

**COLLECTIVE RESPONSES TO ILLEGAL ACTS
IN INTERNATIONAL LAW**

LEGAL ASPECTS OF
INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION

VOLUME 11

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Graduate Institute of International Studies – Geneva

COLLECTIVE RESPONSES TO ILLEGAL ACTS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

UNITED NATIONS ACTION IN THE QUESTION
OF SOUTHERN RHODESIA

Vera Gowlland-Debbas



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gowlland-Debbas, Vera, 1943-

Collective responses to illegal acts in international law : United Nations action in the question of Southern Rhodesia / Vera Gowlland-Debbas.

p. cm. -- (Law and international organization ; 10)

"Graduate Institute of International Studies."

Originally presented as the author's thesis (doctoral--Graduate Institute of International Studies, 1986).

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-7923-0811-5 (alk. paper)

1. Zimbabwe--International status. 2. Recognition (International law) 3. United Nations--Zimbabwe. 4. Sanctions (International law)

I. Graduate Institute of International Studies (Geneva, Switzerland)

II. Title. III. Series.

JX4084.R5G68 1990

341.2'9'096891--dc20

90-7471

ISBN 0-7923-0811-5

Published by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers,
P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Academic Publishers,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Academic Publishers Group,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1990 by Kluwer Academic Publishers
Kluwer Academic Publishers incorporates the publishing programmes of
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	17
Acknowledgements.	23
List of Abbreviations	25
INTRODUCTION	27
PART I: APPLICATION OF THE LAW ON DECOLONIZATION TO THE TERRITORY OF SOUTHERN RHODESIA	
Chapter 1: The Constitutional Relationship between the United Kingdom and Southern Rhodesia	39
Chapter 2: The Determination of Southern Rhodesia as a Non-Self-Governing Territory	93
PART II: COLLECTIVE RESPONSE TO THE UDI: INVALIDATION AND NON-RECOGNITION	
Chapter 3: The Determination of the Illegality and Invalidity of the UDI	181
Chapter 4: Legal Consequence of the Determination of Illegality and Invalidity: The Policy of Non-Recognition	273
PART III: COLLECTIVE RESPONSE TO THE UDI: COERCIVE MEASURES	
Chapter 5: The Adoption of Collective Measures Outside the Framework of Chapter VII	365
Chapter 6: The Adoption of Collective Measures Within the Framework of Chapter VII	423
Chapter 7: Legal Effects of the Mandatory Collective Measures	487
Chapter 8: Legal Aspects of the Implementation of Collective Measures	695
CONCLUSION	
Table of United Nations Resolutions	665
Table of Cases.	667
Table of Statutes.	669
Bibliography	671
Appendix	695
Index	745

INTRODUCTION	27
 Part I: Application of the Law on Decolonization to the Territory of Southern Rhodesia	 37
 Chapter 1	
THE CONSTITUTIONAL RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE UNITED KINGDOM AND SOUTHERN RHODESIA	39
I THE CONSTITUTIONAL RELATIONSHIP UP TO NOVEMBER 11, 1965	40
A. Origins of European Settlement and Company Rule to 1923	40
1) From sphere of influence to conquest	42
2) The genesis of white "responsible government"	44
3) The end of Company rule and annexation	44
B. Internal Self-Government of the Colony from 1923	45
1) The system of "responsible self-government"	47
2) The system of government for the African majority	48
a) Existing representation and protection of African interests	48
b) Prospects for African access to the political system	50
i) The raising of the franchise qualifications	50
ii) Legislation and governmental policies	51
C. Constitutional Limitations on the Sovereignty of the Colony of Southern Rhodesia	54
1) Limitations on internal autonomy	54
a) United Kingdom powers of amendment	54
b) United Kingdom right to "veto" legislation	54
c) Sovereignty of the United Kingdom Parliament	56
d) The constitutional convention	57
2) Legal control in external affairs	59
a) Status of Southern Rhodesia within the Commonwealth	59
b) International relations	60
i) Participation in treaties	60
ii) Representation	60
iii) Membership in international organizations	61
iv) Ultimate authority of the United Kingdom	63
II THE CONSTITUTIONAL RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN NOVEMBER 11, 1965 AND APRIL 18, 1980	65
A. The Origins of the Unilateral Declaration of Independence (UDI)	65
1) The failure of the 1961 Constitution	65
2) The failure of independence negotiations	65
a) The negotiation proposals	66
b) The threat of a UDI	69
B. The Unilateral Endeavour to Establish a Sovereign State	71
1) The unilateral severance of constitutional links with the United Kingdom	73

