

THE PURSUIT OF NATIONALIZED PROPERTY

DEVELOPMENTS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

C.R. Symmons, *The Maritime Zones of Islands in International Law*

ISBN 90 247 2171 7

B.H. Dubner, *The Law of International Sea Piracy*

ISBN 90 247 2191 1

R.P. Anand, ed., *Law of the Sea: Caracas and Beyond*

ISBN 90 247 2366 3

V.S. Mani, *International Adjudication: Procedural Aspects*

ISBN 90 247 2367 1

R.St.J. Macdonald and D.M. Johnston, *The Structure and Process of International Law*

ISBN 90 247 2882 7

G.M. Badr, *State Immunity: An Analytical and Prognostic View*

ISBN 90 247 2880 0

M.E. Villiger, *Customary International Law and Treaties*

ISBN 90 247 2980 7

M. Sornarajah, *The Pursuit of Nationalized Property*

ISBN 90 247 3130 5

C.F. Murphy, Jr., *The Search for World Order – A Study of Thought and Action*

ISBN 90 247 3188 7

THE PURSUIT OF NATIONALIZED PROPERTY

by

M. SORNARAJAH

1986 **MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS**
a member of the KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS GROUP
DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LANCASTER



Distributors

for the United States and Canada: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 190 Old Derby Street, Hingham, MA 02043, USA

for the UK and Ireland: Kluwer Academic Publishers, MTP Press Limited, Falcon House, Queen Square, Lancaster LA1 1RN, UK

for all other countries: Kluwer Academic Publishers Group, Distribution Center, P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Sornarajah, M.

The pursuit of nationalized property.

(Developments in international law)

Bibliography: p.

1. Eminent domain (International law) 2. Alien property. I. Title. II. Series.

JX4263.P6S65 1985 341.4'8 85-3024

ISBN 90-247-3130-5

ISBN 90-247-3130-5 (this volume)

ISBN 90-247-2345-0 (series)

Copyright

© 1986 by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publishers,

Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht,
The Netherlands.

PRINTED IN THE NETHERLANDS

For
Appamma

CONTENTS

PREFACE	xiii
INTRODUCTION	xv
CHAPTER ONE: The Changing Basis of the International Law on Nationalization	
1. Changes Within the International Order	2
(i) Impact of the Newly Independent States	3
(ii) Change in Values	7
(iii) Impact of Idealistic Movements	9
(iv) Conclusion	10
2. Changes Affecting State Responsibility for Nationalization of Alien Property	10
(i) The Traditional Law	10
(ii) Changes affecting State Responsibility for Nationalization	13
(iii) The Growth of an International Law of Development	14
(iv) An International Right to Development	21
3. The Role of Justice and Morality	24
4. The Changing Philosophy of Contract and Property	26
(i) The Sanctity of Property	28
(ii) The Sanctity of Contract	28
5. Efforts at Preserving the Old Norms of State Responsibility for Expropriation	29
(i) State Responsibility and Human Rights	29
(ii) The Right to Property and State Responsibility	32

(iii) Bilateral Investment Treaties	35
(iv) Subrogation	41
6. The Multinational Corporation as the Investor	41
(i) The Neo-classical Economic Theories of Foreign Investment	42
(ii) The Rejection of the Neo-classical Theory of Foreign Investment	44
(iii) Abuses by Multinational Corporations	45
7. The Regulation of Multinational Corporations	47
(i) Codes of Conduct for Multinational Corporations	48
(ii) Code on Restrictive Business Practices	48
(iii) Code on Transfer of Technology	49
(iv) Legal Effect of the Codes	49
8. The Responsibility of Home States and Diplomatic Protection	51
9. Reasons for Nationalization	53
(i) Changing Reasons for Nationalizations	54
(ii) The Dependencia School	54
10. Institutionalized Arbitration of Investment Disputes	56
(i) The Court of Arbitration of the International Court of Commerce	58
(ii) The American Arbitration Association	59
(iii) The Inter-American Commercial Arbitration Commission	59
(iv) The International Centre for the Settlement of Investment disputes	60

