

The World Bank Legal Papers

THE WORLD BANK LEGAL PAPERS

IBRAHIM F.I. SHIHATA



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

THE HAGUE / BOSTON / LONDON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 90-411-1512-9

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America
by Kluwer Law International,
675 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 2000 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD	xxxvii
INTRODUCTORY CHAPTER INTERPRETATION AS PRACTICED AT THE WORLD BANK	xliii
PART ONE: ISSUES RELATED TO THE BANK'S CAPITAL	
CHAPTER 1 VALUATION OF IBRD CAPITAL – THE 1983 LEGAL OPINION	1
CHAPTER 2 DEVELOPMENTS RELATED TO THE STANDARD OF VALUE OF IBRD'S CAPITAL AND THE SUBSCRIPTIONS TO IDA	31
CHAPTER 3 DETAILS OF MAINTENANCE OF VALUE OF THE PAID IN CAPITAL HELD BY THE BANK	57
CHAPTER 4 CAPITAL SHARES; PREEMPTIVE RIGHTS AND CALLS ON UNPAID CAPITAL	81
CHAPTER 5 USE OF CURRENCIES OF BANK RESOURCES	95
CHAPTER 6 THE IBRD LENDING LIMIT AND THE "HEAD ROOM" ISSUE	117
PART TWO: THE BANK'S PURPOSES AND LIMITS	
CHAPTER 7 AUTHORIZED PURPOSES OF BANK LOANS, GUARANTEES AND GRANTS	157

CHAPTER 8 ACTUAL EXAMPLES OF AUTHORIZED ACTIVITIES THAT REQUIRED LEGAL CONSIDERATION AND ANALYSIS	191
CHAPTER 9 POLITICAL ACTIVITY PROHIBITED	219
CHAPTER 10 ISSUES OF “GOVERNANCE” IN BORROWING MEMBERS – THE EXTENT OF THEIR RELEVANCE UNDER THE BANK’S ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT	245
PART THREE: OPERATIONAL ISSUES	
CHAPTER 11 FINANCING LOCAL EXPENDITURE	283
CHAPTER 12 THE NEGATIVE PLEDGE CLAUSE	303
CHAPTER 13 DEBT AND DEBT SERVICE REDUCTION	329
CHAPTER 14 LEGAL QUESTIONS RELATED TO ADJUSTMENT LENDING	377
CHAPTER 15 TREATMENT OF IBRD BORROWERS IN CASES OF “ACUTE EXCHANGE STRINGENCIES” AND “DEFAULT”	407
CHAPTER 16 THE REQUIREMENT OF A GOVERNMENTAL GUARANTEE OF BANK LOANS TO ENTITIES OTHER THAN A MEMBER COUNTRY	425
CHAPTER 17 THE BANK’S POLICY AND PRACTICE ON EXTERNAL DEBT DEFAULTS TO INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS, GOVERNMENTS AND GOVERNMENTAL INSTITUTIONS – A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS	447
CHAPTER 18 GUARENTEES BY THE BANK OF PRIVATE LOANS	461
CHAPTER 19 THE IBRD GRADUATION POLICY	493

CHAPTER 20	
STATE SUCCESSION IN THE BANK – THE CASE OF YUGOSLAVIA	509
CHAPTER 21	
ASSISTANCE TO NON-MEMBERS	531
CHAPTER 22	
ISSUES RELATED TO THE INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION (IDA)	553
CHAPTER 23	
ISSUES RELATED TO THE INSPECTION PANEL	591
CHAPTER 24	
OTHER OPERATIONAL ISSUES	619
PART FOUR: ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT	
CHAPTER 25	
ROLE AND STATUS OF THE BANK’S EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS, AS A BOARD AND INDIVIDUALLY	639
CHAPTER 26	
SOME DETAILS OF BOARD PROCEDURES	671
CHAPTER 27	
ISSUES OF BOARD-MANAGEMENT RELATIONSHIP	705
PART FIVE: PERSONNEL ISSUES	
CHAPTER 28	
UNILATERAL CHANGES BY THE BANK OF EMPLOYMENT TERMS	727
CHAPTER 29	
THE SCOPE OF TAX EXEMPTION OF “SALARIES AND EMOLUMENTS” UNDER SECTION 9(B) OF ARTICLE VII OF THE ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT OF THE BANK – A LEGAL ANALYSIS	745
CHAPTER 30	
MISCELLANEOUS PERSONNEL MATTERS	763

PART SIX: COOPERATION WITH INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

CHAPTER 31

**THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE BANK AND THE FUND – DISTINCT
AND OVERLAPPING RESPONSIBILITIES** 773

CHAPTER 32

**THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE UNITED NATIONS AND
THE WORLD BANK** 799

CHAPTER 33

**THE WORLD BANK AND HUMAN RIGHTS – A PRESENTATION BEFORE
THE 1993 UN WORLD CONFERENCE ON HUMAN RIGHTS** 815

PART SEVEN: MISCELLANEOUS ISSUES

CHAPTER 34

**SOME LEGAL ASPECTS OF THE BANK'S POLICY ON DISCLOSURE
OF INFORMATION** 819

CHAPTER 35

DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE ISSUES 833

CHAPTER 36

**ESTABLISHMENT BY THE WORLD BANK OF A SUBSIDIARY UNDER
DOMESTIC LAW-LEGAL ISSUES** 851

CHAPTER 37

OTHER ISSUES 865

INDEX 877

PUBLICATIONS BY THE AUTHOR 893

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD	xxxvii
INTRODUCTORY CHAPTER	
INTERPRETATION AS PRACTICED AT THE WORLD BANK	xliv
I. INTRODUCTION	xliv
II. INTERPRETATION AND THE FILLING OF GAPS	xliv
The Issue	xliv
Judicial Practice	xlvi
Nature of Interpretation in Legal Theory	xlvii
Interpretation of the Bank's Articles	xlvii
Conclusion	xlviii
III. TREATY INTERPRETATION UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	xliv
IV. METHODS OF INTERPRETATION	lii
V. INFORMAL AMENDMENTS	liv
VI. UNAUTHORIZED AMENDMENT	lvi
VII. INTERPRETATION OF CHARTERS OF INTERNATIONAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS (IFIs)	lvii
VIII. INTERPRETATION OF THE IBRD AND IDA ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT	lviii
PART ONE: ISSUES RELATED TO THE BANK'S CAPITAL	
CHAPTER 1	
VALUATION OF IBRD CAPITAL – THE 1983 LEGAL OPINION	1
I. INTRODUCTION	4
II. THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS' POWER OF INTERPRETATION	7
III. LEGAL INTERPRETATION OF ARTICLE II, SECTION 2(A)	13
A. Implications of the Issue	13
B. Interpretation Doctrine and Rules	15
C. Judicial Practice	16
D. Interpretation of the Provisions of Article II, Section 2(a) of the Bank's Articles of Agreement	19

IV. LEGALLY ACCEPTABLE WAYS TO LIMIT MEMBERS' MAINTENANCE OF VALUE OBLIGATIONS	24
A. The 2 Percent Portion	24
B. The 18 Percent Portion	25
C. The 80 Percent Portion	26
V. CONCLUSION: OPTIONS FOR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	27

CHAPTER 2

DEVELOPMENTS RELATED TO THE STANDARD OF VALUE OF IBRD'S CAPITAL AND THE SUBSCRIPTIONS TO IDA 31

I. SUBSEQUENT DEVELOPMENTS RELATED TO THE VALUATION OF THE IBRD CAPITAL FOLLOWING THE 1983 LEGAL OPINION	31
A. The 1986 Decision of the IBRD Executive Directors	31
B. Establishment and Work of a New Ad-Hoc Board Committee	32
C. Options before the Committee	35
D. Final Outcome	39
E. Modification of the IBRD General Conditions to Cope with the "Headroom" Issue	42
II. VALUATION OF INITIAL SUBSCRIPTION IN THE INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION (IDA) AND RELATED ISSUES	47
A. Maintenance of Value	48
B. Valuation of IDA Credits	49
ANNEXES TO CHAPTER TWO	51