2) The Rhodesian judiciary and the question of the domestic legality of the UDI	74
3) The internal system of government	76
a) The 1969 "Constitution" and the principle of "parity"	76
b) The "internal settlement" of 1978 and the principle of "majority rule"	78
C. The Legal Validity and Effects of the Unilateral Declaration of Independence under the Constitutional Law of the United Kingdom	80
1) Formal assertion by the United Kingdom of complete sovereignty over Southern Rhodesia	80
a) Legal measures adopted to reassert United Kingdom sovereignty	82
b) The United Kingdom judiciary and the constitutional illegality of the UDI	84
2) The adoption of economic and other measures	85
a) Economic measures	85
b) Financial measures	86
c) Other measures	86
3) Negotiations for a settlement and return to constitutional legality	86

Chapter 2

THE DETERMINATION OF SOUTHERN RHODESIA AS A NON-SELF-GOVERNING TERRITORY

93

I COMPETENCE OF THE UN TO APPLY THE LAW ON DECOLONIZATION TO THE TERRITORY OF SOUTHERN RHODESIA

95

A. Introduction	95
1) The institutional mechanism	95
2) Adoption of GA Res.1747 (XVI)	99
3) Summary of respective legal arguments	102
B. Legal Basis of GA Res.1747 (XVI)	104
1) The relevance of Art. 2(7) to Non-Self-Governing Territories	104
a) The plea of domestic jurisdiction	104
b) The assertion of international jurisdiction	107
2) Arguments relating to the status of Southern Rhodesia	110
a) United Kingdom assertion of Southern Rhodesia's self-governing status	110
i) Self-government under UK constitutional law	110
ii) Special autonomous status in international affairs	111
iii) Constitutional considerations as limitation on obligations under Art. 73	112
iv) Lack of competence of the UN in the affairs of Southern Rhodesia	113
b) Assertion by the majority of Southern Rhodesia's Non-Self-Governing Status	115
i) Arguments relating to constitutional considerations	115
ii) Status of Southern Rhodesia in the light of UN criteria	117
iii) No international recognition of self-governing status	121
iv) Constitutional considerations as limitation on transmission of information	122
3) Conclusions regarding the legal validity of GA Res.1747 (XVI)	123
C. The Legal Effects of GA Res.1747 (XVI)	132
1) The legal arguments	133

2) The legal effects of General Assembly resolutions	136
a) Legal effects of General Assembly determinations	137
b) Legal effects of General Assembly declaratory resolutions and the right of self-determination	144
i) As an interpretation of Charter rules	149
ii) As an element in the development of a customary rule	150
II COMPETENCE OF THE UN TO DEFINE THE MODALITIES OF DECOLONIZATION	158
A. Objectives and modalities	158
1) Measures requested of the Administering Power	160
a) The timing and acceptance of independence	160
b) The method of public consultation	164
c) Constitutional and other reforms proposed by the UN	165
d) Measures to forestall independence under minority rule	167
2) UN Action	171
B. Legal Basis and Effects of UN Recommendations relating to the Modalities of Decolonization in Southern Rhodesia	173
 Part II: Collective Response to the UDI: Invalidation and Non-Recognition	 179
 Chapter 3	
THE DETERMINATION OF THE ILLEGALITY AND INVALIDITY OF THE UDI	181
I INTRODUCTION	183
A. History of the Adoption of the Resolutions	183
1) The response to the UDI	183
2) The response to the proclamation of a republic	185
3) The response to the internal settlement	187
B. Legal Basis of the Organization's Competence after the UDI	191
1) The basis of the United Kingdom's waiver of the plea of domestic jurisdiction	191
2) Objections to the competence of the Organization after the UDI	195
a) The position of France	196
b) The positions of South Africa and Portugal	197
3) The position of the majority of Members: Non-alteration of the status of the Territory as a basis for continued UN competence	199
II THE DETERMINATION BY THE SECURITY COUNCIL OF THE ILLEGALITY OF THE UDI UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	201
A. The Constitutional Illegality and Invalidity of the UDI under International Law	202
1) Effects of constitutional illegality in international law	203
2) Southern Rhodesia and the criteria for statehood	205
a) Effectiveness	207
b) Independence	209
c) Conclusions regarding statehood	214
B. The Determination of the Illegality of the UDI under International Law	216
1) Evidence of and grounds for invalidity at the international level	216

