

## At the Roots of Causality

# Islamic Philosophy, Theology and Science

TEXTS AND STUDIES

*Edited by*

Hans Daiber  
Anna Akasoy  
Emilie Savage-Smith

VOLUME 124

The titles published in this series are listed at [brill.com/ipts](http://brill.com/ipts)

# At the Roots of Causality

*Ontology and Aetiology from Avicenna  
to Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī*

By

Francesco Omar Zamboni



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: *Kull mā kāna mumkin al-wujūd bi-ʿtibār dhātih fa-wujūduh wa-ʿadamuh kilāhumā bi-ʿilla*  
(Everything contingently existent in itself is such that both its existence and non-existence have a cause).  
Calligraphy by Nihad Nadam, 2023.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>  
LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2023042143>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: [brill.com/brill-typeface](http://brill.com/brill-typeface).

ISSN 0169-8729

ISBN 978-90-04-68486-7 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-68487-4 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004684874

Copyright 2024 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via [brill.com](http://brill.com) or [copyright.com](http://copyright.com).

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

*This book is dedicated to the memory of my grandparents*



My knowledge is like a mirage, my heart is left in ruin by fear, problems are as numerous as the grains of sand. Despite all this, I hope to be among the loved ones. Please to not frustrate my hope, oh magnanimous Giver. You know that everything I said and wrote was only meant to attain truth and correctness, and to abandon ignorance and doubt. If I was correct, grant me Your favour. If I erred, skip over my shortcomings with Your mercy and Your patience.

FAKHR AL-DĪN AL-RĀZĪ, *al-Maṭālib al-ʿāliya mina l-ʿilm al-ilāhī*, IV, 426–427



# Contents

## Acknowledgements XI

	<b>Introduction</b>	1
	1 Avicenna	2
	2 The Avicennians: Bahmanyār, Lawkarī, Khayyām, and Sāwī	4
	3 The Anti-Avicennians: Ghazālī, Ibn al-Malāḥimī, Shahrastānī, Mas‘ūdī, and Ibn Ghaylān	7
	4 The Innovators: Abū l-Barakāt and Suhrawardī	12
	5 The Systematiser: Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī	15
	6 The Thirteenth Century: Traditional Mutakallimūn, Post-Rāzians, Ishrāqīs, and Neo-Avicennians	19
	7 General Overview of the Study	21
<b>1</b>	<b>Efficient Causality in Avicenna</b>	24
	1 The Subject of and the Reason for Causal Dependence	28
	2 Categories of Efficient Causality	34
	3 Necessitation Contra Contingent Choice	37
	4 Corollaries of Efficient Causality	40
	5 The Epistemic Function of Avicenna’s Aetiology	41
<b>2</b>	<b>The Essence of Existence</b>	49
	1 Avicenna: Primitivity, Simplicity, Identity with Reality, and Distinction from Quiddity	50
	2 Bahmanyār, Khayyām, and Rāzī: The Rejection of Grounding and Dependent Knowability	55
	3 Mas‘ūdī and Abū l-Barakāt: Grounding and Inferential Knowability	59
	4 Ibn al-Malāḥimī: Reduction to Quiddity, Nominalism, and Extensionalisation	61
	5 Debates: On Grounding	62
	6 Debates: On Simplicity and Knowability	65
	7 Debates: On Primitivity	67
<b>3</b>	<b>The Universality of Existence and Mental Existence</b>	74
	1 Avicenna and the Majority: The Universality of Existence and Mental Existence	75
	2 Mas‘ūdī and Rāzī: The Rejection of Mental Existence and the Aporia of Universality	80

- 3 Avicenna, Khayyām, Abū l-Barakāt, and Rāzī: The Distinction between Mental and Concrete 84
- 4 Debates: On Universality 89
- 5 Debates: On Mental Existence 97
  
- 4 **The Conceptual Invariance of Existence** 106
  - 1 Avicenna and the Majority: Conceptual Invariance 107
  - 2 Ibn al-Malāḥimī: Unrestricted Conceptual Variance 110
  - 3 Shahrastānī: Restricted Conceptual Variance 112
  - 4 Debates: On the Case for Invariance 113
  - 5 Debates: On the Case for Variance, Unrestricted and Restricted 118
  
- 5 **The Modulation of Existence** 122
  - 1 Avicenna and Sāwī: The Modulation of Existence by Priority and Worth 123
  - 2 Ibn al-Malāḥimī, Shahrastānī, and Suhrawardī: The Rejection of the Modulation of Existence 130
  - 3 Bahmanyār: Modulation by Intensity and Accidental Unity 132
  - 4 Ibn al-Malāḥimī, Shahrastānī, Mas‘ūdī, and Rāzī: Essential Unity and the Rejection of Intensity 136
  - 5 Debates: On Intensity 138
  - 6 Debates: On the Accidentality and Essentiality of Unity 139
  
