

**INTERNATIONAL
AND
COMPARATIVE
CRIMINAL
LAW
SERIES**

Editorial Board

Series Editor

M. Cherif Bassiouni

President, International Human Rights Law Institute, DePaul University
President, International Institute of Higher Studies in Criminal Sciences, Siracusa, Italy
President, International Association of Penal Law, Paris, France
Professor of Law, DePaul University, Chicago, IL, USA

Diane Amann

Professor of Law
University of California
School of Law
Davis, CA, USA

Christopher L. Blakesley

William S. Boyd Professor of Law
School of Law
University of Nevada
Las Vegas, NV, USA

Roger S. Clark

Board of Governors Professor
Rutgers University
School of Law
Camden, NJ, USA

John Dugard

Member, International Law
Commission, Geneva; Emeritus
Professor of Law, University of
Witwatersrand, South Africa; and
Professor of Public International
Law, University of Leiden,
The Netherlands

Albin Eser

Professor of Criminal Law, Albert
Ludwig University; Director, Max-
Planck Institute for International and
Comparative Criminal Law
Freiburg, Germany

Alfredo Etcheberry

Professor of Criminal Law,
National University of Chile;
President, Chilean Lawyers'
Association, Santiago, Chile

Jordan Paust

Law Foundation Professor of Law
University of Houston Law Center
Houston, TX, USA

Mario Pisani

Professor of Criminal Procedure
Faculty of Law, University of Milan
Milan, Italy

William Michael Reisman

Myres S. McDougal Professor of Law
and Jurisprudence, Yale Law School
New Haven, CT, USA

Leila Sadat

Professor of Law
Washington University in St. Louis
School of Law
St. Louis, MO, USA

Michael P. Scharf

Professor of Law
Frederick K. Cox Int'l Law Center
Case Western University
School of Law
Cleveland, OH, USA

Kuniji Shibahara

Professor Emeritus
University of Tokyo, Faculty of Law
Tokyo, Japan

Brigitte Stern

Professor of International Law
University of Paris I
Panthéon, Sorbonne
Paris, France

Otto Triffterer

Emeritus Professor of International
Criminal Law and Procedure,
Faculty of Law,
University of Salzburg
Salzburg, Austria

**AN INTRODUCTION
TO THE LAW OF
INTERNATIONAL
CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

A Comparative Study

GEERT-JAN ALEXANDER KNOOPS



Transnational Publishers, Inc.
Ardsley, New York

Published and distributed by *Transnational Publishers, Inc.*
Ardsley Park Science and Technology Center
410 Saw Mill River Road
Ardsley, NY 10502

Phone: 914-693-5100
Fax: 914-693-4430
E-mail: info@transnationalpubs.com
Web: www.transnationalpubs.com

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Knoops, Geert-Jan G. J.

An introduction to the law of the international criminal tribunals:
a comparative study / by Geert-Jan Alexander Knoops.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-57105-310-7

1. International criminal courts—Rules and practice. 2. Criminal
procedure (International law). I. Title.

KZ6310 .K578 2003

345'.01--dc22

2003059699

Copyright © 2003 by Transnational Publishers, Inc.

All rights reserved. This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that copying permitted by U.S. Copyright Law in Section 107, "fair use" in teaching and research, Section 108, certain library copying, and except in published media by reviewers in limited excerpts), without written permission from the publisher.

Manufactured in the United States of America

*To Professor M. Cherif Bassiouni
for his mentoring and leadership in
International Criminal Law
And to his wife, Nina,
for her indispensable support.*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Table of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Table of Authorities</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxv</i>
<i>Foreword</i>	<i>xxvii</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>xxix</i>

Chapter I

Contemporary International Criminal Tribunals (ICT):

Distinctions and Main Characteristics	1
1 The Values and Goals of ICT	1
2 The ICTY and ICTR	2
2.1 Unique Origins	2
2.2 ICTY Characteristics	4
2.2.1 ICTY Jurisdiction	4
2.2.2 ICTY Subject Matter	5
2.3 ICTR Characteristics	5
2.3.1 The Specific Origins of the ICTR and Its Legal Basis	5
2.3.2 ICTR Jurisdiction and Subject Matter	6
2.4 ICTY-ICTR Rules of Procedure and Evidence	6
2.5 Similarities	7
3 The Origin and Character of the ICC	7
3.1 Treaty-Basis and Differences with ICTY-ICTR	7
3.2 Jurisdiction Principles	8
3.3 ICC: Subject Matter Jurisdiction	9
3.4 ICC: General Principles of Criminal Law	10
3.5 ICC Procedural Law and Rules of Procedure and Evidence	10
4 The Emerging Concept of <i>ad hoc</i> Internationalized or Mixed Courts	11
4.1 Introduction	11
4.2 Special Court for Sierra Leone	11
4.3 The <i>ad hoc</i> Cambodia Tribunal	13

4.4	The UNTAET (East Timor) Serious Crimes Panel	14
4.5	The Kosovo Internationalized Panels	15
5	The Legitimacy of ICT: Selective Enforcement Mechanisms?	17

