

# NOTES

## Chapter One

1. Plato, *Charmides*, 166. Cf. *The Dialogues of Plato*, B. Jowett, trans. (New York, Random House, 1937), Vol. 1, p. 17.
2. Immanuel Kant, *Prolegomena* (Rīga, Prussia: Johann Friedrich Hartknoch, 1783), trans. here by Robert S. Hartman. Cf. Paul Carus, *Kant's Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics* (Chicago: Open Court Pub. Co., 1949), p. 140.
3. *Ibid.*, p. 143.
4. Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value: Foundations of Scientific Axiology* (Carbondale and Edwardsville, Ill.: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), pp. 121–131.
5. *Ibid.*, pp. 31–43, 69–92. See also Robert S. Hartman, “The Logical Difference Between Philosophy and Science,” *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 23 (March 1963), pp. 353–379.
6. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 43–54, 101–106.
7. See Robert S. Hartman, “La Creación de una Ética Científica,” *Dianoia*, 1 (1955), pp. 205–235.
8. G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), Sect. 75 ff., pp. 126 ff.
9. See Robert S. Hartman, “Crítica Axiológica de la Ética de Kant,” *Revista Mexicana de Filosofía*, 1 (1958), pp. 75–84; “The Logic of Description and Valuation,” *Review of Metaphysics*, 14 (December 1960), pp. 206–207; *The Structure of Value*, pp. 265 ff.
10. Gottlob Frege, *Die Grundlagen der Arithmetik* (Breslau, Poland: M. & H. Marcus, 1934), p. 34.
11. Rudolf Carnap, “Intellectual Autobiography,” *The Philosophy of Rudolf Carnap*. Paul A. Schilpp, ed. (La Salle, Ill.: Open Court Pub. Co., 1963), p. 6.
12. Bertrand Russell, *Our Knowledge of the External World* (London: G. Allen & Unwin, 1952), p. 191.
13. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, pp. 12–15.
14. *Ibid.*
15. Sigmund Freud, *New Introductory Lectures on Psycho-Analysis* (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1933), p. 227.
16. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 3.
17. Herbert Butterfield, *The Origins of Modern Science* (New York: Free Press, 1957), p. 5.
18. Kant, *Prolegomena*. Cf. Carus, *Kant's Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics*, p. 9.
19. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 15.
20. John Locke, *Some Thoughts Concerning Education* (Menston, England: Scholar Press, 1970); and *Essay Concerning Human Understanding* (New York: Dover Publications, 1959), Bk. 3, Ch. 11, Sects. 15–18; Bk. 4, Ch. 3, Sects. 18–20, Ch. 4, Sects. 5–10, Ch. 12, Sects. 7–8; “Epistle to the Reader,” par. 15.
21. C. G. Jung, *Psychology and Alchemy* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1953); and C. G. Jung, *The Interpretation of Nature and the Psyche* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1955).

22. Brand Blanshard, *The Impasse in Ethics and a Way Out* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1955), p. 111.
23. *Ibid.*, p. 94.
24. *Ibid.*
25. H. A. Prichard, "Does Moral Philosophy Rest on a Mistake?" *Mind*, 21 (1912), pp. 21–37.
26. Blanshard, *The Impasse in Ethics and a Way Out*, p. 95.
27. W. D. Ross, *The Right and the Good* (Oxford, England: The Clarendon Press, 1930); and *Foundations of Ethics* (Oxford, England: The Clarendon Press, 1939).
28. Blanshard, *The Impasse in Ethics and a Way Out*, p. 95.
29. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 342–343, note 6.
30. Blanshard, *The Impasse in Ethics and a Way Out*, pp. 97–98.
31. *Ibid.*, p. 99.
32. *Ibid.*, pp. 99–100.
33. G. E. Moore, *Ethics* (London: Oxford University Press, 1911).
34. Blanshard, *The Impasse in Ethics and a Way Out*, p. 100.
35. *Ibid.*, pp. 100–101.
36. A. J. Ayer, *Language, Truth and Logic* (London: V. Gollancz, 1936), p. 108; quoted by Blanshard, *The Impasse in Ethics and a Way Out*, p. 101.
37. Blanshard, *ibid.*, p. 101.
38. *Ibid.*, p. 102.
39. *Ibid.*, p. 103.
40. *Ibid.*, p. 104.
41. *Ibid.*, p. 105.
42. *Ibid.*
43. *Ibid.*, p. 106.
44. *Ibid.*, p. 107.
45. *Ibid.*, pp. 107–108.
46. *Ibid.*, p. 109.
47. *Ibid.*
48. *Ibid.*, p. 110.
49. *Ibid.*
50. *Ibid.*, pp. 110–111.
51. *Ibid.*, p. 111.
52. *Ibid.*, p. 112.
53. Brand Blanshard, *Reason and Goodness* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1961), p. 269.
54. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 101–106.
55. Thomas Hill, *Contemporary Ethical Theories* (New York: Macmillan, 1950), p. 354.
56. *Ibid.*
57. *Ibid.*, p. 315.
58. *Ibid.* See also G. E. Moore, *Philosophical Studies* (London: Routledge & K. Paul, 1922), pp. 271 ff., and p. 275; and Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 131–149.
59. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 20.
60. Thomas Hill, *Ethics in Theory and Practice* (New York: Crowell, 1956).
61. Robert S. Hartman, "Value, Fact and Science," *Philosophy of Science*, 25 (April 1958), pp. 97–108; *The Structure of Value*, pp. 215–228; and Paul W. Taylor,

"The Normative Function of Metaethics," *Philosophical Review*, 67 (January 1958), p. 29.

62. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 58–60.

## Chapter Two

1. Goethe to Zelter.

2. Tobias Dantzig, *Number: The Language of Science* (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1930).

3. Edwin Arthur Burt, *The Metaphysical Foundations of Modern Physical Science* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1954), p. 76.

4. William H. Werkmeister, *Theories of Ethics* (Lincoln, Neb.: Johnsen Pub. Co., 1961), pp. 409 ff.

5. Henry Lanz, *In Quest of Morals* (Stanford, Cal.: Stanford University Press, 1941).

6. Albert L. Hilliard, *The Forms of Value* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1950).

7. Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Judgment* (New York: Hafner Press, 1974), First Introduction, Sect. 5.

8. *Ibid.*, Sect. 6.

9. A. C. Ewing, "A Suggested Non-Naturalistic Analysis of Good," *Mind*, 48 (1939) in *Readings in Ethical Theory*, eds. Wilfrid Sellars and John Hospers (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1952), pp. 231–249; and *The Definition of Good* (New York: Macmillan, 1949), Ch. 5.

10. G. E. Moore, "Freedom," *Mind*, (1897). Quoted by L. Susan Stebbing in "Moore's Influence," *The Philosophy of G. E. Moore*, ed. Paul A. Schilpp (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University, 1942), p. 520.

11. See Senator J. William Fulbright, "The University and American Foreign Policy," *Center Diary*, 12 (May-June 1966). Santa Barbara, Cal.: Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions.

12. H. A. Prichard, "Does Moral Philosophy Rest on a Mistake?" *Mind*, 21 (1912), pp. 21–37. See also D. Z. Phillips, "Does it Pay to Be Good?" *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, (1964–1965), pp. 45–60.

13. Henry Margenau, *The Nature of Physical Reality* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1950), Chs. 4 & 5; and Richard D. Braithwaite, *Scientific Explanation* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1953).

14. Bertrand Russell, *An Inquiry into Meaning and Truth* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1940), p. 131.

15. Bertrand Russell, "The Elements of Ethics," in *Readings in Ethical Theory*, eds. Wilfrid Sellars and John Hospers (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1952), p. 1.

16. Charles L. Stevenson, "The Emotive Meaning of Ethical Terms," *Mind*, 46 (1937), pp. 14–31.

17. Charles L. Stevenson, *Ethics and Language* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1944), p. 1.

18. *Ibid.*, pp. 207–209.

19. *Ibid.*, p. 21.

20. *Ibid.*, p. 207.

21. *Ibid.*, p. 272.
22. *Ibid.*, pp. 9, 134, 156 and *pass.*
23. Clarence I. Lewis, *An Analysis of Knowledge and Valuation* (La Salle, Ill.: Open Court, 1947), p. 366.
24. Stevenson, *Ethics and Language*, p. 225.
25. *Ibid.*, p. 132.
26. Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Goethe's Color Theory*. Arranged and ed. Rupprecht Matthaei (New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1971), section on Isaac Newton.
27. Charles L. Stevenson, "The Nature of Ethical Disagreement," *Sigma*, 1-2:8-9 (1947-1948); reprinted in *Great Traditions in Ethics*, eds. Ethel M. Albert, Theodore C. Denise, and Sheldon P. Peterfreund (New York: American Book Co., 1953), pp. 341-347; and *Ethics and Language*, Ch. 11, and pp. 158 ff, 185, 198-199, 222, 261, 270, 328ff.
28. A. P. Brogan, "The Fundamental Value Universal," *Journal of Philosophy*, 16:4 (1919); Edwin T. Mitchell, *A System of Ethics* (New York: Scribner, 1950); Sören Halldén, *On The Logic of "Better"* (Lund: C. W. K. Gleerup, 1957); Georg Henrik von Wright, *The Logic of Preference* (Edinburgh, Scotland: University Press, 1963).
29. Georg Henrik von Wright, *Norm and Action: A Logical Enquiry* (New York: Humanities Press, 1963).
30. R. M. Hare, *The Language of Morals* (Oxford, England: Clarendon Press, 1952); Henry Margenau, *Ethics and Science* (Princeton, N.J.: Van Nostrand, 1964).
31. Bertrand E. Jessup, *Relational Value Meanings* (Eugene, Or.: University of Oregon, 1943).
32. Edmund Husserl, *Ideen zu einer reinen Phänomenologie und Phänomenologischen Philosophie* (Den Haag: M. Nijhoff, 1976), par. 9; *Ideas: General Introduction to Pure Phenomenology* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1931), p. 54.
33. Otto Bruhlmann, *Physik und Tor der Metaphysik* (Munich, Germany: E. Reinhardt, 1935).
34. G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), p. 6.
35. Immanuel Kant, *Prolegomena* (Rīga, Prussia: Johann Friedrich Hartknoch, 1783), par. 3.
36. Daniel Christoff, *Recherche de la Liberte* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1957) and Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value* (Carbondale and Edwardsville, Ill.: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), Ch. 7, Sect. 1.
37. Immanuel Kant, *Lectures on Ethics* (London: Methuen & Co., 1930), p. 2; Paul A. Schilpp, *Kant's Pre-Critical Ethics* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University, 1938).
38. Immanuel Kant, *Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten* (Rīga, Prussia: Johann Friedrich Hartknoch, 1797), Preface and Second Section, first footnote.
39. Immanuel Kant, *Metaphysische Anfangsgruende der Naturwissenschaft, Werke*, Vol.4 (Berlin, Germany: de Gruyter, 1968), Preface.
40. Kant, *Metaphysik der Sitten* (Königsberg: F. Nicolovius, 1803), Peface.
41. Alfred North Whitehead, "Mathematics and the Good," in *The Philosophy of Alfred North Whitehead*, ed. Paul A Schlipp (New York: Tudor Pub. Co., 1951), pp. 661-681.
42. Alfred North Whitehead, "Remarks" at the session of the American Philosophical Association, 1936, *Philosophical Review*, 46 (1937), p. 186.
43. Whitehead, "Mathematics and the Good," pp. 677-678.

44. Robert S. Hartman, "Group Membership and Class Membership," *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 13:3 (1953), pp. 353–370.
45. Lanz, *In Quest of Morals*.
46. Robert S. Hartman, "The Moral Situation: A Field Theory of Ethics," *Journal of Philosophy*, 45:11 (1948), pp. 413–420.
47. Francis Hutcheson, "An Inquiry concerning Moral Good and Evil," in *British Moralists*, ed. L. A. Selby-Bigge (Oxford, England: Clarendon Press, 1897), Vol. 1, pp. 110–177.
48. Jacques Rueff, *From the Physical to the Social Sciences* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1929), Ch. 14.
49. Henry Margenau, "Remarks on Ethical Science," *The Nature of Concepts, Their Interrelation and Role in Social Structure* (Stillwater, Okla.: A. & M. College, 1950); and *Ethics and Science* (Princeton, N.J.: Van Nostrand, 1964).
50. F. S. C. Northrop, "Ethics and the Integration of Natural Knowledge," *The Nature of Concepts, Their Interrelation and Role in Social Structure* (Stillwater, Okla.: A. & M. College, 1950); and *The Logic of the Sciences and the Humanities* (New York: Macmillan Co., 1947).
51. Bertha B. Friedmann, *Foundations of the Measurement of Values* (New York: Teachers College of Columbia University, 1946).
52. Hermann Friedmann, *Wissenschaft und Symbol* (Munich, Germany: C. H. Beck, 1949).
53. Carl G. Hempel, *Fundamentals of Concept Formation in Empirical Science* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952), p. 49.
54. Ernst Manheim, *Zur Logik des Konkreten Begriffs* (Munich, Germany: Beck, 1930).
55. Brand Blanshard, *The Nature of Thought* (London: G. Allen & Unwin, 1948), Vol. 1, pp. 629 ff, 640; Vol. 2, pp. 356 ff.
56. *THE PRACTICE OF PHILOSOPHY* by Susanne Langer, © 1930 by Susanne Langer, pp. 213–214. Reprinted by permission of Henry Holt and Company, LLC.
57. *Ibid.*, p. 209.
58. *Ibid.*
59. Hartman. *The Structure of Value*. Ch. 3.
60. See J. von Uexküll, *Theoretical Biology* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1926); D'Arcy W. Thompson, *Growth and Form* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1942); Ludwig von Bertalanffy, *Das Geflüge des Lebens* (Leipzig, Germany: B. G. Teubner); C. M. Childs, *Patterns and Problems of Development* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1941); Ernst Janisach, *Das Exponential-gesetz* (Berlin, Germany: J. Springer, 1927), and "Über die mathematische Erfassung biologischer Gesetze," *Sudhoffs Archiv*, 27: 3 & 4; M. Vito Volterra and M. Umberto d'Ancona, *Les Associations Biologiques au Point de Vue Mathématique* (Paris, France: Hermann et Cie, 1935); V. A. Kostitzin, *Symbiose, Parasitisme et Évolution (Étude Mathématique)* (Paris, France: Hermann & Cie, 1934); V. A. Kostitzin, *Mathematical Biology* (London: G. G. Harrap, 1939); Friedrich Ringleb, *Mathematische Methoden der Biologie* (Leipzig, Germany: B. G. Teubner, 1937); W. M. Feldman, *Biomathematics* (New York: Hafner Pub. Co., 1954); Nicolas Rashevsky, *Mathematical Biophysics* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1938); J. H. Woodger, *The Axiomatic Method in Biology* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1937), and *The Technique of Theory Construction* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1939).

