

## CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW AND TREATIES

## DEVELOPMENTS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

- C.R. Symmons, *The Maritime Zones of Islands in International Law*  
ISBN 90-247-2171-7
- B.H. Dubner, *The Law of International Sea Piracy*  
ISBN 90 247 1893 7
- R.P. Anand, ed. *Law of the Sea: Caracas and Beyond*  
ISBN 90 247 2366 3
- V.S. Mani, *International Adjudication: Procedural Aspects*  
ISBN 90 247 2367 1
- G.M. Badr, *State Immunity: An Analytical and Prognostic View*  
ISBN 90 247 2880 0
- R.St.J. Macdonald and D.M. Johnston, *The Structure and Process of International Law*  
ISBN 90 247 2882 7
- M.E. Villiger, *Customary International Law and Treaties*  
ISBN 90 247 2980 7

# **CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW AND TREATIES**

A Study of their Interactions and Interrelations with Special  
Consideration of the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

*by*

MARK E. VILLIGER

1985 **MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS**

a member of the KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS GROUP  
DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LANCASTER



## Distributors

---

*for the United States and Canada:* Kluwer Academic Publishers, 190 Old Derby Street, Hingham, MA 02043, USA

*for the UK and Ireland:* Kluwer Academic Publishers, MTP Press Limited, Falcon House, Queen Square, Lancaster LA1 1RN, UK

*for all other countries:* Kluwer Academic Publishers Group, Distribution Center, P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands

## Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

---

Villiger, Mark E.

Customary international law and treaties.

(Developments in international law : 7)

Originally presented as the author's

habilitationsschrift (University of Zurich).

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Treaties. 2. Customary law, International.

3. Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969)

I. Title. II. Series: Developments in international law ; v. 7.

JX4165.V55 1985 341'.1 85-4952

ISBN 90-247-2980-7

ISBN 90-247-2980-7 (this volume)

ISBN 90-247-2345-0 (series)

## Copyright

---

© 1985 by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publishers,

Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

PRINTED IN THE NETHERLANDS

To my wife  
**Bernadette**  
in gratitude

---

**Contents**

	<i>Page</i>
Abbreviations	XVII
List of Tables	XXII
Acknowledgements	XXIII
 <b>INTRODUCTION</b>	
A. Outline, Approach and Possible Significance of the Present Study	XXV
B. Delimitations	XXIX
 <b>PART ONE THEORETICAL AND FACTUAL FRAMEWORK</b>	
 <b>CHAPTER ONE A Modern Theory of Customary International Law</b>	 <b>3</b>
A. What Constitutes State Practice?	4
I. In General	4
II. The Framework of the United Nations and of Diplomatic Conferences	5
a) The Value of Statements	5
b) Functions and Examples	8
III. Written Texts (Conventions, ILC Drafts etc.) as State Practice?	10
IV. State Practice <i>qua</i> Contractual Obligation	10
B. The Material Requirements of Customary Law	12
I. General Practice: Notion and Implications	12
II. The Practice of “Specially Affected” States	13
III. The Practice of Dissenting States	15

a) Persistent Objectors	15
b) Subsequent Objectors	17
IV. Passive Conduct	18
a) The Traditional View	18
b) The Voluntarist Approach	20
V. Uniformity and Consistency of Practice	22
VI. Duration of Practice	24
C. <i>Opinio juris</i>	25
I. Concept	25
II. Evidence of <i>opinio juris</i> , the UN Framework and “Instant” Customary Law	27
III. The Formation of Customary Law	29
D. Special Questions	32
I. Desuetude and Modification of a Customary Rule	32
II. Special Customary Law	33
III. The Relationship between Customary Law and Treaties	34
a) Is There a Hierarchy of Sources in International Law?	34
b) Conflicts between Rules of Different Sources	36
E. Conclusions	37
 <b>CHAPTER TWO The Factual Framework: Codification in Past and Present</b>	 <b>63</b>
A. Efforts of Individuals and Private Organizations	63
I. Individual Efforts	63
II. Private Organizations	64
B. Official Efforts Outside the United Nations	65
I. 1815–1914	65
II. The League of Nations (1919–1946)	67
III. Codification in the Inter-American System	68
IV. Other Official Bodies	69
C. The UN International Law Commission	70
I. Establishment	70
II. Election and Composition	71
III. Functions	71
IV. Discharge of Duties	72
a) Selection of Topics	72
b) Procedure	73
c) Accomplishment of Work	75

