

LEGAL CONTROL OF THE MULTINATIONAL ENTERPRISE

LEGAL CONTROL OF THE MULTINATIONAL ENTERPRISE

National Regulatory Techniques
and the
Prospects for International Controls

Cynthia Day Wallace



1982

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

THE HAGUE/BOSTON/LONDON

Distributors:

for the United States and Canada

Kluwer Boston, Inc.
190 Old Derby Street
Hingham, MA 02043
USA

for all other countries

Kluwer Academic Publishers Group
Distribution Center
P.O. Box 322
3300 AH Dordrecht
The Netherlands

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Wallace, Cynthia D.
Legal control of the multinational enterprise.

Originally presented as the author's thesis
(Ph. D.)--Cambridge University.

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. International business enterprises--law and
legislation. I. Title.

K1322.W34	1982	346*.07	82-3598
ISBN 90-247-2668-9		342.67	AACR2

ISBN 90-247-2668-9

Copyright © 1983 by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, The Hague.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publishers, Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, P.O. Box 566, 2501 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

PRINTED IN THE NETHERLANDS

To I.H.S. and B.L.H.,
both of whom sustained
me in their respective spheres.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD	Page vii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ix
INTRODUCTION	xvii

PART ONE: SETTING THE STAGE

Chapter I	THE NATURE OF THE MULTINATIONAL ENTERPRISE	1
	1. Preliminary Observations	1
	2. Limiting the Scope	5
	3. Definitional Aspects of the MNE	9
	a. Definition of terms relating to the structure of the MNE	9
	b. Analysis of current usage	10
	4. Operational Aspects of the MNE	13
	a. Principal legal and organizational forms and structures	13
	b. Relation of legal form to managerial control	17
	5. Terminology Selection and Definition Formulation for Purposes of the Present Study	19
	6. Conclusion	20
Chapter II	IMPORTANT PRELIMINARY DISTINCTIONS <i>RE</i> CONTROL AND CONTROL RELATIONSHIPS	23
	1. National v. International Control	23
	2. Internal v. External Control	24
	a. Distinctions: internal v. external/ <i>de facto</i> v. <i>de jure</i> control	24
	b. Relation to international law	29
	c. Relevance of internal control to external legal controls	32

3. Host-State Control over Foreign MNE	
Affiliates: Incentives and Inducements v.	
Unilateral Restrictions	33
a. Incentives and inducements	37
b. Unilateral restrictions	38

***PART TWO: TECHNIQUES OF RESTRICTIVE HOST-STATE CONTROL
OVER FOREIGN MNE AFFILIATES: ENTRY AND ESTABLISHMENT***

Chapter III	EXCLUSIONARY TECHNIQUES AT ENTRY	43
	1. Total Exclusion	44
	2. Exclusion from 'Key Sectors'	45
	3. 'Discretionary' Legislation and Practice	48
	a. Special legislation with discretionary intent	48
	b. General legislation with fortuitous deterrent effect and discretionary potential	55
	c. Non-statutory discretionary practice	58
	d. Systematic case-by-case screening	61
Chapter IV	CONDITIONAL ENTRY	69
	1. Negotiation for Maximum Benefits to the Host State	69
	2. Guarantees of Continuing Flows of Technology	73
	a. Joint ownership	74
	b. Joint management	79
Conclusion		81

***PART THREE: TECHNIQUES OF RESTRICTIVE HOST-STATE
CONTROL OVER FOREIGN MNE AFFILIATES: OPERATIONS***

Chapter V	GENERAL POLICY AND PRACTICE	83
	1. Legal Power of Host over Established Foreign Affiliates	83
	a. General legislation and practice	83
	b. Special legislation	87

