Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung</i>
NKJV	New King James Version
ÖNB	Österreichische Nationalbibliothek / Austrian National Library
PL	Patrologia Latina
q.	question

Abbreviations Used in the Transcriptions

<i>a.c.</i>	<i>ante correctionem</i>
<i>add. sed del.</i>	<i>addidit, sed delevit</i>
<i>corr. ex.</i>	<i>correxerit ex</i>
<i>i.l.</i>	<i>inter lineas</i>
<i>iter.</i>	<i>iteravit</i>
<i>m</i>	<i>in margine</i>
<i>p.c.</i>	<i>post correctionem</i>
<i>s.l.</i>	<i>supra lineam</i>