

Evil and Intelligibility

Value Inquiry Book Series

Founding Editor

Robert Ginsberg

Editor-in-Chief

J.D. Mininger

VOLUME 379

Philosophy and Religion

Editor

Rod Nicholls (*Cape Breton University*)

Founding Editor

Ken Bryson (*Cape Breton University*)

Editorial Board

Deane-Peter Baker, *University of New South Wales (UNSW)* – Harriet E. Barber, *University of San Diego* – Stephen Clark, *University of Liverpool/University of Bristol* – G. Elijah Dann, *Simon Fraser University* – Russ Dumke, *University of the Incarnate Word* – Jim Gerrie, *Cape Breton University* – Gwen Griffith-Dickson, *Heythrop College, University of London* – Carl Kalwaitis, *Marian University* – Jim Kanaris, *McGill University* – Pawel Kawalec, *John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin* – Esther McIntosh, *St. John University* – Ludwig Nagl, *University of Vienna* – Ruby Ramji, *Cape Breton University* – Peter Redpath, *Holy Apostles College and Seminary* – Heather Salazar, *Western New England University* – William Sweet, *Saint Francis Xavier University* – Alana M. Vincent, *University of Chester*

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/vibs and brill.com/par

Evil and Intelligibility

A Grammatical Metacritique of the Problem of Evil

By

Lauri Snellman



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON



This is an open access title distributed under the terms of the [CC BY-NC 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) license, which permits any non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author(s) and source are credited. Further information and the complete license text can be found at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The terms of the CC license apply only to the original material. The use of material from other sources (indicated by a reference) such as diagrams, illustrations, photos and text samples may require further permission from the respective copyright holder.

Cover illustration: Image by Yagnik Sankhedawala, made available on unsplash.com in 2021.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: “Brill”. See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 0929-8436

ISBN 978-90-04-52478-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-52479-8 (e- book)

Copyright 2023 by Lauri Snellman. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands. Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau, V&R unipress and Wageningen Academic. Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

List of Tables and Diagrams IX

- 1 Introduction 1
- 2 The Presuppositions of the Problem of Evil 20
 - 2.1 Defining the Problems of Evil and Theodicism 20
 - 2.2 Evil and Dualism in Modern Thought 23
 - 2.2.1 *Footnotes to Plato: Dualism and the Background for the Problem of Evil* 24
 - 2.2.2 *The Problem of Evil as a Central Problem of Modern Thought* 27
 - 2.2.3 *The Presuppositions of Theodicy in the Modern Debate* 30
 - 2.2.4 *The Dualisms behind the Problem of Evil* 33
 - 2.2.4.1 The Modern Concept of the Fact 34
 - 2.2.4.2 Appearances, Meanings, Real Facts and Values 38
 - 2.2.4.3 The Principle of Sufficient Reason 42
 - 2.2.5 *The General Argument from Evil* 44
 - 2.3 Theism, Atheism and the Presuppositions of Theodicy 50
 - 2.3.1 *Leibnizian Theism as a Solution to the Problem of Intelligibility* 50
 - 2.3.2 *Theodicism in Contemporary Philosophy of Religion* 56
 - 2.3.2.1 Mackie and Atheistic Analytic Theodicism 56
 - 2.3.2.2 William Rowe and Divine Goodness 61
 - 2.3.2.3 Plantinga on Omnipotence and Freedom 64
 - 2.3.3 *The Neo-Leibnizian Nature of the Current Debate* 69
- 3 Metaphysics, Grammar and Evil: in Search of a Method 71
 - 3.1 The Project of Antitheodicy 72
 - 3.1.1 *Antitheodicies: Conceptual, Moral and Moralistic* 72
 - 3.1.2 *Antitheodicy and the Critique of Reason* 78
 - 3.1.2.1 Kantian Antitheodicism 80
 - 3.1.2.2 Jamesian Antitheodicism 85
 - 3.1.2.3 Hamannian Antitheodicism 90
 - 3.1.3 *Some Preliminary Arguments for Hamannian Antitheodicism* 97
 - 3.2 Philosophical Grammar and Grammatical Metacritique 103
 - 3.2.1 *Insights from Wittgenstein* 103