Chapter II

Classification and Identification of International

	Crimes by ICT	21
1	Introduction	21
2	The Evolution of the Crime of Genocide within the Law of the Tribunals	21
3	Proliferation of ICTY-ICTR Case Law on the Crime of Genocide	23
4	The ICTY-ICTR Statutory and Jurisprudential Elements of the Crime of Genocide.	23
5	Crimes against Humanity before ICT.	28
5.1	The Characteristics of Crimes against Humanity	28
5.2	ICTY and ICTR Requirements	29
5.3	The Context Element as a Requirement to Qualify Crimes against Humanity before ICT.	32
6	Requirements of the Context Element under ICT Statutes	33
6.1	Widespread or Systematic Attack	33
6.2	The Element of "Any Population"	35
6.3	The Element of Civilian Population	35
6.4	The Element of Policy.	37
6.5	The Individual Act and the Element of Knowledge of the Attack	38
6.6	Comparison of ICTY/ICTR and ICC	39
7	The Concept of War Crimes before ICT	40
7.1	Introduction	40
7.2	War Crimes and Armed Conflict under the ICTY and ICTR Statutes	42
7.3	War Crime and Armed Conflict under the ICC Statute	46
7.4	Comparison with Genocide/Crimes against Humanity.	47

Chapter III

General Principles of Substantive Criminal Law Envisioned

	by ICT.	49
1	Emergence of General Principles	49
2	Modes of Criminal Responsibility within the ICT System	50
2.1	ICTY-ICTR.	50
2.1.1	Individual Criminal Responsibility	50
2.1.2	Superior Responsibility under Article 7 (3) ICTY Statute.	53

2.1.3	Criminal Participation de novo: Joint Criminal Enterprise	60
2.2	ICC	64
2.2.1	Forms of Individual Criminal Responsibility ...	64
2.2.2	Superior Responsibility under Article 28 of the ICC Statute	66
2.2.3	Comparison ICC and ICTY Superior Responsibility	67
3	Defenses as General Principles of ICT	68
3.1	Introduction	68
3.2	Immunities of Former Heads of States and other State Officials as Defenses before ICT	68
3.2.1	ICJ Jurisprudence	68
3.2.2	ICJ's Jurisprudential Influence on the Law of the ICC and ICTY-ICTR	69
3.3	Duress and Necessity as Defenses before ICT	70
3.3.1	Doctrinal Distinctions	70
3.3.2	The Approach of ICTY-ICTR	72
3.3.3	The Approach of the ICC Statute	74
3.4	The Limited Scope of Superior Orders under the Law of ICT.	74
3.4.1	International Criminal Law Parameters	74
3.4.2	ICTY-ICTR Case Law	75
3.4.3	Superior Orders under the ICC Statute	76
3.5	The Defenses of Mental insanity, Diminished Responsibility and Intoxication before ICT	77
3.6	Expanding the Boundaries of Criminal Law Defenses before ICT: Mental Insanity and Diminished Responsibility	78
3.6.1	Introduction	78
3.6.2	The Insanity Defense and Defense of Diminished Responsibility	79
3.6.3	The Interrelationship of the Insanity/ Diminished Responsibility Defense and the Intoxication Defense	81
3.6.4	The Interrelationship of the Insanity Defense and the Diminished Responsibility Defense ...	83
3.6.5	The Insanity Defense and Forensic Expertise before ICT	84
3.7	Jurisprudential and Statutory Self-Defense under the Law of ICT.	85

Chapter IV

General Principles of Procedural Criminal Law Envisioned

by ICT	89
1 Procedural Nature and Characteristics of Proceedings before ICT	89
1.1 The ICTY-ICTR System: A Merger of Common Law and Civil Law Procedural Elements	89
1.1.1 Introduction.....	89
1.1.2 Procedural Reform as Basis for System Change	89
1.1.3 The Recent ICTY RPE and Amendments	91
1.1.4 Impact on ICTY Law Practice.....	95
1.1.5 The Recent ICTR RPE and Amendments	97
1.1.6 Influence on the ICC Statute	98
1.1.7 Conclusions	99
1.2 The Legal Nature of the ICC Statute.....	100
2 Contemporary Procedural Pre-Trial Aspects of ICT	101
2.1 Introduction	101
2.2 The Nature of Pre-Trial Proceedings before ICT	101
2.2.1 Purpose of Pre-Trial	101
2.2.2 ICTY-ICTR: Rule 61 Hearings.....	101
2.2.3 ICC	102
2.3 The Indictment and the Principles of <i>nullum crimen sine lege, nulla poena sine lege</i>	103
2.3.1 ICTY-ICTR Requirements	103
2.3.2 ICC Requirements	106
2.4 <i>Ne bis in idem</i> before the ICC and ICTY-ICTR.....	106
2.5 The Presumption of Innocence before ICT.....	109
2.6 Provisional Release before ICT	109
3 Contemporary Procedural Trial Aspects of ICT.....	113
3.1 Introduction	113
3.2 The Emerging Adjudicatory Concept of Plea Agreements before ICT	113
3.3 Contemporary Sentencing Procedures and Policies before ICT	116
3.4 Appeals Procedures before ICT: Some Contemporary Issues	118
3.5 The ICC and Forensic Evidence: Prosecutorial and Defense Implications of the Principle of Procedural Equality of Arms.....	120
3.5.1 Introduction.....	120
3.5.2 Legal-Forensic Framework of Equality of Arms.....	123

