

The Role of the
International Court of Justice
as the Principal Judicial Organ
of the United Nations

LEGAL ASPECTS OF
INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION

VOLUME 40

The Role of the
International Court of Justice
as the Principal Judicial Organ
of the United Nations

by

Mohamed Sameh M. Amr



KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

THE HAGUE / LONDON / NEW YORK

Published by:

Kluwer Law International

P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands

sales@kluwerlaw.com

<http://www.kluwerlaw.com>

A CIP Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

Printed on acid-free paper.

Typeset by *Steve Lambley Information Design*, The Hague.

ISBN 90-411-2026-2

© 2003 Kluwer Law International

Kluwer Law International incorporates the imprint of Martinus Nijhoff Publishers

This publication is protected by international copyright law.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

This book is dedicated to the memory of my grandmother

Dawelat El-Dahrawe

CONTENTS

Foreword	vii
Abbreviations	xix
Introduction	1
1. International Courts as Organs of International Organisations: Historical Perspective	5
1. International courts and international organisations: A historical development	5
1.1. The situation prior to the First World War	6
1.1.1. Prior to 1899	6
1.1.2. The Hague Peace Conferences of 1899 and 1907	9
1.1.3. The establishment of the Permanent Court of Arbitration (PCA)	10
1.2. After the First World War	12
1.2.1. The establishment of the League of Nations and the Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ)	12
1.2.2. The institutional relationship between the PCIJ and the League of Nations	14
1.3. After the Second World War	17
1.3.1. The development of the notion of international organisations	17
1.3.2. The establishment of the United Nations and the International Court of Justice	17
1.3.3. The ICJ and the PCIJ: Is it a new Court?	20
2. The ICJ as a part of the UN system	22
2.1. The legal basis of the organic relationship	23
2.1.1. The UN Charter	23
2.1.2. The Statute of the ICJ	25

Table of Contents

2.2. The dimensions of the organic relationship between the ICJ and the UN	26
2.2.1. The effect on the ICJ	26
2.2.2. The effect on the UN	33
2.3. Final remarks	41
Conclusion	44
2. The Advisory Role of the International Court of Justice	47
1. The Legal Basis of the ICJ's Advisory Jurisdiction	49
2. Organs Authorised to Request Advisory Opinions	50
2.1. Direct authorisation	52
2.2. Indirect authorisation	52
2.2.1. The nature and limits of the authorisation	53
2.2.2. Authorised organs	55
3. Prerequisites for Requesting an Advisory Opinion	66
3.1. The competence of the requesting organ	66
3.1.1. Limits upon the competence to request	66
3.1.2. The impact of a request for an opinion by one organ upon the competence of other organs	72
3.1.3. The impact of the refusal to request by one organ upon the competence of other organs	74
3.1.4. The power to withdraw a request	75
3.2. The vote	75
3.3. The request	79
3.4. The subject-matter of the request	83
3.4.1. The scope of the term "legal question"	84
3.4.2. Legal questions and other questions	86
3.4.3. Abstract questions	91
3.4.4. Legal questions related to disputes actually pending between states	92
4. The Obligation to Request Advisory Opinions from the ICJ	100
5. Is the ICJ under any Obligation to Give Opinions?	102
5.1. The power of the Court to decide upon its own jurisdiction	103

5.2. The discretionary power of the ICJ to give advisory opinions	105
6. The Legal Effect of Advisory Opinions of the Court: Are They Binding?	109
6.1. The non-binding effect as a consequence of the absence of an express provision	110
6.2. The obligatory effect of the advisory opinions in exceptional cases	112
6.3. The non-binding effect of the advisory opinions in the ICJ's jurisprudence	113
6.4. Evaluation	114
Conclusion	119
3. The Role of the International Court of Justice in Interpreting and Developing the Institutional Law of the United Nations	121
1. The Power of the ICJ to Interpret the Constitutional Instrument	122
1.1. The United Nations Charter: A treaty or a constitution?	122
1.2. The power of the ICJ to interpret the Charter	124
1.2.1 The silence of the Charter	124
1.2.2. General Assembly resolutions	126
1.2.3. The practice of the ICJ: Confirmation of its interpretative power	127
2. The ICJ and the Implied Powers of the UN and its Organs	129
2.1. The international legal personality of the UN	130
2.2. Supervisory competence over territories under the mandate system	132
2.3. The creation of subsidiary judicial organs by political organs	135
3. The Determination of the Relationship between the UN Organs	136
3.1. Concurrent functions between the GA and SC in maintaining international peace and security	137
3.2. Joint competence of the political organs	141
4. The ICJ and the Exercise of Exclusive Competence by the UN Organs	143
4.1. Interpreting and developing the competencies of the GA	144
4.1.1. Protection of human rights	144
4.1.2. The power of the GA over international conventions concluded under its auspices	145

