

**SERIES ON
INTERNATIONAL
LAW AND
DEVELOPMENT**

Editorial Board

Series Editor

Raj Bhala

**Rice Distinguished Professor
The University of Kansas
School of Law
Lawrence, KS • USA**

Professor Scott Optican

**Faculty of Law
University of Auckland
Auckland, New Zealand**

Muhammad Nawazish Pirzada

**Associate Professor of Law
Pakistan College of Law
Partner, Pirzada Law Partners
Lahore, Pakistan**

Ramsay Taylor

**Attorney
Baker & Botts
Riyadh, Saudi Arabia**

Professor Peter Muchlinski

**Kent Law School
University of Kent at Canterbury
England**

The IMF, the World Bank Group and the Question of Human Rights

BAHRAM GHAZI



Transnational Publishers

Published and distributed by Transnational Publishers, Inc.
Ardsley Park
Science and Technology Center
410 Saw Mill River Road
Ardsley, NY 10502

Phone: 914-693-5100

Fax: 914-693-4430

E-mail: info@transnationalpubs.com

Web: www.transnationalpubs.com

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Ghazi, Bahram.

The IMF, the World Bank group, and the question of human rights /
by Bahram Ghazi Shariat Panahi.

p. cm.

At head of title: Université de Genève. Institut universitaire de
hautes études internationales.

"Thèse no. 672".

Thesis (doctoral)—Université de Genève, 2004.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-57105-185-6

1. Financial institutions, International—Political aspects. 2. Human
rights. 3. International Monetary Fund. 4. World Bank Group.

I. Title.

HG3881.G46 2004

323—dc 22

2005041738

Copyright © 2005 by Transnational Publishers, Inc.

All rights reserved. This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that copying permitted by U.S. Copyright Law in Section 107, "fair use" in teaching and research, Section 108, certain library copying, and except in published media by reviewers in limited excerpts), without written permission from the publisher.

Manufactured in the United States of America

This work is dedicated to the loving memory of my father,
Dr. Abolfazl Ghazi, whose commitment to his students and to
the promotion of the rule of law has always inspired me.

I also dedicate this work to my mother who helped my
throughout these years with her unalterable support and affection.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>List of Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>xxi</i>

Chapter 1 **History, Structure, Organization and Operations of the** **International Monetary Fund**

1. History	1
A. The Origins	1
B. The Purpose of the Organization	2
C. Crisis of the Bretton Woods System	3
2. Structure	4
3. Operations	5
A. Exchange Arrangements	6
B. Surveillance	6
C. Consultations	6
4. Functions	7
A. Financial Functions	7
a. Source of Finance	8
b. Financial Assistance	9
c. IMF's Loans and Facilities	10
d. Charges	11
e. SDRs	12
B. Other Activities	13
a. Services	13
b. Economies in Transition and LDCs	14
5. Quotas and Decision Making	14
6. Conditionality	15

Chapter 2 **History, Structure, Organization and Operations of the** **World Bank Group**

1. International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD)	20
A. History	20
B. Membership	20

C. Structure	21
D. Loans and Guarantees	21
2. International Development Association (IDA)	24
A. History	24
B. Membership	24
C. Operations	25
D. IDA Borrowers	26
E. IDA Lending	26
F. IDA Funding	26
3. International Finance Corporation (IFC)	27
A. History	27
B. Membership	28
C. Corporate Structure	28
D. Operations	29
E. Project Finance	30
a. Advisory Services	31
b. Investment Operations	31
4. Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency (MIGA)	32
A. History	32
B. Membership	32
C. Operations	32
D. Other Activities	33
5. International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID)	34
A. History	34
B. Structure	34
C. Procedure	34
D. Other Activities	35
6. Conclusion to Chapters 1 and 2	35

Chapter 3

IFI Activities and Human Rights Violations

1. The Relation Between IFIs' Activities and Human Rights Violations	39
2. Projects	40
A. Land Bank Program in Brazil	41
B. The Kedung Ombo Project	42
C. The Quinghai Project	43
D. Oil Projects in Africa	43
3. Macro-economic Policies	55
A. The Washington Consensus	55
B. Structural Adjustments	47
C. Conditionality	50
D. Privatisation	50
E. Corporate Interests	51
4. Loans and Financial Aid	52