3.5.3	Equality of Arms in International Law: Balancing Prosecution and Defense Interests . . .	125
3.6	The ICC Statute and Neurosciences	126

Chapter V

Principles of Criminal Evidence before ICT	127
1 Introduction	127
2 Requisite Standards of Proof before ICT	128
2.1 Introduction	128
2.2 Standard of Proof for Indictment	128
2.3 Procedure for Judgment of Acquittal	129
2.4 Standard of Proof for Conviction	130
2.5 Standard of Proof for Defenses	130
3 Disclosure of Evidence.	131
3.1 Introduction	131
3.2 Modalities of Disclosure under ICT Systems.	131
3.2.1 Prosecution Disclosure under the ICTY-ICTR System	131
3.2.2 Defense Disclosure under the ICTY-ICTR System	134
3.2.3 Prosecution and Defense Disclosure under the ICC System	135
4 Admissibility of Evidence	135
4.1 Different Types of Witness Evidence before ICT	135
4.2 Hearsay before ICT.	136
4.2.1 ICTY Case Law on Hearsay Evidence	137
4.2.2 ICTY Case Law on Hearsay Evidence: Conclusion	139
4.2.3 ICTR Case Law on Hearsay Evidence	139
4.2.4 Hearsay Evidence under the ICC.	140
4.3 Use of Anonymous Witnesses before ICT.	141
4.3.1 ICTY Approach Regarding Anonymous Witnesses	141
4.3.2 Conclusions and Practical Reflections on ICTY Case Law Referring to Anonymous Witnesses	143
4.3.3 ICTR Approach Regarding Anonymous Witnesses	144
4.3.4 The ICC Approach Regarding Anonymous	

5	Presentation and Appreciation of Evidence by ICT	150
5.1	Forensic Evidence at ICT	150
5.1.1	The Function of Forensic Evidence before ICT	150
5.1.2	Practical Application of Forensic Expertise before ICT	153
5.2	Appreciation of the Defense of Alibi.	154

Chapter VI

The Emergence of Uniform Standards of Due Process

before ICT: Influence on (Inter)national Criminal Law(s)

1	Introduction	157
2	Definition of Due Process Rights Relevant to ICT.	158
3	The Influx of Common Standards of Due Process to ICT Systems	159
3.1	Introduction	159
3.2	Fair Trial as an Exponent of Due Process before ICT	160
3.2.1	ICTY-ICTR	160
3.2.2	ICC	163
3.3	<i>Habeas Corpus</i> as Due Process Right under ICT	164
3.3.1	Introduction	164
3.3.2	<i>Habeas Corpus</i> Writs under International Human Rights Conventions	164
3.3.3	The Right to <i>Habeas Corpus</i> Writs under the ICTR System: Substantive and Procedural Aspects	166
3.3.4	ICTR <i>Habeas Corpus</i> Restrictions Ratione Materiae	169
3.3.5	Effects of <i>Habeas Corpus</i> Writs: Relativism and Material Prejudice	170
3.3.6	ICTR and ICC <i>Habeas Corpus</i> Remedies Compared	171
3.3.7	<i>Habeas Corpus</i> Writs before the ICTR: Distinct Nature?	174
3.4	Due Process and Admissibility of Evidence before ICT	173
3.5	Due Process and Trial Rights under ICT	175
3.6	Due Process and Pre-Trial Proceedings before ICT	176
3.7	Due Process and Supervisory Mechanisms before ICT	177

Chapter VII

International State Cooperation with ICT:

	Obtaining Evidence Abroad	179
1	Introduction	179

2	Cooperation Distinctions between the ICTY-ICTR and ICC systems	179
3	The State Cooperation System under the ICC Statute.	181
3.1	Treaty-Based Cooperation	181
3.2	ICC-UN Mutual Cooperation: Comparison with ICTY-ICTR	183
4	Surrendering to ICT: Practical Implications	186

Chapter VIII

Redressing Wrongful Prosecutions and Convictions or

Miscarriages of Justice by ICT

1	Introduction	191
2	Rationale of ICT Review Proceedings.	191
3	The Revision System under the ICTY and ICTR	192
3.1	ICTY-ICTR Criteria	192
3.2	ICTY-ICTR Case Law on Review Proceedings	193
3.3	ICTR's Extensive View on the "New Fact" Criterion	194
3.4	Conclusion.	195
4	The Revision System under the ICC Statute	196
5	Redressing Wrongful Prosecutions and Convictions by ICT through Financial Compensation	196
5.1	Introduction	196
5.2	ICTY-ICTR	197
5.3	ICC	197
6	Conclusion	199

<i>Appendix I</i>	201
-------------------------	-----

<i>Biography</i>	203
------------------------	-----

<i>Index</i>	205
--------------------	-----