The International Law of Expropriation as Reflected in the Work of the Iran-U.S. Claims Tribunal

Developments in International Law

VOLUME 17

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

The International Law of Expropriation as Reflected in the Work of the Iran-U.S. Claims Tribunal

by

Allahyar Mouri

Iran-U.S. Claims Tribunal

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 0-7923-2654-7

Published by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers,
P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Academic Publishers,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Academic Publishers Group,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1994 Kluwer Academic Publishers
Kluwer Academic Publishers incorporates the publishing programmes of
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

Acknowledgements

An appreciation for one's mentor has deep roots in the Iranian tradition. In this nation's literature and history, and even in stories told by parents to their children, ample emphasis is placed on respect and gratitude for all kinds of tutorial instructions . This value is so thoroughly ingrained in the nation's psyche that with his first calligraphy lessons at school, a child is taught to write, in the neatest and most presentable manner possible, the aphorism that "the teacher's rod is sweeter than a father's love." In keeping with this tradition, my thanks and sincere gratitude shall go first to Prof. Rosalyn Higgins who supervised this work and gave unstintingly of her precious time, effort and advice in assisting the author.

My thanks go also to Dr. Frank Vittor, a learned colleague in the Language Services Division of the Iran-U.S. Claims Tribunal who devoted time and effort in editing and proofreading the English of the work.

However, I owe a particular debt of gratitude and appreciation to my wife, whose tolerance and dedication made it possible for me to bring this work to completion; and also to my younger daughter Sharareh, who lost, during the years that the work was in progress, the close care and attention that she profoundly needed and deserved due to her handicap.

Allahyar Mouri
March 1993

Table of Contents

Table of Cases: Iran-U.S. CTR viii

Table of Cases: Other International *Fora* xviii

Table of Cases: Municipal Courts xxi

Books, Articles, Journals and Papers xxiii

Laws, Regulations, Treaties and Conventions xxxii

Aspects of The Iran-United States Claims Tribunal

A: **Introduction** 1

B: **The Algiers Declarations** 3

C: **The Tribunal's Jurisdiction** 7

D: **Appointing of Arbitrators and Chambers Compostition** 14

E: **Awards and Other Decisions of the Tribunal** 19

F: **The Tribunal's Nature** 23

G: **The Applicable Law** 28

BOOK ONE

What Constitutes Expropriation or Measures Affecting Property Rights

CHAPTER I

What Constitutes a Property Right 37

I.A) **Definition** 37

I.B) **Rights Constituting Independent Property** 39

I.B.1) ***Contract Rights*** 39

I.B.2) ***Shareholder Rights*** 50

I.B.2.a) *Management Rights* 51

I.B.2.b) *Right to Receive Dividends* 52

I.B.2.c) *Right to Repayment of Loans* 55

I.C) Elements Relating to Valuation but not Considered Property Rights 58

I.D) Rights Not Protected as Property Rights 61

CHAPTER II

What Constitutes Expropriation 65

II.A) Definition 65

II.B) De Jure and De Facto Expropriation 70

II.B.1) ***De Jure Expropriation*** 72

II.B.1.a) *Oil Agreement Cases* 72

II.B.1.b) *Insurance Cases* 83

II.B.1.c) *Other Cases* 84

II.B.2) ***De Facto Expropriation*** 88

II.B.2.a) *Application of the Rule to Physical Properties* 89

II.B.2.b) *Application of the Rule to Business Operations* 94

CHAPTER III

What Constitutes Measures Affecting Property Rights . . . 100

III.A) Definition and Constituent Elements of Measure 104

III.A.1) ***Is Omission a Constituent Element?*** 105

III.A.2) ***Ejusdem Generis Rule*** 119

III.A.2.a) *Failure as a Measure* 119

III.A.2.b) *Tortious Act as a Measure* 124

III.B) Kinds of Measures and Their Impact 129

III.B.1) ***Deprivation by Unreasonable Government Interference*** . 129

III.B.1.a) *Interference Through Management Control* 129

III.B.1.b) *Interference As Majority Shareholder* 140

III.B.1.c) *Interference With Banking Transactions* 145

III.B.2) *Deprivation Caused by Breach of Obligation* 152
III.B.3) *Appropriation* 172

Book Two

Liability

CHAPTER IV

Attributibility 177

IV.A) Application of International Law Test 177
IV.A.1) *What Comprises a State* 179
IV.A.2) *Acts of What Organs or Persons Are Attributable to States* 185
IV.A.2.a) *Acts of Revolutionary Organs* 185
IV.A.2.b) *Acts of Independent and Separate Persons or Entities* 191

IV.B) Application of the Claims Settlement Declaration Test . . . 198
IV.B.1) *Definition of the Term "Control"* 199
IV.B.2) *Is Capital and Management Control the Test?* 203
IV.B.3) *Is Either Capital or Management Control a Sufficient Test* 208

CHAPTER V

Causal Link Requirement and Defences to Liability 213

V.A) Causal Link 214

V.B) Is Aggrieved Conduct a Defence? 219

V.C) Is Force Majeure a Defence? 229

V.D) Are Regulatory Measures a Defence to Liability? 248

V.E) Is Absence of Intention a Defence? 257

CHAPTER VI

Burden of Proof 265

VI.A) Proof of the Existence of Valuable Property or Property Rights 269

VI.B) Proof of Expropriation or Other Measures and Attribution to the State 276

VI.C) Proof In Defences to Liability 283

Book Three

Compensatio

CHAPTER VII

What is the Applicable Law 296

VII.A) Applicability of Customary International Law 298

VII.B) Applicability of the Treaty of Amity 301

VII.C) Applicability of the Treaty and International Law 306

CHAPTER VIII

Compensability and Elements Affecting Compensation . . 310

VIII.A) Compensability and Its Basis 310
VIII.A.1) ***Acquired Rights and Sanctity of Contract as Basis*** . . . 311
VIII.A.2) ***Unjust Enrichment as Basis*** 315
VIII.A.3) ***Theory of "Damage" or "Loss" as Basis*** 319