2) Evidence of and grounds for the determination of illegality at the international level	218
a) Evidence of international illegality in resolutions and debates	218
b) The grounds for illegality	221
i) UDI as violation of human rights and fundamental freedoms . .	221
ii) UDI as violation of the right of self-determination	225
c) Imputability for violation of self-determination	229
i) State responsibility	230
ii) Individual or collective responsibility	232
III INVALIDITY AS A CONSEQUENCE OF ILLEGALITY	237
A. The Doctrine of Nullity in International Law	237
B. The Concept of International Crime	241
1) Article 19 of the ILC Draft Articles on State Responsibility	241
2) Evolution of the concept of obligations fundamental to the international community	244
3) Common elements between the concepts of <i>jus cogens</i> , obligations <i>erga omnes</i> and international crimes	249
4) Relevance of these concepts to the case of Southern Rhodesia	251
a) Self-determination as a "fundamental obligation"	253
b) The role of UN practice in this process	255
C. Recent Practice by the United Nations in Determinations of Invalidity . .	258
1) Cases concerning the illegal use of force	258
2) Cases concerning decolonization, racial discrimination and territorial integrity	260
a) Namibia	261
b) The independence of the bantustans	262
c) The declaration of a Turkish Cypriot Republic	264
d) The Treaty of Peace between Egypt and Israel	265
D. Competence of UN Organs to Make Such Determinations	265
1) Charter basis and function of determinations	266
2) Right of the international community to invoke the illegality	268
3) ILC assertion of UN jurisdiction over international crimes	270

Chapter 4

LEGAL CONSEQUENCE OF THE DETERMINATION OF ILLEGALITY AND INVALIDITY: THE POLICY OF NON-RECOGNITION	273
I THE DUTY OF NON-RECOGNITION	273
A. The Object of Non-Recognition	274
B. The Function of Non-Recognition	276
C. Legal Basis and Effects of Collective Non-Recognition	278
1) Existence of a duty of non-recognition in general international law . .	281
a) Existence of a duty of non-recognition arising from the illegal resort to force	282
i) The origins in a conventional obligation: the case of Manchukuo	282
ii) The development of a customary rule	284
b) Existence of a duty of non-recognition arising from a violation of the right of self-determination	287

