

A Companion to the Abbey of Cluny in the Middle Ages

Brill's Companions to European History

VOLUME 27

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/bceh

A Companion to the Abbey of Cluny in the Middle Ages

Edited by

Scott G. Bruce and Steven Vanderputten



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Steven Vanderputten wishes to acknowledge the Research Foundation-Flanders (FWO) for financially supporting his work on this volume in the context of the project “The Quest for Otherness. Uncovering Narratives of Religious Distinction in the Long Tenth Century’ (2020–24).

Cover illustration: Duke William Founds the Abbey of Cluny, from Paris, BNF Latin 17716, fol. 85. Copyright Bibliothèque Nationale de France.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Bruce, Scott G. (Scott Gordon), 1967- editor. | Vanderputten, Steven, editor.

Title: A companion to the Abbey of Cluny in the Middle Ages / edited by Scott G. Bruce, and Steven Vanderputten.

Description: Boston, Massachusetts : Brill, [2022] | Series: Brill's companions to European history, 2212-7410 ; vol 27 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021042741 (print) | LCCN 2021042742 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004470132 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004499232 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Cluny (Benedictine abbey)—History—To 1500.

Classification: LCC BX2615.C63 C66 2022 (print) | LCC BX2615.C63 (ebook) | DDC 271/.14—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021042741>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021042742>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: “Brill”. See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2212-7410

ISBN 978-90-04-47013-2 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-49923-2 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau Verlag and V&R Unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

for Giles



Contents

Acknowledgements	IX
List of Illustrations	X
Abbreviations	XI
Notes on Contributors	XII

Introduction	1
<i>Steven Vanderputten and Scott G. Bruce</i>	

PART 1

A Brief History of Cluny and Cluniac Monasticism

1	Tenth-Century Cluny	11
<i>Isabelle Rosé</i>		
2	The Emergence of the <i>Ecclesia Cluniacensis</i>	34
<i>Steven Vanderputten</i>		
3	Challenges of the Twelfth Century	50
<i>Marc Saurette</i>		
4	Cluny in the Later Middle Ages and Beyond	80
<i>Denyse Riche</i>		

PART 2

Cluniac Identities

5	Imagining Early Cluny in Abbatial Biographies	105
<i>Steven Vanderputten</i>		
6	Shaping Cluniac Devotion	125
<i>Susan Boynton</i>		
7	Archaeology and the Abbey of Cluny	146
<i>Anne Baud</i>		
8	Shaping Cluniac Memory	173
<i>Sébastien Barret</i>		

PART 3***The Cares of the Cloister***

- 9 Abbatial Lordship 189
Robert F. Berkhofer III
- 10 Discipline and the Problem of Cluny's Customaries 204
Isabelle Cochelin
- 11 The General Chapter and Cluniac Legislation 223
Michael Hänchen and Gert Melville
- 12 Cluny and Religious Women 244
Eliana Magnani

PART 4***Beyond the Cloister***

- 13 Cluny and Lay Patronage 267
Constance B. Bouchard
- 14 The Problem of Cluniac Exemption 288
Benjamin Pohl
- 15 Cluny and the Crusades 306
Scott G. Bruce
- 16 The Relics of Cluny 322
Scott G. Bruce

Bibliography 341

Index 384

Acknowledgements

The editors have incurred many debts in the process of shepherding this volume from concept to printed book. They are grateful to the contributors, who shared their expertise on so many aspects of Cluniac monasticism; to the two external readers, who improved the articles with their generous reports; to Kate Hammond and Alessandra Giliberto at Brill for their editorial and practical guidance as the volume came together; to Theo Riches, who translated one of the contributions from German into English; to Susan Boynton, who translated four of the contributions from French into English; and to Sheila Bonde and Clark Maines for providing invaluable advice on the rendering of some of the technical terminology in Anne Baud's article in English. The editors would also like to thank Professor Giles Constable, who was instrumental in supporting both of their careers and with whom they spent many hours discussing the lineaments of this volume before his death in January 2021. Giles' unrivalled contributions to Cluniac studies have left their mark on almost every article in this book. It is only fitting that we dedicate this companion to Cluny to his memory.