V. Relations with States and other Bodies	77
a) Direct Relations with States	77
b) Relationship with the Sixth Committee and other Bodies	77
VI. Review of Programme and Methods of Work	78
VII. Appreciation	79
a) The Position of the ILC in the Context of Sources	79
b) Quantitative Appreciation: How Effective is the ILC?	79
c) Selection of Topics	81
d) The Composition of the Commission	83
D. Other UN Bodies	84
E. Evolution of the 1969 Vienna Convention	86
I. Professor BRIERLY's Reports (1950–1952)	87
II. Sir Hersch LAUTERPACHT's Reports (1953–1954)	88
III. Sir Gerald FITZMAURICE's Reports (1956–1960)	88
IV. Sir Humphrey WALDOCK's Reports (1962–1966)	89
a) Reports I–III (1962–1964)	89
b) Reports IV–VI (1965–1966)	90
c) Appreciation	91
V. The 1968/1969 Vienna Conference on the Law of Treaties	92
a) Session of 1968	92
b) Session of 1969	93
c) Some Disputed Matters of Substance	94
d) Conclusion and Entry into Force	95

## **PART TWO INTERACTIONS BETWEEN CUSTOMARY AND CONVENTIONAL RULES**

<b>CHAPTER THREE Codification and Progressive Development of International Law (<i>jus scriptum</i>)</b>	<b>117</b>
A. The UN Framework	117
I. UN Charter Art. 13 subpara. 1(a)	117
II. Response to UN Charter Art. 13 subpara. 1(a)	118

a) The Committee on the Progressive Development of International Law and its Codification (1946/47)	118
b) The ILC-Statute and the Practice of the ILC	120
c) Doctrine	121
B. The Concepts of Codification and Progressive Development	122
I. Codification	122
II. Progressive Development	124
III. "Agreement" and Codification	125
IV. Appreciation	126
C. The Freedom of the Drafting Body to Codify or Develop the Law	127
D. Functions of <i>jus scriptum</i>	128
I. Clarity and Certainty	128
II. The Systematization of Law	129
III. Reform of Law	129
<b>CHAPTER FOUR Methods of Codification</b>	<b>139</b>
A. Code of Rules	139
I. Basis of Validity and Authority	139
II. Attributes	140
III. Types of Codes	141
B. UN General Assembly Resolutions	142
I. Basis of Validity and Authority	142
II. Attributes	145
III. Resolutions and Declarations of Other Bodies	146
C. Conventions	146
I. Bases of Validity	146
II. Political and Scientific Authority	148
III. Implications of the Legal Character of Conventions	149
a) Independent Source of Obligation	149
b) The Convention as a Homogeneous Whole	149
c) Universality of, and Equality before, the Contractual Obligation	150
d) Questions of Ascertainment	152

