

Ibn Taymiyya and the Attributes of God

Islamic Philosophy, Theology and Science

TEXTS AND STUDIES

Edited by

Hans Daiber
Anna Akasoy
Emilie Savage-Smith

VOLUME 125

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/ipts

Ibn Taymiyya and the Attributes of God

By

Farid Suleiman

Translated from the German by

Carl Sharif El-Tobgui



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: Laysa ka-mithlihi shay'un wa-huwa l-samī'u l-baṣīr ("There is nothing like unto Him, and He is the All-Hearing, the All-Seeing," Q. 42:11). Cover calligraphy by Nihad Nadam, 2022.

The translation of this work was funded by Geisteswissenschaften International—Translation Funding for Work in the Humanities and Social Sciences from Germany, a joint initiative of the Fritz Thyssen Foundation, the German Federal Foreign Office, the collecting society VG WORT, and the Börsenverein des Deutschen Buchhandels (German Publishers & Booksellers Association). Suleiman, Farid. *Ibn Taymiyya und die Attribute Gottes* © Walter de Gruyter GmbH Berlin Boston. All rights reserved. This work may not be translated or copied in whole or in part without the written permission of the publisher (Walter De Gruyter GmbH, Genthiner Straße 13, 10785 Berlin, Germany).

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Suleiman, Farid, author. | El-Tobgui, Carl Sharif, 1974- translator.

Title: Ibn Taymiyya and the attributes of God / by Farid Suleiman ; translated from the German by Carl Sharif El-Tobgui.

Other titles: Ibn Taymiyya und die Attribute Gottes. English

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2023. | Series: Islamic philosophy, theology and science, 0169-8729 ; volume 125 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023045796 (print) | LCCN 2023045797 (ebook) |

ISBN 9789004499898 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004499904 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Ibn Taymiyah, Aḥmad ibn 'Abd al-Ḥalīm, 1263–1328. | God (Islam)—Attributes. | Islam—History of doctrines.

Classification: LCC BP80.I29 S8513 2023 (print) | LCC BP80.I29 (ebook) |

DDC 297.2/112—dc23/eng/20231002

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2023045796>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2023045797>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 0169-8729

ISBN 978-90-04-49989-8 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-49990-4 (e-book)

DOI 10.1163/9789004499904

Copyright 2024 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements (to the English translation)	IX
Acknowledgements (of original German version)	X
List of Figures and Tables	XII

1	Introduction	1
1	State of the Field	4
2	Objectives and Approach	9
3	Overview of the Works of Ibn Taymiyya Most Frequently Used in This Study	13

PART 1

Ibn Taymiyya's Biography and the History of the Divine Attributes in Islamic Thought before His Time

2	Ibn Taymiyya's Biography	23
3	The Divine Attributes in Islamic Intellectual History up to the Time of Ibn Taymiyya	38
1	The Emergence of the Debate over the Divine Attributes in Early Islam	39
2	The Mu'tazila	41
3	The <i>Falāsifa</i>	49
4	<i>Ahl al-Ḥadīth</i>	58
5	The Ash'arīs	81

PART 2

The Methodological Foundations of Ibn Taymiyya's Doctrine of the Divine Attributes

4	Ontological Foundations	95
1	The Term <i>wujūd</i> : Meaning and Gradations	95
2	Likeness (<i>mīthl, tamāthul</i>) and Similarity (<i>shibh, tashābuh, ishtibāh</i>) among Existent Things	99
3	Ibn Taymiyya's Ontological Conceptualism	103
3.1	<i>The Onto-linguistic Perspective: The Relationship between Universal Concepts and the External World</i>	107