Illustrations

- 1.1 Apse of Cluny II, Phase 2b (CEM 2010) 20
- 1.2 Reconstruction of the altar of Cluny II (drawing by G. Fèvre, CEM) 21
- 1.3 The first four Cluniac multi-abbacies 26
- 1.4 How Odo of Cluny's multi-abbacy was divided after his death 27
- 1.5 The ecclesiology of Odo of Cluny 30
- 6.1 The dedication of the high altars in Cluny III, 1095 (Paris, BNF, Latin 17716, fol. 91r) 144
- 7.1 The south arm of the main transept (photograph by J. P. Gobillot) 147
- 7.2 The "anonymous plan" (Musée Ochier) 148
- 7.3 A page from Conant's daybook (Centre des Monuments Nationaux) 150
- 7.4 Bird's eye view of the medieval monastery from the east by K. J. Conant 151
- 7.5 Restoration of the Carolingian *domus villae* (Centre d'études médiévales) 154
- 7.6 The masonry tomb and sarcophagus of Ava (Centre d'études médiévales) 156
- 7.7 Restoration of the altar of the second abbey church (Centre d'études médiévales) 158
- 7.8 Reliquary urn of Saint Peter (Centre des Monuments Nationaux) 159
- 7.9 Archaeological plan of the eastern part of the monastery in the late eleventh century (DAO CEM and UMR ArAr 5138) 160
- 7.10 The south arm of the great transept, interior view (photograph by J. P. Gobillot) 163
- 7.11 Drawing of the west wall of the south arm of the great transept, interior facing, showing the distribution of building stones (A. Baud, A. Allimant, G. Macabéo, DAO A. Lorphelin) 164
- 7.12 Capital on the south arm of the great transept representing animals facing each other (photograph by J. P. Gobillot) 165
- 7.13 Thirteenth-century chapter house; detail of a pillar on the west wall and paving stones reused in the eighteenth century (photograph by A. Baud) 166
- 7.14 Excavation of the fourteenth-century kitchen or apothecary in the infirmary (photograph by UMR ArAr 5138) 168
- 7.15 Treasure discovered during the 2017 excavation campaign (photograph by CREAM) 168
- 7.16 Signet ring with ancient engraving (photograph by Laboratory IRAMAT) 169
- 7.17 Medieval guesthouse (photograph by A. Baud) 171
- 11.1 Action, text, and validity in Cluniac Legislation 233

Abbreviations

- AASS *Acta sanctorum quotquot toto orbe coluntur*, ed. Jean Bolland et al., Antwerp, 1643–1940
- ASOB *Acta sanctorum ordinis sancti Benedicti in saeculorum classes distributa*, ed. Jean Mabillon, 9 vols., Paris, 1668–1701
- BB *Recueil des chartes de l'abbaye de Cluny*, ed. A. Bernard et A. Bruel, 6 vols., Paris, 1876–1903 (cited by volume, page, and charter number)
- BC *Bibliotheca Cluniacensis*, ed. Martin Marrier and André Duchesne, Paris, 1614; repr. Mâcon, 1915
- Bernard Bernard of Cluny, *Ordo Cluniacensis sive Consuetudines*, ed. M. Herrgott, in *Vetus Disciplina Monastica*, Paris, 1726; repr. Siegburg, 1999, pp. 136–364 (cited by book, chapter, and page number)
- BHL *Bibliotheca hagiographica latina antiquae et mediae aetatis*, 2 vols., Brussels, 1898–1901, with supplemental volumes published in 1911 and 1986 (cited by BHL number)
- BNF Bibliothèque nationale de France
- CCCM Corpus Christianorum: Continuatio Mediaevalis
- CCM *Corpus consuetudinum monasticarum*, Siegburg, 1963–
- CHMM *The Cambridge History of Medieval Monasticism in the Latin West*, ed. Alison I. Beach and Isabelle Cochelin, 2 vols., Cambridge, 2020
- DM Peter the Venerable, *De miraculis libri duo*, ed. Denise Bouthillier, CCCM 83, Turnhout, 1988 (cited by book, chapter, and page number)
- Letters *The Letters of Peter the Venerable*, ed. Giles Constable, 2 vols., Cambridge, MA, 1967
- PL *Patrologia Cursus Completus: Series Latina*, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne, 221 vols., Paris, 1844–88
- Statuts *Statuts, Chapitres Généraux et Visites de l'ordre de Cluny*, ed. Dom G. Charvin, 9 vols., Paris, 1965–82
- VPV Ralph of Sully, *Vita Petri Venerabilis*, ed. Edmond Martène, in *Veterum scriptorum et monumentorum historicorum dogmaticorum et moralium amplissima collectio*, 9 vols., Paris, 1724–33, vol. 6, cols. 1187–1202; repr. in PL 189, cols. 15–28 (cited by chapter and column numbered from the PL reprint)