## Chapter Three

1. Benjamin Franklin, "Letter to Joseph Priestly, 8 February 1780," *Benjamin Franklin: A Biography in His Own Words*, ed. Thomas Fleming (New York: Newsweek, 1972), Vol. 2, p. 317.
2. Everett W. Hall, *Modern Science and Human Values* (Princeton, N.J.: D. Van Nostrand, 1956), pp. 105 ff, 118.
3. J. V. Langmead Casserley, *Morals and Man in the Social Sciences* (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1951), p. 76.
4. *Ibid.*, p. 73.
5. G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), p. 60.
6. *Ibid.*
7. Casserley, p. 77. Also see William H. Gass, "The Case of the Obliging Stranger," *Philosophical Review*, 66 (April 1957), pp. 193–204.
8. See Robert S. Hartman, "The Analytic and the Synthetic as Categories of Inquiry." In *Perspectives in Philosophy*, ed. Albert Aevy. (Columbus: Ohio State University, 1953), p. 63.
9. Albert Einstein, *Out of My Later Years* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1950), Chs. 13 and 16.
10. "The Kettering Mind," *Look*, 21:7 (2 April 1957), p. 87. See also D. D. Runes, ed. *The Diary and Sundry Observations of Thomas Alva Edison* (New York: Greenwood Press, 1948), p. 169.
11. Einstein, *Out of My Later Years*, pp. 60 ff.
12. *Ibid.*, p. 62.
13. *Ibid.*, p. 63.
14. *Ibid.*
15. *Ibid.* Italics supplied.
16. *Ibid.* p. 64. Italics supplied.
17. *Ibid.* Italics supplied.
18. Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value* (Carbondale and Edwardsville, Ill: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), pp. 79–92.
19. Alfred North Whitehead, *Science and the Modern World* (Cambridge: The Macmillan Co., 1933), p. 41.
20. Einstein, *Out of My Later Years*, p. 64. Compare Charles Sanders Peirce's Lowell Lecture on "Kepler," in *Values in a Universe of Chance*, ed. Philip P. Wiener (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1958), pp. 255ff.
21. Helen Evangeline Rees, *A Psychology of Artistic Creation* (New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1942).
22. See E. V. Huntington, *The Continuum* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1942), p. 32.
23. See Carl Hempel, *Fundamentals of Concept Formation in Empirical Science* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952), p. 30.
24. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 6, Sect. 3b and Ch. 7.
25. Cf. Michael Polyani, *Personal Knowledge* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1958); Norman Campbell, *What is Science?* (New York: Dover Publications, 1952), p. 94; J. Bronowski, "The Creative Process," *Scientific American*, (September 1958), pp. 58–65; and Henry Margenau, *Ethics and Science* (Princeton, N.J.: Van Nostrand, 1964), p. 2.

26. Hempel, *Fundamentals of Concept Formation in Empirical Science*, p. 30.
27. Einstein, *Out of My Later Years*, p. 78.
28. *Ibid.*, p. 83.
29. *Ibid.*, p. 64.
30. See Alfred Landé, *Foundations of Quantum Theory* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1955).
31. Einstein. *Out of My Later Years*, p. 61.
32. Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz, *Philosophical Papers and Letters*, ed. Leroy E. Loemker (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956), p. 350. See also Nicolai Hartmann, *Grundzüge einer Metaphysik der Erkenntnis* (Berlin, Germany: W. de Gruyter, 1949), pp. 67–70.
33. Hartmann, *ibid.*, pp. 63–64.
34. *Ibid.*, p. 90.
35. Albert Einstein, *Essays in Science* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1934), p. 40. Cf. Albert Einstein, *Mein Weltbild* (Amsterdam, Holland: Querido Verlag, 1934), p. 143.
36. Einstein, *Out of My Later Years*, p. 61.
37. Jacques Hadamard, *The Psychology of Invention in the Mathematical Field* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1945), pp. 142 ff.
38. Einstein, *Essays in Science*, p. 4.
39. *Ibid.*
40. Einstein, *Out of My Later Years*, pp. 114–115. Also, *Readings in the Philosophy of Science*, eds. Herbert Feigl and May Brodbeck (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1953), pp. 779–780.
41. *Ibid.*
42. Frederick Sontag, “The Decline of British Ethical Theory: 1903–1951,” *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 18 (1957), pp. 226–227.
43. Einstein, *Out of My Later Years*, pp. 114–115.
44. Hall, *Modern Science and Human Values*.
45. *Ibid.*, p. 4.
46. *Ibid.*, pp. 5–6.
47. *Ibid.*, p. 274.
48. *Ibid.*, p. 4.
49. *Ibid.*, p. 469.
50. Johannes Kepler *De Harmonices Mundi* (Lincii. Austriae: Sumptibus Godofredi Tampachii, Excudebat Ioannes Plancvs, 1619).
51. Hall, *Modern Science and Human Values*, p. 475.
52. *Ibid.*, p. 117.
53. *Ibid.*, p. 274.
54. *Ibid.*, pp. 275–276.
55. *Ibid.*, p. 461.
56. *Ibid.*, p. 474.
57. *Ibid.*, p. 472.
58. *Ibid.*, pp. 471–472.
59. *Ibid.*, p. 3.
60. *Ibid.*, p. 470.
61. *Ibid.*, p. 5.
62. *Ibid.*, p. 470.
63. *Ibid.*

64. *Ibid.*, p. 4.
65. *Ibid.*, p. 6.
66. Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*, trans. Stillman Drake (Berkeley, Cal.: University of California Press, 1953), p. 113.
67. Hall, *Modern Science and Human Values*, pp. 22–23.
68. *Ibid.*, p. 100.
69. *Ibid.*
70. *THE PRACTICE OF PHILOSOPHY* by Susanne Langer, © 1930 by Susanne Langer, pp. 213–214. Reprinted by permission of Henry Holt and Company, LLC..
71. *Ibid.*, pp. 199–200.
72. *Ibid.*, p. 202.
73. Hall, *Modern Science and Human Values*, p. 22.

### Chapter Four

1. G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), pp. 20, 90.
2. See Wilfrid Sellars and John Hospers, eds. *Readings in Ethical Theory* (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1952), p. x.
3. *Ibid.*, pp. 1–59.
4. *Ibid.*, pp. 63–91.
5. Thomas Hill, *Contemporary Ethical Theories* (New York: Macmillan, 1950), pp. 4–5.
6. Sellars and Hospers, *Readings in Ethical Theory*, p. ix.
7. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. ix.
8. *Ibid.*, pp. 20–21.
9. Norman Malcolm, *Ludwig Wittgenstein: A Memoir* (London: Oxford University Press, 1958), p. 66.
10. Hill, *Contemporary Ethical Theories*, p. 354.
11. G. E. Moore, "Reply to My Critics," *The Philosophy of G. E. Moore*, ed. Paul A. Schilpp (Evanston, Ill.: Open Court Pub. Co., 1942), pp. 537 ff.
12. Brand Blanshard, *Reason and Goodness* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1961), p. 269; A. C. Ewing, "The Work of G. E. Moore," *The Indian Journal of Philosophy*, 1:2 (December 1959); Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value* (Carbondale and Edwardsville, Ill.: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), Ch. 4, note 46.
13. G. E. M. Anscombe and P. T. Geach, *Three Philosophers* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1961), p. 130.
14. See A. C. Ewing, "Subjectivism and Naturalism in Ethics," *Mind*, 53 (1944). Reprinted in Sellars and Hospers, pp. 115–133.
15. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, pp. 110–111.
16. See Austin Duncan-Jones. "Intrinsic Value: Some Comments on the Works of G. E. Moore," *Philosophy*, 33:126 (July 1958), p. 126.
17. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 4.
18. *Ibid.*, p. 3.
19. *Ibid.*, p. xiii.
20. *Ibid.*, p. 2. Italics supplied.
21. *Ibid.*, p. 5.
22. *Ibid.*

23. *Ibid.*, p. 142.
24. *Ibid.*, pp. 5–6. Some italics added.
25. See Pierre Duhem, *The Aim and Structure of Physical Theory* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1954), p. 187, pass.
26. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 2; and “The Logical Difference Between Philosophy and Science,” *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 23:3 (March 1963).
27. *Ibid.*, and Ernst Cassirer, *Substance and Function* (Chicago: Open Court Pub. Co., 1923), Ch. 1.
28. See E. A. Burtt, *The Metaphysical Foundations of Modern Physical Science* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1954), p. 70.
29. Sir Isaac Newton, *Opticks* (London: S. Smith and B. Walford, 1704), last two paragraphs.
30. Albert Einstein, *Out of My Later Years* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1950), Ch. 13.
31. René Descartes, *Regulae* (Gravenhage, Holland: Martinus Nijhoff, 1966).
32. Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz, *On Universal Synthesis and Analysis*, 1679; and *Meditations on Knowledge, Truth and Ideas*, 1684; reprinted in *Philosophical Papers and Letters*, ed. L. E. Loemker (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956), pp. 351 ff. and 448 ff.
33. Immanuel Kant, *Logik* (Königsberg: Friedrich Nicolovius, 1800); trans. Robert S. Hartman (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1974); and *Critique of Pure Reason*, trans. Norman Kemp Smith (London: Macmillan, 1934), “Transcendental Doctrine of Method.”
34. Nicholai Hartmann, *Gründzuge einer Metaphysik der Erkenntnis* (Berlin, Germany: de Gruyter, 1949), Chs. 67–70.
35. Jacques Hadamard, *The Psychology of Invention in the Mathematical Field* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1945).
36. Raymond Poincaré, *The Foundation of Science* (Bolton, England: Lancaster Press, 1946), pp. 383 ff.
37. See E. D. Hutchinson, *How to Think Creatively* (New York: Abingdon Press, 1949); Helen E. Rees, *A Psychology of Artistic Creation* (New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1942); N. L. Munn, *Psychology* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1946), pp. 186 ff.; Brewser Ghiselin, ed. *The Creative Process* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1952); Arthur Koestler, *The Act of Creation* (New York: Macmillan, 1964).
38. See Abraham Edel’s contributions to Paul A. Schilpp, ed. *The Philosophy of G. E. Moore* (New York: Tudor Pub. Co., 1952), pp. 135 ff, 620 ff.
39. Leibniz, *Meditations in Knowledge, Truth, and Ideas*. 1684.
40. Kant, *Logik*, p. 70. Also see Leibniz, *On Universal Synthesis and Analysis*.
41. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 20. Italics added.
42. *Ibid.* Italics added.
43. *Ibid.*, p. 14.
44. *Ibid.*
45. *Ibid.*, p. 77.
46. W. K. Frankena, “The Naturalist Fallacy,” *Mind*, 48 (October 1939), pp. 464–477.
47. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 20.
48. See G. W. Leibniz, *Thoughts on the Principles of Descartes*, 1692, p. 637.

49. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 20.  
 50. *Ibid.*, p. 9.  
 51. *Ibid.*, p. 8.  
 52. Descartes, *Reguale*, 12.  
 53. See Robert S. Hartman, "Research in the Logic of Value," Columbus, Oh.: The Ohio State University, *The Graduate School Record*, 5:4 (January 1952), pp. 6–8; also see *Main Currents in Modern Thought*, 8:3.  
 54. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. ix.  
 55. *Ibid.*  
 56. *Ibid.*, p. x.  
 57. *Ibid.*, p. viii.  
 58. *Ibid.* Italics added.  
 59. René Descartes, Third Meditation.  
 60. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. x.  
 61. *Ibid.*  
 62. *Ibid.*, p. 143.  
 63. *Ibid.*, pp. 143 ff.  
 64. *Ibid.*, p. x.  
 65. *Ibid.*, p. 144.  
 66. *Ibid.*, pp. 144–145. Italics added.  
 67. *Ibid.*, p. 143.  
 68. *Ibid.*, p. 142.  
 69. *Ibid.*, p. 144.  
 70. *Ibid.*, p. 20.  
 71. *Ibid.*, p. 142.  
 72. *Ibid.*  
 73. *Ibid.*, p. 144.  
 74. *Ibid.*  
 75. *Ibid.*  
 76. *Ibid.*, p. 6.  
 77. *Ibid.*, p. 21.  
 78. *Ibid.*  
 79. *Ibid.*, p. 143.  
 80. *Ibid.*, p. 7.  
 81. *Ibid.*, p. 58.  
 82. *Ibid.*, pp. 5–6.  
 83. See Duhem, *The Aim and Structure of Physical Theory*, p. 187, *pass.*  
 84. See C. D. Broad, "Is 'Goodness' a Name of a Simple Non-Natural Quality?" *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 34 (1933/1934), especially pp. 266–267.  
 85. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 111.  
 86. See Gottlob Frege, *Die Grundlagen der Arithmetik* (Hildesheim: G. Olms Verlag., 1961); *The Foundations of Arithmetic*, trans. J. L. Austin. (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, c1959), p. 34; and Bertrand Russell, *Our Knowledge of the External World* (London: G. Allen & Unwin, 1962), p. 191.  
 87. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, p. 111.  
 88. *Ibid.*, p. 125.  
 89. *Ibid.*, pp. 125, 117.  
 90. *Ibid.*, p. 145.  
 91. *Ibid.*, p. 117.