A. IBRD - Decision of the Executive Directors under Article IX of the Articles of Agreement Regarding Article II, Section 2(a) and Section 9(a) of the Articles of Agreement:	
– <i>Valuation of the Bank's Capital and Related Issues (Dated October 14, 1986).</i>	51
– <i>Original Annex to Decision of October 14, 1986 Implementation of Maintenance of Value Settlements</i>	53
B. IDA - Decision of the Executive Directors of the International Development Association under Article X of the Articles of Agreement Regarding Article II, Section 2(b) of the Articles of Agreement:	
– <i>Valuation of Initial Subscriptions and Related Issues (dated June 22, 1987)</i>	55

CHAPTER 3

DETAILS OF MAINTENANCE OF VALUE OF THE PAID IN CAPITAL HELD BY THE BANK 57

I. ARTICLE II, SECTION 9 OF THE BANK'S ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT	57
--	----

A.	Introduction	57
B.	History	58
C.	Possible Interpretations of Section 9 of Article II	60
D.	The Standard Against Which to Measure Changes in the Value of Currencies for Purposes of Article II, Section 9	64
II.	REPURCHASE OF BANK SHARES TO LIMIT MEMBERS'S OBLIGATIONS TO AMOUNTS PAID IN THEIR NATIONAL CURRENCY	66
III.	MAINTENANCE OF VALUE: THE SO-CALLED PHILIPPINE FORMULA	70
IV.	CAPITAL SUBSCRIPTION: CERTAIN EFFECTS OF PAYMENT OF LOCAL CURRENCY PORTION BY NOTES DENOMINATED IN US DOLLARS	71
A.	Possible Effects of the New Option on the Potential Encashment Schedule and on the Related Voting Power of Members Choosing the Option.	71
B.	Possible Conflict between the Letter of the Articles and the Intentions of its Drafters as to the Order of Priority for Use of Capital.	72
C.	Detailed Legislative History of Article IV, Section 2(a)	73
1.	<i>Pre-Bretton Woods Proposals</i>	73
2.	<i>Bretton Woods Conference</i>	74
	ANNEX TO CHAPTER THREE:	
	REVISED ANNEX TO EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS DECISION OF OCTOBER 14, 1986, AS REISSUED ON SEPTEMBER 13, 1990 Capital Subscriptions in Local Currency: Repurchase and Maintenance of Value	76
1.	<i>Repurchase Options</i>	76
2.	<i>General Provisions for Repurchase</i>	77
3.	<i>Maintenance of Value</i>	78
4.	<i>Currency on Loan and Recovery</i>	79
5.	<i>Effective Date</i>	80
6.	<i>Previous Decisions</i>	80
	CHAPTER 4	
	CAPITAL SHARES; PREEMPTIVE RIGHTS AND CALLS ON UNPAID CAPITAL	81
I.	ALLOCATION OF SHARES TO NEW MEMBERS	81
A.	Number of Shares to be Reserved for New Members	82
B.	Basis for Allocation of Shares to New Members	83
C.	Effect of Exercise of Preemptive Rights: Possible Conflict between Sections 3(a) and 3(c) of Article II	83
	Conclusion	86
II.	ISSUES RELEVANT TO THE BANK'S GENERAL CAPITAL INCREASE	86
A.	Issuance and Allocation of Shares	86
B.	Form and Payment of the Paid-In Portion of Capital	92
III.	CALLS ON THE UNPAID PORTION OF THE BANK'S CAPITAL	92

CHAPTER 5

USE OF CURRENCIES OF BANK RESOURCES	95
I. LEGAL AND POLICY RESTRICTIONS ON THE USE AND CONVERSION OF CURRENCIES (CAPITAL STOCK; BORROWED FUNDS; EARNINGS) BY THE BANK	95
A. Capital Stock	95
1. <i>The "2 Percent Currency" (the Portion of Capital Subscriptions Payable in Gold or U.S. dollars)</i>	96
2. <i>The "18 Percent Currency" (the Portion of Capital Subscriptions Payable in Local Currency)</i>	97
B. Borrowed Funds	99
C. Earnings	102
D. Exchange Risk in Respect of Currencies on Loan	103
Conclusions	105
II. CONSENT REQUIREMENTS FOR ECU BORROWINGS BY THE BANK	105
III. TREATMENT OF 18 PERCENT CURRENCIES OUT ON LOAN WHEN THE COUNTRY OF THE CURRENCY WITHHOLDS ITS USE IN BANK OPERATIONS AFTER AN INITIAL RELEASE	106
IV. USE OF LOCAL CURRENCY PORTION OF CAPITAL SUBSCRIPTIONS TO MEET BANK'S ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES IN MEMBER COUNTRIES	108
V. SPECIAL RESERVE	110
A. Nature of the Special Reserve	110
B. Use of Special Reserve to Write off Loan Losses	113
VI. COSTS OF CERTAIN BANK BORROWINGS NOT TO BE INCLUDED IN CALCULATION OF INTEREST RATES OF BANK LOANS	115

CHAPTER 6

THE IBRD LENDING LIMIT AND THE "HEAD ROOM" ISSUE	117
I. LEGAL ANALYSIS OF THE "LENDING LIMIT" REQUIREMENT UNDER ARTICLE III, SECTION 3 OF THE IBRD ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT	117
A. Introduction	117
B. Intended Meaning of Article III, Section 3	119
1. <i>Drafting History</i>	119
2. <i>The Text as it Stands</i>	125
3. <i>Intended Meaning</i>	127
C. Interpretation of Article III, Section 3 in the Bank's Practice	129
1. <i>Subjective Interpretation Discarded</i>	129
2. <i>Interpretation of the "Amount Outstanding of Loans" in the Bank's Practice</i>	130
3. <i>Extension of Interpretation to the Bank's "Contingent Obligations"</i>	132
D. Meaning of the Outstanding Amount of Guarantees	133

1. <i>The Consistency Argument</i>	133
2. <i>Criticism of the Consistency Argument</i>	136
3. <i>A Necessary Qualification of the "Consistent Interpretation"</i>	140
4. <i>Other Possible Interpretations</i>	141
E. Summary and Conclusion	143
II. CAPITAL ADEQUACY - LEGAL ASPECTS	148
A. Introduction	148
B. Timely information to the Executive Directors	149
C. The Lending Limit and Further Disbursements	150
D. The Bank's General Conditions	150
E. The General Law of Treaties	151
F. The Bank's Relationship with its Borrowers	153
G. Amending the General Conditions	154
PART TWO	
THE BANK'S PURPOSES AND LIMITS	
CHAPTER 7	
AUTHORIZED PURPOSES OF BANK LOANS, GUARANTEES AND GRANTS	
	157
I. AUTHORIZED PURPOSES OF LOANS MADE OR GUARANTEED BY THE BANK	157
A. Introduction	157
B. The General Rule: Financing for Specific Projects	159
C. Authorization of Loans for other than Specific Projects in Special Circumstances	160
D. Limits on Lending for other than Specific Projects	163
1. <i>Structural Adjustment Loans and Sectoral Adjustment Loans</i>	163
2. <i>Loans and Guarantees to Refinance or Restructure Existing Commercial Debt</i>	167
(a) <i>Refinancing as a mechanism to ensure commercial bank financing of a specific investment in an early stage</i>	169
(b) <i>Providing means of credit enhancement to enable borrowers to receive new money for productive purposes in the context of debt restructuring</i>	169
(c) <i>Supporting debt/equity conversion in specific cases which involve the enhancement of an investment enterprise</i>	170
(d) <i>Supporting interest rate swaps of existing debt through Bank guarantees, as a mechanism to improve financial management</i>	172
E. Conclusion	172
II. PROJECT AND NON-PROJECT FINANCING UNDER THE IBRD ARTICLES	173
A. Introduction	173
B. Loans for Specific Projects	174
1. <i>Legislative History</i>	174

2. <i>Subsequent Practice</i>	177
C. Loans for other than Specific Projects	179
D. Conclusions	182
III. THE POWER OF THE BANK TO MAKE GRANTS	183
A. The Power of the Bank to Make Grants	183
B. The Scope Of The Bank's Power To Make Grants	184
C. The Accounting Treatment of Grants	185
D. Legal Aspect of IBRD Grants	186
E. IBRD Grants For <i>Emergency Assistance</i>	188

