

THE UNITED STATES AND THE
WORLD COURT AS A
'SUPREME COURT OF THE NATIONS':
DREAMS, ILLUSIONS AND
DISILLUSION

LEGAL ASPECTS OF
INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION

VOLUME 26

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

THE UNITED STATES AND THE
WORLD COURT AS A
'SUPREME COURT OF THE NATIONS':
DREAMS, ILLUSIONS AND
DISILLUSION

MICHLA POMERANCE



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 90-411-0204-3

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Law International,
675 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1996 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

In memory of

JULIUS STONE
(1907-1985)

An unforgettable jurist
whose bright beacon of scholarship, integrity and courage
continues to illumine the legal landscape

תנצב"ה

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	xi
ABBREVIATIONS	xv
INTRODUCTION	1
I. A ‘SUPREME COURT OF THE NATIONS’: PRE-WORLD WAR I IMAGES AND REALITY	7
The Supreme Court as a Model for a World Court	9
U.S. Arbitration Treaties up to World War I: Obligations, Illusions, and Rhetoric	21
U.S. Pre-World War I Arbitrations	41
The United States and Plans for a Permanent Tribunal	49
Arbitration, Adjudication, and the American Tradition	61
II. REJECTING THE EUROPEAN OFFSPRING: THE UNITED STATES AND THE FIRST WORLD COURT	65
The Seeds of Rejection	65
Establishment of the Court and of the Advisory Jurisdiction	70
The First Failed Adhesion, 1923-1926	78
The Second Attempt: The Issue Reopened	108
The Final Rejection	120
Monday Morning Quarterbacking	133

III. FROM PCIJ TO ICJ: THE U.S. ROLE	139
Old or New Court?	145
Compulsory Jurisdiction	151
Composition of Court: Selection of Judges	165
Composition of Court: Other Questions	170
Advisory Jurisdiction	175
The Roles Not Given	182
A. Official Interpreter of the Charter	182
B. Official Interpreter of the Domestic Jurisdiction Clause	184
C. Arbiter of Inter-Organizational Disputes and Administrative Court of Appeal	189
D. Arbiter of Peaceful Change	191
Enforcement of Judgments	192
Codification of International Law	198
The U.S. Role Reassessed	202
IV. U.S. ACCEPTANCE OF THE OPTIONAL CLAUSE: OLD WINE IN NEW BOTTLES	206
The Process of Acceptance: Constitutional Issues	211
The Conditions in S. Res. 196	217
Domestic Jurisdiction and the Connally Amendment	222
The Vandenberg Amendment	237
The Millikin Amendment	247
Contemporary Assumptions, Fears, and Expectations	254
V. THE 'REPEAL CONNALLY' CAMPAIGN: THE FRUSTRATION OF THE EXORCISTS	264
The 1960 'Grand Debate': The Background	264
The Administration Stand: Words and Deeds	274
Pro-Repeal Arguments	285
Anti-Repeal Arguments	295
Intertia, Renewed Efforts — and Inertia	313
The Roots of Frustration	325

VI. THE FORTIETH YEAR ITCH: TERMINATION OF THE U.S. DECLARATION 1985-1986	333
Background to the Termination: Proximate and Other Causes	333
Official Explanations	341
Congressional Counter-Initiatives	350
The Dissenters: The Case Against the Administration	357
The Defenders, the Disarmed, and the Disinterested	364
Aftershocks and Aftermath	372
VII. THE UNITED STATES AND THE COURT: OLD MODELS, NEW CONTEXTS, UNMAPPED FUTURE	382
The Past Tradition: Whose Prism?	383
A Tradition of Dichotomies and Paradoxes	387
For Everything There is A Season: A Cyclical Tradition	390
A Public Opinion of Many Opinions	392
A 'Supreme Court of the Nations' — For What Purpose?	396
The World Court: A Changing Institution	397
U.S.-Court Relations in a Period of Transition	405
APPENDICES	
1. Article 36 of the Statute of the International Court of Justice	439
2. U.S. Declaration Accepting ICJ Optional Clause Jurisdiction, 1946	441
3. Shultz Notice of Modification of U.S. Declaration, 1984	443
4. U.S. Statement on Withdrawal from Proceedings in the <i>Nicaragua</i> Case, 1985	444
5. U.S. Termination of Optional Clause Declaration, 1985	449
BIBLIOGRAPHY	453
INDEX	477