92. *Ibid.*, pp. 205–206.
93. G. E. Moore, "The Conception of Intrinsic Value," *Philosophical Studies* (London: Routledge & K. Paul, 1965), p. 273.
94. See H. J. Paton, *The Categorical Imperative* (London: Hutchinson & Co., 1958), p. 123.
95. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 4.
96. Edel in Schilpp, ed., *The Philosophy of G. E. Moore*, p. 590. Some italics added.
97. G. E. Moore, "Is Goodness a Quality?" *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary*, 11 (1932).
98. See Robert S. Hartman, "Prolegomena to a Meta-Anselmian Axiomatic," *Review of Metaphysics*, 14:4 (June 1961), pp. 637–675; and "Good as a Non-Natural Quality and Good as a Transcendental," *Review of Metaphysics*, 16:1 (September 1962), pp. 149–155.
99. Cicero, *De Ligebus*, 1.
100. See Andre Lalande, *Vocabulaire Technique et Critique de la Philosophie* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1960), pp. 650 ff.
101. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 4.
102. Carl Cohen, "Natural and Non-Natural Qualities," *The Journal of Philosophy*, 55:10 (8 May 1958), p. 417.
103. Alfred North Whitehead and Bertrand Russell, *Principia Mathematica* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1925), Vol. 1, p. 32.
104. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 3, Sect. 2, Part 3.
105. *Ibid.*, pp. 215–228.
106. Jerrold J. Katz, "Semantic Theory and the Meaning of 'Good,'" *The Journal of Philosophy*, 61:23 (10 December 1964), p. 766.
107. Newton, *Optiks*, at end.

## Chapter Five

1. Søren Kierkegaard, *Journals* (London: Oxford University Press, 1938).
2. Ludwig Wittgenstein, *Notebooks, 1914 - 1916* (New York: Harper, 1961), p. 84.
3. *Ibid.*, p. 77. See Ludwig Wittgenstein, *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus* (London: K. Paul Trench, Trubner & Co., 1922), p. 182 (6.41-6.421).
4. Ved Mehta, *Fly and the Fly-Bottle* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1962), p. 37.
5. Alfred J. Ayer, *Language, Truth, and Logic* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1936), pp. 160–161.
6. *Ibid.*
7. *Ibid.*, pp. 168, 112.
8. Julian Huxley and Ludwig Koch, *Animal Language* (New York: Grosset & Dunlap, 1966).
9. Diogenes Laertius, *Lives of Eminent Philosophers* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1942).
10. Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value* (Carbondale and Edwardsville, Ill.: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), pp. 54–58.
11. Alfred J. Ayer, "On the Analysis of Moral Judgment," *Philosophical Essays* (London: Macmillan, 1954), pp. 231–249.
12. J. Harrison, "Can Ethics Do Without Propositions?" *Mind*, 59 (1950), pp. 358–371.

13. W. H. F. Barnes, "Ethics without Propositions," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary*, 22 (1948), pp. 1–30.
14. C. A. Campbell, "Ethics without Propositions," *Mind*, 59 (1950), pp. 88–93. Also see "Bibliography of Logical Positivism," in *Logical Positivism*, A. J. Ayer, ed. (New York: The Free Press, 1959), pp. 381–455..
15. Everett W. Hall, *What is Value? An Essay in Philosophical Analysis* (London: Routledge & Paul, 1952). See also Everett W. Hall, "Practical Reason(s) and the Deadlock in Ethics," *Mind*, 64 (1955), pp. 319–332.
16. Axel Hägerström, *Inquiries Into the Nature of Law and Morals*, trans. C. D. Broad (Uppsala, Sweden: Almqvist & Wiksells, 1953).
17. Ingemar Hedenius, "Befallningssatser, Normer och Vardeutsagor," ("Imperative Sentences, Norms and Value Statements"), *Moderne Videnskab*, 4 (1955), pp. 179–202.
18. Ingemar Hedenius, "Values and Duties," *Theoria*, 15 (1949), p. 115.
19. Sören Halldén, *Emotive Propositions* (Stockholm : Almqvist & Wiksell, 1954).
20. Einar Tegen, "The Basic Problem in the Theory of Value," *Theoria*, 10 (1944), pp. 28–52.
21. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 303–311.
22. Paul Edwards, *The Logic of Moral Discourse* (New York: The Free Press, 1955), pp. 74–75, 141–149.
23. Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, Bk. I, Ch. 6.
24. Edwards, *The Logic of Moral Discourse*, p. 75.
25. *Ibid.*, p. 120.
26. *Ibid.*, pp. 28–29, 150–158.
27. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 43–54.
28. Edwards, *The Logic of Moral Discourse*, pp. 139–140.
29. Avrum Stroll, *The Emotive Theory of Ethics* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1954).
30. See Arene Naess, "Toward a Theory of Interpretation and Preciseness," *Semantics and the Philosophy of Language*, ed. Leonard Linsky (Urbana, Ill.: University of Illinois Press, 1952), pp. 248–269.
31. V. Tomas, "Ethical Disagreements and the Emotive Theory of Values," *Mind*, 60 (1951), pp. 205–222.
32. See Asher Moore, "Emotivism: Theory and Practice," *Journal of Philosophy*, 55:9 (April 1958), pp. 375–382.
33. See E. M. Adams, "Word Magic and Logical Analysis in the Field of Ethics," *Journal of Philosophy*, 66 (1950), pp. 313–319; Richard Brandt, "The Emotive Conception of Ethics and Its Cognitive Implications," *Philosophical Review*, 59 (1950), pp. 291–318; and Richard Brandt, "Stevenson's Defense of the Emotive Theory," *Philosophical Review*, 59 (1950), pp. 535–540.
34. Bertrand Russell, *My Philosophical Development* (London: Allen and Unwin, 1959), pp. 214–215. Italics supplied.
35. *Ibid.*, p. 231.
36. *Ibid.*
37. Bertrand Russell, "My Present View of the World," *Encounter*, 12:1 (January 1959), pp. 8–9.
38. *Ibid.*
39. E. Vernon Arnold, *Roman Stoicism* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1911), p. 59.

40. See John W. Davis, "Is Philosophy a Sickness or a Therapy?" *The Antioch Review*, (Spring 1963), pp. 5–21.
41. Stuart Hampshire, "Fallacies in Moral Philosophy," *Mind*, 58 (October 1949), pp. 466–482.
42. *Ibid.*
43. Everett W. Hall, "Practical Reason(s) and the Deadlock in Ethics."
44. Hampshire, "Fallacies in Moral Philosophy," pp. 466–482.
45. See David Taylor, "Fallacies in Moral Philosophy, S. Hampshire," *Mind*, 60 (October 1951), pp. 521–525.
46. See Donald Davidson and Patrick Suppes, *Outlines of a Formal Theory of Value*, (Stanford, Cal.: Stanford University Press, 1954), Vol. 1; *Decision Making* (Stanford: Cal.: Stanford University Press, 1957); R. A. Braithwaite, *Theory of Games as a Tool for the Moral Philosopher* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1955); N. M. Smith, Jr., "A Calculus for Ethics: A Theory of *The Structure of Value*," *Behavioral Science*, 1 (1956), pp. 186–211.
47. See J. L. Austin, *Philosophical Papers* (Oxford, England: Clarendon Press, 1961).
48. H. L. A. Hart, "The Ascription of Responsibilities and Rights," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 49 (1948–1949), pp. 171–194; and *Logic and Language*, ed. E. G. N. Flew (Oxford, England: Blackwell, 1953).
49. Eduardo García Máynez, *Introduccion a la Logica Juridica* (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Economica, 1951); *Logica del Juicio Juridico* (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Economica, 1955); *Logica del Concepto Juridico* (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Economica, 1959); *Logica del Raciocinio Juridico* (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Economica, 1964).
50. Margaret Macdonald, "Ethics and the Ceremonial Use of Language," *Philosophical Analysis*, ed. Max Black (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1950), pp. 198–215.
51. R. C. Cross, "The Emotive Theory of Ethics," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary*, 22 (1948), pp. 127–140.
52. Gilbert Ryle, *The Concept of Mind* (London: Hutchinson's University Library, 1949), Ch. 2.
53. L. J. Russell, "Moral Statements as Proposals," *Australasian Journal of Psychology and Philosophy*, 30:1 (1952).
54. Gilbert Ryle, "Ordinary Language," *Philosophical Review*, 62 (1953), pp. 167–186.
55. Stuart Hampshire, "Fallacies in Moral Philosophy," *Mind*, 58 (1949), pp. 466–482.
56. W. D. Falk, "Goading and Guiding," *Mind*, 62 (1953), pp. 145–171.
57. Abraham Edel, "Ethical Reasoning," *Academic Freedom, Logic, and Religion*, ed. M. White (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1953), p. 134.
58. Stephen E. Toulmin, "Is There a Fundamental Problem in Ethics?" *Australasian Journal of Psychology and Philosophy*, 33 (1955), pp. 1–19.
59. Stephen E. Toulmin, "Knowledge of Right and Wrong," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 50 (1949–1950), pp. 139–156; *An Examination of the Place of Reason in Ethics* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1960).
60. *Ibid.*, p. 223.
61. *Ibid.*, p. 224.

62. J. L. Mackie, "Review of Stephen E. Toulmin, *The Place of Reason in Ethics*," *Australasian Journal of Philosophy and Psychology*, 29 (1950) pp. 114–124.
63. P. H. Nowell-Smith, *Ethics* (London: Penguin Books, 1954), p. 64. Reproduced by permission of Penguin Books Ltd.
64. *Ibid.*, p. 65.
65. Bertrand Russell, *Introduction to Mathematical Philosophy* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1938), p. 189; *An Inquiry into Meaning and Truth* (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1940), pp. 252–253. Also see Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 5, note 6.
66. Nowell-Smith, *Ethics*, p. 71.
67. *Ibid.*, pp. 58, 71.
68. *Ibid.*, p. 69.
69. *Ibid.*, p. 72.
70. *Ibid.*
71. *Ibid.*, p. 70.
72. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 31–43.
73. Nowell-Smith, *Ethics*, pp. 83–84.
74. *Ibid.*, p. 84.
75. *Ibid.*, pp. 102 ff, 160.
76. *Ibid.*, pp. 191–193.
77. *Ibid.*, p. 192.
78. *Ibid.*, pp. 193–197.
79. *Ibid.*, p. 192.
80. *Ibid.*, p. 73.
81. *Ibid.*, pp. 81–82; also see J. L. Stocks, "The Need for a Social Philosophy," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary*, 36 (1962), pp. 1–18.
82. Nowell-Smith, *Ethics*, Ch. 12.
83. *Ibid.*, p. 161.
84. *Ibid.*
85. H. J. M. McCloskey, "D-Words, A-Words, and G-Words," *Philosophical Studies*, 16: 1-2 (January-February 1965), pp. 21–30.
86. Nowell-Smith, *Ethics*, p. 81.
87. *Ibid.*, pp. 165–166.
88. *Ibid.*, p. 166.
89. *Ibid.*, p. 167. See also p. 97n.
90. *Ibid.*
91. *Ibid.*, pp. 167–168.
92. *Ibid.*, pp. 168–169.
93. See R. M. Hare, *The Language of Morals* (Oxford, England: Clarendon Press, 1952), pp. 124, 135, 147.
94. Nowell-Smith, *Ethics*, pp. 317–318.
95. *Ibid.*, p. 182.
96. *Ibid.*
97. Stroll, *The Emotive Theory of Ethics*.
98. Everett W. Hall, "Practical Reason(s) and the Deadlock in Ethics."
99. *Ibid.*, pp. 319–320.
100. Hare, *The Language of Morals*, 1952.
101. From *ON THE KNOWLEDGE OF GOOD & EVIL* by Philip B. Rice, copyright © 1960, p. 83. Used by permission.

102. Hare, *The Language of Morals*, p. 132.
103. *Ibid.*, Ch. 8.
104. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 60–63.
105. *The Shorter Oxford English Dictionary* (Oxford, England: Clarendon Press, 1933).
106. Hare, *The Language of Morals*, p. 126.
107. G. J. Warnock, "Metaphysics in Logic," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 51 (1950–1951), pp. 197–222; also see *Essays in Conceptual Analysis*, ed. Anthony Flew (London: Macmillan, 1960), pp. 75–93.
108. R. F. Harrod, *The Life of John Maynard Keynes* (London: Macmillan: 1951), p. 80.
109. *Ibid.*, p. 140.
110. Bertrand Russell, *My Philosophical Development*, p. 233.
111. Hare, *The Language of Morals*, Ch. 9.
112. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 112–115.
113. Hare, *The Language of Morals*, p. 140.
114. *Ibid.*
115. *Ibid.*
116. *Ibid.*, p. 141.
117. *Ibid.*, pp. 143–144.
118. *Ibid.*, p. 144.
119. *Ibid.*, p. 145; Also see p. 81.
120. *Ibid.*, pp. 81–82.
121. See G. E. Anscombe and P. E. Geach, *Three Philosophers* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1961), p. 82.
122. Paul A. Schilpp, ed. *The Philosophy of G. E. Moore* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University, 1942), pp. 558, 590.
123. Hare, *The Language of Morals*, p. 143.
124. *Ibid.*
125. *Ibid.*, p. 83.
126. *Ibid.*, p. 84.
127. *Ibid.*, pp. 111–118.
128. *Ibid.*, p. 146.
129. *Ibid.*, p. 130.
130. Stuart Hampshire, *Thought and Action* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1960), p. 261.
131. *Ibid.*, p. 223. Italics supplied.
132. *Ibid.*
133. *Ibid.*, p. 225.
134. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 109–110.
135. Hampshire. *Thought and Action*, p. 225.
136. Bertrand Russell, *Principles of Mathematics* (London: G. Allen & Unwin, 1903), p. 26.
137. Hampshire, *Thought and Action*, pp. 226–227.
138. *Ibid.*, p. 227.
139. *Ibid.*, pp. 229 ff. Also see Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 110–111.
140. *Ibid.*, p. 231.
141. *Ibid.*, p. 235.
142. *Ibid.*, p. 231.