Notes on Contributors

Sébastien Barret

is a researcher at the Institut de recherche et d'histoire des textes (IRHT). He is the author of *La mémoire et l'écrit: L'abbaye de Cluny et ses archives (Xe-XVIIIe siècle)* (Lit Verlag, 2004). Besides Cluny, his scholarly interests include diplomatics, palaeography, the edition of charters, and more generally the history of written culture in medieval Europe.

Anne Baud

is maître de conférences in Archaeology at the University of Lyon 2 (France). She has published many studies on the physical remains of Cluny and its churches based on her ground-breaking archaeological excavations, including most recently (with Christian Sapin and others) *Cluny: Les origines du monastère et de ses églises* (CTHS, 2019).

Robert F. Berkhofer III

is Associate Professor of Medieval History in the Department of History at Western Michigan University. He is the author of *Days of Reckoning: Power and Accountability in Medieval France* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004). His research focuses on the social and cultural history of England, France, and Flanders from 900 to 1200, with special attention to monastic documentary culture and historical writings.

Constance B. Bouchard

is Distinguished Professor emerita at the University of Akron, who specializes in the social and ecclesiastical history of France, 500–1200. Her major monographs are *Sword, Miter, and Cloister: Nobility and the Church in Burgundy, 980–1198* (Cornell University Press, 1987), *Those of My Blood: Creating Noble Families in Medieval Francia* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001), and *Rewriting Saints and Ancestors: Memory and Forgetting in France, 500–1200* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015). Her forthcoming book is about the French peasantry. She has also published editions of five French cartularies, most recently *The Cartulary-Chronicle of St-Pierre of Bèze* (Medieval Academy Books, 2019).

Susan Boynton

is Professor of Music at Columbia University. She is a medievalist and musicologist with research interests in the liturgy and chant of Latin monasticism, music and childhood, musical iconography, liturgical drama, troubadour song, and

the history of the Hispanic rite in the early modern period. She is the author of *Shaping a Monastic Identity: Liturgy and History at the Imperial Abbey of Farfa, 1000–1125* (Cornell University Press, 2006) as well as co-editor of *Gesta* and the interdisciplinary book series *Disciplina Monastica* (Brepols).

Scott G. Bruce

is Professor of Medieval History at Fordham University in the Bronx, New York. An historian of religion and culture in the early and central Middle Ages (c. 400–1200 CE), his research interests include monasticism, hagiography, and the reception of classical and patristic traditions in medieval Europe. He has published several books on the abbey of Cluny, including *Silence and Sign Language in Medieval Monasticism: The Cluniac Tradition* (c. 900–1200) (Cambridge University Press, 2007), *Cluny and the Muslims of La Garde-Freinet: Hagiography and the Problem of Islam in Medieval Europe* (Cornell University Press, 2015); and (with Christopher A. Jones), *The Relatio metrica de duobus ducibus: A Twelfth-Century Cluniac Poem on Prayer for the Dead* (Brepols, 2016).