IV. Special Types of Treaties, or Combinations with Other Methods	154
V. Appreciation	154
D. Relations between Conventional and Customary Law	156
I. Codificatory Conventional Rules	156
a) Some Views on the Matter	156
b) Criteria by which to Assess the Continuing Existence of a Customary Rule	157
c) In Particular Conventions with Quasi-Universal Membership	159
d) Implications	160
II. Customary Rules on the Same Subject-Matter but with Different Content; the <i>expressio unius-maxim</i>	161
III. Customary Rules on Subjects not Covered by the Convention	162
IV. Effects of Conventions with Few Parties, or not in Force	163
a) Reasons for Non-Acceptance	163
b) Detrimental Effects on Customary Law	164
V. Embodiment of the Law of Treaties in a Convention	163
<b>CHAPTER FIVE Generation of New Customary International Law</b>	<b>183</b>
A. Art. 38 of the 1969 Vienna Convention	183
I. <i>Travaux préparatoires</i>	183
a) The Work of the ILC	183
b) Practice of States	185
II. Interpretation of Art. 38 and Evaluation of Materials	186
B. Jurisprudence of Tribunals and Doctrinal Writings	187
C. Delimitations; Arts. 34–37 of the 1969 Vienna Convention	189
D. Conditions of Generation	189
I. New Rules of a “Norm-Creating”, General Character	189
II. Superseding Agreements and “Special Circumstances”	191
III. Reasons for Generation	192

E. The Process of Generation	192
I. Notion	192
II. Aspects of State Practice	194
a) Practice of Parties and Non-Parties	194
b) Treaties as State Practice: Questions of Quasi-Legislative Effects and of a “Copyright” of Parties	195
c) Bilateral Treaties	196
F. Appreciation	197
<b>CHAPTER SIX Modification of Conventional Rules by Subsequent Customary Law</b>	<b>207</b>
A. ILC Drafts and the 1969 Vienna Convention	207
I. Art. 68(c) of the 1964 ILC Draft	207
a) <i>Travaux préparatoires</i>	207
b) Appreciation	209
II. The Function of Art. 31 of the 1969 Vienna Convention	210
III. The Relevance of Art. 38 of the 1966 ILC Draft	211
IV. The Relevance of Arts. 42 and 54 of the 1969 Vienna Convention	211
B. State Practice, Jurisprudence of Tribunals and Doctrinal Writings	213
C. Reasons for Modification	214
D. Modification as the Result of the Formation of a New Customary Rule	215
I. The Conflict Between the Conventional and the Customary Rule	215
a) How Does the Conflict Arise?	215
b) Solution: Desuetude of the Conventional Rule; Customary Law as the <i>lex posterior</i>	215
c) Conflict with a Declaratory Conventional Rule	217
d) Special Customary Law and Special Treaties	217
II. Origination and Formation of the New Customary Rule	218
a) Derogation from, or Breach of, the Conventional Rule	218
b) Modification through Interpretation and Adaptation	219

III. Implications of the Customary Basis of the New Rule	220
a) Practice of Parties and Non-Parties	220
b) <i>Opinio juris</i> and the Intention to Depart from the Conventional Rule	221
c) Presumption Against Change; the Difficulty of Ascertaining Modification	222
IV. Questions of Time	223
E. Conclusions; Comparisons with Other Means of Amendment	224

**PART THREE INTERRELATIONS BETWEEN  
CUSTOMARY AND CONVENTIONAL  
RULES**

<b>CHAPTER SEVEN Ascertainment of the Declaratory Quality of Conventional Rules</b>	<b>237</b>
A. Preliminary Remarks	237
I. Rules on Interpretation	237
II. When is Ascertainment Necessary?	238
III. The Value of Sweeping Statements	238
B. The Strata of Materials	239
I. Pre-ILC Materials	239
II. <i>Travaux préparatoires</i> — the ILC Materials	239
III. <i>Travaux préparatoires</i> — State practice	240
IV. Conventions	240
a) Statements in the Conventional Text	240
b) Statements in Preambles	241
c) Other Indicators	243
V. Subsequent State Practice	244
C. The Techniques of Employing These Materials	244
I. Opinions of Courts and Writers	244
II. Appreciation of Professor BAXTER's Approach	245
III. Evaluation	247
IV. Criteria of Comparison; Delimitation Between Declaratory and Non-Declaratory Conventional Rules	248