CHAPTER 8

ACTUAL EXAMPLES OF AUTHORIZED ACTIVITIES THAT REQUIRED LEGAL CONSIDERATION AND ANALYSIS 191

I. "MATERIALITY" CRITERIA REQUIRED FOR BANK LENDING FOR DEBT AND DEBT SERVICE REDUCTION PURPOSES.	191
A. Adjustment Lending	192
B. Loans and Guarantees to Refinance or Restructure Existing Commercial Debt	193
II. THE FINANCING OF SEVERANCE PAY AND SALARY SUPPLEMENTS IN BANK LENDING	194
III. FACTORS TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT BY THE BANK WHEN DETERMINING WHETHER TO LEND OR CONTINUE LENDING TO A COUNTRY IN WHICH THERE HAVE BEEN OR THERE ARE OPEN HOSTILITIES	197
A. Introduction	197
B. Articles of Agreement	197
C. Past Bank Practice in Dealing with Hostilities	198
1. <i>Development Policy and Fulfillment of Investment Objectives</i>	199
2. <i>Creditworthiness</i>	201
3. <i>Project Implementation and Security of Personnel</i>	201
D. Developments in the Nineties	205
IV. DISBURSEMENT OF BANK LOANS TO BORROWERS UNDER ECONOMIC SANCTIONS	208
Postscript	208
V. LENDING TO A COUNTRY WITHOUT A GOVERNMENT – THE CASE OF CAMBODIA IN 1993.	209
VI. FINANCING BY THE BANK OF DEMINING ACTIVITES	213
VII. FINANCING OF "NON-LENDING SERVICES"	215
VIII. REVIEWING THE LEVEL OF A BORROWER'S MILITARY EXPENDITURE	216

CHAPTER 9

POLITICAL ACTIVITY PROHIBITED 219

I. PROHIBITION OF POLITICAL ACTIVITIES IN THE BANK'S WORK	219
Introduction	219

A.	Requirements of Relevant Provisions of the Articles of Agreement	221
1.	<i>The Bank's Purposes and Functions</i>	222
2.	<i>Prohibition of Political Activities</i>	223
3.	<i>Interpretation and Amendment of the Articles</i>	224
B.	Rationale of the Emphasis on Depoliticization of the Bank and its Operations	225
C.	Extent of the Exclusion of Political Considerations in the Bank's Work.	227
1.	<i>Concern with Economic Issues, even if Associated with, or Originating in Political Factors</i>	228
2.	<i>Compliance with Binding Decisions of the UN Security Council under Articles 41 and 42 of the UN Charter.</i>	229
3.	<i>Concern with Specific Issues of Governance</i>	230
D.	More Recent Practical Issues: Not Lending on Account of Human Rights Violations and Questions Related to the Bank's Research and Publications	233
1.	<i>Not Lending to Countries with a Record of Violation of Internationally Recognized Human Rights</i>	233
2.	<i>Bank Research and Publications</i>	236
	Conclusions	238
II.	PROHIBITION OF POLITICAL ACTIVITIES UNDER THE IBRD ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT AND ITS RELEVANCE TO THE WORK OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	239
	Conclusions	244
CHAPTER 10		
ISSUES OF "GOVERNANCE" IN BORROWING MEMBERS – THE EXTENT OF THEIR RELEVANCE UNDER THE BANK'S ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT		
		245
	INTRODUCTORY STATEMENT	245
	THE GENERAL COUNSEL'S 1990 PAPER ON ISSUES OF "GOVERNANCE"	248
I.	INTRODUCTION	248
II.	RECENT EMERGENCE OF GOVERNANCE ISSUES IN DEVELOPMENT FORA	249
A.	Bank Studies on African Development - The Sub-Saharan Africa Long Term Perspective Study of 1989	249
B.	The Agreement Establishing the EBRD	251
C.	Gradual Expansion in the Scope of World Bank Adjustment Lending	252
III.	EXCLUSION OF POLITICAL CONSIDERATIONS IN THE BANK'S ARTICLES. ITS MEANING AND SCOPE IN THE CONTEXT OF THE INSTITUTION'S EVOLUTION	254
A.	The Bank's Authorized Purposes	254
B.	Prohibition of Political Activities	257

C.	Political Considerations of Possible Relevance Due to their Direct Economic Effect or to Binding International Obligations	265
IV.	THE BANK'S MANDATE IN RELATION TO ASPECTS OF GOVERNANCE IN ITS BORROWING MEMBER COUNTRIES	268
A.	Defining the Issue	268
B.	Aspects of Governance Beyond the Bank's Mandate	270
C.	Aspects of Governance Consistent with the Bank's Mandate	272
D.	Examples of Relevant Issues of Governance	274
(i)	Civil Service Reform.	275
(ii)	Legal Reform.	275
(iii)	Accountability for Public Funds.	277
(iv)	Budget Discipline.	278
E.	Sensitive Cases	279
	CONCLUSION	280

PART THREE OPERATIONAL ISSUES

CHAPTER 11		
FINANCING LOCAL EXPENDITURE		283
INTRODUCTION		284
I.	FINANCING LOCAL EXPENDITURES BY IBRD LOANS AND IDA CREDITS	284
A.	The Articles of Agreement of the IBRD	284
B.	The Articles of Agreement of IDA	286
C.	The Bank's Practice	287
1.	<i>Financing Local Costs in Project Lending</i>	287
	<i>The 1949 Board Construction of the Articles of Agreement</i>	287
	<i>The 1964 Elaboration</i>	288
	<i>The 1968 Review</i>	289
	<i>The 1968 Legal Opinion</i>	290
	<i>Recent Codification of Policy</i>	291
2.	<i>Financing Local Costs in Adjustment Lending</i>	293
II.	GUARANTEE BY THE BANK AND IDA OF LOANS MADE IN LOCAL CURRENCY OR RAISED IN DOMESTIC MARKETS	296
A.	The IBRD Articles of Agreement	296
B.	The Articles of Agreement of IDA	297
	CONCLUSIONS - LEGAL OPINION	299

CHAPTER 12		
THE NEGATIVE PLEDGE CLAUSE		303
I.	NEGATIVE PLEDGE CLAUSES IN COMMERCIAL BANKS' LOAN AGREEMENTS	303
A.	The <i>Pari Passu</i> Provision	303

B.	The Prepayment Condition	304
C.	The Negative Pledge Clause	304
II.	THE NEGATIVE PLEDGE CLAUSE APPLICABLE TO IBRD LOANS AND THE CONDITIONS FOR ITS WAIVER	306
A.	General Position on the Importance of the Negative Pledge Clause	308
B.	General Waiver of the Negative Pledge Clause for certain countries under the 1992 Waiver Policy	309
1.	<i>Meaning, Scope and Rationale of the Bank's Negative Pledge Clause</i>	309
2.	<i>Application of the Negative Pledge Clause in Practice</i>	311
3.	<i>Proposed General Waiver</i>	312
(a)	<i>The Special Purpose Entity Requirement</i>	313
(b)	<i>The Absence of Alternative Recourse Requirement</i>	313
III.	BANK POLICY ON WAIVER OF THE NEGATIVE PLEDGE CLAUSE	314
IV.	APPLICATION OF THE WAIVER POLICY	319
V.	EXCEPTION FROM THE NEGATIVE PLEDGE WAIVER POLICY	321
VI.	LOOPHOLES – A CASE STUDY	321
A.	Background	321
B.	Brief Description of [Country X]’s Refinancing	322
C.	Does the Transaction Violate [Country X’s] Negative Pledge Undertakings?	323
D.	Arguments for the Position that [Country X] has violated its Negative Pledge	323
E.	Arguments for the Position that [Country X] has not violated its Negative Pledge.	325
	Conclusion	326
CHAPTER 13		
DEBT AND DEBT SERVICE REDUCTION		329
I.	A FRAMEWORK FOR THE BANK’S FINANCING OF COMMERCIAL DEBT REDUCTION – ISSUES TO BE ADDRESSED	329
A.	Issues Related to the Articles of Agreement	329
1.	<i>Authority of the Bank to Finance the Servicing and Reduction of Existing Debt</i>	329
2.	<i>Authority of the Bank to act as trustee for the benefit of commercial creditors?</i>	329
3.	<i>Issues related to forms of Bank intervention</i>	329
4.	<i>Effect on Bank’s lending limit</i>	330
5.	<i>Objective criteria for determining country eligibility</i>	330
B.	Possible Options for Credit Enhancement of Reduced Debt (Other than Through Guarantees)	330
C.	Issues Related to Agreements with Commercial Creditors	331
D.	Other Issues for the Bank with Possible Legal Ramifications	331