2) Existence of a duty of non-recognition in the Charter	288
a) Existence of a conventional duty prior to March 1970	289
b) Legal basis of the duty laid down in SC Res. 277 (1970)	291
c) Duty of non-recognition laid down in Security Council resolutions and third States	293
D. Legal Basis of the Content of Non-Recognition	295
1) Diplomatic and consular relations	298
2) Non-admission to international organizations	300
3) Non-cognizance of the acts of the régime	302
a) Non-application of laws or acts	303
b) Refusal of passports	307
4) Prohibition of other actions implying legality	312
a) Persons and organizations purporting to act for or on behalf of the illegal régime	312
b) Contacts in the field of sports	314
5) Non-recognition and the severance of practical relations	317
E. Legal Effects of Implied or Eventual Express Recognition	319
 II THE CONTINUING NON-SELF-GOVERNING STATUS OF SOUTHERN RHODESIA	 325
A. Responsibility of the Administering Authority	325
1) Independence terms	327
a) 1971 Proposals for a Settlement	327
b) 1977 Anglo-American proposals	328
c) 1971 Lancaster House Agreement	329
2) Preliminary constitutional reforms	330
3) The use of force by the Administering Authority	331
B. Recognition of the Legitimacy of the National Liberation Movements	336
1) The right to representation	337
a) Observer status: the legal issues raised	337
i) Legal basis for the decision to grant observer status	339
ii) Implications of the granting of observer status	340
iii) The designation of representatives to participate as observers	342
iv) The practice	342
b) Representation in the Security Council	345
2) The right to resort to force	347
a) Arguments relating to the Zimbabwe National Liberation Movements	347
i) Zimbabwe Liberation Movements and the <i>jus ad bellum</i>	347
ii) Zimbabwe Liberation Movements and the <i>jus in bello</i>	349
b) Legal issues raised	351
i) Internationalization of national liberation wars	352
ii) The <i>jus ad bellum</i>	354
iii) The <i>jus in bello</i>	355
3) The status of third parties to the conflict	358
 Part III: Collective Response to the UDI: Coercive Measures	 363

Chapter 5

THE ADOPTION OF COLLECTIVE MEASURES**OUTSIDE THE FRAMEWORK OF CHAPTER VII 365****I INTRODUCTION 365****II THE RECOMMENDATION OF ECONOMIC AND DIPLOMATIC****MEASURES: SC RES. 216 AND 217 (1965) 372****A. History and Outline of the Measures 372**

1) The views of the United Kingdom and the UK draft resolution 373

2) The views of the Afro-Asian States and the African draft resolution 374

3) The compromise resolution: SC Res. 217 376

B. Content and Legal Basis of SC Res. 216 and 217 377

1) The types of measures envisaged 378

a) Economic 379

b) Diplomatic 379

2) Legal basis of the resolutions 381

a) Article 41 of Chapter VII 381

i) The necessity of a prior determination under Article 39 381

ii) The qualification of the situation arising from the UDI 381

iii) Previous efforts to qualify the situation as a threat to international
peace and security 383

b) Alternative legal basis under Chapter VII 387

c) Legal basis under Chapter VI 389

d) Conclusion with regard to legal basis 391

C. Legal Effects of the Resolutions 393

1) The non-mandatory nature of the resolutions 393

a) Charter basis 393

b) Language of the resolutions 394

c) The intentions of Member States 395

2) The parties called on to execute the measures 395

a) Member and non-Member States 395

b) The United Kingdom 396

c) The Organization of African Unity 396

3) The coercive nature of the measures 397

4) The collective nature of the measures 398

III THE INITIATION OF THE USE OF FORCE IN THE APPLICATION OF**NON-MANDATORY MEASURES: SC RES. 221 (1966) 400****A. History and Outline of the Measures 400**1) The incidents of the *Joanna V* and the *Manuela* 400

2) The adoption of SC Res. 221 402

a) The United Kingdom draft resolution 403

b) The African amendments 404

3) The execution by the UK of SC Res. 221 406

B. Content and Legal Basis of SC Res. 221 407

1) Content of the resolution 407

a) Reiteration 407

b) Enforcement 407

i) The type of measure envisaged	407
ii) The requirement of prior authorization	408
2) Charter basis of the resolution	413
a) The determination of a threat to the peace	413
b) The legal basis within Chapter VII	416
C. The Legal Effects of SC Res. 221	419