5. Debt and Its Repayment	55
6. Conclusion	57

Chapter 4

Evolution of Human Rights and Related Notions Inside IFIs

1. World Bank's Operational Guidelines	59
2. Direct References to Human Rights	60
3. Indigenous Peoples	64
4. Children's Rights	65
5. Labor Rights	66
6. Women's Rights	67
7. Environment	68
8. Resettlement and Displacement Issues	71
9. Social Initiatives	72
A. World Bank's Social Impact Analysis	72
B. MIGA Social and Environmental Procedures	72
C. Social Dimensions of the IMF's Policy Dialogue	75
10. Development	75
11. Poverty and Debt	76
A. Debt Initiative for the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPCs)	77
B. IDA and Poverty	79
C. IFC and Poverty Reduction	80
12. Human Capital Development	80
13. Post-Conflict Reconstruction	81
14. Disability	82
15. Conclusion	82

Chapter 5

Politics, Human Rights and IFIs

1. Politics in IFIs	85
A. Decision-Making Procedures and Power Distribution	85
B. Politicization of IFI Activities	87
C. Instrumentalization of the IFIs	87
D. Independence of Executive Directors	88
E. Are Human Rights Politics?	92
2. A Shift in IFIs and Human Rights Relations	93
A. A Slow Evolution	93
B. A New World Bank Position on Human Rights	95
3. Conclusion	97

Chapter 6

International Legal Personality of the IMF and the World Bank

1. The Debate on Human Rights Obligations of IFIs	99
2. International Legal Personality Applied to the IMF and the WB	102
A. International Legal Personality	102

B. International Legal Personality and Third States	106
C. The Consequences of International Legal Personality.	107
D. Application to Our Current Problem	109
3. World Bank and IMF Constituencies	111
A. Non-Economic Considerations in IFIs' Mandates	111
B. Non-Reference to Human Rights and Interpretation of the Articles of Agreements.	114
C. Evolution of Human Rights and IFIs Articles of Agreement . . .	116
D. Margin of Interpretation.	1117
E. IFIs Articles of Agreement and the Relationship Agreements	119
4. Defining Human Rights Obligations for IFIs.	124
A. Various Classifications of Obligations	124
B. Levels of Human Rights Obligations	125
5. Conclusion	127

Chapter 7

Sources of Human Rights Obligations for IFIs and Their Member States

1. Customary International Human Rights	129
A. General Practice and <i>Opinio Juris</i>	129
B. Declarations and Resolutions	130
C. IFIs and Customary Human Rights Law	133
2. Human Rights Treaty Obligations	134
A. U.N. Charter-Based Obligations.	134
B. The International Covenants	135
3. Particular Sources of Human Rights Obligations	140
A. Peremptory Norms	140
a. International Obligations of States Under <i>Jus Cogens</i>	140
b. Non-Derogable Rights	142
c. Serious Breach of an Obligation Arising Under a Peremptory Norm.	143
d. <i>Jus Cogens</i> and IFIs.	144
B. <i>Erga Omnes</i> Obligations	145
4. General International Law	147
A. Good Faith	147
B. Unilateral Acts	149
a. Unilateral Acts and IFIs Member States	149
b. Unilateral Acts and IFIs	150
C. The Notion of Consensus	151
D. Soft Law	151
5. Conflicts of Norms.	152
A. Conflicting Obligations of States	152
B. Norm Conflict Between IFIs and Other IOs	153
6. International Cooperation	155

A. The Principle of Solidarity	156
B. The Duty to Cooperate	167
C. The Concept of International Community	158
7. Conclusion	161

Chapter 8

Other Sources of Human Rights Obligations for the World Bank and the IMF

1. Governance	163
A. World Bank and Governance	163
B. The IMF and the Issue of Governance	165
C. Linking Governance and Human Rights	167
2. Democracy	168
A. Studies on Democracy and Project Performances	168
B. Linking Democracy and Human Rights	170
C. Demands for Democracy and Transparency in IFIs	170
3. Development	171
A. Sustainable Development	172
B. Right to Development	173
C. Freedom from Poverty	174
4. International Peace and Security	176
A. Security Council's Decisions	176
B. Terrorism and Human Rights	178
C. The Peace Conditionality	179
5. Humanitarian Law	179
6. Economy, Finance and Human Rights	180
7. Conclusion	181