II.	INSTRUMENTS FOR PROVIDING SUPPORT FOR DEBT AND DEBT SERVICE REDUCTION TRANSACTIONS – LEGAL ISSUES	332
A.	Introduction	332
B.	Three Instruments for Interest Support	333
1.	<i>Loans to Fund Separate Accounts</i>	333
(a)	<i>Escrow Accounts</i>	334
(b)	<i>Trust Accounts</i>	335
(c)	<i>Collateral Accounts</i>	336
(d)	<i>International Law Considerations</i>	337
2.	<i>Lines of Credit</i>	337
3.	<i>Guarantees</i>	338
C.	Some Legal Issues Affecting the Use of the Three Different Instruments	339
1.	<i>Recovery of Amounts Paid under Guarantees</i>	339
2.	<i>Termination of World Bank Guarantee</i>	339
3.	<i>Negative Pledge and Pari Passu Clauses</i>	340
4.	<i>Selection of Separate Account Arrangement and Holder</i>	342
5.	<i>Legal Liabilities of the Bank</i>	343
6.	<i>Tax Liability</i>	344
7.	<i>Irrevocability of World Bank Commitment</i>	346
8.	<i>Effect on Bank's Statutory Lending Limit</i>	346
D.	Conclusion	347
III.	GUARANTEE BY THE BANK OF INTEREST PAYMENTS UNDER DEBT SERVICE REDUCTION SCHEMES -A LEGAL ANALYSIS	348
IV.	RELEVANT PROVISIONS OF COMMERCIAL BANK'S LOAN AGREEMENTS AFFECTING PROPOSED DEBT REDUCTION SCHEMES	354
	Introduction	354
A.	Scope of Transactions Involving Debt or Debt Service Reductions	355
B.	General Contractual Provisions	355
1.	<i>Provisions to Ensure Equal Treatment of Lenders within the Syndicate</i>	356
(a).	<i>Sharing Provision</i>	356
(b).	<i>Optional Prepayment Provision</i>	357
2.	<i>Provisions to Ensure Equal Treatment between Lenders in the Syndicate and Other Creditors</i>	357
(a).	<i>Pari Passu Provision</i>	357
(b).	<i>Negative Pledge Provision</i>	357
(c).	<i>Mandatory Prepayment/Prohibition of Prepayment Provision</i>	358
3.	<i>Waiver and Amendment Provisions</i>	358
(a).	<i>Sharing Provisions</i>	359
(b).	<i>Prepayment Provisions</i>	359
(c).	<i>Pari Passu Provisions</i>	359
(d).	<i>Negative Pledge Provisions</i>	359
4.	<i>Special Provisions in New Commercial Bank Loan Agreements Permitting Debt Reduction Transactions</i>	360

C.	Two Recent Examples Involving Cash Buy-Backs	360
1.	<i>Bolivia</i>	360
2.	<i>Chile</i>	361
V.	DETAILS IN IMPLEMENTATION OF THE BANK'S FINANCING OF DEBT AND DEBT SERVICE REDUCTION	362
A.	Use of Portions of Adjustment Loans (Set-Aside Funds) to Collateralize Interest Payments	362
B.	Bank Financing of Debt Reduction	363
	<i>Not a routine operation</i>	363
	<i>Evaluation of the Materiality of Debt Reduction</i>	363
	<i>Applicability of the Materiality Criteria to IDA's Debt Reduction Facility</i>	364
	<i>Relevance of Drafting History</i>	365
C.	Use of the Unused Resources of the Interest Subsidy Fund (ISF) to Finance the HIPC Trust Fund	365
VI.	NEED FOR CHANGES IN AND HARMONIZATION OF STANDARDS APPLICABLE TO COMMERCIAL BANKS' LENDING TO DEVELOPING COUNTRIES, AND ASSOCIATED, REGULATORY, TAX AND ACCOUNTING REGIMES	366
A.	Capital Adequacy Guidelines	367
B.	Loan Loss Provisions	369
	1. <i>Level of provisioning</i>	369
	2. <i>Tax Deductibility of Loan Loss Provisions</i>	369
	3. <i>United States: Improvements in ATTR (Specific Provisioning)</i>	370
	4. <i>Inclusion of Loan Loss Reserves in Regulatory Capital</i>	371
	<i>Interest Accrual</i>	372
	<i>Interest Capitalization</i>	372
	<i>Non-Recognition of Loss on Restructuring</i>	372
	Conclusion	372
VII.	BANK'S ROLE IN THE WORLD DEBT CRISIS	373
	Attachment: Towards Central Management of The Debt Problem On A Country-By-Country Basis	374
CHAPTER 14		
LEGAL QUESTIONS RELATED TO ADJUSTMENT LENDING		
I.	LIMITS ON ADJUSTMENT LENDING	377
II.	POSSIBILITY OF BANK LOANS FOR ECONOMIC RECOVERY AND THE RECONSTRUCTION OF MONETARY SYSTEMS, INCLUDING LONG TERM STABILIZATION LOANS	378
III.	DRAFTING OF SECOND TRANCHE RELEASE CONDITIONS IN ADJUSTMENT LOAN/CREDIT AGREEMENTS	382
IV.	ADJUSTMENT LOANS CONDITIONALITY INVOLVING THIRD PARTIES	383
V.	NOTE ON ENACTMENT OF LEGISLATION BY THE BORROWER AS A CONDITION IN ADJUSTMENT LOAN AGREEMENTS	384

A.	Bank Policy Statements (Re Investment Lending)	385
B.	Adjustment Lending	385
C.	Modalities in Bank Practice	386
D.	Board Discussion	388
VI.	SAL CONDITIONALITY TO BE CONSISTENT WITH THE COUNTRY'S RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS UNDER GATT/WTO	388
A.	Capping Antidumping Duties with Tariffs	389
B.	Qualitative Restrictions (QRs) as Safeguard (SG) Measures (under Article XIX GATT 1994 and SGC)	389
VII.	SECTORAL ADJUSTMENT LOANS (SECALs)	390
A.	The Link of Second Tranche Release to an Overall Macroeconomic Framework	390
B.	SECAL Loan Agreements: Specific Suggestions	395
VIII.	DISBURSEMENT OF ADJUSTMENT LOANS	397
A.	Responsibility for Disbursement of Adjustment Loans (In the Context of the Second Tranche Release of IDA's Adjustment Credits)	397
B.	Questions Raised Regarding Disbursement under a SAL Agreement	398
IX.	ADJUSTMENT LOANS FINANCING LOCAL COST	399
	Postscript	401

CHAPTER 15

TREATMENT OF IBRD BORROWERS IN CASES OF "ACUTE EXCHANGE STRINGENCIES" AND "DEFAULT" 407

I.	INTRODUCTION	407
II.	DRAFTING HISTORY OF RELEVANT PROVISIONS	408
A.	Article IV, Section 4(c)	409
1.	<i>Early U.S. Drafts</i>	409
2.	<i>The U.K. Boat Draft</i>	410
3.	<i>Discussions in Atlantic City</i>	411
4.	<i>Discussions at the Bretton Woods Conference</i>	412
B.	Article IV, Section 7(a)	413
III.	BANK'S PRACTICE	414
A.	Bank's Prospectuses and Underlying Policies	414
B.	The "Rights" Accumulation Policy	417
C.	Legal Basis of Loan Rescheduling	419
IV.	Legal and Policy Implications	420
V.	Conclusions	423

CHAPTER 16

THE REQUIREMENT OF A GOVERNMENTAL GUARANTEE OF BANK LOANS TO ENTITIES OTHER THAN A MEMBER COUNTRY 425

I.	GOVERNMENT GUARANTEE OF LOANS MADE TO OTHER THAN A MEMBER COUNTRY - ITS REQUIREMENT UNDER THE ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT OF THE IBRD	425
----	---	-----