143. *Ibid.*, 256–257.
144. *Ibid.*, p. 257. Italics supplied.
145. *Ibid.*, p. 258.
146. Theodor Lessing, *Studien zur Wertaxiomatik* (Leipzig, Germany: F. Meiner, 1914), pp. 104–105.
147. Hampshire, *Thought and Action*, p. 258.
148. *Ibid.*, p. 260.
149. *Ibid.*, p. 265.
150. *Ibid.*, p. 269.
151. F. E. Sparshott, *An Enquiry into Goodness* (Toronto, Canada: University of Toronto Press, 1958), p. 122.
152. *Ibid.*, p. 217.
153. *Ibid.*, p. 131.
154. *Ibid.*, p. 132.
155. G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), p. 20.
156. *Ibid.*, p. 77.
157. Sparshott, *An Enquiry into Goodness*, pp. 134–135.
158. *Ibid.*, p. 135.
159. *Ibid.*
160. *Ibid.*, pp. 124–125.
161. *Ibid.*, p. 105.
162. *Ibid.*, p. 83.
163. *Ibid.*, p. 58.
164. *Ibid.*, p. 59.
165. *Ibid.*, p. 61.
166. *Ibid.*, pp. 65–66.
167. *Ibid.*, Sect. 3.42.
168. *Ibid.*, p. 65.
169. *Ibid.*, p. 60.
170. *Ibid.*, p. 76.
171. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 108, 112 ff.
172. Sparshott, *An Enquiry into Goodness*, p. 127.
173. *Ibid.*, p. 129.
174. *Ibid.*
175. *Ibid.*, p. 130.
176. *Ibid.*, p. 129.
177. *Ibid.*
178. *Ibid.*, p. 157.
179. *Ibid.*
180. *Ibid.*
181. *Ibid.*
182. *Ibid.*, p. 148.
183. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 218–219.
184. Sparshott, *An Enquiry into Goodness*, pp. 179, 205, 147–148.
185. *Ibid.*, pp. 151, 198, 232, 285.
186. *Ibid.*, p. 188.
187. *Ibid.*, p. 202.

188. J. V. Langmead Casserley, *Morals and Man in the Social Sciences* (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1951).
189. *Ibid.*, p. 77.
190. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 67–68.
191. Casserley, *Morals and Man in the Social Sciences*, p. 85.
192. Eric Gilman, "Objectivity in Conduct," *Philosophy*, 29 (1954), pp. 308–320.
193. D. B. Terrell, "What You Will, or the Limits of Analysis," *Philosophical Studies*, 3 (1952), pp. 33–38.
194. See Kurt Baier, "Proving a Moral Judgment," *Philosophical Studies*, 3 (1953), p. 33, and Bernard Mayo, "Commitments and Reasons," *Mind*, 64 (1955), pp. 342–360.
195. Glenn Negley, "The Failure of Communication in Ethics," *Symbols and Values: An Initial Study*, ed. L. Bryson, et al. (New York: Harper, 1954).
196. Rudolf Allers, "The Failure of Communication in Ethics," (Discussion), *Symbols and Values: An Initial Study*, ed. L. Bryson, et al. (New York: Harper, 1954).
197. E. A. Gellner, "Ethics and Logic," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 55 (1954–1955), pp. 157–178.
198. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, p. 306.
199. R. M. Hare, "Universalisability," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 55 (1954–1955), pp. 295–312.
200. Hare, *Language of Morals*, pp. 140 ff.
201. Everett W. Hall, "Practical Reasons and the Deadlock in Ethics."
202. Stuart Hampshire, "Fallacies in Moral Philosophy," *Mind*, 58 (1949), pp. 466–482.
203. Abraham Edel, "Ethical Reasoning," *Academic Freedom, Logic and Religion*, ed. M. White (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1953).
204. Abraham Edel, "The Ascription of Responsibility and Rights," *Academic Freedom, Logic and Religion*, ed. M. White (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1953).
205. *Ibid.*, p. 138.
206. *Ibid.*, p. 140.
207. *Ibid.*, p. 142.
208. D. H. Monro, "Are Moral Problems Genuine?" *Mind*, 65 (1956), pp. 166–183.
209. *Ibid.*
210. *Ibid.*
211. H. P. Rickman, "Linguistic Analysis and Moral Statements," *Philosophy*, 29 (1954), pp. 122–130.
212. Rice, *On the Knowledge of Good & Evil*, p. 81.
213. C. D. Broad, "Review of *An Examination of the Place of Reason in Ethics* by S. E. Toulmin," *Mind*, 61 (1952) pp. 93–101.
214. Rice., *On the Knowledge of Good & Evil*, pp. 81–82.
215. Monro, "Are Moral Problems Genuine?" pp. 166–183.
216. Rice, *On the Knowledge of Good & Evil*, p. 82.
217. Hampshire, "Fallacies in Moral Philosophy," pp. 358–371.
218. Rice, *On the Knowledge of Good & Evil*, p. 150.
219. *Ibid.*, p. 195.
220. *Ibid.*, p. 194.
221. Charles L. Stevenson, *Ethics and Language* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1944), pp. 46 ff.

222. Rice, *On the Knowledge of Good & Evil*, p. 108.
223. *Ibid.*, pp. 113–114.
224. *Ibid.*, p. 124.
225. Herbert Feigl, “*De Principiis Non Disputandum...?*” *Philosophical Analysis*, ed. Max Black (Englewood-Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1963), pp. 113–147.
226. Herbert Feigl, “Validation and Vindication, an Analysis of the Nature and the Limits of Ethical Arguments,” *Readings in Ethical Theory*, eds. Wilfrid Sellars and John Hospers (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1952), pp. 667–680.
227. *Ibid.*, p. 677.
228. *Ibid.*
229. *Ibid.*
230. *Ibid.*, p. 674.
231. *Ibid.*, pp. 675, 676.
232. *Ibid.*, p. 678.
233. *Ibid.*
234. Henry Lanz, *In Quest of Morals* (Stanford, Cal.: Stanford University Press, 1941).
235. Feigl, “Validation and Vindication, an Analysis of the Nature and the Limits of Ethical Arguments,” p. 679.
236. Kurt Baier, “Objectivity in Ethics,” *Australasian Journal of Psychology and Philosophy*, 26 (1948), pp. 147–165.
237. Henry Lanz, *Den Etiska Objektiviteten* (Stockholm, Sweden: Natur och Kultur, 1937).
238. Lanz, *In Quest of Morals*, p. 163.
239. *Ibid.*, p. 157. Italics supplied.
240. *Ibid.*, p. 162.
241. *Ibid.*, p. 155.
242. *Ibid.*, pp. 155–156.
243. *Ibid.*, p. 156.

## Chapter Six

1. C. I. Lewis, *An Analysis of Knowledge and Valuation* (La Salle, Ill.: Open Court, 1946), p. 366.
2. Paul Kecskemeti, *Meaning, Communication, and Value* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952).
3. Arthur N. Prior, *Logic and the Basis of Ethics* (Oxford, England: The Clarendon Press, 1949), p. 7.
4. Abraham Edel, *Ethical Judgment* (Glencoe, Ill.: Free Press, 1955).
5. *Ibid.*, pp. 78–79.
6. *Ibid.*, p. 75.
7. *Ibid.*
8. See Robert S. Hartman, “The Logical Difference Between Philosophy and Science,” *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 23:3 (March 1963), pp. 353–379.
9. Abraham Edel, *Science and the Structure of Ethics* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961), par. 19 and p. 100.
10. Maxime Glansdorff, *Theories Generale de la Valeur* (Bruxelles, Belgium: Éditions Du Parthenon, 1954).

11. See Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value: Foundations of Scientific Axiology* (Carbondale and Edwardsville, Ill.: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), Ch. 5, Sect. 2.
12. Gosta Carlberg, *Om Manniskans Behov och Varden (On Man's Needs and Values)* (Stockholm, Sweden: LT:s Förlag, 1950).
13. Abraham Maslow, *Principles of Abnormal Psychology* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1941).
14. Abraham Maslow, *Motivation and Personality* (New York: Harper and Row, 1954); and Abraham Maslow, *Toward a Psychology of Being* (Princeton: Van Nostrand, 1968).
15. Werner Wolff, *Values and Personality* (New York: Grune and Stratton, 1950).
16. Stephan Strasser, *Das Gamüt* (Utrecht, Netherlands: Uitgeverij Het Spectrum, 1956); also *Seele und Beseeltes* (Wien, Germany: F. Deuticke 1955).
17. Maria Ossowska, *Motywy Postepowania: Zzagadnien Psychologii Moranosci (Human Motivation: Inquiry into the Psychology of Moral Life)* (Warszawa, Poland: Ksiazka i Wiedza, 1949).
18. See Strasser, p. 217.
19. Bertrand Russell, *Human Society in Ethics and Politics* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1955).
20. *Ibid.*, p. 36.
21. *Ibid.*, p. vi.
22. *Ibid.*, p. vii.
23. Bertrand Russell, "The Elements of Ethics," in *Readings in Ethical Theory*, eds. Wilfrid Sellars and John Hospers (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1952), p. 1, note \*.
24. John L. McKenney, "Concerning Russell's Analysis of Value Judgments," *Journal of Philosophy*, 55 (24 April 1958), pp. 382–389.
25. *Ibid.*, pp. 386 ff.
26. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 2, Sect. 2, 6.
27. See *ibid.*, Ch. 1, Sect. 1; Morris Weitz, "The Unity of Russell's Philosophy," *The Philosophy of Bertrand Russell*, ed. Paul A. Schilpp (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1944), pp. 92–110; John L. McKenney, *The Problem of a Science of Ethics in the Philosophies of John Dewey and Bertrand Russell* (Ohio State University, Dissertation, 1952).
28. Maurice Mandelbaum, *The Phenomenology of Moral Experience* (Glencoe, Ill.: Free Press, 1955).
29. *Ibid.*, p. 38.
30. See P. H. Nowell-Smith, "Review of Maurice Mandelbaum, *The Phenomenology of Moral Experience*," *Philosophy*, 32 (April 1957), pp. 170–173.
31. Mandelbaum, *The Phenomenology of Moral Experience*, p. 39.
32. See Robert S. Hartman, "The Moral Situation: a Field Theory of Ethics," *Journal of Philosophy*, 45 (20 May 1948), pp. 292–300.
33. Nicolai Hartmann, *Ethics* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1932), Vol. 1, pp. 274 ff.
34. Risieri Frondizi, *What is Value?* (La Salle, Ill.: Open Court Pub. Co., 1963).
35. See Robert S. Hartman, "The Moral Situation: A Field Theory of Ethics."
36. A. L. Hilliard, *The Forms of Value, The Extension of a Hedonistic Axiology* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1950).
37. *Ibid.*, p. 6.

38. *Ibid.*, p. 42.  
 39. *Ibid.*, p. 46.  
 40. *Ibid.*  
 41. *Ibid.*, p. 207.  
 42. *Ibid.*  
 43. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 162–168.  
 44. Hilliard, *The Forms of Value*, pp. 278–279. Also see Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 6, note 19.  
 45. *Ibid.*, p. 209.  
 46. G. F. Hourani, *Ethical Value* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1956).  
 47. W. K. Frankena, "The Naturalistic Fallacy," *Mind*, 48 (October 1939), pp. 464–477.  
 48. Hourani, *Ethical Value*, p. 88.  
 49. *Ibid.*, pp. 87–88, 66.  
 50. Viktor Kraft, *Grundlagen einer Wissenschaftlichen Wertlehre* (Vienna: Springer, 1951).  
 51. See Robert S. Hartman, "Comments by Hartman," in *The Language of Value*, ed. Ray Lepley (New York: Columbia University Press, 1952), pp. 366–369.  
 52. Kraft, *Grundlagen einer Wissenschaftlichen Wertlehre*, p. 262.  
 53. F. S. C. Northrop, *The Meeting of East and West* (New York: Macmillan, 1946); *Logic of Sciences and the Humanities* (New York: Macmillan, 1947); "Naturalist and Cultural Foundations for a More Effective International Law," *The Yale Law Journal*, 59 (1950), pp. 1430–1450; "The Nature of Concepts and Conceptual Structure," *The Nature of Concepts, Their Inter-relations and Role in Social Structure* (Stillwater, Okla.: A. & M. College, 1950); "The Importance of Deductively Formulated Theory in Ethics and Social and Legal Sciences," *Structure, Method and Meaning, Essay in Honor of Henry M. Sheffer* (New York: 1951); "The Philosophy of Natural Science and Comparative Law," *Proceedings, American Philosophical Association* (1952); "Criterion of Universal Ethical and Legal Norms," *Moral Principles in Action*, ed. R. N. Anshen (New York: Harper, 1952); "Ethical Relativism in the Light of Recent Legal Science," *Journal of Philosophy*, 52 (1955), pp. 649–662; "Man's Relation to the Earth in Its Bearing on His Aesthetic, Ethical, and Legal Values," *Man's Role in Changing the Face of the Earth*, ed. W. L. Thomas (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956); *The Complexity of Legal and Ethical Experience* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1959).  
 54. Northrop, *The Meeting of East and West*, pp. 450–451.  
 55. E. Vernon Arnold, *Roman Stoicism* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1958), p. 57.  
 56. Northrop, *The Meeting of East and West*, pp. 528, 470.  
 57. J. M. Hussey and J. B. Bury, *The Cambridge Medieval History, IV, The Byzantine Empire, Part I* (Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1966), pp. 46, 49, italics supplied.  
 58. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 79–92.  
 59. Anatol Rapoport, *Science and the Goals of Men* (New York: Harper, 1950); *Operational Philosophy* (New York: Wiley, 1953).  
 60. Rapoport, *Operational Philosophy*, p. 116.  
 61. Donald Davidson, J. C. C. McKinsey, and Patrick Suppes, *Outlines of a Formal Theory of Value* (Stanford, Cal.: Stanford University Press, 1954), Vol. 1.  
 62. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 249–265.

