

INTERNATIONAL LAW AND SELF-DETERMINATION

Developments in International Law

VOLUME 38

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

JOSHUA CASTELLINO

**INTERNATIONAL LAW AND
SELF-DETERMINATION**

**The Interplay of the Politics of Territorial
Possession with Formulations of
Post-Colonial 'National' Identity**



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

THE HAGUE / BOSTON / LONDON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 90-411-1409-2

Published by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America
by Kluwer Law International,
675 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Layout and camera-ready copy:
Anne-Marie Krens, Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest – The Netherlands

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 2000 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	xi
ABBREVIATIONS	xiii
TABLE OF DOCUMENTS	xv
TABLE OF CASES	xvii
TABLE OF TREATIES	xix
TABLE OF UN DOCUMENTS	xxi
INTRODUCTION	1

PART I

THEORETICAL UNDERPINNINGS OF THE DISCOURSE OF SELF-DETERMINATION

1	THE HISTORY OF THE NORM OF SELF-DETERMINATION	7
	Introduction	7
1.1	Two Models of Self-Determination Theory	9
1.2	The Origins of the Concept	11
1.3	Wilson: the Father of Modern Self-Determination	13
1.3.1	Åland Islands Case	19
1.4	Soviet Support: the Norm Changes Guise	21
1.5	The 1960 Declaration of Independence (xv)	22
1.6	Resolution 1541 (xv)	27
1.7	The International Covenants for Human Rights (1966)	31
1.8	The 1970 Declaration (xxv)	34
	Conclusion	42

2	WHO ARE THE PEOPLE? NATIONAL MINORITIES IN SELF-DETERMINATION DISCOURSE	45
	Introduction	45
2.1	What is a Minority?	48
2.2	The Concept of a 'Minority' in Historical Perspective	49
2.3	Current Attempts to Protect Minorities	55
2.4	Claims to Peoplehood	64
2.5	Were the Ibos a people?	69
	Conclusion	71
3	THE STATE AND SELF-DETERMINATION: THE CONCEPTUAL CONFLICT BETWEEN SELF-DETERMINATION AND TERRITORIAL SOVEREIGNTY	75
	Introduction	75
3.1	The State	75
3.2	Sovereignty	90
3.2.1	Sovereignty in Modern Times	94
3.3	Limits to Sovereignty	101
3.3.1	Norms of <i>Jus Cogens</i>	101
3.3.2	Status of Liberation Movements	102
3.3.3	Limits to Intervention	104
3.3.4	Limits to Use of Belligerent Force	106
	Conclusion	107
4	THE NORM OF UTI POSSIDETIS JURIS: THE DECIDING FACTOR IN THE CREATION OF MODERN NATIONAL IDENTITY	109
	Introduction	109
4.1	Meaning of the Doctrine of <i>Uti Possidetis</i>	109
4.2	Historic Development of the Norm	114
4.3	Viewed in International Legal History	121
4.4	The Merits of the Norm	126
4.5	Conflict with Self-Determination	132
4.6	Shortcomings of <i>Uti Possidetis</i>	136
4.7	<i>Uti Possidetis</i> and Modern International Law	140
	Conclusion	141

PART II
PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS OF THE DISCOURSE OF
SELF-DETERMINATION IN BANGLADESH AND
THE WESTERN SAHARA

Case Study I: 'Self-Determination' Achieved

5	THE BANGLADESHI SECESSION IN INTERNATIONAL LAW: SETTING NEW STANDARDS?	147
	Introduction	147
5.1	Self-Determination	149
5.1.1	The Evolving Norm	149
5.1.2	Bangla Claims to Statehood	151
5.1.3	The Merits of the Bangladeshi Case	152
5.1.4	The Norm of Self-Determination Post Bangladesh	155
5.2	Armed Intervention by a Third Party	156
5.2.1	The Use of Force Prior to Bangladesh	157
5.2.2	Use of Force under the Charter System	168
5.2.3	Use of Force & Self-Determination: The 1970 Declaration	158
5.2.4	Indian Action as Self-Defence	160
5.2.5	Precedents Set	162
5.3	Bangladesh & State Sovereignty	163
5.3.1	Applicability of Article 2(7)	163
5.3.2	Affecting International Peace & Security	164
5.3.3	Right to Police Action	165
5.3.4	Protection within International Law	166
5.4	Recognition of the Sovereign State of Bangladesh	167
5.4.1	Effects of Recognition	167
5.4.2	<i>De Jure & De Facto</i> Recognition	167
5.4.3	Difference from Biafra	169
	Conclusions	170

*Case Study II: 'National' Identity in the Western Sahara**Part 1*

6	MODERN INTERNATIONAL LEGAL HISTORY OF THE CONFLICT OVER THE WESTERN SAHARA	173
	Introduction	173
6.1	The Post-Colonial History of the Territory	177
6.2	Direct UN Involvement in the Western Sahara	183
6.3	OAU Involvement	189
6.4	Who Are the 'People'?	191
6.5	The Issue of Tribal Chiefs	195
6.6	The UN Fact Finding Mission	196
6.7	Hierarchies of Disputed Identities	200
6.8	Direct Negotiations	208
	Conclusion	211

*Case Study II: 'National Identity in the Western Sahara**Part 2*

7	THE WESTERN SAHARA CASE AND THE FALLACY OF THE SELF-DETERMINATION DISCOURSE	213
	Introduction	213
7.1	Historical Background	214
7.1.1	Sherifian Society	215
7.1.2	Bilad Shinguitti	220
7.1.3	Colonial Influence	225
7.2	The Case Before the International Court of Justice	228
7.2.1	'at the time of colonisation'	230
7.2.2	'terra nullius'	231
7.2.3	'legal ties'	233
7.3	Legal Ties' Between the Sherifian State & the Western Sahara	238
7.4	Identity in the Western Sahara – the View of the POLISARIO	252
	Conclusion	257

CONCLUSION	259
BIBLIOGRAPHY	263
APPENDICES	265
INDEX	283