II.	AMENDING THE IBRD ARTICLES TO AUTHORIZE LOANS TO PRIVATE ENTERPRISES WITHOUT GOVERNMENT GUARANTEE	430
III.	LEGAL IMPLICATIONS OF AMENDING THE ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT TO AUTHORIZE BANK LOANS TO PRIVATE ENTERPRISES WITHOUT GOVERNMENT GUARANTEE	434
	A. Introduction	434
	B. Governing Law and Dispute Settlement in the Existing Instruments	434
	C. Governing Law and Dispute Settlement under Unguaranteed Loans to Private Enterprises	435
	ANNEX TO CHAPTER SIXTEEN	439
	A. Intermediate Options for Changing the IBRD Articles of Agreement to Permit Unguaranteed Lending to Private Entities under Certain Limits	439
	1. <i>Limiting the Scale of Lending without Government Guarantee</i>	439
	2. <i>Loan Participations with the IFC</i>	440
	3. <i>Expansion of the List of Eligible Official Guarantors</i>	440
	4. <i>Limiting Government Guarantees to Convertibility and Transfer Risk</i>	441
	B. Avenues for Increasing Bank Group Support to Private Borrowers without a Change in the IBRD Articles	441
	1. <i>Avenues for IBRD and IDA</i>	441
	(a) <i>Increase of Financial Intermediation Lending (FIL)</i>	441
	(b) <i>Direct Lending to Private Borrowers</i>	442
	(c) <i>Cofinancing with Private Lenders</i>	443
	(d) <i>Financing NGOs</i>	443
	(e) <i>Government Procurement and Subcontracting</i>	444
	2. <i>Avenues for IFC</i>	444
	3. <i>Avenues for MIGA</i>	444
	(a) <i>Broadening the Scope of Eligible Loans for MIGA's Insurance</i>	444
	(b) <i>Covering Portfolio Investments, Country Funds and New Forms of Investment</i>	446
	4. <i>Possible Joint Activities</i>	446
	CHAPTER 17	
	THE BANK'S POLICY AND PRACTICE ON EXTERNAL DEBT DEFAULTS TO INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS, GOVERNMENTS AND GOVERNMENTAL INSTITUTIONS – A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS	447
I.	INTRODUCTION	447
II.	RELEVANT PROVISIONS OF THE ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT	447
III.	GENERAL CONDITIONS APPLICABLE TO IBRD LOANS AND IDA CREDITS	449
IV.	BANK POLICY ON DISPUTES OVER DEFAULT ON EXTERNAL DEBT	451
V.	THE BANK'S PRACTICE	453

VI. CONCLUSION	454
ANNEX TO CHAPTER SEVENTEEN:	
Drafting History of Article V, Section 8 and Article III, Section 4 of IBRD Articles of Agreement	455
I. Article V, Section 8	456
II. Article III, Section 4 (V)	457
 CHAPTER 18	
GUARENTEES BY THE BANK OF PRIVATE LOANS	461
 I. BANK GUARENTEES NOT TO BE EXTENDED TO PUBLIC LENDING AGENCIES?	 461
II. GUARENTEES FOR BANK LOANS TO UNCREDITWORTHY COUNTRIES THROUGH A GUARENTEE FUND?	462
A. Would the Proposal Be Consistent with the Bank's Articles?	462
B. Design of Guarantee Fund Options	463
1. <i>Independent legal entity funded by member countries</i>	463
2. <i>Trust account funded by member countries</i>	464
3. <i>Guarantee Fund administered by Bank and funded by members</i>	464
4. <i>Guarantee Fund entrusted to IDA</i>	466
(a) <i>Guarantee Fund as part of IDA's operations</i>	466
(b) <i>IDA as administrator of the Guarantee Fund</i>	467
5. <i>Guarantee Fund funded out of Bank income</i>	467
C. Other Issues	468
1. <i>Currency composition of the Guarantee Fund</i>	468
2. <i>Risk of default by the Guarantee Fund</i>	469
D. Conclusions	469
III. COUNTER-GUARENTEE REQUIREMENT FOR CROSS-BORDER PROJECTS	470
IV. A CASE STUDY OF BANK GUARENTEES - LEGAL ASPECTS	471
A. Introduction	471
B. Do the Proposed Bank Guarantees Meet the Requirements of the Bank's Articles of Agreement?	474
1. <i>What is the Project under consideration?</i>	475
2. <i>Does the Project Involve an Investment for Productive Purposes?</i>	476
3. <i>Do the Loans Meet the Country Eligibility Requirements under the Bank's Articles and its Graduation Policy?</i>	477
4. <i>Was it Possible for the Borrower to Obtain the Guarantee otherwise under Reasonable Terms?</i>	478
5. <i>Are Counter-Guarantees by Other Countries Required Under the Bank's Articles?</i>	478
6. <i>Does the Project meet the Bank's Articles' Requirements with respect to Procurement of Goods and Services?</i>	479
7. <i>Would the Bank Violate Any Legal or Policy Requirement by Its Issuance of the Proposed Guarantee, Instead of IFC or MIGA?</i>	480
C. Legal Safeguards against Use for Military Purposes of the Project Assets Financed by the Bank Guaranteed Loans	481

1. <i>The Partnership Agreement</i>	481
2. <i>Deed of Covenant</i>	482
3. <i>Safeguards in the Guarantee Agreements</i>	482
4. <i>Indemnity Agreements</i>	483
5. <i>Other Agreements</i>	484
<i>The Partnership Agreement</i>	484
<i>MTCR Controls</i>	485
<i>Supply Agreements</i>	485
<i>The Project Support Agreements</i>	485
D. What are the Legal Safeguards to Ensure Respect for Applicable Environmental National and International Requirements?	485
1. <i>Requirements under the Bank's Applicable Policies and Procedures</i>	486
2. <i>Requirements under International Conventions</i>	486
3. <i>Requirements under the Project Agreement</i>	487
(a) <i>Respect for environmental laws</i>	487
(b) <i>Maintenance of permits</i>	487
(c) <i>Compliance with national and international environmental requirements</i>	488
(d) <i>Monitoring</i>	488
4. <i>Requirements under the Guarantee Agreements</i>	488
(a) <i>Notice of no coverage with respect to further advances if the Borrower breaches its obligations to the Guarantor</i>	488
(b) <i>Breach of Obligations</i>	489
E. Conclusion	489
V. GUARANTEE OF COMMERCIAL LOANS BY IDA	490
CHAPTER 19	
THE IBRD GRADUATION POLICY	493
I. LEGAL ASPECTS OF THE BANK'S GRADUATION POLICY	493
II. CONSISTENCY OF THE GRADUATION POLICY WITH THE BANK'S ARTICLES	495
Introduction	495
Legal Opinion	495
Annex 1:THE BANK'S POLICY ON GRADUATION	497
Annex 2:DRAFTING HISTORY OF THE RELEVANT PROVISIONS OF THE ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT	499
Annex 3:APPLICATION OF GRADUATION IN THE BANK'S PRACTICE	502
Annex 4:POSTSCRIPT: TEXT OF THE GRADUATION POLICY AS REFORMULATED BY THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS IN 1984	504
III. APPLICATION OF THE GRADUATION POLICY –THE "DE-GRADUATION" OF KOREA	505

CHAPTER 20

STATE SUCCESSION IN THE BANK – THE CASE OF YUGOSLAVIA 509

I.	PRELIMINARY AGREEMENTS CONCLUDED WITH YUGOSLAV REPUBLICS IN FEBRUARY 1992	509
II.	STATUS OF YUGOSLAVIA IN INTERNATIONAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS IN MID 1992	510
III.	EFFECTS OF THE DISINTEGRATION OF YUGOSLAVIA ON BANK MEMBERSHIP (SEPTEMBER, 1992)	512
IV.	EFFECTS OF THE TERRITORIAL DISINTEGRATION OF THE SOCIALIST FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF YUGOSLAVIA (SFRY)	513
	Annex I: SUMMARY OF EVENTS LEADING TO THE DISINTEGRATION OF THE SOCIALIST FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF YUGOSLAVIA	518
	Annex II: BANK PORTFOLIO OF OUTSTANDING LOANS IN THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLICS	520
	Annex III: THE BANK'S PRACTICE WITH RESPECT TO STATE SUCCESSION	521
A.	Membership Issues	521
	1. <i>The Division of India into India and Pakistan</i>	521
	2. <i>The Secession of Bangladesh</i>	521
	3. <i>The Dissolution of the United Arab Republic</i>	522
	4. <i>The Merger of the two Yemens</i>	522
B.	Apportionment and Devolution of Rights and Obligations under Existing Loans and Guarantees	522
	1. <i>Singapore</i>	522
	2. <i>Rwanda-Burundi</i>	523
	3. <i>The United Arab Republic (UAR)</i>	523
	4. <i>India/Pakistan</i>	523
	5. <i>The secession of Bangladesh</i>	523
	6. <i>Rhodesia and Nyasaland</i>	524
	Annex IV: A SUMMARY OF STATE SUCCESSION IN PUBLIC DEBT UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	526
A.	Introduction	526
B.	Basic Theories of Succession	526
C.	State Practice	527
D.	Attempts at "Codification"	528
V.	RESOLUTION OF ISSUES RELATED TO YUGOSLAVIA	529