CHAPTER TWO: Nationalizations in Breach of “International” Contracts

1. The Internationalization of Investment Agreements	81
(i) Types of Investment Agreements	81
(ii) Policy Arguments for Internationalization of State Contracts	86
(iii) Criticisms of the Policy Justifications for Internationalization of State Contracts	88
2. Legal Arguments in Favour of Internationalization of State Contracts	90
(i) The “Stabilization Clause”	91
(ii) Assimilation of the Agreement to Treaties	94
(iii) The Arbitration Clause	95

(iv) Efforts at Creating Permanent Arbitration Tribunals	96
(v) Ad Hoc Arbitral Tribunals	97
(vi) Effect of Arbitration Clauses	98
(vii) Choice of Law	100
(viii) Conclusion	103
3. Arguments Against Internationalization of State Contracts	103
(i) Positivism and Personality	105
(ii) A Breach of a Foreign Investment Agreement is not per se a Violation of International Law	106
4. Trends in Favour of Internationalization	108
(i) Pacta Sunt Servanda	108
(ii) Acquired Rights	112
(iii) Arbitral Awards and Doctrinal Views	113
5. Trends Against Internationalization	119
(i) Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources	120
(ii) Administrative Contracts	130
(iii) Clausula Rebus Sic Stantibus	133
(iv) The Calvo Clause	135
(v) Conclusion	137
6. Remedies	138
(i) Restitutio in Integrum	140
(ii) Declaration	147
(iii) Damages	147
7. Internationalization and Institutionalized Arbitration	147
8. Alternatives to the Theory of Internationalization	152

CHAPTER THREE: The Legality of Nationalization of Foreign Property

1. The Legality of Nationalizations	168
(i) Renunciation of the Right by Treaty	169
(ii) Acts of Nationalization	171
2. The Illegality of Nationalizations	173
(i) Public Purpose	174
(ii) Reprisal and the Public Purpose Requirement	176
(iii) Discrimination	183
(iv) Conclusion	187
3. Compensation for Nationalization	188
(i) Policy Considerations	189

(ii) Authorities Supporting “Prompt, Adequate and Effective” Compensation	193
4. The Continuing Vitality of the Norm of Full Compensation	210
(i) Unjust Enrichment	210
(ii) The Theory of Acquired Rights	212
(iii) Restitutio in Integrum	213
(iv) Conclusion	213
5. The Emergence of New Norms	214
(i) Lump Sum Agreements	214
(ii) Claim that it is Permissible to Deduct Excess Profits from Compensation	217
(iii) Claim that the Taking is a “Revindication” for which No Compensation is Necessary	219
(iv) Claim that some Appropriate Compensation should be Paid	222
(v) Conclusion	225
6. Conclusion	225

CHAPTER FOUR: The Role of Domestic Courts in the Pursuit of Nationalized Property

1. Policy Considerations	242
(i) The Extraterritorial Application of Antitrust Laws	245
(ii) Nationalization Decrees and Political Conflict	249
(iii) Role of the Executive	250
(iv) Domestic Courts and Economic Coercion	251
(v) Conclusion	251
2. Sovereign Immunity	253
(i) Legislation on Sovereign Immunity	253
(ii) The Nature and Purpose Tests	255
(iii) Sovereign Immunity and Nationalizations	259
(iv) Execution of Arbitral Awards	274
(v) Conclusion	278
3. The Act of State Doctrine	278
(i) Sovereign Immunity and the Act of State	278
(ii) The Rationale of the Act of State Doctrine	278
(iii) Nationalization Decrees and the Act of State Doctrine	282
(iv) Restrictions on the Rule in Sabbatino	284

4. Foreign Nationalization Decrees before European Courts	291
(i) English Law	291
(ii) German Law	295
(iii) Dutch Law	296
(iv) French Law	296
(v) Other Jurisdictions	298
5. The Role of Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources	299
6. Conclusion	300

CHAPTER FIVE: Towards Compromise

Appendices	321
Table of Cases	337
Documents	341
Bibliography	343
Index	353