- 6 **The Accidentality of Existence** 145
  - 1 Avicenna, Bahmanyār, Sāwī, Mas‘ūdī, and Rāzī: The Accidentality of Existence 147
  - 2 Ghazālī and Ibn al-Malāḥimī: The Rejection of Distinction (Nominalism) 153
  - 3 Khayyām, Shahrastānī, Ibn Ghaylān, and Suhrawardī: The Rejection of Concrete Reality (Conceptualism) 154
  - 4 Abū l-Barakāt: The Rejection of Inherence 158
  - 5 Debates: On Distinction 160
  - 6 Debates: On Concrete Reality 164
  - 7 Debates: On Externality 168
  - 8 Debates: On Inherence 176
  
- 7 **The Contingency of Existence** 182
  - 1 Avicenna: Intuitivity, Temporal Neutrality, Equidistance, Attribution to Pure Quiddity, and Concrete Reality 182

- 2 Bahmanyār and Lawkarī: Relativity, Modulation, and the Problem of Concrete Reality 187
- 3 Ghazālī and Mas‘ūdī: Contingency as Causal Dependence 190
- 4 Ibn al-Malāḥimī: Temporal Qualification and Non-equidistance 191
- 5 The Majority: The Rejection of Concrete Reality 193
- 6 Debates: On Contingency as Causal Dependence 197
- 7 Debates: On the Possibility of Contingency 198
- 8 Debates: On Equidistance 200
- 9 Debates: On Concrete Reality 204
  
- 8 The Signs of Contingency 210**
  - 1 Avicenna and the Majority: The Contingency of the Conditional and of What Comes-to-be 212
  - 2 Ghazālī and Mas‘ūdī: The Insufficiency of Conditionality for Contingency 218
  - 3 Ibn al-Malāḥimī: The Insufficiency of Composition for Contingency 220
  - 4 Suhrawardī: The Contingency of the Imperfect and the Multipliable 222
  - 5 Debates: On the Contingency of the Conditional 225
  - 6 Debates: On the Contingency of What Comes-to-be 233
  - 7 Debates: On the Contingency of the Imperfect and the Multipliable 234
  
- 9 The Principle of Sufficient Reason 238**
  - 1 Avicenna and the Majority: Sufficient Reason, Causal Necessitarianism, and Unrestricted Applicability 239
  - 2 Ghazālī and Ibn Ghaylān: Non-applicability to Voluntary Actions 243
  - 3 Ibn al-Malāḥimī: The Weakening of the Principle 247
  - 4 Shahrastānī: Possible Applicability to Divine Actions 249
  - 5 Rāzī: The Preference for Non-applicability to Divine Actions 252
  - 6 Debates: On the Intuitivity of Sufficient Reason 256
  - 7 Debates: The Inferential Case for Sufficient Reason 264
  - 8 Debates: The Case against Sufficient Reason 268
  
- 10 The Coexistence of Cause and Effect 283**
  - 1 Avicenna and the Majority: Coexistence as Entailed by Sufficient Reason 284

2	Rāzī: Coexistence as Distinct from Sufficient Reason	286
3	Shahrastānī: The Rejection of Coexistence with God	287
4	Ibn al-Malāḥimī and Masʿūdī: Causeless Persistence	288
5	Debates: On Coexistence	291
6	Debates: On Coexistence with God	292
7	Debates: On Causeless Persistence	294
<b>11</b>	<b>Causal Priority</b>	<b>303</b>
1	Avicenna and the Majority: Causal Priority as Existential Priority	303
2	Rāzī: The Problematisation of Causal Priority and Its Corollaries	307
3	Debates: On Causal Priority	309
4	Debates: On Self-Causation	311
5	Debates: On Essential Coming-to-be	316
	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>321</b>
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>325</b>
	<b>Index of Historical Figures and Schools</b>	<b>340</b>
	<b>Index of Subjects</b>	<b>342</b>

## Acknowledgements

This book offers a revised, refined, and expanded take on the topics of my 2021 PhD dissertation. I am grateful to my PhD supervisor Amos Bertolacci, for his help throughout my doctoral studies at the Scuola Normale Superiore (Pisa), as well as to my PhD discussants Toby Mayer and Ayman Shihadeh, for their critical but supportive engagement with my work. Their writings are among the main reasons why I chose to investigate the Avicennian tradition back in 2016.

I presented some of the claims present in this book at several conferences throughout the years (Rome, Pisa, Lyon, Madinat al-Kuwait, Munich, Naples, Paris, Bologna, Berlin, and New Haven). My thanks go to the organisers and all participants, whose feedback helped me in more ways than I can count.

In composing this monograph, I greatly benefited from the weekly exchanges of ideas with my colleagues at the university of Jyväskylä, Yusuf Daşdemir, Agnieszka Erdt, Jari Kaukua, and Hassan Rezakhani. My dear friend John Moffatt took on himself the ungrateful task of going through a preliminary version of the book, checking for errors big and small. I hope I will be able to return the favour someday.

Finally, my two anonymous reviewers helped me with multiple insightful comments and constructive critiques. I tried my best to address nearly all their concerns in this final version of the book, fixing mistakes and clarifying obscure points. All remaining shortcomings are my sole responsibility.

The Academy of Finland [Grant Number 340923] funded the research which resulted in the composition of the present monograph.