<b>CHAPTER EIGHT</b>	<b>Effects of the Declaratory Nature of Conventional Rules</b>	<b>255</b>
A.	Effects of Declaratory Rules Before the Entry into Force of the Convention	255
	I. Arts. 4 and 28 of the 1969 Vienna Convention	255
	a) <i>Travaux préparatoires</i>	255
	b) Evaluation	257
	II. Notion	258
B.	Questions of Reservations	259
	I. Reservations to Declaratory Rules	259
	a) Permissibility of Reservations	259
	b) The Value of Reservation Clauses	261
	c) The Applicable Law	263
	d) Effects of Reservations Upon the Underlying Customary Law	264
	II. Reservations to Non-Declaratory Rules	264
	III. Appreciation	265
	IV. Reservations to the 1969 Vienna Convention	266
C.	Influence of Customary and Conventional Rules on the Interpretation and Ascertainment of One Another	266
	I. The Framework of the 1969 Vienna Convention: Art. 31 subpara. 3(c)	267
	a) History	267
	b) Post-1969 Developments	268
	c) Interpretation	268
	d) Question of Declaratory Nature	269
	II. Function of the Customary Rule for the Interpretation of the Conventional Rule	269
	III. Function of the Conventional Rule for the Customary Rule	270
D.	Subsequent Changes in the Conventional Régime	271
	I. The Framework of the 1969 Vienna Convention	271
	a) Art. 43 — <i>travaux préparatoires</i> and Functions	271
	b) Function of Art. 56	273
	c) Relationship of Art. 43 to Other Articles of the 1969 Vienna Convention	274
	II. Effects of the Invalidity, Termination or Denunciation of a Convention or of the Suspension of its Operation	275

III. Amendment of Conventional Rules	276
E. Applicability of the 1969 Vienna Convention to Treaties and Subjects not within its Scope (VCT Art. 3[b])	276
<b>CHAPTER NINE Conclusions</b>	<b>289</b>
A. The Degree of Recognition of Customary Law in the State Community	289
B. “Codification” and “Progressive Development”	290
C. The Conservative Impact of <i>jus scriptum</i> upon Customary Law	292
D. The Dynamic Impact of Customary Law upon <i>jus</i> <i>scriptum</i>	292
E. Individualistic and Communal Interests of States	294
F. Customary Law and Treaties as Sources of Law	295
G. Identification of Customary Law	297
H. Customary Law and the Present International Community	298
I. Codification of the Interplay of Sources?	299
<b>PART FOUR QUESTION OF THE DECLARATORY NATURE OF SELECTED ARTICLES OF THE 1969 VIENNA CONVENTION</b>	
<b>INTRODUCTION General Statements on the 1969 Vienna Convention</b>	<b>307</b>
A. ILC	307
B. State Practice	308
C. International Tribunals and Doctrinal Writings	309
D. Appreciation	310
E. Position of the French Government	310
<b>CASE STUDY I: VCT Art. 18</b>	<b>315</b>
A. History	315
I. Pre-ILC Case-Law and Doctrine	315
II. ILC	316
III. State Practice	318
B. Post-1969 Developments	319
C. Appreciation	320
D. Interpretation	321

<b>CASE STUDY II: VCT Arts. 31 and 32</b>	<b>327</b>
A. History	327
I. Pre-ILC Doctrine and Case-Law	327
II. ILC	328
III. State Practice	332
B. Post-1969 Developments	334
I. State Practice	334
II. Jurisprudence of Tribunals	338
III. Doctrinal Writings	341
C. Appreciation	342
D. Interpretation of Arts. 31 and 32	343
I. Art. 31	343
II. Art. 32	345
<b>CASE STUDY III: VCT Art. 60</b>	<b>357</b>
A. History	357
I. Pre-ILC Doctrine and Case-Law	357
II. ILC	358
III. State Practice	362
B. Post-1969 Developments	365
I. State Practice	365
II. Jurisprudence of Courts	367
III. Doctrinal Writings	369
C. Appreciation	369
D. Interpretation	370
<b>APPRECIATION IN THE CONTEXT OF SOURCES</b>	<b>381</b>
Argument	387
Table of Treaties and Preparatory Materials	395
Table of Cases	403
Official Documents	402
Bibliography	409
Index	421