Chapter 6

THE ADOPTION OF COLLECTIVE MEASURES	
WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK OF CHAPTER VII	423
I HISTORY AND CONTENT OF THE MEASURES	423
A. Adoption of Selective Mandatory Measures: SC Res. 232 (1966)	423
1) Southern Rhodesian exports	424
2) Southern Rhodesian imports	425
3) Financial or economic aid	425
B. Adoption of Quasi-Comprehensive Mandatory Sanctions	426
1) SC Res.253 (1968)	426
a) Southern Rhodesian exports	427
b) Southern Rhodesian imports	427
c) Movement of funds	428
d) Communications	428
e) Movement of persons	428
2) SC Res.277 (1970)	429
a) Diplomatic relations	431
b) Communications	431
3) Adoption of minor extensions to mandatory sanctions: SC Res. 333 (1973), 388 (1976) and 409 (1977)	432
a) Insurance coverage	434
b) Granting of trade names and franchises	434
c) Movement of funds	435
4) Measures cited under Article 41 which were rejected	437
a) Ban on total means of communications	438
b) Measures involving nationals of Member States	439
c) Action to be taken against South Africa and Portugal	441
d) Measures relating to stopovers and interline traffic	442
II LEGAL BASIS OF THE MEASURES	444
A. The Preliminary Finding of a Threat to the Peace as a Legal Prerequisite	445
1) Necessity of an explicit determination of a threat to the peace	446
2) The precedents	447
3) Legal validity of the finding of a threat to the peace	449
a) The controversy over the factual existence of a threat to the peace	449
b) Requirements of the Charter in the question of a finding	451
B. Charter Basis of the Measures	456
1) Reference to Charter provisions	457
2) Legal basis of the content	457
a) Basis in Article 41	457

b) Exceptions	459
c) Reservations by Member States	459
3) Wording of the resolutions	461
III NATURE OF THE MEASURES: POLITICAL MEASURES FOR PRESERVATION OF THE PEACE OR LEGAL SANCTION?	461
A. Sanctions in International Law	462
1) Need for sanctions	462
2) Agreed elements of a definition	463
3) Conditions, purpose and form	464
B. Measures under Chapter VII as Legal Sanctions	465
1) Covenant and Charter compared	466
2) Practice of the UN in questions relating to the use of force	468
3) The Southern Rhodesian case and legal sanctions	469
4) The views of publicists regarding the nature of Chapter VII measures	472
5) The Draft Articles on State Responsibility and the question of sanctions	473
6) Conclusion	479
IV THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY AND THE INITIATION OF COLLECTIVE MEASURES AGAINST SOUTHERN RHODESIA	480
A. The Power to Recommend Collective or Enforcement Measures	482
B. Limitations Placed by Article 12 of the Charter	484

Chapter 7

LEGAL EFFECTS OF THE MANDATORY COLLECTIVE MEASURES .	487
I LEGAL EFFECTS OF THE RESOLUTIONS ON MEMBER STATES .	487
A. Obligations under Article 25 of the Charter	487
B. The Plea of Exemption from Article 25	491
1) Reservations on the grounds of formal invalidity: the case of Portugal and South Africa	491
a) The positions of Portugal and South Africa	491
b) The legal effects of voluntary abstentions by a permanent member of the Security Council	494
2) Reservations on the grounds of necessity	497
a) The position of neighbouring States	497
b) The meaning of Article 50 of the Charter	499
3) Reservations on the grounds of domestic law: the United States and the Byrd Amendment	500
a) The position of the United States	501
b) The position of the United Nations majority	502
c) Resolution of conflicts between international law and municipal law	505
i) In domestic courts	506
ii) Under international law	509
4) Reservations arising from a status of permanent neutrality	514
a) The official position of the permanently neutral States	517
b) The position of neutral States under the Charter in the application of mandatory measures under Chapter VII	520

