

New Explorations in Plato's *Theaetetus*

Brill's Plato Studies Series

Editors

Gabriele Cornelli (*Brasilia, Brazil*)
Gábor Betegh (*Cambridge, United Kingdom*)

Editorial Board

Beatriz Bossi (*Madrid, Spain*)
Luc Brisson (*Paris, France*)
Michael Erler (*Würzburg, Germany*)
Franco Ferrari (*Salerno, Italy*)
Maria do Ceu Fialho (*Coimbra, Portugal*)
Mary-Louise Gill (*Providence, USA*)
Debra Nails (*Michigan, USA*)
Noburu Notomi (*Tokyo, Japan*)
Olivier Renaut (*Paris, France*)
Voula Tsouna (*Santa Barbara, USA*)

VOLUME 10

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/bpss

New Explorations in Plato's *Theaetetus*

Belief, Knowledge, Ontology, Reception

Edited by

Diego Zucca



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Zucca, Diego, editor.

Title: New explorations in Plato's Theaetetus : belief, knowledge, ontology, reception / [edited] by Diego Zucca.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2022. | Series: Brill's Plato studies series, 2452-2945 ; volume 10 | Includes index. | Summary: "What is knowledge? This fundamental question is treated with unprecedented depth by Plato in his Theaetetus, where it opens the path to many puzzles and issues we are still coping with in our days: what is the nature of perception, belief, justification, truth? Which objects can be properly known? How are we to account for cognitive mistakes? How can the mind be "in touch" with the world? This book provides fresh, rigorous and original explorations of the main themes of the dialogue by well-established scholars who work on Plato and Platonism, especially on Plato's theory of knowledge"—Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022012190 (print) | LCCN 2022012191 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004516021 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004516014 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Plato. Theaetetus—Congresses. | Knowledge, Theory of—Congresses. | Ontology—Congresses.

Classification: LCC B386 .N49 2022 (print) | LCC B386 (ebook) | DDC 121—dc23/eng/20220504

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022012190>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022012191>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2452-2945

ISBN 978-90-04-51602-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-51601-4 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Diego Zucca. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hoteli, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements IX
Notes on Contributors X

Introduction 1
Diego Zucca

SECTION 1

The Theaetetus and Plato

- 1 Themes in the *Theaetetus* 27
Gail Fine
- 2 The Structure and Role of the *Theaetetus* in the Platonic Project 43
Maurizio Migliori
- 3 Is Plato's *Theaetetus* an Exercise in Epistemology? A Granite Epitaph Erected Also on the Strength of the *Parmenides* 61
Vasilis Politis
- 4 Republics of Conversation: The Normativity of Talk in Plato up to the *Theaetetus* 83
Sophie-Grace Chappell

SECTION 2

Relativism between Ontology and Epistemology

- 5 Protagoras' Secret Doctrine: *Theaetetus* 152a–157c. Relativism, Indeterminacy and Ineffability 117
Ugo Zilioli
- 6 Plato, *Theaetetus* 169e8–171c7: The Self-Refutation Argument and What Protagoras Is Right About 133
Diego Zucca

SECTION 3

Maieutics, Sophistry, Philosophy

- 7 Socratic Midwifery and Noble Sophistry: An Intertextual Reading 163
Zina Giannopoulou
- 8 In What Sense Is the Philosopher Leader a «Stranger» in the City?
Notes on the “Digression” in *Theaetetus* (172c2–177c5) 177
Beatriz Bossi

SECTION 4

Images of the Cognitive Soul

- 9 The Ontological Background of the Wax Block Model in
Plato’s *Theaetetus* 199
Francesco Aronadio
- 10 The Soul as an Aviary: A Metaphorical and Metaphysical Reading of
Theaetetus 196c7–200d4 216
Emanuele Maffi

SECTION 5

Belief, Knowledge, Ontology

- 11 Two Remarks on False Opinion between Epistemology and Ontology
in *Theaetetus* 187b–201c 249
Francesco Fronterotta
- 12 Knowledge, Opinion, and Recollection in the *Theaetetus* 271
Franco Trabattoni
- 13 The *Theaetetus* on the Proper Use of Scientific Elements 284
Naly Thaler

