

IN DEFENSE OF MENTALISM

IN DEFENSE OF MENTALISM: a Critical Review of the Philosophy of Mind

René Marres
University of Amsterdam



AMSTERDAM 1989

CIP-GEGEVENS KONINKLIJKE BIBLIOTHEEK, DEN HAAG

Marres, René

In defense of mentalism : a critical review of the
philosophy of mind / René Marres; [transl. from the
Dutch by Marleen Rozemond and Philip Clark]. —
Amsterdam : Rodopi

Vert. van: Filosofie van de geest : een kritisch
overzicht. — Muiderberg : Coutinho, 1985. — Met
bibliogr., index.

ISBN 90-5183-071-8

SISO 413 UDC 159.922:13

Trefw.: bewustzijn.

©Editions Rodopi B.V., Amsterdam 1989

Printed in The Netherlands

CONTENTS

PREFACE to the Second Edition

INTRODUCTION	1
1. CONSCIOUSNESS	5
Descartes and Ryle	9
Cultural Objects	11
The Physical	13
Characteristics of the Mental	15
Negative Characterization	15
Intentionality	17
Privacy	19
A Distinction of Degree	21
Being and Seeming	24
2. BEHAVIORISM	28
Critical Consideration	30
Dispositions to Behave	32
Sensations and Mental Images	34
A Case of Imagining?	35
Behavior is Neither Sufficient nor Necessary	37
Feelings	38
Feeling is Essential	40
Inclinations	41
Volition	43
Talking about the Mental: The 'Avowal Theory'	45
3. MENTALISM	48
The Meaning of Names for Sensations	48
Reflection and Introspection	52
Reflection	52
Reflection Contained in Consciousness?	54
Reflection should Not be Identified with Consciousness <i>Tout Court</i>	56
No Infallibility of Knowledge of the Mental	58
Epistemic Authority	61
Introspection	64

Is Introspection an Illusion?	68
Perception of the World and Introspection	70
4. INTROSPECTION AND THE UNCONSCIOUS	73
Critical Discussion	75
The Unconscious as Part of Consciousness	77
Repression	79
Consciousness and Self-awareness	80
Conclusion	82
5. TALKING ABOUT THE MENTAL: WITTGENSTEIN AND MENTALISM	85
Terms for the Mental	86
1. Meaning 'this'	86
2. Giving Meaning to a Sign	87
Trust in Memory	89
3. Communication of the Meaning via a Public Correlate	90
Attempt to Eliminate the Private Object	91
Terms for Sensations and Behavior	93
Names for Private Experiences	94
Taste	96
Conclusion	97
Statements about the Mental	97
Knowing that One is in Pain	98
6. KNOWLEDGE OF OTHER MINDS	102
Knowledge by Analogy	102
Analogy Fundamental for Meaning	103
Facial Expressions	105
The Acquisition and Justification of Knowledge	106
Objections to the Idea of Analogy	107
Verification and Uncertainty	109
Suppose it is False	111
Defense against Scepticism	112
Other Objections	113
Behaviorism and Similar Views	118
Linguistic Behaviorism	122
Having an Attitude	124
7. THE MIND-BRAIN IDENTITY THEORY	126
Meaning and Reference	127
Topic Neutralism	130

The Difference with Other Identifications	131
The Monadic Thesis	134
Reduction via the Response	137
Coexistence in Space and Time	138
Public versus Private	139
The Elimination Theory	140
Determinism as a Motive for Materialism	143
8. FUNCTIONALISM AND THEORETICAL ENTITIES	147
The Mental as a Theoretical Entity	147
The Mental is Not Always an Hypothesis	150
Mental Images are Pictorial	152
Dreams	153
Two Forms of Functionalism	154
Causal Role	156
Criticisms of Functionalism	158
Spectrum Inversion	161
The Incorrectness of Definitions in Terms of Input and Output	161
Historical Background: The Principle of Verification	165
9. THE RELATION OF MIND AND BODY	169
Double Aspect Theory	169
Only Two Aspects	170
The Person Theory	172
Neutral Monism	173
Dualism and Mentalism	174
Causal Interaction	177
1) (Un)intelligibility	177
2) Is the Physical World a Causally Closed System?	178
Parallelism	179
Epiphenomenalism	180
The Implausibility of Epiphenomenalism	182
Double Causation	184
Comparison with Epiphenomenalism	185
The Acceptability of this Form of Interaction	187
Precise Formulation	189
EPILOGUE	192
BIBLIOGRAPHY	194
NAME INDEX	203