- 3.2 *The Ontological-Epistemological Perspective: On Causality* 110
- 3.3 *The Ontological–Natural Philosophical Perspective: On Space and Time* 116
- 4 Ibn Taymiyya's Critique of the Doctrine of the Unity of Being (*waḥdat al-wujūd*) in Speculative Sufism 125
- 5 **Linguistic Foundations** 141
- 1 The *ḥaqīqa–majāz* Dichotomy 141
- 1.1 *Ibn Taymiyya's Critique of the ḥaqīqa–majāz Dichotomy* 143
- 1.2 *Did Ibn Taymiyya Hold Different Positions on the ḥaqīqa–majāz Dichotomy?* 152
- 2 On the Semantic Relationship of Homonymous Expressions: Ibn Taymiyya's Linguistic Counterproposal to the *ḥaqīqa–majāz* Dichotomy 155
- 3 What Are the Theological Consequences of Ibn Taymiyya's Alternative to the *ḥaqīqa–majāz* Dichotomy? 167
- 6 **Hermeneutical Foundations** 173
- 1 Verse Q. 3:7—Ibn Taymiyya's Understanding of the Terms *muḥkam*, *mutashābih*, and *ta'wīl* 173
- 1.1 *The Term ta'wīl* 176
- 1.2 *The Opposite Pair muḥkam and mutashābih* 183
- 1.3 *Verse Q. 3:7—A Crossroads in Quranic Hermeneutics?* 188
- 2 Ibn Taymiyya's Challenge to the Validity of *ta'wīl majāzī*: Attempting to Limit the Scope of Application of the Universal Rule (*al-qānūn al-kullī*) 192
- 2.1 *The Ash'arīs and the Universal Rule* 192
- 2.2 *Conditions for the Validity of ta'wīl majāzī* 199
- 3 The Two Principles and the Seven Basic Rules for Interpreting the Divine Attributes 209
- 7 **Epistemological Foundations** 222
- 1 On the Applicability of *qiyās* in Theology 222
- 1.1 *Qiyās in Islamic Theology before Ibn Taymiyya* 224
- 1.2 *Ibn Taymiyya's View on qiyās: A Further Development of al-Āmidī's Position* 235
- 1.3 *Ibn Taymiyya's Critique of His Opponents* 246
- 1.4 *Evaluating Ibn Taymiyya's Position* 250

- 2 The Epistemic Value of Textual Indicants: Ibn Taymiyya in Debate
with al-Rāzī 252
- 8 Summary 267

PART 3

The Divine Essence and Attributes in Focus

- 9 Temporally Originating States and Acts (*ḥawādith*) in the Divine
Essence 277
- 10 Case Studies of Selected Divine Attributes 284
- 1 *al-ʿadl*: God's Justice 284
- 2 *al-kalām*: God's Speech 293
- 3 *al-istiwāʾ*: God's Rising over His Throne 307
- 4 *al-maʿīyya*: God's "Withness" 321
- 11 Summary 326
- 12 Evaluation and Conclusion 329
- Bibliography 337
- Index of Quranic Verses 377
- Index of People and Subjects 378

Acknowledgements (to the English translation)

A few years ago, the thought that I would one day hold in my hands an English translation of my book on Ibn Taymiyya's doctrine of the divine attributes seemed possible but not very likely. What I would not have dared to imagine, however, is that I would be fortunate enough to receive funding through a very competitive grant, to find a translator who is both an internationally acknowledged expert on Ibn Taymiyya and fluent in (not just) all three languages relevant to the translation project (English, German, and Arabic), and to find a home for the translation in a highly esteemed monograph series at an unusually experienced and professional publishing house. But this is exactly what has happened, and I acknowledge with gratefulness the efforts of all those involved in the process.

At an early stage of that process, I enjoyed the support of De Gruyter, among whose staff I would like to thank especially Christina Lembrecht and Maxim Karagodin. Furthermore, I wish to express my gratitude to Jon Hoover and Ahmed El Shamsy for their encouragement of this translation and for their recommendation letters that significantly strengthened my application for funding. This brings me also to acknowledge my indebtedness to the Börsenverein des deutschen Buchhandels, for without their funding this book would never have seen the light of day.

