

CONSIDERATIONS OF EQUITY IN THE SETTLEMENT OF TERRITORIAL
AND BOUNDARY DISPUTES

International Law in Japanese Perspective

VOLUME 2

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Considerations of Equity in the Settlement of Territorial and Boundary Disputes

by

MASAHIRO MIYOSHI

Aichi University, Japan



Martinus Nijhoff Publishers

Dordrecht / Boston / London

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Miyoshi, Masahiro.

Considerations of equity in the settlement of territorial and boundary disputes / by Masahiro Miyoshi.

p. cm. -- (International law in Japanese perspectives ; v. 2)

Includes bibliographical references and indexes.

ISBN 0-7923-2217-7 (HB : acid-free paper)

1. Boundary disputes. 2. Jurisdiction, Territorial. 3. Equity (International law) I. Title. II. Series.

JX4111.M58 1993

341.4'2--dc20

93-22109

ISBN 0-7923-2217-7

Published by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers,
P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Academic Publishers,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Academic Publishers Group,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1993 Kluwer Academic Publishers
Kluwer Academic Publishers incorporates the publishing programmes of
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from
the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

To the memory of my parents

Table of Contents

Foreword	xv
Preface	xvii
Acknowledgements	xix
Table of Abbreviations	xxi
Table of Cases	xxiii
Table of Treaties	xxvii
Introduction	1
Chapter I. Preliminary Considerations of the Concept of Equity	11
1. Diverse Meanings of Equity	11
2. Attempts at Clarification of the Meaning of Equity	13
(1) "Equity" and "equitable principles"	13
(2) "Equity" and " <i>ex aequo et bono</i> "	14
3. Expressions Having an Equivalent Effect to Equity	16
Chapter II. Arbitration Clauses	21
1. Multilateral Arbitration Treaties	21
(1) The Hague Convention for the Pacific Settlement of International Disputes	22
(2) The Statute of the Permanent Court of International Justice	23
(3) The General Act for the Pacific Settlement of International Disputes	25
2. Restricted Multilateral Treaties	25
(1) Regional Arbitration Treaties	26

viii *Table of Contents*

a)	The Convention Establishing the Central American Court of Justice to Act as a Permanent Court of Arbitration	26
b)	The Treaty of Conciliation and Arbitration between Estonia, Finland, Latvia and Poland	26
c)	Little Entente: General Act of Conciliation, Arbitration and Judicial Settlement	26
d)	The American Treaty on Pacific Settlement (<i>Pact of Bogotá</i>)	27
e)	The European Convention for the Peaceful Settlement of Disputes	27
f)	The Protocol to the Charter of the Organization of African Unity	27
g)	The Final Act of the Conference on Security and Co-operation in Europe	28
h)	The Statute of the Court of Justice of the Cartagena Agreement	28
(2)	Treaties of a Functional Character	28
a)	The Statute on Freedom of Transit	28
b)	The Slave Convention	29
c)	The Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	29
d)	The Treaty Establishing the European Coal and Steel Community	29
e)	The European Fisheries Convention	30
f)	The BENELUX Protocol concerning the Co-ordination of Economic and Social Policies	30
g)	The Treaty Instituting the BENELUX Economic Union	30
h)	The Act regarding Navigation and Economic Co-operation between the States of the Niger Basin	31
i)	The European Convention for the Protection of Animals During International Transport	31
j)	The International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination	32
k)	The United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea	32
(3)	Treaties for the Settlement of Commercial or Civil Disputes	33
a)	The European Convention on International Commercial Arbitration	33
b)	The Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States	34
c)	The Convention on Settlement by Arbitration of Civil Law Disputes Resulting from Economic, Scientific and Technical Co-operation	34
d)	The UNCITRAL Model Law on International Commercial Arbitration	35
3.	Bilateral Treaties	35