SECTION 6

The Theaetetus beyond Plato

- 14 *Doxa* and *Epistēmē* in Plato's *Theaetetus* and Aristotle's
Posterior Analytics 307
Walter Cavini
- 15 *Homoiôsis Theôi* (Plato, *Theaetetus* 176b1) in Late Neoplatonism 325
Giovanna R. Giardina
- 16 Berkeley, the *Theaetetus*, and the Platonic Theory of Ideas 353
Aldo Brancacci
- Index of Authors 369

Acknowledgements

This book brings together (also) a selection of the papers presented at an international Conference held in Alghero (Sardinia, Italy) in September 2019, dedicated to the various issues and themes of Plato's *Theaetetus*. The conference was organized as part of a research project led by me (Diego Zucca, University of Sassari) on the ancient models of mind and the ontology of the soul-body relation.

I would like to thank the *Regione Sardegna*, who financially supported the project of which this publication is the last outcome. I would also like to thank the *University of Sassari* – in particular: the *Department of Storia, scienze dell'uomo e della formazione* – for its support, as well as the *Department of Architecture* for hosting the conference in its wonderful setting by the sea.

I am very grateful to Dr Roberto Medda and Dr Gabriele Meloni, who played an important role in organizing the conference together with me and in making everything come together so smoothly.

A special thank you to Professor Franco Trabattoni, who fully supported the project of this publication, and to Professor Gabriele Cornelli, who kindly accepted and encouraged it as an Editor of the prestigious Brill's Plato Studies Series.

Finally, my most profound thanks go to the contributors of this book for their valuable work: with the generous contribution of such great scholars, this book may hopefully become a point of reference for future research in the field.

Notes on Contributors

Francesco Aronadio

teaches History of Ancient Philosophy and History of Philosophy at the University of Rome “Tor Vergata”. He is the author of numerous articles on ancient philosophy and on the reception of ancient thought in the contemporary age. He edited *Platone. Cratilo*, Rome-Bari 1996, and *Platone. Dialoghi spuri*, Turin 2008. Among his monographs: *Procedure e verità in Platone*, Naples 2002, and *L'aisthesis e le strategie argomentative di Platone nel Teeteto*, Naples 2016.

Beatriz Cecilia Bossi Lopez

is Associate Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the Faculty of Philosophy of the Complutensian University of Madrid and a member of the Executive Committee of the International Plato Society. Author of *Saber Gozar, Estudios sobre el placer en Platón* (2008), she has co-edited, with Thomas M. Robinson, *Plato's Sophist Revisited* (De Gruyter, 2013), *Plato's Statesman Revisited* (De Gruyter, 2018) and *Plato's Theaetetus Revisited* (De Gruyter, 2020). After her stay at Princeton University (2015) she has held a visiting appointment at the University of California (Santa Barbara, 2018). She has organized several conferences on Plato's Eleatic dialogues in Spain, and has published widely on Plato and Aristotle.

Aldo Brancacci

is Full Professor of History of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Rome “Tor Vergata”. He has published several articles and essays on Plato, in particular on the *Meno*, *Theaetetus*, *Republic*, and *Laws*. He is editor of the following books: *Platon, source des Présocratiques*, Paris 2002 (with M. Dixsaut); *La Repubblica di Platone*, «Giornale critico della filosofia italiana», 93, 2012. He has recently edited the essays on Plato by Guido Calogero: *Eros e dialettica in Platone*, Introduzione e cura di A. Brancacci, Milano 2020. His research interests lie in the history of ancient philosophy, from the Presocratics to the philosophy of the Roman Imperial Age.

Walter Cavini

graduated in philosophy in Florence in 1973 with a thesis on Sextus Empiricus and Gian Francesco Pico della Mirandola, supervisor Prof. Eugenio Garin. He has improved his studies in ancient philosophy in London (University College) and in Oxford (Brasenose College). Since 1987 he has been Associate Professor of history of ancient philosophy, first at the Dept. of Philosophy of

the University of Siena (1987–91), then from 1991/92 until 2017/18 to that of the University of Bologna. He has dealt in particular with ancient and modern philosophical skepticism and the concept of truth in ancient logic and metaphysics, with several publications, in Italian and in English, and by participating in numerous national and international conferences and seminars. He has been a visiting professor at the Universities of Lille and Irvine, and at New College, Oxford.