CHAPTER 21

ASSISTANCE TO NON-MEMBERS 531

I.	TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO NON-MEMBERS: A LEGAL ANALYSIS	531
II.	BANK'S INVOLVEMENT IN THE WEST BANK AND GAZA	534

III. LEGAL MEMORANDUM CONCERNING POSSIBLE WORLD BANK ASSISTANCE TO THE WEST BANK AND THE GAZA STRIP	537
Introduction	537
A. Legal Status of the Territories	539
B. Eligibility of the Territories to Receive Bank Assistance	540
1. <i>General requirement for Extension of Bank Assistance</i>	540
2. <i>Specific Issues for Consideration</i>	542
(a). <i>Establishment and Administration of a Trust Fund Where the Finances are Provided by other Donors.</i>	542
(b). <i>Use of Administrative Budget Resources for Work Related to the Territories.</i>	543
(c). <i>Establishment and Administration of a Trust Fund Financed by a Bank Grant and Administered by IDA</i>	543
(d). <i>Bank Loans and Guarantees</i>	544
IV. OPTIONS FOR THE FUTURE DIRECT BANK / IDA LENDING FOR THE BENEFIT OF THE WEST BANK AND GAZA OCCUPIED TERRITORIES - VARIOUS LENDING OPTIONS	546
CHAPTER 22	
ISSUES RELATED TO THE INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION (IDA)	553
I. IDA ELIGIBILITY AND ALLOCATION POLICIES – INFORMATIONAL BACKGROUND AND LEGAL ANALYSIS	553
A. The Articles of Agreement	553
B. Decisions of the Executive Directors	555
1. <i>Population Size</i>	558
2. <i>Poverty</i>	558
3. <i>Performance</i>	559
4. <i>Creditworthiness</i>	559
C. IDA Lending to Small Island Economies	561
D. Conclusion	563
II. THE ROLE OF IDA DEPUTIES	564
III. SOME LEGAL ASPECTS OF THE PROPOSED USES OF IDA REFLOWS	568
A. Introduction	568
B. Relevant Provisions of the IDA Articles of Agreement	569
C. Use of IDA Resources to Purchase Bank Loans	569
D. Use of IDA Reflows to Reduce the Borrower's Debt to the Bank	570
1. <i>An IDA Credit to Finance Interest on a New Bank Loan?</i>	570
2. <i>An IDA Credit Presumably to Finance Servicing Existing Bank Loans?</i>	571
3. <i>An IDA Credit Explicitly to Refinance an Existing Loan</i>	572
E. Conclusion	573
IV. IDA FINANCING OF PRIVATE ENTITIES	574
V. IDA GUARANTEE OF LOANS MADE BY THIRD PARTIES	575

VI. POWER OF IDA TO PURCHASE PARTICIPATIONS IN BANK LOANS IN THE EXCEPTIONAL CIRCUMSTANCE OF PROTECTING THE BANK'S HEADROOM	577
Attachment	578
VII. PROCEDURES FOR CONSULTATION AND APPROVAL OF CREDITS FUNDED OUT OF THE RESOURCES OF THE INTERIM TRUST FUND ESTABLISHED UNDER THE IDA ELEVENTH REPLENISHMENT	579
VIII. LEGAL ASPECTS OF VOTING RIGHTS IN IDA	580
A. Introduction	580
B. The Decision-Making /Structure of IDA	581
C. The Initial Voting Rights under the Articles of Agreement	582
D. The Evolution of the Voting Rights System	585
1. <i>Subscription Votes</i>	585
2. <i>Membership Votes</i>	586
3. <i>The Present Voting Rights System in IDA</i>	587
E. Conclusions	589
CHAPTER 23	
ISSUES RELATED TO THE INSPECTION PANEL	591
I. ROLE OF THE INSPECTION PANEL IN THE PRELIMINARY ASSESSMENT OF WHETHER TO RECOMMEND INSPECTION	591
A. Introduction	591
1. <i>The Purpose of this Memorandum</i>	591
2. <i>Establishing Eligibility: The Panel's Jurisdiction (Competence) and the Admissibility of the Request for Inspection</i>	592
B. Ascertaining, the Panel's Competence <i>Ratione Personae</i> - Establishing the "Standing" of the Complainant	592
C. Ascertaining the Panel's Competence <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	593
D. Ascertaining the Panel's Competence <i>Ratione Temporis</i> and Establishing that the Complaint is not Barred for Other Reasons	595
Conclusion	596
II. TIME-LIMITS ON THE ELIGIBILITY OF COMPLAINTS SUBMITTED TO THE INSPECTION PANEL	597
A. Introduction	597
B. Scope of the Time Exclusion	598
C. Complaints Related to Projects Receiving Supplemental Financing	600
III. SECOND REVIEW OF THE INSPECTION PANEL EXPERIENCE – A COMMENTARY (PROPOSALS BY THE GENERAL COUNSEL)	601
Introduction	601
A. Unbundling Questions and Responses Triggered by a Request for Inspection	602
1. <i>A Basic Distinction</i>	602
2. <i>Eligible Complaints</i>	603
3. <i>A Preliminary Condition of Admissibility</i>	604
4. <i>Defining the Process in Light of Management's Possible Responses</i>	605

B.	Meaning of the Bank's Failure to Observe its Policies and Procedures, and Issues of Liability and Accountability for the Remedial Action	607
	1. <i>Scope of the Bank's Failure</i>	608
	2. <i>Issues of Bank Liability and Accountability</i>	609
	(a) <i>Liability</i>	609
	(b) <i>Accountability</i>	611
	Conclusion	611
C.	Inspection Panel – Further Clarification of the “Commentary”	612
	ANNEX TO CHAPTER TWENTY-THREE:	
	Text of the Conclusions Adopted by the Executive Directors After Their Second Review of the Inspections Panel's Experience	613
	 CHAPTER 24	
	OTHER OPERATIONAL ISSUES	619
I.	REMEDIES AVAILABLE TO THE BANK/IDA UNDER THE LOAN/CREDIT AGREEMENTS ON THE SARDAR SAROVAR PROJECTS	619
	A. Introduction	619
	B. Remedies Generally Available to the Bank and IDA	620
	C. Events Justifying Suspension under the General Conditions	621
	D. Events Justifying Suspension under the Loan/Credit and Project Agreements for the Dam Project	621
	1. <i>On Resettlement and Rehabilitation</i>	622
	2. <i>On Environment</i>	623
	3. <i>On Health</i>	623
	E. Procedures for Suspension of Disbursements	624
	Conclusions	625
II.	GRACE PERIODS AND FINAL MATURITIES ON BANK LOANS	626
III.	TRANCHING IN THE DISBURSEMENT OF INVESTMENT PROJECTS	627
IV.	PROCUREMENT UNDER SUB-LOANS PROVIDED BY INTERMEDIARY INSTITUTIONS	629
V.	REQUIREMENT OF “MEANINGFUL CONSULTATION” WITH LOCAL COMMUNITIES AND NGOs IN THE PREPARATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT REPORTS	630
VI.	DISPUTED TERRITORIES IN MAPS USED IN BANK DOCUMENTS ON LOAN PROPOSALS	631
VII.	THE BANK'S DEALING WITH TAIWAN, CHINA	632
VIII.	EFFECT OF TERMINATION OF MEMBERSHIP IN THE INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND ON DISBURSEMENT OF BANK LOANS	633
IX.	IFC AS A BANK-FINANCED CONSULTANT TO BANK BORROWERS?	634