Chapter 9

Responsibility Under Public International Law

1. Preliminary Remarks	183
2. IFIs' Responsibility in Internal Legal Systems	185
3. IFIs' Responsibility Under International Law	188
A. Bases for Establishing Responsibility	189
B. The Illicit Act	191
C. Attribution of the Illicit Act	192
D. Exclusion of the Illicit Character of the Act	194
a. Self-Defense	194
b. Distress	194
c. Necessity	195
d. <i>Force Majeure</i>	195
e. Counter-Measures	196
f. Consent	196
E. IFIs' Indirect Responsibility	197
4. Responsibility of Member States	198

A. Responsibility of a State for Its Officials and Organs	198
B. General Responsibility of States	199
C. Responsibility of Member States for Wrongful Act Committed by an IFI	200
D. Responsibility Regimes Toward Third Parties	202
5. Responsibility of Individuals	205
A. Individual Responsibility	205
B. Complicity	209
C. Conditions of Responsibility for Crimes and Human Rights Violations	210
6. Consequences of Responsibility	211
7. Conclusion	212

Chapter 10

Accountability Mechanisms

1. Accountability by Judicial Means	213
A. ICJ's Advisory Opinions	213
B. <i>Actio Popularis</i>	214
C. Individual Claims	216
2. The World Bank Inspection Panel	217
A. History of the Inspection Panel (IP)	217
B. Composition, Purpose and Functions	217
C. Requests	217
D. Remarks and Criticisms	219
E. The IP and Human Rights	221
3. IFC-MIGA Compliance Advisor/Ombudsman (CAO)	223
A. Scope of Work of the CAO	224
B. Organization of the CAO	226
C. Complaints	226
D. Compliance Audit	228
E. Advisory Role	230
F. The CAO and Human Rights	230
4. IMF's Independent Evaluation Office	232
A. Background to the Establishment of IEO	232
B. Terms of Reference	235
5. Conclusion	240

Chapter 11

Human Rights Mainstreaming Inside the World Bank and the IMF

1. Human Rights Obligations for IFIs	241
A. General Remarks	241
B. A Listing of IFIs' Human Rights Obligations	242
a. Self-Determination and Use of Natural Resources	242
b. Non-Discrimination	243
c. Freedom from Slavery	244
d. Right to Life	244

e. Judicial Guarantees and Fair Justice	245
f. Right to Liberty and Security	245
g. Freedom of Thought and Opinion	246
h. Right to Assembly	246
i. Workers' Rights	246
j. Freedom from Torture	247
k. Right of Minorities and Rights of Indigenous Peoples	247
l. Right to an Adequate Standard of Living	248
m. Right to Health	248
n. Right to Education	248
o. Political Rights	249
C. The Inter-Relation of Norms	249
2. World Bank Approach on Human Rights Guidelines	250
A. Project Cycle	250
B. Governance and Human Rights	251
C. Judicial Reforms and Human Rights	257
D. Consultation and Participation	259
3. Additional Measures	263
A. Additional Guidelines	263
B. Taking the Global Compact into Account	266
C. Democracy and Human Rights	270
D. Human Rights and Conflict and Post-Conflict Situations	270
4. Economic and Financial Aspects of IFIs' Operations	272
A. General Guidelines	272
B. The Use of Conditionality	273
C. A Human Rights Approach to Economics: The Case of Debt	274
D. An Economic Approach to Human Rights	275
5. Conclusion	2778

Chapter 12

Improving Conditions for the Implementation of Human Rights in IFIs

1. Changes Inside the IFIs	279
A. Democratization and Transparency of IFIs	279
B. Work with Civil Society and NGOs	282
C. Working with Parliaments and Other Organs	286
2. Reforming IFIs	287
A. Revision in IFI Models	287
B. Reforming the IMF	290
C. Reforming the World Bank	292
3. Collaboration at International Level	292
A. Collaboration Between the Institutions	292
B. Joint U.N./Bretton Woods Institutions Review	296
4. International Law and Judicial System	297
5. Conclusion	300

Conclusions and Prospects for Future Research 303

Bibliography. 313

Annexes. 373

Index. 433