(1) General Arbitration Treaties	36
1) “ <i>ex aequo et bono</i> ”	36
a) “ <i>ex aequo et bono</i> ”	36
b) “according to the principles of international law, or <i>ex aequo et bono</i> ”	36
c) “a tribunal having authority to decide <i>ex aequo et bono</i> ”	36
d) “a tribunal having power to decide <i>ex aequo et bono</i> , provided that a rule of international law cannot be applied”	37
e) “ <i>ex aequo et bono</i> if there exist no such substantive rules applicable as those of Article 38 of the Statute of the Permanent Court of International Justice”	37
f) “ <i>ex aequo et bono</i> if there are no rules of international law applicable”	37
g) “If the dispute is not of a juridical nature in the opinion of the Court, the Parties agree to its being settled <i>ex aequo et bono</i> .”	38
h) “Arbitration, but the right reserved to submit the case to the Permanent Court of International Justice which decides <i>ex aequo et bono</i> ”	38
i) “non-legal disputes to be submitted to the Permanent Court of International Justice, which decides <i>ex aequo et bono</i> if there is no rule of law applicable”	39
j) “non-legal disputes may be submitted to the International Court of Justice, which may decide <i>ex aequo et bono</i> if the parties so agree”	39
2) “the powers of an <i>amiable compositeur</i> ”	39
3) “Unless the <i>compromis</i> imposes the application of special rules or authorizes the arbitrator to decide as an <i>amiable</i> <i>compositeur</i> , he must apply the principles of international law”	40
4) “On the basis of claims of the parties in the absence of a <i>compromis</i> ”	40
5) “in accordance with the principles of justice and equity”	41
6) “in accordance with considerations of equity, if the parties agree”	41
7) “in accordance with the principles of law and equity”	41
8) “differences which are justiciable in their nature by reason of being susceptible of decision by the application of the principles of law or equity”	42
9) “Permanent Court of Arbitration unless otherwise agreed”	42
10) “an arbitral tribunal in accordance with the Hague Convention for the Pacific Settlement of International Disputes”	42
11) “the Permanent Court of International Justice in accordance	

x *Table of Contents*

with its Statute or an arbitral tribunal according to the Hague Convention"	43
12) "provisions of the Hague Convention in the absence of particulars in the <i>compromis</i> "	44
13) "Article 38 of the Statute to be applied by the arbitral tribunal"	44
14) "equitable compensation for consequences of a domestic judicial measure"	44
(2) Treaties of a Functional Character	45
1) "on the basis of respect for law"	45
2) "the powers of an <i>amiable compositeur</i> "	45
3) " <i>ex aequo et bono</i> "	46
4) "consideration of relevant circumstances"	47
5) "consideration of special circumstances"	48
6) "pursuant to equity"	49
7) "justice and equity"	49
8) "law and equity"	50
9) "equity in the absence of law"	50
10) "in an equitable manner"	50
11) "amicable settlement"	51
12) "on the basis of mutual interests"	52
13) "reference of the claim to the Permanent Court of Arbitration"	52
14) "application of the provisions of the General Act of 1928"	53
15) "arbitration based on the principle of parity"	53
16) "arbitration, rather than legal proceedings"	53
17) "rules of procedure in accordance with justice and equity"	54
18) "rules of procedure of the Hague Convention"	54
19) "rules of procedure to be decided by the tribunal"	54
20) "provisions of the European Convention on International Commercial Arbitration"	55
4. Special Agreements (<i>Compromis</i>)	55
(1) Special Agreements for Arbitration of Claims Cases	56
1) "according to equity"	56
2) "upon a basis of absolute equity"	56
3) "according to justice and equity"	56
4) "carefully and impartially"	57
5) "equitable or just solution"	58
6) " <i>amiable compositeur</i> "	59
7) " <i>ex aequo et bono</i> "	60
8) "according to evidence"	60
9) "taking into account all relevant matters"	60
10) "to the best of the arbitrator's judgment and according to law"	61

11) "to the best of the arbitrator's judgment and according to justice, equity and law"	62
12) "according to justice and in compliance with the provisions of this convention"	62
13) "according to law and/or equity"	62
14) "on the basis of respect for law"	63
15) "provisions of the Hague Convention"	63
16) "rules of procedure conforming to justice and equity"	64
17) "rules of procedure of the Hague Convention"	64
(2) Special Agreements for Arbitration of Territorial and Boundary Disputes	64
1) "scrupulous and impartial decision"	64
2) "exchange of territory"	65
3) "according to evidence"	65
4) "arbitrators of equity, acting <i>ex aequo et bono</i> "	65
5) "equitable solution"	66
6) "according to justice and equity"	67
7) "according to law and justice or equity"	67
8) "provisions of the Hague Convention"	68
9) "taking into account the relevant circumstances"	69
10) "in view of the reasons and documents produced"	70
11) "according to equitable principles"	70
5. Conclusions	70
 Chapter III. Arbitrations of Territorial and Boundary Disputes	 93
1. Equitable Considerations in Procedural Matters	93
(1) Tribunal's Liberty of Accepting and Collecting Evidence	94
(2) Acceptance of Additional Documents During the Preliminary Phase	95
(3) Examination of Pleas of Estoppel and the Critical Date	98
(4) Taking Account of the Spirit Which Guided the Conclusion of the Treaty	99
2. Equitable Considerations in Substantive Matters	99
(1) Equitable Considerations <i>infra legem</i>	100
1) Very careful weighing of legal bases of the claims and supporting evidence of the parties	100
2) By reason of historical right, of equity and of a geographical nature	104
3) Equitable interpretation of treaty provisions	105
a) Most reconciliatory interpretation of the documents which present no desired clarity of the case	105
b) Equitable interpretation of the text so as to give practically significant effect to it	106