63. Donald Davidson and Patrick Suppes, *Decision Making: An Experimental Approach* (Stanford, Cal.: Stanford University Press, 1957).
64. Georg Henrik von Wright, *The Logic of Preference* (Edinburgh, Scotland: The University Press, 1963), par. 1.
65. *Ibid.*, pp. 21, 35.
66. *Ibid.*, p. 34.
67. *Ibid.*, p. 42.
68. Sören Halldén, *On the Logic of "Better"* (Lund, Sweden: C. W. K. Gleerup, 1957); Sören Halldén, *Emotive Propositions* (Stockholm, Sweden: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1954). Cf. von Wright, *The Logic of Preference*, pp. 14, 16.
69. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 293–302.
70. Bertrand Russell, *My Philosophical Development* (London: Allen and Unwin, 1959), pp. 79–80.
71. Brewster Ghiselin, *The Creative Process* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1952), p. 38; Eliot Dole Hutchinson, *How to think Creatively* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1949), p. 111; Helen Evangeline Rees, *A Psychology of Artistic Creation* (New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1942), p. 156.
72. William Wollaston, *The Religion of Nature Delineated* (London: J. and P. Knapton, 1750), Sect. 1, esp. Propositions 2, 3, and 4; Also see Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 60–63, Ch. 5, note 19.
73. Von Wright, *The Logic of Preference*, p. 14. Also see Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 5, note 20.
74. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 5, Sect. 2.
75. *Ibid.*, Ch. 6, Sect. 3, b, and Robert S. Hartman, "The Logic of Value," *Review of Metaphysics*, 14:3 (March 1961), pp. 408–423.
76. Von Wright, *The Logic of Preference*, p. 35.
77. *Ibid.*, p. 31.
78. See G. H. von Wright, *Norm and Action: A Logical Enquiry* (New York: Humanities Press, 1963) and *The Varieties of Goodness* (New York: Humanities Press, 1963).
79. Von Wright, *The Logic of Preference*, p. 15.
80. Richard D. Braithwaite, *Scientific Explanation. A Study of the Function of Theory, Probability and Law in Science* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1953); *Moral Principles and Inductive Policies* (London: British Academy, 1953).
81. Richard D. Braithwaite, *Theory of Games as a Tool for the Moral Philosopher* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1955).
82. *Ibid.*, p. 27.
83. *Ibid.*, p. 51.
84. Nicolas Oresme, *Tract. de configuratione intensionum*, part 3, cap. 7; Galileo Galilei, *Two New Sciences* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1950), Third Day, Theor. 1., Prop. 1. Cf. Oskar Becker, *Grundlagen der Mathematik* (Freiburg, Germany: Verlag Karl Alber, 1964), pp. 133–134.
85. See G. H. von Wright, *Norm and Action: A Logical Enquiry* (New York: Humanities Press, 1963) and *The Varieties of Goodness* (New York: Humanities Press, 1963).
86. See Nicolas M. Smith, Jr., "A Calculus for Ethics: A Theory of *The Structure of Value*," *Behavioral Science*, 1 (April-July 1956), pp. 111–142, 186–211.

87. Henry Margenau, "Scientific Ethics," *Scientific Monthly*, 69 (1949), pp. 290–296; "Remarks on Ethical Science," *The Nature of Concepts, Their Interrelation and Role in Social Structure* (Stillwater, Okla.: A. & M. College, 1950).
88. Henry Margenau, *Ethics and Science* (Princeton, N. J.: Van Nostrand, 1964).
89. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 7, Sect. 2.
90. Robert S. Hartman, "The Scientific Basis of Value Theory," *New Knowledge in Human Values*, ed. Abraham H. Maslow (New York: Harper, 1959), p. 39.
91. Margenau, *Ethics and Science*, p. 265.
92. Jacques Rueff, *From the Physical to the Social Sciences* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1929).
93. R. F. Harrod, *The Life of John Maynard Keynes* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1951), p. 76. Also see John Maynard Keynes, *A Treatise on Probability* (London: Macmillan and Co., 1952), p. 19.
94. G. W. Leibniz, "Toward a Universal Characteristic," 1679, *Philosophical Papers and Letters*, ed. L. E. Loemker (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956), pp. 340–341; *Selections*, ed. Philip P. Wiener (New York: Scribner, 1951), p. 18.
95. Leibniz, "Preface to the General Science," *Selections*, pp. 12–13.
96. G. W. Leibniz, "On Universal Synthesis and Analysis, or the Art of Discovery and Judgment," 1679, and "Two Studies in the Logical Calculus," 1679, *Philosophical Papers and Letters*, pp. 351–370. Also see Robert S. Hartman, "Group Membership and Class Membership," *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 13 (1953), p. 364.
97. Margenau, "Remarks on Ethical Science," p. 109.
98. Albert Einstein, *Out of My Later Years* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1950), p. 115.
99. *Ibid.*
100. *Ibid.*, p. 67.
101. *Ibid.*, p. 115; see Margenau, *Ethics and Science*, pp. 228 ff.
102. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 2, Sect. 2.
103. J. Bronowski, *Science and Human Values* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1956).
104. Abraham H. Maslow, ed. "The Values of Science," *New Knowledge in Human Values* (New York: Harper, 1959).
105. Lillian R. Lieber, *Human Values, and Science, Art and Mathematics* (New York: Norton, 1961).
106. D. Daiches Raphael, *Moral Judgment* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1955).
107. A. C. Ewing, *The Definition of Good* (New York: Humanities, 1948); also see A. C. Ewing, *Second Thoughts on Moral Philosophy* (New York: Macmillan, 1959).
108. Raphael, *Moral Judgment*, p. 168.
109. See Leonard Nelson, *System of Ethics* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1956), Introduction.
110. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 1, Sect. 1.
111. David J. McCracken, *Thinking and Value* (London: MacMillan, 1950).
112. *Ibid.*, p. 13.
113. *Ibid.*, p. 15.
114. *Ibid.*, p. 27.
115. Hellmuth Stofer, *Über das ethische Werturteil* (Basil, Switzerland: Verlag für Recht und Gesellschaft, 1955).
116. Paul Kecskemeti, *Meaning, Communication, and Value* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952).

117. Charles L. Stevenson, *Ethics and Language* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1944), pp. 26 ff; Kecskemeti, pp. 315 ff; on "conflict levels," see pp 246 ff.
118. Kecskemeti, p. 101.
119. C. I. Lewis, *The Ground and Nature of the Right* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1955)
120. *Ibid.*, p. 2.
121. *Ibid.*, pp. 3 ff.
122. *Ibid.*
123. *Ibid.*
124. *Ibid.*, pp 32–33.
125. *Ibid.*, p. 64.
126. *Ibid.*, p. 89.
127. C. I. Lewis, *An Analysis of Knowledge and Valuation* (La Salle, Ill.: Open Court, 1946).
128. A. C. Ewing, *Ethics* (New York: The Free Press, 1953); "Philosophical Analysis in Ethics," *Philosophical Studies*, 1 (October 1950), pp. 74–80; "A Middle Way in Ethics?" *Analysis*, 13 (1952), pp. 33–38.
129. Henry Margenau, *Ethics and Science* (Princeton, N.J., Van Nostrand, 1964), p. 151.
130. See Luis Recaséns Siches, *Nueva Filosofía de la Interpretación del Derecho* (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1956).
131. C. A. Baylis, "The Confirmation of Value Judgments," *Philosophical Review*, 61 (1952), pp. 50–58.
132. Warner A. Wick, "Moral Problems, Moral Philosophy, and Metaethics: Some Further Dogmas of Empiricism," *Philosophical Review*, 62 (1953), pp. 3–22.
133. J. O. Urmson, "Some Questions Concerning Validity," *Revue Internationale de Philosophie*, 25 (1953), pp. 217–229.
134. H. J. Paton, "The Emotive Theory of Ethics," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society Supplement*, 22 (1948), pp. 107–126.
135. J. D. Mabbott, "True and False in Morality," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 49 (1948–1949), pp. 133–150.
136. William H. Werkmeister. "On Describing a World," *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 11 (1951), pp. 303–325; "Problems of Value Theory," *Philosophical and Phenomenological Research*, 12 (1952), pp. 495–512; "Prolegomena to Value Theory," *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 14 (1954), pp. 293–308; "The Meaning and Being of Values within the Framework of an Empirically Oriented Value Theory," *Sinn und Sein*, ed. Richard Wisser (Tübingen, Germany: M. Niemeyer, 1960); *Theories of Ethics* (Lincoln, Neb.: Johnsen Pub. Co. 1961).
137. William H. Werkmeister, *The Basis and Structure of Knowledge* (New York: Harper, 1948).
138. William H. Werkmeister, *A Philosophy of Science* (Lincoln, Neb.: University of Nebraska Press, 1940).
139. Werkmeister, *The Basis and Structure of Science*, pp. 256–266; 307ff.
140. R. B. Perry, *Realms of Value* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1954).
141. W. D. Lamont, *The Value Judgment* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1955).
142. W. D. Lamont, *The Principles of Moral Judgment* (Oxford, England: Clarendon Press, 1946).

143. Lamont, *The Value Judgment*, p. 11.
144. *Ibid.*, pp. 59 ff.
145. *Ibid.*, p. 291.
146. *Ibid.*, p. 292.
147. *Ibid.*, pp. 292–293.
148. *Ibid.*, p. 294.
149. *Ibid.*
150. William Kneale, "Objectivity and Morals," *Philosophy*, 25 (1950). Also, *Readings in Ethical Theory*, eds. Wilfrid Sellars and John Hospers (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1952), pp. 681–697.
151. H. L. A. Hart, "The Ascription of Responsibility and Rights," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 49 (1948–1949), pp. 171–194. Also, *Logic and Language*, ed. A. G. N. Flew (Oxford, England: Blackwell, 1951).
152. Stephen E. Toulmin, *The Uses of Argument* (Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1958).
153. See "The Work of Justice," *Time* (5 May 1958).
154. See A. Banfi, *L'uomo Copernicano* (Milan, Italy: 1950); J. Lacroix, *Marxisme, Existentialisme, Personnalisme* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires, 1951); Florian Znaniecki, *Cultural Sciences, Their Origin and Development* (Urbana, Ill.: University of Illinois, 1952); L. Straus, "Social Science and Humanism," *Iyyum*, 7 (1956), pp. 65–73.
155. See G. Geiger's symposium, "The Problem of Values and the Social Scientist," *Journal of Social Issues*, 6 (1950), pp. 1–79, on the general relation between value judgments and scientific judgments.
156. Abraham Maslow, ed. *New Knowledge in Human Values*. (New York: Harper, 1959); Ethel M. Albert and Clyde Kluckhohn, *A Selected Bibliography on Values, Ethics, and Esthetics* (Glencoe, Ill.: Free Press, 1959).
157. Ray Lepley, ed. *Value: A Cooperative Inquiry* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1949); *The Language of Value* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1957).
158. Cf. Robert S. Hartman, "Value Propositions," *The Language of Value*, ed. Ray Lepley (New York: Columbia University Press, 1957), pp. 352–374.
159. T. Czezowski, "Etyka Jako Nauka Empiryczna" ("Ethics as an Empirical Science"), *Kwartalnik Filozoficzny*, 18 (1949), pp. 161–171.
160. Sören Halldén, *Emotive Propositions* (Stockholm, Sweden: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1954).
161. Meckler, "Facts and Values," *Iyyum*, 6 (1955), pp. 156–166.
162. See F. E. Sparshott, *An Enquiry into Goodness* (Toronto, Canada: The University of Toronto Press, 1958), pp. 147–148.
163. Carl Cohen, "The Reconstruction of Hidden Value Judgments; Word Choices as Value Indicators," *Symbols and Values: An Initial Study*, L. Bryson, et al., eds. (New York: Harper, 1954).
164. Hartmann, *Ethics*, Vol. 2, pp. 256, 417.

## Chapter Seven

1. Plato, *Laws*, p. 967. Cf. *The Dialogues of Plato*, B. Jowett, trans. (New York, Random House, 1937) Vol. 2, p. 702.

2. Jacques Leclercq, *Les Grandes Lignes de la Philosophie Morale* (Louvain, Belgium: Publications Universitaires de Louvain, 1954); *La Philosophie Morale de Saint Thomas Devant la Pensée Contemporaine* (Louvain, Belgium: Publications Universitaires de Louvain, 1955).
3. Leclercq, *Les Grandes Lignes de la Philosophie Morale*, pp. 217–218.
4. See Bernard J. Lonergan, *Insight* (London: Darton Longman and Todd, 1958), pp. 30, 355–356.
5. Leclercq, *Les Grandes Lignes de la Philosophie Morale*, p. 218.
6. *Ibid.*
7. *Ibid.*, p. 219.
8. See Lonergan, *Insight*, pp. 37–38, 737; and Robert S. Hartman, “Non-natural Good and Transcendental Good,” *Review of Metaphysics*, 16:1 (September 1962), pp. 149–155.
9. See Peter Coffey, *Ontology* (New York: Longmans, Green, 1938), pp. 167 ff; Lonergan, *Insight*, pp. 596 ff; Martin Foss, *The Idea of Perfection in the Western World* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1946), Ch. 2; Robert S. Hartman, “Prolegomena to a Meta-Anselmian Axiomatic,” *Review of Metaphysics*, 14:4 (June 1961), pp. 637–671; Charles Hartshorne, *Anselm’s Discovery* (La Salle, Ill.: Open Court, 1965).
10. Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value: Foundations of Scientific Axiology* (Carbondale and Edwardsville, Ill.: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), pp. 268 ff.
11. See Hermann Lotze, *Logik* (Leipzig, Germany: Weidmann’sche Buchhandlung, 1843), pp. 28 ff., 123 ff. Also Hartman, “Non-natural Good and Transcendental Good,” pp. 149–155.
12. Louis Lavelle, *Traité des Valeurs, 2. Système des Différentes Valeurs* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1955).
13. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 220, 227.
14. René Le Senne, *Le Destinée Personnelle* (Paris, France: Flammarion, 1951).
15. René Le Senne, *Obstacle et Valeur* (Paris, France: F. Aubier, 1946), pp. 175 ff.
16. Jules Pirlot, *Destinée et Valeur. La Philosophie de René Le Senne* (Namur : Secrétariat des Publications, 1953).
17. Raymond Ruyer, *Le Monde des Valeurs* (Paris, France: Aubier, 1948).
18. Raymond Ruyer, *La Philosophie de la Valeur* (Paris, France: Colin, 1952).
19. Raymond Polin, *La Création des Valeurs* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1944).
20. Raymond Polin, *Du Laid, du Mal, du Faux* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1948).
21. Benedetto Croce, *Indagini su Hegel, E Schiarimenti Filosofici* (Bari, Italy: Laterza, 1952).
22. Giovanni Gentile, *Genesi e Struttura della Società* (Florence, Italy: Sansoni, 1951).
23. See Armando Saitta, *Il Problema di Dio e la Filosofia dell’Immanenza* (Bologna, Italy: Calderini, 1953) and Fazio Allmayer, *Moralità dell’Arte* (Florence, Italy: Sansoni, 1953) and Fazio Allmayer, *Il Significato della Vita* (Florence, Italy: Sansoni, 1953).
24. See Alfredo Parente, *Il Tramonto della Logica Antica* (Bari, Italy: G. Laterza, 1952) and Adelchi Attisani, *Interpretazioni Crociane* (Messina: Università Degli Studi, 1952).
25. Ugo Spirito, *La Vita Come Amore* (Florence, Italy: Sansoni, 1953).