Table of Contents

4.1.3. The exercise of supervisory competence over the territories under the trusteeship (mandate) system	146
4.1.4. The relationship between the GA and the UN Administrative Tribunal	148
4.1.5. Budgetary power of the GA	149
4.1.6. The power to terminate mandate and trusteeship agreements (self-determination)	152
4.1.7. The GA and disarmament	155
4.2. The role of the ICJ in respect of the Security Council's competencies	156
4.2.1. Exclusive competence to act under Chapter VII	156
4.2.2. Unlimited competence in maintaining international peace and security	157
5. Interpretation and Application of Agreements between the UN and its Specialized Agencies vis-à-vis their Member States	159
5.1. The Headquarters Agreement case between the UN and the US	160
5.2. Interpretation of the Agreement of 25 March 1951 between the WHO and Egypt	161
5.3. The application of the Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of the UN	163
6. The ICJ and the Legal Effect of the Resolutions of the UN Organs	167
6.1. The legal effect of the SC's resolutions	167
6.2. The legal effect of the GA's resolutions	171
Conclusion	174
4. The Role of the International Court of Justice in Facilitating the Realisation of the Purposes and Principles of the United Nations through its Contentious Jurisdiction	177
1. The ICJ's Contentious Jurisdiction: The Necessity of States' Consent	178
1.1. The forms of states' consent	179
1.1.1. <i>Ante hoc</i> consent	180
1.1.2. <i>Post hoc</i> consent	190
1.2. Time of determining the Court's jurisdiction	193
1.3. Limits upon the ICJ's jurisdiction	194

1.3.1. Reservations upon the ICJ's jurisdiction	194
1.3.2. Non-legal disputes	202
2. The role of the ICJ in maintaining international peace and security	213
2.1. The practice of the ICJ in settling international disputes	216
2.2. The relationship between the ICJ and the political organs in settling international disputes	218
2.2.1. The role of the political organs with regard to the settlement of international disputes	218
2.2.2. The dimensions of the relationship between the ICJ and the political organs of the UN	220
3. The role of the ICJ with regard to other purposes and principles of the UN	262
3.1 Prohibiting the threat or use of force	263
3.2. The duty of non-intervention	266
3.3. The right of self-defence	269
3.4. The principle of equal rights and self-determination of peoples	271
3.5. The principle of good faith	273
Conclusion	277
 5. The International Court of Justice as a Constitutional Court: The Question of Judicial Review	 279
1. The rule of law in the UN	280
1.1. Are the UN organs above the law?	280
1.2. Sources of law in the UN legal system	287
1.2.1. The Charter	287
1.2.2. Rules of procedure	287
1.2.3. Rules of international law and general principles of law	287
2. Judicial review in the national and international domain	290
2.1. What is meant by the term "judicial review"?	290
2.2. Judicial review by domestic courts	290
2.3. The practice of judicial review by international courts	292
3. Judicial review by the ICJ in the framework of the UN	295
3.1. Judicial review of the acts of the specialised agencies	295

Table of Contents

3.1.1. Constitutional provisions	295
3.1.2. The jurisprudence of the ICJ as a constitutional court	296
3.2. Judicial review by the ICJ of the acts of the political organs of the UN	298
3.2.1. Judicial review of the political organs' acts in the <i>travaux préparatoires</i>	300
3.2.2. Judicial review of the political organs' acts in international doctrine	301
3.2.3. The ICJ's jurisprudence: Recognition of its power of judicial review	308
3.3. Evaluation	320
4. The means of referring acts to the Court	326
4.1. <i>Proprio motu</i>	326
4.2. Direct recourse	327
4.3. Advisory jurisdiction	329
4.4. Contentious jurisdiction	331
5. The scope of the judicial review	333
5.1. Judicial review <i>de novo</i>	334
5.2. Examination of facts	335
5.3. Declaring the invalidity of an act	337
5.4. Judicial review against the failure to act by the organs	338
Conclusion	339
6. The International Court of Justice as a Court of Appeal	341
1. Judicial appeal and other judicial activities	343
1.1. Judicial appeal	343
1.2. The distinction between judicial appeal and other judicial procedures	343
2. The legal basis of the ICJ's appellate jurisdiction over the Administrative Tribunals' judgments	345
2.1. The Charter and the ICJ's Statute	345
2.2. The Statutes of the Administrative Tribunals	346
2.2.1. Art. XII of the Statute of the ILOAT	346

2.2.2. Art. 11 of the Statute of the UNAT	348
3. Procedures of judicial appeal	353
4. The scope and grounds of judicial appeal	355
Is the ICJ a court of appeal?	359
5. The parties to judicial appeal	361
6. The ICJ's practice as a court of appeal	364
Comments on the ICJ's practice	367
7. GA Resolution 50/54: A turning point and evaluation	368
7.1. GA Res. 50/54	368
7.2. Evaluation	371
Conclusion	374
General Conclusions and Suggestions	377
1. General evaluation of the Court's role	377
2. Suggestions to enhance the Court's role as the principal judicial organ of the UN	380
2.1. The Court's advisory jurisdiction	380
2.2. The Court's contentious jurisdiction	382
2.3. The determination of the relationship between the ICJ and the other principal organs of the UN	387
2.4. The enforcement of the Court's judgments	387
2.5. The constitutional role of the Court	390
2.6. The Court's judges	391
2.7. The Court's budget	393
3. Concluding Remarks	394
 Bibliography	 397
Index	439