Isabelle Cochelin

is Associate Professor at the University of Toronto, working on male monasticism in the central Middle Ages and focusing on less studied groups and spaces of monastic communities. Her most recent publication is the *Cambridge History of Medieval Monasticism in the Latin West*, 2 vols. (Cambridge University Press, 2020), co-edited with Alison Beach. She is co-editing a collection of essays with Diane Wolfthal on servants in Western Europe between 1000 and 1700 and her new collaborative research project concerns non-cloistered religious women between 1100 and 1800.

Michael Hänchen

is a historian at FOVOG – Dresden. He studied medieval history, Saxon regional history, and political science, and received his doctorate from the Technische Universität Dresden. His research interests are medieval historiography and the legitimation of rule, medieval diplomatics and endowments, as well as the institutional history and organizational practice of medieval orders.

Eliana Magnani

is a researcher at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS). She is a social historian of the early and central Middle Ages, working on gift exchange, literacy, and digital humanities. Among her recent publications, she has edited *Reconstituer, composer, corréler, compiler: Productions et pratiques sociales de l'écrit médiéval en Bourgogne* (Presses Universitaires de Rennes, 2021).

Gert Melville

is Professor Emeritus of History at the Technische Universität Dresden. A specialist on the history of monastic orders in the high Middle Ages, he is the author of many influential articles about the abbey of Cluny and editor of the book series *Vita regularis* (LIT Verlag). His most recent book is *The World of Medieval Monasticism: Its History and Forms of Life*, trans. James D. Mixson (Cistercian Publications, 2016).

Benjamin Pohl

is Senior Lecturer in Medieval History, Programme Director of the MA in Medieval Studies, and International Co-Director of the School of Humanities at the University of Bristol. His research focuses on medieval monastic history and manuscript culture with a specialisation in codicology, palaeography, and cultural memory studies. He is the author of *Dudo of Saint-Quentin's Historia Normannorum: Tradition, Innovation, and Memory* (York Medieval Press, 2015).

Denyse Riche

is maître de conférences honoraire in Medieval History at the University of Lyon 2 (France). She is a historian of the monastic orders, principally in the central and late Middle Ages. She has published many studies on the order of Cluny, including *L'ordre de Cluny à la fin du Moyen Âge. Le "vieux pays clunisien" XIIe-XVe siècle* (CERCOR, 2000); and (with O. Hurel), *Cluny: De l'abbaye à l'ordre clunisien Xe-XVIIIe siècle* (Armand Colin, 2010).

Isabelle Rosé

is Lecturer in Medieval History at the University of Rennes 2 (France). She is the author of *Construire une société seigneuriale: Itinéraire et ecclésiologie de l'abbé Odon de Cluny (fin du IX^e-milieu du X^e siècle)* (Brepols, 2008) and many articles about the history of early Cluny. She is currently writing a book about the prohibition of clerical marriage in the Middle Ages.

Marc Saurette

is Associate Professor of History/Medieval and Early Modern Studies at Carleton University (Ottawa, Canada), where he regularly offers courses in the history of the Middle Ages, gamifying medieval society, and digitizing manuscripts. His research focuses on the writings of Peter the Venerable and his writing circle in the twelfth-century *ecclesia Cluniacensis*. He is currently developing a project to make the writings of Peter and other Cluniac monks more accessible online.

Steven Vanderputten

is Full Professor of Early and High Medieval History at Ghent University. His research is primarily concerned with the development, societal embedding, and culture of monastic groups between *circa* 800 and 1200, and covers a wide range of subjects, including the shaping of collective identities, leadership and institutional dynamics, discourses and realities of ecclesiastical and religious reform, and gendered identities. He is the author of many books, including, most recently, *Imagining Religious Leadership in the Middle Ages: Richard of Saint-Vanne and the Politics of Reform* (Cornell University Press, 2015); *Dark Age Nunneries: The Ambiguous Identity of Female Monasticism, 800–1050* (Cornell University Press, 2018); and *Medieval Monasticisms: Forms and Experiences of the Monastic Life in the Latin West* (De Gruyter/Oldenbourg, 2020).