VIII.B) Elements Affecting the Standard of Compensation 320
VIII.B.1) ***Lawfulness and Unlawfulness of the Act or Measure*** . 320
VIII.B.1.a) *Public Purpose* 324
VIII.B.1.b) *Non-discrimination* 328
VIII.B.1.c) *Prompt Payment of Compensation* 332
VIII.B.1.d) *Conformity with Municipal Law or Contract* 338
d.i) Conformity with Municipal Law 339
d.ii) Conformity with the Contract 341

VIII.B.2) *Large-scale Nationalization* 347

CHAPTER IX

Standard of Compensation 351

IX.A) Standard of Compensation under International Law 352
IX.A.1) ***Impact of Settlements and Bilateral Treaties*** 352
IX.A.2) ***U.N. Resolutions*** 359
IX.A.3) ***What is the Standard*** 363
IX.A.3.a) *Awards Requiring "Appropriate" Compensation for Lawful Expropriations* 366
IX.A.3.b) *Award Requiring "Full" Compensation in both Lawful and Unlawful Expropriation* 371
IX.A.3.c) *Awards Requiring "Full" Compensation for Unlawful Expropriation* 374
IX.A.3.d) *"Restitutio Compensation" for Unlawful Expropriation* 375

IX.B) Standard of Full Compensation under the Treaty of Amity 378

IX.C) What Does "Full Compensation" Mean? 382
IX.C.1) ***"Full Compensation" as Defined by Khemco Award*** . . . 383
IX.C.2) ***The Practice of the Tribunal: The Deprivation Cases*** . . 390
IX.C.3) ***The Practice of the Tribunal: The Expropriation Cases*** . 396
IX.C.3.a) *Expropriation Involving a Property or Business* 396
IX.C.3.b) *Expropriation Involving Contract Rights* 399
IX.C.4) ***The Practice of the Tribunal: Unjust Enrichment Cases*** 403

Book Four

Valuation

CHAPTER X

Methods of Valuation 408

X.A) "Fair Market Value" Concept 410

X.A.1) ***The Meaning and Constituent Elements of the Concept*** . 410
X.A.2) ***Who is a Willing Seller or a Willing Buyer*** 417
X.A.3) ***Valuation of Business Enterprises*** 419
X.A.3.a) *"Going Concern" Value* 420
a.i) Definition of "Going Concern" and "Going Concern Value" 421
a.ii) How a "Going Concern" is Valued 427
Tangible Assets 429
Intangible Assets including Goodwill and Profitability 431
Loss of Future Profits 438
Liabilities of the Enterprise 441
X.A.3.b) *"Liquidation" or "Dissolution" Value* 442
X.A.3.c) *"Original" or "Initial Investment" Value* 451
X.A.4) ***Valuation of Individual Tangible Assets*** 453
X.A.4.a) *Depreciated Replacement Value* 454
X.A.4.b) *Comparable Sales* 457
X.A.4.c) *Insurance Value* 459

X.B) "Owner Value" Concept 461
X.B.1) ***"Discounted Cash Flow" ("DCF") Value*** 462
X.B.1.a) *What does the DCF Method Mean?* 464
X.B.1.b) *How is DCF Value Calculated?* 466
b.i) Projection of the Future Cash Flow 467
b.ii) Projection of the Future Costs 473
b.iii) Discount factor 475
X.B.2) ***Valuation Based on Past Earnings*** 480

X.C) Book Value 483
X.C.1) ***The Meaning of "Book Value"*** 485
X.C.2) ***"Book Value" in Valuing a Concern or Undertaking*** . . . 487
X.C.3) ***"Book Value" in Valuing Discrete Tangible Properties*** . . 490

X.D) Valuation of Independent Intangible Rights 492

X.E) Approximate Value 496

CHAPTER XI

Valuation Date and Its Impact 501

XI.A) Date of Taking or Deprivation as the Valuation Date 501

XI.A.1) ***Date of Valuation in Expropriation Cases*** 503

XI.A.2) ***Date of Valuation in Deprivation Cases*** 508

XI.A.3) ***Date of Valuation in Appropriation Cases*** 513

XI.B) Factors Affecting Valuation 514

XI.B.1) ***Post-expropriation (Post-valuation date) Factors*** 516

XI.B.2) ***Pre-expropriation (Pre-valuation date) Factors*** 520

XI.B.2.a) *Factors Related to the Nature of Business or Property* 520

XI.B.2.b) *Expropriatory or Deprivative Measures and the Threat Thereof* 522

XI.B.2.c) *Social, Political and Economic Factors* 526

XI.B.3) ***Excess Profits and Unjust Enrichment as Factors*** 530

XI.C) Currency of Payment and Conversion Date and Rate 533

XI.D) Interest, its Date and Rate 544

XI.D.1) ***Common Principles*** 547

XI.D.1.a) *Contractual Rate of Interest should be Respected* . . . 549

XI.D.1.b) *Payment of Simple Interest is the Rule* 553

XI.D.2) ***How Interest Rate is Calculated*** 555

XI.D.1.a) *Sylvania Method* 557

XI.D.2.b) *McCollough Principles* 561

XI.D.3) ***The Period of Computation of Interest*** 564