	2. 'National Treatment' Principle in Practice	91
	a. National practice	92
	b. EEC and international practice	95
	3. Application of Law and Policy	99
	a. <i>Fruehauf-France</i>	100
	b. 'Serving two masters'	103
	c. 'Lifting the veil'	110
Chapter VI	CONTROL OVER CAPITAL MOVEMENTS	121
	1. Host-State Laws and Policy	121
	2. MNE Practice	126
Chapter VII	CONTROL THROUGH TAX LEGISLATION	127
	1. Transfer Pricing	127
	2. Tax Treaties	130
	3. Relevant National Tax Laws and Policy	132
	4. Evaluation	136
Chapter VIII	CONTROL THROUGH DISCLOSURE LEGISLATION	139
	1. Generally Applicable Host-State Disclosure Requirement	140
	a. National approaches	140
	b. Regional approaches	148
	c. International approaches	149
	2. Problem of Concurrent and Conflicting Jurisdictions	154
	a. National trends	154
	b. Regional trends	169
	c. International trends	170
	3. Evaluation	174
Chapter IX	CONTROL THROUGH 'MERGER' LEGISLATION	177
	1. Applicability of Antitrust and the 'Effects' Doctrine	177

	2. Purpose of Anti-Combines Laws	183
	3. American v. European Practice	183
	4. Model Types of MNE Mergers	186
	a. Merger situation I: strict territorial principle	188
	b. Merger Situation II: extension of jurisdiction through home parent to foreign affiliate	189
	c. Merger Situation III: territorial principle with foreign ramifications	190
	d. Merger Situation IV: 'reverse extra-territoriality'	191
	5. Emergence of New Competition Policy and Legislation	201
	6. International Tentatives	229
Chapter X	CONTROLS OVER OPERATIONS RESULTING IN DISINVESTMENT	235
	1. Voluntary v. Involuntary Disinvestment	235
	2. Contract Renegotiation	236
	a. Shift in bargaining position	236
	b. Economic coercion by host state	242
	c. Unreasonable coercion resulting in disinvestment	243
	3. 'Fade-out' Formula	244
	4. Evaluation	246
	<i>PART FOUR: TECHNIQUES OF RESTRICTIVE HOST-STATE CONTROL OVER FOREIGN MNEs: COERCED DISINVESTMENT</i>	
Chapter XI	EXPROPRIATION: TRADITIONAL CONCEPTS IN TRANSITION	249
	1. Definitions	249
	2. The Compensation Debate	251
	3. Legality Link	256
	4. Conclusion	256

Chapter XII	“CREEPING EXPROPRIATION”	259
	1. Defining the Perimeters	259
	2. Terminology, Interpretation and Definitions	260
	3. Unreasonable Interference with Ownership: “Canadianization”	263
	4. Unreasonable Interference with Management: “Mitbestimmung”	268
	a. <i>Bundesverfassungsgericht</i> decision: international implications	271
	b. German <i>Gutachten</i> : international implications	272
	5. Other Techniques of “Constructive Taking”	276
	6. “Constructive Taking” before National Courts and International Tribunals	279
	7. “Disguised Expropriation”: <i>Barcelona Traction</i> ...	281
Conclusion		293

PART FIVE: THE SCOPE FOR INTERNATIONAL CONTROLS

Chapter XIII	NATURE OF INTERNATIONAL CODES AND GUIDELINES	295
	1. Overview of Major Current Efforts at International Codes and Guidelines	295
	a. The United-Nations-family ‘package’ and related efforts	296
	b. The OECD ‘package’	298
	2. Legal Aspects	300
	a. Non-legally-binding character	300
	b. Prospects for the “minimalist position”	301
	c. Prospects for the “maximalist position”	305
	d. General prospects	307
	3. Non-Legal Aspects	308
	a. Non-legally-binding nature as a possible asset	308
	b. Tangible non-legal effects	308

	4. Addressees	310
	a. Directives to home governments	311
	b. Directives to MNEs	312
	c. Directives to host governments	315
Chapter XIV	FUNCTION OF INTERNATIONAL CODES AND GUIDELINES	321
	1. Protection of Beneficial Free-Flow of Private Investment Capital and Maintenance of Proper Balance of Benefits to MNE and Host Respectively	321
	2. Harmonization of National Laws in Certain Key Areas	323
	3. Coverage of Those Areas Inadequately Provided for under Municipal Law	323
	4. Overall Function	325
Conclusion		325
CONCLUSIONS		327
BIBLIOGRAPHY		331
TABLE OF CASES		xi
INDEX		364