Sophie Grace Chappell

is Professor of Philosophy at the Open University, UK, Leverhulme Major Research Fellow 2017–2020, Visiting Fellow in the Department of Philosophy, St Andrews 2017–2020, and Erskine Research Fellow, University of Canterbury NZ, Spring 2020. She was educated at Magdalen College, Oxford, and Edinburgh University. She was Director of the Scots Philosophical Association, 2003–2006. Since 2000 she has been Reviews Editor of *The Philosophical Quarterly* and Treasurer of the Mind Association. In 2021 she will be a REF sub-panellist for Philosophy. She has held visiting appointments in the Universities of Edinburgh, Glasgow, British Columbia, Stirling, Reykjavik, and Oslo. She has published over a hundred articles on ethics, moral psychology, epistemology, ancient philosophy and philosophy of religion. Her books include *Aristotle and Augustine on Freedom* (Macmillan, 1995), *Understanding Human Goods* (Edinburgh University Press, 2003), *The Inescapable Self: an Introduction to Philosophy* (Orion, 2005), *Reading Plato's Theaetetus* (Hackett, 2005), *Ethics and Experience* (Acumen, 2009), and *Knowing What to Do: Imagination, Virtue, and Platonism in Ethics* (Oxford University Press, 2014). She has also edited or co-edited five collections of essays in ethics, most recently *The Problem of Moral Demandingness* (Routledge 2011), *Intuition, Theory, and Anti-Theory in Ethics* (Oxford University Press, 2015) and *Ethics Beyond The Limits: Essays on Bernard Williams' Ethics and the Limits of Philosophy* (Routledge, 2019). Her main current research is about epiphanies, immediate and revelatory encounters with value, and their place in our experience and our philosophical ethics. She was a Governor of the British Association of Counsellors and Psychotherapists 2012–2018. She is a member of the Scottish Mountaineering Club (climbing new winter routes up to grade VII, 7), an active poet and translator of the classical Greek dramatists, and an untalented but keen cyclist and pianist. She is the UK's first openly transgender philosophy academic, having transitioned in 2014, and campaigns actively on feminist and transgender issues. She lives with her family in Dundee.

Gail Fine

is Professor Emerita of Philosophy in the Sage School of Philosophy at Cornell University; Senior Research Fellow Emerita at Merton College, Oxford; and a Visiting Professor of Ancient Philosophy in the University of Oxford. She is the author of several books: *On Ideas: Aristotle's Criticism of Plato's Theory of Forms*; *Plato on Knowledge and Forms: Selected Essays*; *The Possibility of Inquiry: Meno's Paradox from Socrates to Sextus*; and *Essays in Ancient Epistemology*, all published by OUP. She is also the author of many articles, and the editor of *The Oxford Handbook of Plato* and of *Plato 1* and *2* in the *Oxford Readings in Philosophy* series.

Francesco Fronterotta

studied at the Scuola Normale Superiore in Pisa and EHESS in Paris. He currently teaches the History of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Rome "Sapienza". He is particularly concerned with Pre-Socratic reflection, Plato and the ancient and modern Platonic tradition.

Zina Giannopoulou

is an Associate Professor of Classics and affiliate of European Languages and Studies at the University of California, Irvine. Her research interests include comparative classicisms in the 20th and 21st centuries literature and film, philosophy and fiction, Plato, critical theory, and translation theory. She is currently working on a monograph on literary and filmic receptions of Plato's allegory of the Cave in late 20th century Europe.

Giovanna R. Giardina

is Full Professor in Ancient Philosophy at the University of Catania, where she heads the Master Degree programme in Philosophical Sciences, and Editor of *Symbolon – Collana di Studi e Testi di Filosofia Antica e Medievale*. Her research interests concern mainly Aristotle, Neoplatonic philosophy with special reference to the texts of the Commentators, ancient physics and mathematics. Among her most recent publications: *Fisica del movimento e teoria dell'infinito. Analisi critica di Aristotele, Phys. III*, Sankt Augustin 2012, Academia Verlag; *Platone, Eutidemo 294e2–3*, «Museum Helveticum», 75/2 (2018), pp. 129–137; *Question de mesure et de mesurabilité chez Aristote, Phys. VI 7*, in Ead. (ed.), *To Metron. Sur la notion de Mesure dans la philosophie d'Aristote*, Paris-Bruxelles 2020, Vrin, pp. 101–114.