X.	GLOBAL ENVIRONMENTAL FACILITY (GEF) 2ND REPLENISHMENT POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS	636
A.	Integrating Global Environment into the Operations of Implementing Agencies (IAs) including the World Bank	636
B.	Direct Cooperation with Bodies other than the three Implementing Agencies	636
C.	Leveraging Additional Resources from the Private Sector	637

PART FOUR ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT

CHAPTER 25

ROLE AND STATUS OF THE BANK'S EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS, AS A BOARD AND INDIVIDUALLY 639

I.	THE ROLE OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS OF THE BANK UNDER THE BANK'S ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT AND IN THE BANK'S PRACTICE	639
A.	The Articles of Agreement	639
	<i>Drafting History</i>	641
B.	The Role of the Executive Directors in the Bank's Practice	641
	1. <i>Inaugural Meeting and Rules of Procedure</i>	641
	2. <i>Early Relationship with the President</i>	642
	3. <i>Recent Practice</i>	643
II.	DELEGATION BY THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS OF THE POWER TO MAKE LOANS OR GUARANTEES	646
A.	An Explanatory Note	646
B.	Drafting History of the Provision on the Powers of the Bank's Board	649
	Postscript	652
III.	STATUS OF THE BANK'S EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	652
	Status of Elected Executive Directors	656
IV.	PARTICIPATION OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS STAFF IN LOAN NEGOTIATIONS	657
A.	Further Clarification on the Role of Executive Directors with Respect to Staff Work	659
	1. <i>The Role of Executive Director in Advising their Constituencies</i>	660
	2. <i>Role of Executive Directors in "Influencing Bank Staff"</i>	661
	3. <i>Role of Executive Directors in the Assessment of Creditworthiness and Risk Management</i>	662
	(a). <i>Required Creditworthiness for IBRD Loans and the Role of Executive Directors in Assessing it</i>	662
	(b). <i>Competence of the Board Joint Audit Committee (JAC) to Address Country Risk Management</i>	664
	4. <i>Role of the Executive Directors in Procurement Matters</i>	664
V.	POWER OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS TO APPROVE THE USE OF FUNDS IN THE SURPLUS ACCOUNT	666
A.	Provisions of the Articles of Agreement and the Bank's By-Laws	667

B.	The Bank's Practice	668
C.	Opinion	669
CHAPTER 26		
SOME DETAILS OF BOARD PROCEDURES		671
I.	FORMS OF MEETINGS OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	671
A.	Difference between the Executive Directors' Board Meetings, the "Committee of the Whole" Meetings, and Board "Seminars"	671
B.	Further Elaboration on the Meetings of the Board's Committee of the Whole	672
1.	<i>Introduction</i>	672
2.	<i>Meetings of the Executive Directors</i>	673
II.	SUBMISSION OF MANAGEMENT DOCUMENTS TO THE BOARD BY THE PRESIDENT	674
III.	CHAIRMANSHIP OF THE MEETINGS OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	676
IV.	LEGAL ASPECTS OF POSTPONING BOARD CONSIDERATION OF LOANS BY DECISION OF THE BANK PRESIDENT	678
A.	Preparation and Changes of the Agenda of Executive Directors' Meetings	678
B.	Prohibition of Politically Motivated Decisions	679
C.	Conclusion	680
IV.	"COUNTRY DISCUSSIONS" BY THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	680
A.	Defining the Issue	680
B.	IMF and Bank Articles of Agreement	682
C.	Country Discussions Independent of Decisions on Loans	684
D.	Conclusions	686
E.	Postscript	687
F.	Country Risk Rating	688
G.	A Supplement on Country Risk Rating	689
V.	TERM OF OFFICE OF ELECTED EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	690
	Extended Application of Article V, Section 4 (d) (Regarding the Term of an Elected Executive Director)	690
VI.	PROPOSAL TO ESTABLISH A BUDGET COMMITTEE OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	691
	<i>The Budget Process</i>	691
	<i>Committees of Executive Directors</i>	692
	<i>Articles of Agreement</i>	692
	<i>By-Laws</i>	693
	<i>Conclusion</i>	693
VI.	THE PROCESS OF BUDGET REVIEW AND APPROVAL – ROLE OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS AND BOARD COMMITTEES	695
A.	Applicable Provisions	695
B.	Bank's Practice	696
C.	The Committee on Cost Effectiveness and Budget Practice	699
D.	General Remarks on Board Committees	700

E.	Conclusions	701
F.	Postscript	702
CHAPTER 27		
ISSUES OF BOARD-MANAGEMENT RELATIONSHIP		705
I.	RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE BANK'S REORGANIZATION	705
A.	The Articles of Agreement and the By-Laws	705
B.	The Bank's Practice	706
	1. <i>Board's Regulatory Power over Staff Issues</i>	706
	2. <i>Board's Control of the Administrative Budget</i>	707
	Conclusion	708
II.	ISSUANCE OF STAFF RULES	709
III.	POWER OF INTRODUCING CHANGES TO THE MEDICAL INSURANCE PLAN FOR STAFF	710
IV.	RESPONSIBILITY OF THE BANK'S PRESIDENT TO ISSUE INSTRUCTIONS TO STAFF REGARDING COOPERATION WITH THE INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND	712
A.	The Implications of Discussing the Memorandum on Bank-Fund Collaboration in the Committee of the Whole	712
	Conclusion	714
B.	Questions in Respect of the Note on Bank-Fund Collaboration Regarding the States of The Former Soviet Union	715
	<i>Introduction</i>	715
	<i>Notes to Staff on Bank-Fund Collaboration</i>	715
C.	Consistency With The 1989 Memorandum	719
	1. <i>Tripartite Documents/PPF-like Documents</i>	719
	2. <i>Cross Conditionality</i>	720
	Conclusion	721
V.	RESPONSIBILITY FOR DECISIONS ON THE MAKING AND SUSPENSION OF DISBURSEMENT UNDER LOANS APPROVED BY THE BOARD	722
VI.	ACCESS OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS TO BANK DOCUMENTS	723
VII.	DISCLOSURE BY EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS OF BOARD DOCUMENTS	725
PART FIVE		
PERSONNEL ISSUES		
CHAPTER 28		
UNILATERAL CHANGES BY THE BANK OF EMPLOYMENT TERMS		727
I.	EXTENT OF THE POWER OF THE BANK TO UNILATERALLY CHANGE THE CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT OF ITS STAFF (With Particular Reference to the Benefits Associated with Separation for Redundancy Purposes)	727

INTRODUCTION	727
BANK'S POWER TO UNILATERALLY CHANGE STAFF BENEFITS	728
A. Non-Retroactivity	728
B. Observance of Essential Rights	730
C. Non-Arbitrariness and Non-Discrimination	732
D. Taking Relevant Factual Circumstances into Account	733
CONCLUSION	736
II. EXTENT OF THE POWER OF THE BANK TO UNILATERALLY CHANGE THE METHOD OF CALCULATING PENSIONS UNDER THE STAFF RETIREMENT PLAN	738
Introduction	738
A. Non-Retroactivity	739
B. Observance of Essential Rights	739
Conclusion	744
CHAPTER 29	
THE SCOPE OF TAX EXEMPTION OF "SALARIES AND EMOLUMENTS" UNDER SECTION 9(B) OF ARTICLE VII OF THE ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT OF THE BANK – A LEGAL ANALYSIS	745
I. INTRODUCTION	745
II. THE EFFECTS OF AN INTERPRETATION OF THE TERM "EMOLUMENTS" AS INCLUDING STAFF RETIREMENT BENEFITS	745
III. FORMAL INTERPRETATIONS OF THE ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT BY THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS	747
IV. PRINCIPLES OF TREATY INTERPRETATION	748
V. THE INTERPRETATION OF THE WORD "EMOLUMENTS" IN ARTICLE VII, SECTION 9(B) OF THE BANK'S ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT	749
A. The Ordinary Meaning of the Word "Emoluments"	749
B. Legal Use of the Term "Emoluments"	750
<i>In Legislation</i>	750
<i>In Court Decisions</i>	751
<i>In Treaties</i>	753
C. The Context of the Bank's Articles	754
D. Resolution No. 11 and Section 13 (b) of the By-Laws.	754
VI. CONCLUSIONS	757
ANNEX- Notes on the Drafting History of Article VII, Section 9(b) of the Articles of Agreement of the Bank	759