26. Martin Buber, *Urdistanz und Beziehung* (Heidelberg, Germany: L. Schneider, 1951); Martin Buber, *Dialogisches Lebens* (Zurich, Switzerland: G. Müller, 1947).
27. Guido Calogero, *Logo e Dialogo* (Milan, Italy: Edizioni di Comunità, 1950).
28. Armando Carlini, *Cattolicesimo e Pensiero Moderno* (Brescia, Italy: Morcelliana, 1953).
29. Augusto Guzzo, *La Moralità* (Turin, Italy: Edizioni di Filosofia, 1950).
30. Felice Battaglia, *Filosofia del Lavoro* (Bologna, Italy: C. Zuffi, 1951); *Arte e Moralità* (Bologna, Italy: C. Zuffi, 1952); *Il Concetto Spiritualistico della Storia* (Bologna, Italy: C. Zuffi, 1953); *Morale e Storia Nella Prospettiva Spiritualistica* (Bologna, Italy: C. Zuffi, 1953).
31. Michele F. Sciacca, *Il Pensiero Moderno* (Brescia, Italy: La Scuola, 1949); *La Filosofia per la Vita* (Brescia, Italy: La Scuola, 1954).
32. Giuseppe Capograssi, *Introduzione alla Vita Etica* (Turin, Italy: Edizioni di "Filosofia," 1950).
33. Guido Lazzarini, *Intensionalità e Istanza Metafisica* (Milan, 1954).
34. Carlo Antoni, *Commento a Croce* (Venice: N. Pozza Editore, 1955).
35. Nicola Abbagnano, *Possibilità e Libertà* (Turin, Italy: Taylor, 1956).
36. Luigi Bagolini, *La Simpatia Nella Morale e nel Diritto* (Bologna, Italy: C. Zuffi, 1952); *Valutazioni Morali e Giuridiche nella Crisi dell'Etica Individuale* (Siena, Italy: Circolo Giuridico dell'Università, 1950).
37. Enzo Paci, *Tempo e Relazione* (Turin, Italy: Taylor, 1955).
38. Ludovico Geymonat, *Saggi di Filosofia Neorazionalistica* (Turin, Italy: G. Einaudi, 1953).
39. Franco Lombardi, *Nascita del Mondo Moderno* (Asti, Italy: Arethusa, 1953); *Dopo lo Storicismo* (Asti, Italy: Casa Editrice Arethusa 1955); *Il Concetto della Libertà* (Asti, Italy: Casa Editrice Arethusa, 1955).
40. Remo Cantoni, *Mito e Storia* (Milan, Italy: A. Mondadori, 1953); *La Vita Quotidiana* (Milan, Italy: A. Mondadori, 1955).
41. Emilio Oggioni, *Filosofia e Psicologia nel Pensiero Postromantico* (Bologna, Italy: R. Patrón, 1955).
42. José Ortega y Gasset, *Obras Completas*, Vol. 6 (Madrid, Spain: Revista de Occidente, 1955), pp. 315–335. Courtesy of Herederos de José Ortega y Gasset.
43. Julián Marías, *Introducción a la Filosofía*, 4th ed. (Madrid, Spain: Revista de Occidente, 1956). *Reason and Life* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1956).
44. José Romano Muñoz, *Hacia una Filosofía Existencial, (El Margen de la Nada, de la Muerte y de la Nausea Metafisica)* (Mexico: Impr. Universitaria, 1953).
45. Luis Recaséns Siches, "Nuevo Existencialismo en México. La Filosofía de José Romano Muñoz," *Cuadernos Americanos*, 15 (1956), pp. 75–89.
46. Luis Recaséns Siches, *Vida Humana, Sociedad y Derecho*, 3rd ed. (Mexico: Editorial Porrúa, 1952); *Human Life, Society and Law, Latin-American Legal Philosophy* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1948); *Filosofía del Derecho* (Mexico: Editorial Porrúa, 1959).
47. Martin Heidegger, *Über den Humanismus* (Frankfurt, Germany: Klostermann, 1949); *Holzwege* (Frankfurt, Germany: Klostermann, 1950).
48. Heidegger, *Holzwege*, pp. 193–277.
49. *Ibid.*, p. 239.
50. *Ibid.*, p. 240.
51. *Ibid.*, p. 239.
52. *Ibid.*, p. 243.

53. *Ibid.*, p. 247.
54. See F. J. von Rintelen, *Philosophie der Endlichkeitals Spiegel der Gegenwart* (Meisenheim, Germany: A. Hain, 1951).
55. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, p. 90.
56. *Ibid.*, pp. 59, 309.
57. F. J. von Rintelen, *Von Dionysus zu Apollon. Der Aufstieg im Geiste* (Wiesbaden, Germany: Metopen Verlag, 1948); *Philosophie der Endlichkeit als Spiegel der Gegenwart* (Meisenheim, Germany: A. Hain, 1951); *Der Rang des Geistes, Goethes Weltverständnis* (Tübingen, Germany: M. Niemeyer, 1955); *Beyond Existentialism* (London: G. Allen & Unwin, 1961)
58. F. J. von Rintelen, *Der Wertgedanke in der Europäischen Geistesentwicklung* (Halle, Germany: M. Niemeyer, 1932).
59. R. Wisser, "Klassische Geistphilosophie und die Existenzphilosophische Bewegung," *Giornale di Metafisica*, 6 (1955), pp. 886–902; "Wertwirklichkeit und Sinnverständnis," *Festschrift für Fritz Joachim von Rintelen* (Tübingen, Germany: 1960).
60. Ernst Jünger, *Der Waldgang* (Frankfurt, Germany: Klostermann, 1956).
61. von Rintelen, *Philosophie der Endlichkeit*, pp. 88, 135 ff.
62. Hermann Krings, *Fragen und Aufgaben der Ontologie* (Tübingen, Germany: M. Niemeyer, 1954).
63. Engelbert Gutwenger, *Wertphilosophie* (Innsbruck: F. Rauch, 1952).
64. See Gustav Siewerth, *Thomas von Aquinas, Die Menschliche Willensfreiheit* (Düsseldorf, Germany: Patmos-Verlag, 1954).
65. Hermann Gauss, *Allgemeine Einleitung in die Platonische Philosophie* (Bern, Switzerland: Herbert Lang, 1952).
66. Fritz Medicus, *Menschlichkeit: Die Wahrheit als Erlebnis und Verwirklichung* (Zurich, Switzerland: Artenis-Verlag, 1951).
67. Paul Häberlin, *Philosophia Perennis* (Berlin, Germany: Springer, 1952).
68. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 2, Sect. 1.
69. See Søren Kierkegaard, *Fear and Trembling* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1954), pp. 38–129, "Preliminary Expectoration."
70. See Mysore Hiriyanna, *The Quest after Perfection* (Mysore, India: Kavyalaya Publishers, 1952); *Art Experience* (Mysore, India: Kavyalaya Publishers, 1954); Sri Jaya Chamaraj Wadiyar Bahdur, *An Aspect of Indian Aesthetics* (Mysore, India: Kavyalaya Publishers, 1956); Surendranath Dasgupta, *Fundamentals of Indian Art* (Bombay, India: Bharatiya Vidya Bhavan, 1952); K. V. Ranga Swami, *Some Aspects of the Hindu Way of Life According to Dharmashastra* (Baroda, India: A. G. Widgery, 1952).
71. Robert S. Hartman, *Partnerschaft von Kapital und Arbeit: Theorie und Praxis eines Neuen Wirtschaftssystems (Partnership of Capital and Labor: Theory and Practice of a New Economic System)* (Opladen-Cologne, Germany: Westdeutscher Verlag, 1958).
72. Nicolai Hartmann, *Ethik*, Vols. 1–3 (Berlin, Germany: W. de Gruyter, 1926); Nicolai Hartmann, *Ethics*, Vols. 1–3 (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1932).
73. *Ibid.*, Vol. 1, pp. 261–262.
74. Thomas Mann, *Schopenhauer* (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1939), p. 10.
75. Hartmann, *Ethics*, Vol. 1, p. 262.
76. *Ibid.*, p. 258.
77. *Ibid.*, p. 255.
78. *Ibid.*, p. 281.

79. *Ibid.*, p. 272.
80. R. Corkey, "Basic Intrinsic Ethical Values," *Philosophy*, 29 (1954), pp. 321–331.
81. See V. Pavi evi, *The Relationship Between Value and Reality in Modern Idealistic Axiology* (Belgrade, Yugoslavia: 1956); Emmanuel Mayer, *Die Objektivität der Werterkenntnis bei Nicolai Hartmann* (Meisenheim, Germany: A. Hain, 1952); and Kaspar Hurlimann, "Person und Werte," *Divus Thomas*, 1952, pp. 273–298, 385–416.
82. Nicolai Hartmann, *Teleologisches Denken* (Berlin, Germany: W. de Gruyter, 1951); *Ethics*, Vol. 1, pp. 274–275.
83. Nicolai Hartmann, "Das Wesen Sittliches Forderungen," *Kleinere Schriften*, Vol. 1 (Berlin, Germany: De Gruyter, 1955), pp. 302–303; also see *Ethics*, Vol. 1, pp. 225–229.
84. *Ibid.*, p. 297.
85. *Ibid.*, pp. 298–299.
86. *Ibid.*, pp. 299–300.
87. *Ibid.*
88. *Ibid.*
89. Johannes Hessen, *Lehrbuch der Philosophie*, (Muchen: Reinhardt, 1948), pp. 56–57; see *Ethik: Grundzüge einer Personalistischen Wertethik* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1954).
90. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 5.
91. See Max Picard, *Hitler in Our Selves* (Hindsdale, Ill.: H. Regnery Co., 1947); Alejandro Rossi, "Sentido y Sentido en las Investigaciones Logicas," *Dianoia* 6 (1960), pp. 91–116; and Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 268 ff.
92. Eduardo García Máynez, *La Definición del Derecho* (Mexico: Editorial Stylo, 1948, Telepa, 1960), pp. 101 ff, 240 ff; "The Philosophical-Juridical Problem of the Validity of Law," *Latin-American Legal Philosophy* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1948); "Das Problem der Definition des Rechts," *Österreichische Zeitschrift für Öffentliches Recht*, 3 (1951), pp. 307–330.
93. García Máynez, "Das Problem der Definition des Rechts," p. 326 and *La Definicion del Derecho*, p. 245.
94. Hans Kelsen, *What is Justice?* (Berkeley, Cal.: University of California Press, 1957), p. 24.
95. Also see H. Westermann, *Person und Persönlichkeit als Wert im Zivilrecht*; P. Karstadt, *Ethik more Juridico* (Heisenheim, Germany: 1956); J. Fausto Fernandez, *Los Valores y el Derecho* (San Salvador: Ministerio de Cultura, Departamento Editorial, 1957); and J. Bonilla, *Introduccion a una Axiologia Juridica* (San Salvador: Ministerio de Cultura, Departamento Editorial, 1957).
96. Georg Cohn, *Existenzialismus und Rechts-wissenschaft* (Basel, Switzerland: Verlag der Israel, 1955); Edmond Cahn, *The Sense of Injustice* (New York: New York University Press, 1949); *The Moral Decision* (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 1955).
97. Gerhart Husserl's *Recht und Zeit* (Frankfurt, Germany: V. Klostermann, 1935); Günter Less, *Vom Wesen und Wert des Richterrechts* (Erlangen, Germany: Palm & Enke, 1954); Passerin d'Entreves, *Natural Law* (London: Hutchinson, 1951); Noberto Bobbio, *Politica y Cultura* (Turin, Italy: Einaudi, 1955); "Formalismo Giuridico e Formalismo Etico," *Revista di Filosofia*, 45 (1954), pp. 264–286; Giorgio Del Vecchio, *Lo Stato* (Rome, Italy: Editrice Studium, 1953); *La Verità nella Morale e nel Diritto* (Rome, Italy:

Studium, 1954); "Mutabilita ed Eternita del Diritto," *Jus*, 5 (1954); *Justice*, (Edinburgh, Scotland, 1952); and Juan M. Terán, *Filosofia del Derecho* (Mexico: Porrúa, 1952).

98. Guido Fasso, *La Storia Come Esperienza Giuridica* (Milan, Italy: Giuffrè, 1953); Luigi Bagolini, "Value Judgments in Ethics and in Law," *Philosophical Quarterly*, 1 (1951), pp. 423–432.

99. Georges Bastide, *Mirages et Certitudes de la Civilisation* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1953); Sebastian De Grazia, *The Political Community: A Study of Anomie* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1948).

100. David Easton, *The Political System* (New York: Knopf, 1953); *A System Analysis of Political Life* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1965); Jacques Maritain, *Man and the State* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951); Fernández del Valle Basave, *Teoria del Estado* (Mexico: Editorial Jus, 1955).

101. See Jules Vuillemin, *L'Etre et le Travail*, (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1949); Eugène Dupréel, *Traité de Sociologie Générale* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1948); Luis Recaséns Siches, *Tratado General de Sociología* (Mexico: Editorial Porrúa, 1956); Pitirim Sorokin, *The Reconstruction of Humanity* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1954); *Explorations in Altruistic Love and Behavior* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1950); *The Ways of Power of Love* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1954); *Forms and Techniques of Altruistic and Spiritual Growth* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1954); Konrad Mellerowicz, *Wert und Wertung in Betrieb* (Essen, Germany: W. Girarde, 1952); W. Wittmann, *Der Wertbegriff in der Betriebswirtschaftslehre* (Opladen-Köln, Germany: 1956).

102. Walter A. Weisskopf, *The Psychology of Economics* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1955); Gunnar Myrdal, *The Political Element in the Development of Economic Theory* (London: Routledge, 1953).