Emanuele Maffi

took his doctorate with a Ph.D joint program between the University of Turin and the University of Geneva. Now he is a research fellow at the University of L'Aquila within a project on Johannes Philoponus' *De opificio mundi* directed by Angela Longo. His main research area are Plato epistemology and metaphysics and late Neoplatonism of Alexandria. On Plato *Theaetetus* he wrote a monography published in 2014 (*Lo spazio della filosofia. Una lettura del Teeteto di Platone*, Loffredo, Napoli) and some articles published in Italian and international reviews.

Maurizio Migliori

was awarded his first-class degree in philosophy in 1967 at the Catholic University in Milan and got a specialization at the same University in 1969. He has worked as a teacher in Secondary Institutes from 1968/69 to 1990/91, then he won a competition for Associate Professor and taught at the University of Macerata, Faculty of Literature and Philosophy, Department of Philosophy and Human Science, from 1/11/1991 to 31/1/2001. He was appointed as a Professor through a competition with DR from 1/2/2001 to 31/10/2015. He has been member of the Executive Committee of the International Plato Society (2001–2007) and Vice-President of the Italian Society of History of Ancient Philosophy (2009–2013). Retired by age limits (1/11/2015), he keeps teaching at the University of Macerata with annual contracts.

Vasilis Politis

was born in Greece, grew up in Denmark, studied in Oxford and Munich, and has been at Trinity College Dublin since 1992. He works on Plato and Aristotle. He has been a Fellow of the Wissenschaftskolleg zu Berlin and The Durham Institute of Advanced Studies. He has completed two major research projects. The first project shows that Plato's and Aristotle's philosophical investigations take the form of *aporia*-based enquiries; and that this explains why Plato affords a central place in philosophy to the *ti esti* question. The second project shows that Plato's theory of Forms is a theory of essence, and that Plato's Forms are essences, not things that have an essence. Both projects have issued in monographs (with Cambridge University Press) and many articles, including three in *Phronesis*.

Naly Thaler

is a Senior Lecturer at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. His main areas of research are Plato's epistemology, psychology and ethics. He has published numerous articles on various aspects of the *Theaetetus*.

Franco Trabattoni

is Full Professor in the History of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Milan: his main field of research is Plato and the Platonic tradition, but his research also focused on other aspects of the Ancient thought, such as the Presocratics and Aristotle, as well as on the relationship between Platonism and Contemporary philosophy. Among his writings: *Scrivere nell'anima. Verità, dialettica e persuasione in Platone*, La Nuova Italia, Firenze 1994; *Platone*, Carocci, Roma, 2009; *Essays on Plato's Epistemology*, Leuven University Press, Leuven 2016; and: *Platone, Teeteto* (ed. by), Einaudi, Torino 2018.

Ugo Zilioli

is Honorary Fellow at Durham University, UK and co-founder of *The Well-Pheal Foundation*. His main publications include: *Protagoras and the Challenge of Relativism* (Ashgate 2006; reprinted for Routledge 2016; Chinese translation 2012); *The Cyrenaics* (Acumen 2012; reprinted for Routledge 2014). He has also edited: *From the Socratics to the Socratic schools* (Routledge 2015; paperback 2020); *Atomism in Philosophy. From Antiquity to the Present* (Bloomsbury Academic 2020). He is currently working on a book on metaphysical eliminativism for Bloomsbury Academic: *Nothing for us? Persons and objects in ancient, Buddhist and contemporary philosophy*.

Diego Zucca

(Ph.D.: Ca' Foscari University of Venice, 2005; Edinburgh University, 2013), is Associate Professor in the History of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Sassari (Italy). He has published monographs and many articles on Aristotle's psychology, physics and ethics. His main interests are and Aristotle's and Plato's philosophy, and the philosophy of mind.