CHAPTER 30	
MISCELLANEOUS PERSONNEL MATTERS	763
I. STAFF COMPENSATION REVIEW - LEGAL QUESTIONS EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS ASK RELATED TO STAFF COMPENSATION REVIEW	763
A. Some Executive Directors ask for Postponement of a Decision on the Proposed Salary Increase until the Board Approves the [New] Budget.	763
B. A number of directors ask whether it is Legally Possible to Reach a Decision Different from that of the Fund on Staff Compensation.	764
C. Assuming a Departure from Parallelism Can Be Justified, some Directors ask Whether There Are Legally Defensible Ways to Reduce the Proposed Salary Increase at This Stage.	764
II. APPLICATION AND AMENDMENT OF STAFF RULE 7.01 WITH RESPECT TO REDUNDANCIES	765
III. EMPLOYMENT AUTHORIZATION FOR G-4 VISA HOLDERS	766
IV. APPOINTMENT OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS' ADVISORS TO BANK STAFF	767
V. PRIVATE EMPLOYMENT OF A BANK STAFF MEMBER	768
VI. IMPACT OF THE LOCATION OF THE STAFF RETIREMENT PLAN ON ITS TAX STATUS	769
VII. EXTENSION OF STAFF RETIREMENT PLAN BENEFITS TO RECIPIENTS OF REDUNDANCY PACKAGES	770
ATTACHMENT	771
PART SIX	
COOPERATION WITH INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS	
CHAPTER 31	
THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE BANK AND THE FUND – DISTINCT AND OVERLAPPING RESPONSIBILITIES	773
INTRODUCTION	773
I. THE ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT	773
A. The Articles' Provisions	773
B. Drafting History	776
1. <i>Two Institutions</i>	776
2. <i>Development as an Incidental Purpose of the Fund</i>	776
3. <i>Stabilization Loans</i>	777
4. <i>Membership Requirements</i>	778
II. THE EVOLUTION OF THE RELATIONSHIP	778
A. Questions of Competence and the Need for Close Collaboration	778
1. <i>The 1949 Memoranda</i>	778
2. <i>The Bank-Fund 1966 Statements on Competence</i>	780
B. Procedures for Collaboration	781
1. <i>The 1966 Outline of Procedures</i>	781

2. <i>The 1970 Detailed Procedural Framework</i>	781
3. <i>The 1980 Review of Collaboration</i>	782
C. Convergence of Interests since the Mid-1970s	782
D. The 1989 Memorandum on Bank-Fund Collaboration	784
E. The 1992 Memorandum on Collaboration on the States of the Former Soviet Union	787
F. The 1995 "Agreement" on Bank-Fund Collaboration on Public Expenditure Work	789
G. The April 1997 Agreement on Bank-Fund Collaboration in Strengthening Financial Sectors	790
H. The September 1998 Review of and Report on Bank-Fund Collaboration	792
1. <i>The September 1998 Review of Bank-Fund Collaboration in Strengthening Financial Systems</i>	792
2. <i>The September 1998 Pilot Program for Enhanced Bank-Fund Collaboration in Low-Income Countries</i>	794
3. <i>The September 1998 Report on the Bank-Fund Collaboration</i>	794
I. Common Concern for Special Policy	794
CONCLUSION	795
ANNEX - Purposes of the Bank and Fund as Stated in the Articles of Agreement	796
- Article I of the Articles of Agreement of the Bank	796
- Article I of the Articles of Agreement of the Fund	797

CHAPTER 32

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE UNITED NATIONS AND THE WORLD BANK

I. A GENERAL OVERVIEW	799
Introduction	799
A. The Articles of Agreement of the Bank	800
B. The Charter of the United Nations	801
C. The Relationship Agreement	802
D. The Reform of the United Nations in the Economic and Related Fields	805
Conclusions	806
II. EFFECT OF SECURITY COUNCIL DECISIONS ON BANK OPERATIONS -THE CASE OF YUGOSLAVIA	808
III. IS IT POSSIBLE FOR THE WORLD BANK TO BE INVOLVED IN THE FINANCING OF THE UN BUDGET?	810
A. IBRD Loans and Guarantees	810
B. IDA Credits	812
C. Other Modes of Financing	812
D. Conclusions	813

CHAPTER 33	
THE WORLD BANK AND HUMAN RIGHTS – A PRESENTATION BEFORE THE 1993 UN WORLD CONFERENCE ON HUMAN RIGHTS	815
PART SEVEN MISCELLANEOUS ISSUES	
CHAPTER 34	
SOME LEGAL ASPECTS OF THE BANK’S POLICY ON DISCLOSURE OF INFORMATION	819
I. INTRODUCTION	819
II. CURRENT DISCLOSURE POLICY - A BRIEF ACCOUNT	819
A. Directive on Disclosure of Information	819
B. Environment-Related Operational Directives	821
C. Directive on Involving NGOs in Bank-Supported Activities	823
D. Disclosure of Information under the Global Environment Facility	823
III. LEGAL LIMITS ON CHANGES IN CURRENT POLICIES	824
IV. REQUIREMENTS IN U.S. LEGISLATION AND REGULATIONS REGARDING DISCLOSURE OF INFORMATION BY THE BANK	827
A. The Pelosi Amendment	827
B. New U.S. Federal “Temporary Rule” regarding Access to Environmental Assessments	828
1. <i>Project Listings</i>	828
2. <i>EIA Summaries</i>	828
3. <i>EIA Reports</i>	828
V. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	829
POSTSCRIPT	831
CHAPTER 35	
DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE ISSUES	833
I. THE ROLE OF THE DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE - A LEGAL ANALYSIS	833
A. The Mandate of the Development Committee	833
B. The Proper Function of Committees of the Board of Governors of the Bank	835
II. ROLE OF THE BANK’S EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS IN THE PREPARATION OF THE WORK OF THE DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE - A REVIEW OF RELEVANT TEXTS	836
Introduction	836
A. General Powers of the Board of Executive Directors	836
B. Mandate of the Development Committee	837
C. Preparation of Work: Role of Executive Directors	838
1. <i>Original Procedures</i>	838

2. <i>Reviews of the Performance of the Committee</i>	839
(a). <i>The 1976 Review by the Executive Directors</i>	839
(b). <i>The 1978 Review and the 1979 Arrangements</i>	840
(c). <i>The 1981 Review and The 1983 Memorandum</i>	842
(d). <i>The 1987 Review of the Role of Executive Secretary</i>	844
D. Preparation of Staff Papers for the Committee	845
E. The Interim Committee	846
F. Summary and Conclusion	846
POSTSCRIPT	848
CHAPTER 36	
ESTABLISHMENT BY THE WORLD BANK OF A SUBSIDIARY UNDER DOMESTIC LAW-LEGAL ISSUES	851
I. INTRODUCTION	851
II. THE BANK'S POWER TO ESTABLISH A SUBSIDIARY	852
III. IBRD LIABILITY FOR WBB TRANSACTIONS	859
IV. CONCLUSIONS	863
CHAPTER 37	
OTHER ISSUES	865
I. APPOINTMENT OF THE BANK'S EXTERNAL AUDITORS- LEGISLATIVE HISTORY OF ARTICLE V, SECTION 13(a), OF THE IBRD ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT AND BY-LAWS SECTION 19 (AUDIT)	865
A. Article V, Section 13 (a) Drafting History	865
B. By-Laws, Section 19 Drafting History	866
C. Early Practice	867
II. THE WORLD BANK GUIDELINES ON THE TREATMENT OF FOREIGN DIRECT INVESTMENT	868
A. Introduction and Background	868
B. Follow Up Action	870
III. THE BANK'S ROLE AS A MEDIATOR IN ECONOMIC DISPUTES INVOLVING MEMBER COUNTRIES	871
IV. MIGA ISSUES	872
A. The MIGA Convention, Signature, Ratification and Participation in the Preparatory Committee	872
B. Answers to Questions Related to MIGA	873
INDEX	877
PUBLICATIONS BY THE AUTHOR	893