103. Jean-Louis Fyot, *Dimensions de l'Homme et Science Economique* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1952); Albert Lauterbach, *Man, Motives, and Money: Psychological Frontiers of Economics* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1954); Kenneth J. Arrow, *Social Choice and Individual Values* (New York: Wiley, 1935); Ronald H. Barback, "Economics and Moral Judgment," *Australasian Journal of Psychology and Philosophy*, 3 (1954), pp. 30–47.

104. David Bidney, *Theoretical Anthropology* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1953); Dorothy Lee, "Being and Value in a Primitive Culture," *Journal of Philosophy*, 46 (1949), pp. 401–415; "Symboliation and Value," in *Symbols and Values: An Initial Study*, Lyman Bryson, ed. (New York: Harper, 1954); "Notes and the Conception of the Self Among the Wintu Indians," *Explorations*, 3 (1954), pp. 49–58; *Freedom and Culture* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1959).

105. Marcel Reding, *Metaphysik der Sittlichen Werte* (Dusseldorf, Germany: L. Schwann, 1949).

106. Eliseo Vivas, *The Moral Life and the Ethical Life* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1950).

107. Daniel Christoff, "La Tâche d'une Morale Philosophique," *Revue de Théologie et de Philosophie*, 2 (1952), pp. 107–119; "Contemplation et Création," *Revue de Théologie et de Philosophie*, 3 (1953), pp. 108–122; *Les Temps et les Valeurs* (Neuchâtel, Switzerland: Editions de la Baconnière, 1944); *Recherche de la Liberté* (Paris, France: Presses Universitaires de France, 1957); "Continuidad y Discontinuidad del Tiempo Vivido," *Dianoia*, 1964.

108. Gabriel Philippe Widmer, *Les Valeurs et Leur Signification* (Neuchâtel, Switzerland: Delachaux & Niestlé, 1950); "La Conscience des Valeurs," *Studia Philosophica*, 13 (1953), pp. 135–156.

109. E.g., see Ch. Perleman, "Comment Raisonnons-nous sur des Valeurs?" *Nederl. T. Psychol.*, 47 (1955), pp. 134–138; also *Traité de l' Argumentation* (Paris, France: P.U.F., 1958); *Justice et Raison* (Brussels, Belgium: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 1963); *The Idea of Justice and the Problem of Argument* (London: Routledge & Paul, 1963).

110. Maria Ossowska, *Motywy Postepowania. Z zagadnien Psychologii Moralnosci* (*Human Motivation: Inquiry into the Psychology of Moral Life*) (Warszawa: Ksiazka i Wiedza, 1949); "Qu'Est ce qu'un Jugement de Valeur?" *Proceedings X, International Congress of Philosophy* (Amsterdam, Holland: North-Holland Pub. Co., 1949), pp. 443 ff.

111. Yehoshua Bar-Hillel, "On the Character of the Ethical Judgment," *Iyyun*, 5 (1954), pp. 18–24.

112. Robert S. Hartman, "Value Theory as a Formal System," *Kant-Studien*, 50 (1958–1959), pp. 287–315; John W. Davis, "Is Philosophy a Sickness or a Therapy?" *The Antioch Review*, (Spring 1963), pp. 5–21.

113. Georges Kalinowski, "Theorie des Proposition Normatives," *Studia Logica* (Poznán, 1953), Vol. 1, pp. 147–182; "Interpretation Juridique et Logique des Proposition Normatives," *Logique et Analyse*, N. S. 2, 6-7 (1959), pp. 128–143.

114. G. H. von Wright, *An Essay in Modal Logic* (Amsterdam, Holland: North-Holland Pub. Co., 1951). Also see Alex R. Anderson, "The Logic of Norms," *Logique et Analyse*, N. S. (April 1958), pp. 84–91. Also see the works of Sören Halledén mentioned in Chapter Five.

115. G. H. von Wright, "Deontic Logic," *Mind*, 60 (1951), pp. 1–15.

116. Eduardo García Máynez, "La Lógica Deóntica de G. H. Von Wright y la Ontología Formal del Derecho," *Revista de la Facultad de Derecho de Mexico*, 3:9 (1953), pp. 10–37; *Introducción a la Lógica Jurídica* (Mexico: Editorial Porrúa, 1951); *Los Principios de la Ontología Formal del Derecho y su Expresión Simbólica* (Mexico: Imprenta Universitaria, 1953); *Lógica del Juicio Jurídico* (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura, 1955); *Lógica del Concepto Jurídico* (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura, 1959); *Lógica del Socioimo Jurídico* (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura, 1964).

117. Norberto Bobbio, "La Logica Giuridical di Eduardo García Máynez," *Revista Internazionale di Filosofia del Diritto*, 31 (1954), pp. 644–669.

118. A. P. Brogan, "The Fundamental Value Universal," *Journal of Philosophy*, 16 (1919), pp. 96–104.

119. E. T. Mitchell, *A System of Ethics* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1950).

120. *Ibid.*, p. 105.

121. *Ibid.*, p. 176.

122. See Brogan, "The Fundamental Value Universal." pp. 96–104.

123. M. Timur, "'Better' as the Value-Fundamental," *Mind*, 64 (1955), pp. 52–60; *The Theory of Morals* (London: Elek Books, 1956).

124. Timur, *The Theory of Morals*, p. 292.

125. Plato, *Philebus*, 16ff. Cf. *The Dialogues of Plato*, B. Jowett, trans. (New York, Random House, 1937), Vol. 2, pp. 348ff.

126. Reprinted below from Felix S. Cohen, *Ethical Systems and Legal Ideals*. Copyright © 1959 by Cornell University. Used by permission of the publisher, Cornell University Press.
127. *Ibid.*, pp. 133–134.
128. *Ibid.*, pp. 139–140.
129. *Ibid.*, pp. 134–135.
130. *Ibid.*, pp. 148 ff.
131. *Ibid.*, p. 149.
132. *Ibid.*, p. 152.
133. G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), pp. 20–21.
134. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, p. 156.
135. Cohen, *Ethical Systems and Legal Ideals*, p. 164.
136. *Ibid.*
137. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, pp. 111, 125, 145.
138. Cohen, *Ethical Systems and Legal Ideals*, p. 170.
139. *Ibid.*, p. 171.
140. Daniel Christoff, “Le Fondement Logique des Valeurs,” *Proceedings X, International Congress of Philosophy* (Amsterdam, Holland: North-Holland Pub. Co., 1949); “La Valeurs en Général et les Valeurs Spécifique,” *International Congress of Philosophy* (Mexico: 1963).
141. Robert S. Hartman, “The Moral Situation: A Field Theory of Ethics,” *Journal of Philosophy*, 45 (26 May 1948), pp. 292–300.
142. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 48–49.
143. See Warner A. Wick, “Moral Problems, Moral Philosophy, and Metaethics: Some Further Dogmas of Empiricism,” *Philosophical Review*, 62 (1953), pp. 3–22.
144. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 165 ff.
145. J. O. Urmson, “On Grading,” *Mind*, 59 (1950), pp. 145–169. Also in *Logic and Language*, A. G. N. Flew, ed. (Oxford, England: Basil Blackwell, 1965), pp. 381–409.
146. Urmson, “On Grading,” *Logic and Language*, p. 397.
147. *Ibid.*, p. 399.
148. *Ibid.*
149. *Ibid.*, p. 403.
150. Karl Britton, “Mr. Urmson on Grading,” *Mind*, 60 (1951), pp. 526–529.
151. G. E. Moore, *Philosophical Studies* (London: Routledge & K. Paul, 1948), p. 273.

## Chapter Eight

1. Bertrand Russell, *My Philosophical Development* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1959), p. 250.
2. *Oxford English Dictionary* (Oxford, England: The Clarendon Press, 1970).
3. Descartes, René, *Regulae ad Directionem Ingenii* (Gravenhage, Holland: Martinus Nijhoff, 1966), Regula 12.
4. Carl G. Hempel, *Fundamentals of Concept Formation in Empirical Science* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952), p. 46.
5. *Ibid.*, p. 40.
6. Paul W. Taylor, “Four Types of Ethical Relativism,” *Philosophical Review*, 63 (1954), pp. 500–516.

7. *Ibid.*, p. 507.
8. *Ibid.*, p. 508.
9. *Ibid.*, p. 507.
10. *Ibid.*
11. *Ibid.*
12. *Ibid.*, p. 508.
13. *Ibid.*, p. 509.
14. *Ibid.*
15. *Ibid.*
16. Alfred North Whitehead and Bertrand Russell, *Principia Mathematica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1925), p. 62.
17. Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value: Foundations of Scientific Axiology* (Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), pp. 165 ff.
18. Galilei, Galileo, *Dialogues Concerning Two New Sciences* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1950), p. 162.
19. Georg Joos, *Theoretical Physics* (London and Glasgow: Blackie & Son, Ltd., 1934), p. 1. Cf. N. R. Hanson, *Patterns of Discovery* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1958), Ch. 4.
20. Robert S. Hartman, "A Logical Definition of Value," *Journal of Philosophy*, 48 (1951), pp. 413–420.
21. Taylor, "Four Types of Ethical Relativism," p. 508.
22. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 165ff.
23. Taylor, "Four Types of Ethical Relativism," p. 514.
24. *Ibid.*, p. 516.
25. *Ibid.*
26. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 165ff.
27. *Ibid.*, pp. 293–302.
28. A. C. Garnett, *The Moral Nature of Man* (New York: Ronald Press Co., 1952), pp. 112ff; "A Non-normative Definition of Good," in *The Language of Value*, ed. Ray Lepley (New York: Columbia University Press, 1957), pp. 12ff., "Is Good a Normative Concept?" *Philosophical Quarterly*, (1957), pp. 260–263.
29. Garnett, "Is Good a Normative Concept?" p. 263.
30. Cf. Garnett, *The Moral Nature of Man*, pp. 120–122.
31. Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Practical Reason* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1949), p. 169.
32. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 5.
33. Garnett, *The Moral Nature of Man*, p. 120.
34. Edwin T. Mitchell, *A System of Ethics* (New York: Scribner, 1950), pp. 103ff.; G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), p. 119.
35. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, index entries for "Galileo" and "Husserl." pp. 368, 370.
36. E.g., Albert L. Hilliard, *The Forms of Value: The Extension of a Hedonistic Axiology* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1950), and esp. Everett W. Hall, *What is Value?* (New York: Humanities Press, 1952).
37. William K. Frankena, "Moral Philosophy at Mid-Century," *Philosophical Review*, 60 (1 January 1951), p. 55.
38. Garnett, *The Moral Nature of Man*, p. 120.
39. *Ibid.*

40. Garnett, "Is Good a Normative Concept?" pp. 262–263.
41. Confucius, *Confucian Analects* (New York: Kasper & Horton, 1950), Ch. 17.
42. R. M. Hare, *The Language of Morals* (Oxford, England: Clarendon Press, 1952), pp. 121, 125, 149.
43. Henry David Thoreau, *The Living Thoughts of Thoreau*, Theodore Dreiser, ed. (Greenwich, Conn: Fawcett Publications, 1939), p. 71.
44. Garnett, *The Moral Nature of Man*, p. 120, and "Is Good a Normative Concept?" p. 262.
45. *Time*, (5 May 1957).
46. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 265–293.

### Chapter Nine

1. See Constance Reid, *From Zero to Infinity* (New York: Crowell, 1956), p. 129.
2. See Ch. 3 above and Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value: Foundations of Scientific Axiology* (Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), pp. 79–92.
3. Galileo Galilei, *Dialogues Concerning Two New Sciences* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1950), pp. 162 ff.
4. Alfred North Whitehead, *Science and the Modern World* (New York: The Free Press, 1967), p. 32.
5. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 64–69.
6. See Henry M. Pachter, *Magic into Science: The Story of Paracelsus* (New York: Schuman, 1951).
7. Everett W. Hall, *What is Value?* (New York: Humanities Press, 1952), esp. Ch. 6; "Existential Normatives," *Journal of Philosophy* 55 (16 January 1958), pp. 75–77.
8. Oliver A. Johnson, *Rightness and Goodness* (The Hague: Nijhoff, 1959).
9. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 293–302.
10. See A. C. Ewing, *The Definition of Good* (New York: Humanities Press, 1947); "Subjectivism and Naturalism in Ethics," *Mind*, 53 (1944). Reprinted in Wilfrid Sellars and John Hospers, *Readings in Ethical Theory* (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1952), pp. 115–133.
11. See Ewing, *The Definition of Good*, pp. 104ff.
12. A. C. Garnett, "Is Good a Normative Concept?" *Philosophical Quarterly*, 7 (1957), pp. 260–263.
13. Robert S. Hartman, "Research in the Logic of Value," *The Graduate Record*, Ohio State University (5 January 1952), pp. 6–8.
14. See the quote at the beginning of Ch. 8 above, p. 257. Cf. R. M. Hare, *The Language of Morals* (Oxford, England: Clarendon Press, 1952), pp. 79ff and Garnett, "Is Good a Normative Concept?" pp. 262ff.
15. Hall, *What is Value?*, pp. 162 and *pass.*
16. *Ibid.*, p. 180.
17. *Ibid.*, p. 178.
18. *Ibid.*, p. 177.
19. *Ibid.*
20. *Ibid.*
21. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 162–168.
22. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 178.
23. *Ibid.*

24. *Ibid.*, p. 59.
25. *Ibid.*
26. Lewis Carol, *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1971).
27. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 215–228.
28. Robert S. Hartman, "The Logic of Values," *Review of Metaphysics*, 14:3 (1961), pp. 389–432.
29. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 184, footnote.
30. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 31–43.
31. *Ibid.*, Ch. 5.
32. *Ibid.*, pp. 168–178.
33. See Hall, *What is Value?*, pp. 125ff.
34. See Everett W. Hall, *Our Knowledge of Fact and Value* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1961), Chs. 3 and 4.
35. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 101–104, 178–181, "The Logical Definition of Value," *Journal of Philosophy*, 48 (21 June 1951), pp. 413–420.
36. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 165ff.
37. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 179.
38. Carl G. Hempel, *Fundamentals of Concept Formation in Empirical Science* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952), p. 46.
39. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. ix.
40. R. M. Hare, "Review of Everett W. Hall, *What is Value?*," *Mind*, 63 (April 1954), p. 269.
41. Brand Blanshard, *On Philosophical Style* (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 1954), p. 58.
42. Hall, *What is Value?*, pp. 152, 183.
43. Everett W. Hall, "Existential Normatives," *Journal of Philosophy*, 55 (16 January 1958), p. 75.
44. Everett W. Hall, "Further Words on 'Ought'," *Philosophical Studies*, 7 (October 1956), p. 76. See also E. M. Adams, "The Nature of Ought," *Philosophical Studies*, 7 (April 1956), pp. 46–59.
45. E. M. Adams, "Hall's Analysis of 'Ought'," *Journal of Philosophy*, 55 (16 January 1958), pp. 73–75.
46. Hall, "Existential Normatives," p. 74.
46. *Ibid.*
48. *Ibid.*, p. 75.
49. *Ibid.*, pp. 75–76.
50. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 168–178.
51. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 183n..
52. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 168–178.
53. Hall, "Existential Normatives," p. 75.
54. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, p. 192.
55. *Ibid.*
56. Hall, *Our Knowledge of Fact and Value*, p. 169.
57. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 242.
58. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 165ff.
59. Hall, *Modern Science and Human Values* (Princeton, N.J.: D. Van Nostrand, 1956), pp. 469–470.
60. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 180.