c) The application of enforcement measures and the duties of permanently neutral States under international law	522
II LEGAL EFFECTS OF THE RESOLUTIONS ON THIRD PARTIES . .	526
A. Legal Effects on Non-Member States	526
1) Provisions in Security Council resolutions relating to non-Member States .	527
a) Specifically as "non-Member States"	527
b) Englobed in the term "All States"	528
c) As members of other international organizations	528
2) Legal problems which arise	529
a) Legal basis of the request to non-Members	529
b) Legal effects of the request	530
B. Legal Effects of the Resolutions on the Specialized Agencies	535
1) Member States also Members of the Specialized Agencies	535
a) The problem of exclusion or suspension of membership by the Specialized Agencies	535
b) The response of the Specialized Agencies	537
i) Universal Postal Union	537
ii) World Meteorological Organization	538
iii) International Telecommunication Union	539
iv) World Health Organization	540
2) Non-member States also Members of the Specialized Agencies	541
3) The Specialized Agencies as such	541
a) Provisions in Council resolutions addressed to the Specialized Agencies themselves: information and assistance	541
b) Legal relationship between the United Nations and the Specialized Agencies	542
c) Legal effects of United Nations recommendations to the Specialized Agencies	544
C. Legal Effects of the Resolutions on Regional Organizations: the Organization of African Unity	548
1) Nature of the request to the OAU	548
2) OAU initiation of enforcement action	551
3) OAU pressure on the Security Council	554

Chapter 8

LEGAL ASPECTS OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF COLLECTIVE MEASURES 557

I IMPLEMENTATION BY MEMBER AND NON-MEMBER STATES OF MANDATORY SANCTIONS 558

A. Inadequacy of the Information at the Disposal of the Organization . . .	562
1) The implementation of selective mandatory sanctions (SC Res. 232 (1966)) .	562
a) Failure to reply	563
b) Variations in the replies	564
i) Frequency	564
ii) Content	565

2) The implementation of quasi-comprehensive sanctions (SC Res. 253 (1968))	567
a) Failure to reply	568
b) Variations in the replies	568
i) Frequency	568
ii) Content	568
B. Modification of the Sanctions Measures at the Level of Implementation	569
1) Domestic legal basis for the application of sanctions	572
a) Resort to the legislative method	572
i) Existence of permanent sanctions legislation	572
ii) Introduction of new sanctions legislation	575
iii) Resort to trade legislation	579
b) Executive decrees with no mention of legal basis	581
c) Time lag in implementation	582
d) The League of Nations experience	583
i) The legislative method	584
ii) Executive decrees and directives	584
2) Modification of the content of the sanctions resolutions at the level of implementation	585
a) The types of measures implemented	586
i) Measures anticipating Council resolutions	586
ii) Implementation of measures not adopted by the Council	590
b) Scope of the prohibitions	591
i) Exceptions to the prohibitions and "special humanitarian circumstances"	591
ii) Territorial application	594
iii) Extraterritorial and personal application	596
iv) Application <i>ratione temporis</i>	600
II THE QUESTION OF CONTROL	605
A. The Security Council Committee	605
1) Composition and functioning	606
2) Mandate	609
3) Measures taken to improve on the implementation of sanctions	611
a) Information relating to trade with Southern Rhodesia	611
b) Measures to tighten loopholes	612
i) Goods from South Africa and Portuguese-controlled territories	612
ii) Procedures and manual of documentation for goods originating in Southern Africa	613
iii) Appointment of experts to make investigations	614
c) Examination of presumed sanctions violations	614
i) Source of information	614
ii) Processing of information	615
iii) Limitations on the system of control	616
d) Cases of sanctions violations	617
e) Recommendations of the Committee relating to the domestic effectiveness of sanctions	622
i) The supply of military equipment	623
ii) The supply of oil and oil products	625

iii) Foreign companies operating in Southern Rhodesia	625
f) Special fund	625
B. Member States Enforcement Machinery	626
1) Legislation specifically providing for penalties	626
2) Action taken by States in the field of sanctions	628
a) Reinforcement of control measures	628
b) Action taken with respect to specific violations of sanctions	629
III THE QUESTION OF COMPENSATION	633
A. Assistance to States under Articles 49 and 50 of the Charter	633
B. Compensation under Domestic Law	639
IV THE TERMINATION OF SANCTIONS	640
CONCLUSION	651