| | | |
|----------|---|------------|
| 3.2.2 | <i>Insights from Hamann</i> | 113 |
| 3.2.3 | <i>An Overview of Philosophical Grammar</i> | 123 |
| 3.3 | The Metaphysical Modelling Debate in Analytic Philosophy | 125 |
| 3.3.1 | <i>Matter, Form and Metaphysics</i> | 125 |
| 3.3.2 | <i>Metaphysics in the Good Company of Science?</i> | 130 |
| 3.3.3 | <i>The Antinomy of Metaphysical Realism</i> | 137 |
| 4 | Language-Games, Categories and Practical Intelligibility | 144 |
| 4.1 | Language-Games: a Definition and Examples | 145 |
| 4.2 | The Practical Objectivity of Concepts and Models | 165 |
| 4.2.1 | <i>Language-Games, Rules and the Possibility of Representation</i> | 166 |
| 4.2.2 | <i>Modelling, Morphisms and Hermeneutics</i> | 172 |
| 4.2.3 | <i>Realism, Idealism and the "Practical Matter-of-Factness" of Language</i> | 178 |
| 4.2.4 | <i>The Genealogical Priority of Language-Games</i> | 190 |
| 4.3 | Language-Games and Categories for Being Qua Being | 197 |
| 4.3.1 | <i>Language-Games for the Concept of Being</i> | 198 |
| 4.3.2 | <i>Discourse Possibilities for Seeking and Finding</i> | 206 |
| 4.3.2.1 | Logical Forms and the Categories of Language Use | 207 |
| 4.3.2.2 | Categories as Types of Encountering Objects | 211 |
| 4.3.2.3 | Categories as Types of Concepts and Types of Objects in Encounters | 217 |
| 4.3.3 | <i>Categories, Being and the Models of Metaphysics</i> | 219 |
| 4.4 | The Objectivity of Metaphysical Concepts and Models | 222 |
| 5 | Facts, Meanings and the Logic of Systemic Identification | 227 |
| 5.1 | Identification and Grammar | 228 |
| 5.1.1 | <i>The Logic of Identification and Categories</i> | 229 |
| 5.1.2 | <i>Functions, Systems, Elements and Institutions for Identification</i> | 237 |
| 5.1.3 | <i>The Location of Individuals in Relationships and Identification</i> | 246 |
| 5.2 | The Intertwining of Facts and Meanings | 251 |
| 5.2.1 | <i>Seeing Facts as Meaningful in Language-Games</i> | 252 |
| 5.2.2 | <i>Facts, Meanings and Objects in Their Systemic Context</i> | 254 |
| 5.2.3 | <i>Some Examples and a Summary</i> | 258 |

| | | |
|----------|--|------------|
| 6 | The Principle of Reason and the Question of Intelligibility | 265 |
| 6.1 | The Principle of Sufficient Reason and Reasons for It | 265 |
| 6.1.1 | <i>Definitions and Consequences of the Principle of Reason</i> | 266 |
| 6.1.2 | <i>Reasons for and against the Principle of Reason</i> | 270 |
| 6.1.3 | <i>The Principle of the Ground of Metaphysics and the Problem of Evil</i> | 277 |
| 6.2 | Practical and Relational Intelligibility as a Critique of the PSR | 283 |
| 6.2.1 | <i>The Ambiguity of the Principle and the Plurality of Reasons</i> | 284 |
| 6.2.2 | <i>The Location of Reasons in Language-Games and Relationships</i> | 289 |
| 6.2.2.1 | The Ground of “Reasons” and “Grounds” in Language-Games | 290 |
| 6.2.2.2 | The Grounds for Logical Spaces and Essences | 292 |
| 6.2.2.3 | The Contingency of Necessity | 296 |
| 6.2.3 | <i>The Question of Reason and the Question of God</i> | 301 |
| 7 | The Grammar of Worldviews and the Fallacies of Theodicism | 308 |
| 7.1 | Narratives, Virtues and Worldviews | 311 |
| 7.1.1 | <i>Facts, Virtues and Narrative Identification</i> | 312 |
| 7.1.2 | <i>Humanistic Meaningfulness: Moral Responsibility, Virtue and Tragedy</i> | 319 |
| 7.1.3 | <i>Virtues and the Religious Concept of Salvation</i> | 325 |
| 7.2 | Theological Grammar, Divine Goodness and Omnipotence | 330 |
| 7.2.1 | <i>Theological Grammar and the Logic of Scripture</i> | 332 |
| 7.2.2 | <i>Theological Grammar, Goodness and Omnipotence</i> | 340 |
| 7.3 | Biblical Grammar and the Fallacies of Theodicism | 346 |
| 7.3.1 | <i>The Gospels and the Redemptive Sovereignty of God</i> | 349 |
| 7.3.2 | <i>Metaphors in the Book of Job and the Fallacies of Theodicism</i> | 356 |
| 7.3.2.1 | Metaphors for God and Man in the Book of Job | 357 |
| 7.3.2.2 | The Speeches of Job and Atheistic Theodicism | 360 |
| 7.3.2.3 | The Speeches of Job’s “Friends” and Theistic Theodicism | 364 |
| 7.3.2.4 | The Speech of God and a New Grammar for “God” | 368 |

| | | |
|----------|---|------------|
| 8 | Why the Argument from Evil Is Fallacious | 371 |
| 9 | Conclusion: the Problem of Evil and the Problem of Intelligibility | 379 |
| | Bibliography | 403 |
| | Index | 414 |

Tables and Diagrams

Tables

| | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 1 | A comparison of theodicism, grammatical and moral antitheodicies | 16 |
| 2 | Contrasting triads in semantics | 167 |
| 3 | Properties of the senses and reason | 170 |
| 4 | The correspondence of discourse possibilities / sensuous practices / grid of possibilities | 214 |
| 5 | Baez's and Stay's Rosetta Stone | 245 |
| 6 | Constituent / process chart for systems | 246 |
| 7 | Isomorphism of the grammars of virtues and salvation | 329 |
| 8 | Isomorphism of the grammars of virtues and salvation (summary) | 396 |

Diagrams

| | | |
|---|---|-----|
| 1 | A fourfold map of the problems of evil | 21 |
| 2 | Theodicies, antitheodicies and consistency proofs | 79 |
| 3 | Concave / convex diagram from Wittgenstein | 177 |
| 4 | Coordination of higher level H and lower level L in top-down action | 244 |
| 5 | A fourfold map of the problems of evil (summary) | 380 |
| 6 | Theodicies, antitheodicies and consistency proofs (summary) | 381 |