61. *Ibid.*
62. Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Farbenlehre, Historischer Teil* (Weimar, Germany: H. Böhlaus Nachfolger, 1957).
63. Robert S. Hartman, "Value, Fact, and Science," *Philosophy of Science* 25 (April 1958), p. 108.
64. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 162.
65. See E. T. Bell, *The Magic of Numbers* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1946), p. 177.
66. E. M. Adams, "The Nature of Ought," *Philosophical Studies*, 7 (April 1956), pp. 36–42.
67. See Hall, *Our Knowledge of Fact and Value*.
68. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 183.
69. E. T. Bell, "Review of S. C. Dodd, *Dimensions of Society*," *American Sociological Review*, 7 (1942), pp. 707–709. See also David Garcia Baca, *Introducción a la Lógica Moderna* (Barcelona, Spain: Editorial Labor, 1936), pp. 37ff; J. M. Keynes, *A Treatise on Probability* (London: Macmillan, 1921).
70. Hall, *What is Value?*, p. 226.
71. Plato, *Timaeus*, 56B.
72. *Ibid.*, 55C.
73. Hall, *Modern Science and Human Values*, pp. 105ff, 118.
74. Francis Bacon, *Novum Organum* (Oxford, England: The Clarendon Press, 1889), Book 1, Aphorisms 95 ff.
75. *Ibid.*, Aphor. 95.
76. *Ibid.*, Aphor. 98, *Italics supplied*.
77. *Ibid.*, Aphor. 96, 97.
78. *Ibid.*, Aphor. 104.
79. Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Naturwissenschaftliche Schriften, Gedenkausgabe der Werke, Briefe und Gespräche* (Zürich, Switzerland: Artemis-Verlag, 1949), Vol. 17, p. 705.
80. Bacon, *Novum Organum*, Book 1, Aphor. 104.

## Chapter Ten

1. Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Analyse und Synthese*, Vol. 16, p. 890.
2. G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), p. 12.
3. Immanuel Kant, *Kant's Inaugural Dissertation of 1770*, trans. William Eckoff, (New York: Columbia College), 1894, par. 5.
4. P. W. Bridgman, *The Logic of Modern Physics* (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1927).
5. Jeremy Bentham, *An Introduction to the Principles of Morals and Legislation*, Ch. 4, reprinted in L. A. Selby-Bigge, *British Moralists* (Oxford, England: Clarendon, 1897), Vol. 1, pp. 356–359.
6. Francis Hutcheson, *An Inquiry Concerning the Original of Our Ideas of Virtue or Moral Good*, Sect. 3:9. Reprinted in L. A. Selby-Bigge, *British Moralists* (Oxford, England: Clarendon, 1897), Vol. 1, pp. 110–113.
7. Brand Blanshard, *On Philosophical Style* (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 1954), pp. 44–45.
8. *Ibid.*, pp. 38ff.

9. José Ortega y Gasset, *The Revolt of the Masses* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1932), Ch. 12.
10. Henry M. Pachter, *Magic into Science: The Story of Paracelsus* (New York: Schuman, 1951), p. 329.
11. Pitrim Sorokin, *Fads and Foibles in Modern Sociology and Related Sciences* (Chicago: H. Regnery Co., 1956), pp. 122ff.
12. L. Guttman and P. F. Lazarsfeld in *Measurement and Prediction: Studies in Social Psychology in World War II*, Samuel A. Stouffer, Louis Guttman, Edward A. Suchman, Paul F. Lazarsfeld, Shirley A. Starr, and John A. Claussen, eds. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1950), Vol. 4.
13. Sorokin, *Fads and Foibles in Modern Sociology and Related Sciences*, pp. 123ff.
14. *Ibid.*, p. 127.
15. A. Kaplan, "Sociology Learns the Language of Mathematics," *The World of Mathematics*, ed. J. R. Newman (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1956), Vol. 2, pp. 1294–1313.
16. William H. Werkmeister, *A Philosophy of Science* (Lincoln, Neb.: University of Nebraska Press, 1940), p. 416.
17. Charles W. Morris, *Varieties of Human Value* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956), pp. 9, 12. Cf. Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, Book 1, Ch. 6.
18. Morris, *ibid.*, p. 12.
19. Guttman and Lazarsfeld.
20. Morris, *Varieties of Human Value*, p. 1.
21. See Edwin A. Burtt, *The Metaphysical Foundations of Modern Physical Science* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday & Co., 1954), p. 81.
22. Morris, *Varieties of Human Value*, p. 148.
23. *Ibid.*, pp. 144–170. See also Charles Morris, "Significance, Signification, and Painting," *The Language of Value*, ed. Ray Lepley (New York: Columbia University Press, 1957), pp. 58–76.
24. Morris, "Significance, Signification, and Painting," p. 58.
25. Morris, *Varieties of Human Value*, motto, p. ii.
26. *Ibid.*, pp. 59–60.
27. *Ibid.*, p. 61. *Italics supplied.*
28. *Ibid.*, p. 15.
29. *Ibid.*, p. 165.
30. *Ibid.*, pp. 61–62.
31. *Ibid.*, p. 63.
32. *Ibid.*
33. *Ibid.*, p. 64.
34. *Ibid.*
35. *Ibid.*, pp. 66ff.
36. *Ibid.*, p. 73.
37. *Ibid.*, p. 67.
38. *Ibid.*, p. 74.
39. *Ibid.*
40. *Ibid.*, p. 67.
41. *Ibid.*, p. 68.
42. *Ibid.*, p. 70, italics supplied.
43. *Ibid.*, p. 67.

44. *Ibid.*, p. 70, italics supplied.
45. *Ibid.*, p. 68.
46. *Ibid.*, pp. 68–69.
47. *Ibid.*, p. 74.
48. *Ibid.*, pp. 167–168, italics supplied.
49. *Ibid.*, p. 58.
50. See Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, B 12 ff. See also S. E. Toulmin, “Crucial Experiments: Priestly and Lavoisier,” *Roots of Scientific Thought*, eds. Philip P. Wiener and Aaron Noland (New York: Basic Books, 1958), pp. 481–496.
51. Morris, “Significance, Signification, and Painting,” p. 58.
52. Morris, *Varieties of Human Value*, p. 167.
53. *Ibid.*, p. 202ff.
54. Morris, “Significance, Signification, and Painting,” p. 76.
55. *Ibid.*, p. 63.
56. Charles W. Morris, “Comments and Responses,” in responses to Hartman, *The Language of Value*, ed. Ray Lepley (New York: Columbia University Press, 1957), p. 372.
57. Morris, “Significance, Signification, and Painting,” p. 63.
58. *Ibid.*, p. 59.
59. *Ibid.*, p. 74.
60. *Collected Papers of Charles Sanders Peirce*, eds. Charles Hartshorne and Paul Weiss (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1935), Vol. 6, par. 484.
61. Morris, *Varieties of Human Value*, Ch. 7; and “Significance, Signification, and Painting,” pp. 70–71.
62. Wiener and Noland, *Roots of Scientific Thought*, pp. 491ff.
63. Morris, *Varieties of Human Value*, p. 12.
64. R. Dugas, *A History of Mechanics* (New York: Central Book Co., 1955), p. 60.
65. F. Dessauer, “Galileo and Newton: The Turning Point in Western Thought,” *Spirit and Nature*, ed. J. Campbell (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1955), p. 297.
66. Alistair C. Crombie, *Augustine to Galileo: The History of Science A.D. 400–1650* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1963), p. 289.
67. Henry Crew, *The Rise of Modern Physics* (Baltimore: Williams & Wilkins, 1928), p. 81.
68. Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, B 12.
69. Herbert Butterfield, *The Origins of Modern Science* (New York, Free Press, 1957), Chs. 1, 5.
70. Alexandre Koyré, “Galileo and Plato,” *Roots of Scientific Thought*, eds. Philip P. Wiener and Aaron Noland (New York: Basic Books, 1958), p. 172.
71. Crew, *The Rise of Modern Physics*, p. 113.
72. Galileo Galilei, *Dialogues Concerning Two New Sciences* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1950), pp. 155–156.
73. Morris, *Varieties of Human Values*, p. viii.
74. Galileo, *Dialogues Concerning Two New Sciences*, pp. 154–155.
75. Morris, “Significance, Signification, and Painting,” p. 76.
76. Alfred North Whitehead, *Science and the Modern World* (New York: The Free Press, 1967), p. 32.
77. See Ernst Cassirer, *Substance and Function* (Chicago: Open Court Pub. Co., 1923), Ch. 1.

## Chapter Eleven

1. G. E. Moore, "The Conception of Intrinsic Values," *Philosophical Studies* (London: Routledge & K. Paul, 1948), p. 274.
2. José Ortega y Gasset, *Introducción a una Estimativa, Obras Completas*, (Madrid, Spain: Revista de Occidente, 1955), Vol. 6; trans. here and throughout this chapter from pp. 315–335 by Robert S. Hartman.
3. Charles Hartshorne, *Anselm's Discovery* (La Salle, Ill.: Open Court Pub. Co., 1965), pp. 3–18.
4. Robert S. Hartman, *The Structure of Value: Foundations of Scientific Axiology* (Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1967), pp. 69–92.
5. Cf. Plato, *Republic*, 506 E. Cf. *The Dialogues of Plato*, B. Jowett, trans. (New York, Random House, 1937), Vol. 2, p. 768. See also Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1096 b 8, 30.
6. G. E. Moore, *Principia Ethica* (Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1903), p. 60.
7. J. V. Langmead Casserley, *Morals and Man in the Social Sciences* (New York: Longmans, Green & Co., 1951), p. 73.
8. Nicolai Hartmann, *Kleinere Schriften* (Berlin, Germany: De Gruyter, 1955), Vol. 1, pp. 302ff.
9. Nicolas Malebranche, *De la Recherche de la Vérité* (Paris, France: Chez André Pralard, 1678-79) Book 4, Ch. 7.
10. Cf. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 3–21.
11. William Shakespeare, *Troilus and Cressida* (London: Davidson, 1852) Act 2, Scene 2.
12. See Augusto Selazar Bondi, *Irrealidad e Idealidad* (Lima: Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos, 1958).
13. Moore, *Principia Ethica*, pp. 110–111.
14. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, Ch. 6.
15. Robert S. Hartman, "The Logic of Value," *The Review of Metaphysics*, 14:3 (March 1961), pp. 389–432. Cf. Susanne K. Langer, *Philosophy in a New Key* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1942), Ch. 5.
16. Robert S. Hartman, "Four Axiological Proofs of the Infinite Value of Man," *Kant-Studien*, 55:3 (1964), pp. 428–438.
17. See Roman Ingarden, *Untersuchungen zur Ontologie der Kunst* (Tübingen, Germany: M. Niemeyer, 1962), pp. 139–253; Susanne K. Langer, *Feeling and Form* (New York: Scribner, 1953), Ch. 5; and Ortega y Gasset, *The Dehumanization of Art* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1948).
18. Raymond Ruyer, *Le Mond des Valeurs* (Paris, France: Aubier, 1948).
19. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, p. 311.
20. Risieri Frondizi, *What is Value?* (La Salle, Ill.: Open Court Pub. Co., 1963).
21. *Ibid.*, pp. 8, 28.
22. *Ibid.*, p. 128.
23. *Ibid.*, p. 131.
24. *Ibid.*, pp. 133–134.
25. *Ibid.*, p. 134.
26. *Ibid.*
27. *Ibid.*, pp. 23ff.
28. *Ibid.*, p. 140.

29. *Ibid.*, p. 139.
30. *Ibid.*, p. 138.
31. Theodor Lessing, *Studien zur Wertaxiomatik*, trans. here by Robert S. Hartman (Leipzig, Germany: Felix Meiner, 1914).
32. *Ibid.*, p. viii.
33. *Ibid.*, p. ix.
34. *Ibid.*, p. xii.
35. *Ibid.*, p. xiv.
36. *Ibid.*, pp. xiii, xiv.
37. *Ibid.*, p. 4.
38. *Ibid.*
39. *Ibid.*, p. 5.
40. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 292ff.
41. *Ibid.*, p. 19.
42. *Ibid.*, p. 20.
43. *Ibid.*
44. *Ibid.*, p. 5.
45. *Ibid.*
46. *Ibid.*, p. 20.
47. Theodor Lessing, *In Bruch in der Ethik Kants* (Bern, Switzerland: 1908).
48. See Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 64–69.
49. Lessing, *Studien zur Wertaxiomatik*, p. 4.
50. *Ibid.*, p. 20.
51. Lessing, *Studien zur Wertaxiomatik*, p. 20.
52. Edmund Husserl, *Formale und Transzendentale Logik* (Halle, Germany: M. Niemeyer, 1929), pp. 121ff.
53. See Daniel Christoff, *Le Temps et les Valeurs* (Neuchâtel, Switzerland: Éditions de la Baconnière, 1945).
54. E.g. see Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 265–293.
55. Lessing, *Studien zur Wertaxiomatik*, p. 22.
56. *Ibid.*, pp. 23ff.
57. Hartman, *The Structure of Value*, pp. 41, 91–92, 298–299, 355 n. 2.
58. *Ibid.*, pp. 310–311.