While securing the financial resources was an enormous step forward, no less important was it to secure a suitable translator. In Carl Sharif El-Tobgui, himself the author of an immensely erudite piece of scholarship on Ibn Taymiyya published in the same series, I found not only a person suited to the task but indeed the best I could have imagined. To him I owe my deepest gratitude for his agreeing without hesitation to take on the time-consuming and laborious task of translating the 400-page original German version of my work and for the fact that throughout the process, he carried out this task with utmost care and concern for detail.

Last but not least I offer a particular note of thanks to Abdurraouf Oueslati at Brill, who provided invaluable guidance throughout the process of publication, as well as to the editors of the Islamic Philosophy, Theology and Science series for accepting to include my book therein.

Wa-mā tawfīqī illā billāh.

Acknowledgements (of original German version)

The present work is a lightly revised version of my doctoral dissertation, entitled “The Methodological Foundations of Ibn Taymiyya’s Doctrine on the Divine Attributes, with an Analysis of Selected Attributes,”¹ which I completed at the Friedrich-Alexander University Erlangen-Nuremberg in September 2017 and defended in July 2018. My primary supervisor, Prof. Abbas Poya, who accepted me as a PhD student in 2013 into a junior research group funded by the Federal Ministry of Education and Research under his direction, accompanied me graciously throughout this project, always with an open ear. It was he who honed my eye to focus on the essentials and who worked to ensure that I had enough time to complete the dissertation despite the many other obligations of university life. For this I extend to him a special note of thanks. I would also like to thank my secondary reader, Prof. Benjamin Jokisch, as well as Prof. Maha El Kaisy-Friemuth, who agreed to act as a third reviewer when the need arose.

I also owe a debt of gratitude to Prof. Frank Griffel, who took the time to discuss portions of this work with me, as well as Prof. Jon Hoover, who allowed me to present and discuss a chapter of this work in a doctoral seminar of his at the University of Nottingham. I would like to draw particular attention to the dedication of Yusuf Kuhn, who read the entire manuscript attentively and, through his well-informed remarks, contributed considerably to the quality of the work. Even in those cases where we continued to see things differently even after extensive discussion, I always came away with the feeling that I had gained a stronger understanding of the topic discussed. I would also like to thank Dr Thomas Hildebrandt for his eminently meticulous copyediting. Any residual errors or deficiencies—which, without the assistance of the aforementioned persons, would certainly have been more numerous and more substantial than they are—remain, naturally, my responsibility alone.

I would like to express my thanks to the editors at De Gruyter, particularly Prof. Ulrich Rudolph, for accepting this work for publication in the series *Worlds of Islam*. I also extend my gratitude to the anonymous reviewers who participated in the peer review process. Additional thanks go to Dr Christina Lembrecht, Ms Albina Töws, and Ms Gabrielle Cornefert at De Gruyter for

¹ Original title: “Die methodischen Grundlagen der Attributenlehre Ibn Taymiyyas. Mit einer Analyse ausgewählter göttlicher Attribute,” published as Farid Suleiman, *Ibn Taymiyya und die Attribute Gottes* (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2019).

their constantly friendly, competent, and patient editorial support. I also thank the Swiss Asia Society for generously assuming the full costs of printing and publication.

I cannot express adequate thanks here for all the emotional support that I have received from my family, most especially my parents. The same goes for my wife, Rozan Suleiman, who, with her excellent knowledge of Classical Arabic, also helped me decipher many a cryptic passage in Ibn Taymiyya's works. To them I say from the bottom of my heart: *Jazākum Allāhu khayran!*

Figures and Tables

Figures

- 1 Ibn Taymiyya's conception of space (*makān/hayyiz*) 121
- 2 Ibn Taymiyya's categorisation of homonymous terms with respect to their semantic relationship to one another 161
- 3 Ibn Taymiyya's categorisation of the Quranic terms *ihkām* and *tashābuh* 187

Tables

- 1 Overview of Ibn Taymiyya's detentions 35