xii *Table of Contents*

c)	Considerations to give the best interpretation of the intention of the diplomatic instruments	108
d)	Consideration of special circumstances in the interpretation of treaty provisions	109
e)	Intentions of the parties ascertained from treaty provisions in the light of all the circumstances	110
f)	Liberal and detailed appreciation of alleged facts	110
4)	Considerations concerning estoppel	111
a)	Estoppel or preclusion from the previous arrangement, provided it is an equitable principle	111
b)	Diplomatic correspondence suffices to prevent the establishment of a title to territory	113
c)	Absence of protest may lead to a title to sovereignty, provided a protest is reasonably expected	114
d)	Silence or non-reaction not necessarily recognition of a claim to sovereignty	115
(2)	Equitable Considerations Marginally <i>infra legem</i>	117
1)	Consideration of particular circumstances of the case	117
a)	Geographical conditions of the arbitration area	117
b)	Consideration of actual circumstances	123
c)	Legal ties based on tribal and religious backgrounds	125
d)	Geographical realities, decisive	126
e)	Presence of islands as a special circumstance	127
2)	Consideration of economic factors	131
a)	Consideration of local economic interests	131
b)	Presence of mineral resources astride the boundary	133
c)	Avoidance of probable inconveniences by tilting the boundary line	134
d)	Consideration of the existence of a <i>de facto</i> boundary	135
3)	Balancing-up of relevant circumstances	136
4)	Equitable balancing of interests of the parties	137
a)	Practical regulation of a positive right in reciprocation to its recognition in principle	137
b)	Reciprocity of the performances of the parties	138
5)	Balanced obligation of the parties	140
a)	Obligation of the upstream country to reconcile its interests with those of the downstream country	140
b)	Obligation to inform of one's stay in return for privileges granted	141
c)	Obligation of the coastal State to give equitable shares to foreign countries traditionally fishing in the coastal waters	142
6)	Proportionality between the continental shelf area and the length of the coastline	142

(3) Equitable Considerations <i>praeter legem</i>	146
1) Recourse to equity in the absence of law	146
a) Recourse to equity by reason of careful weighing of the claims and supporting evidence being impossible	146
b) Choice of a natural frontier in the absence of reliable historical and legal claims to found sovereignty	152
c) According to equity and justice, <i>uti possidetis</i> of 1821 being unable to define the boundary	153
d) Recognition of the existing state of affairs in the absence of clear provisions of a treaty	156
2) Recourse to equity despite the ostensible application of law	157
3) Recommendation of post-award measures	162
a) Consideration for complaints of one party about the domestic legislation of the other	162
b) Desirability of consultation with local inhabitants with a view to possible modification of the boundary	164
(4) Extra-legal Considerations of an Equitable Nature	165
1) Express reference to equity: award to be rendered in equity, the arbitrators having to proceed <i>ex aequo et bono</i>	165
2) Amiable composition	165
a) Consideration for the maintenance of peace and security	165
b) In a spirit of chivalry and love for peace between the parties	166
3) Compromise solution	166
a) Compromise or negotiations between the arbitrators	166
b) Compensation for taking a place from one of the parties by awarding another place thereto	167
c) Consideration to avoid undue advantage being obtained by one of the parties	168
d) Artificial line devised to reconcile the claims of the parties which both conform to the treaty	169
3. A Summary Review of the Cases Analyzed	170
(1) Equitable Considerations in Procedural Matters	170
(2) Equitable Considerations in Substantive Matters	171
Chapter IV. Theoretical Review of Applications of Equity	191
1. The Growing Reference to "Equitable Principles"	191
2. The Important Function of "Relevant Circumstances" in the Settlement of Disputes	193
3. The Predominant Importance of an "Equitable Solution" of the Dispute and Elements of Compromise Therein	197
4. The Criticism of Equity	199
(1) Whether Equity is a Part of "General Principles of Law"	199

xiv *Table of Contents*

(2) Whether “General Principles of Law” Should Be Applied Instead of Equity	200
5. The Need for Careful Weighing of “Relevant Circumstances”	201
6. The Relevance of Historical and Cultural Circumstances	203
7. The Role of Equity to Fill the Gap in the Law	208
Conclusions	217
Bibliography	221
Subject Index	237
Name Index	245