

Liability and Environment

Private and Public Law Aspects of Civil Liability for
Environmental Harm in an International Context

Liability and Environment

Private and Public Law Aspects of Civil Liability for
Environmental Harm in an International Context

Lucas Bergkamp

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / NEW YORK

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands
sales@kli.wkap.nl
<http://www.kluwerlaw.com>

Sold and Distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Kluwer Law International
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, USA
kluwerlaw@wkap.com

Sold and Distributed in all other countries by:

Kluwer Law International
Distribution Centre, P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN 90 411 1645 1

© 2001 Kluwer Law International

Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of Graham & Trotman Ltd., Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

This publication is protected by international copyright law.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

TO KATINKA, DARIUS, PENELOPE, AND SCIPIO

IN MEMORY OF
NICOLAAS BERGKAMP (1932-1991)
AND
JOHANNA BERGKAMP-HILBERINK (1930-2001)

Fire and Ice

Some say that the world will end in fire,
Some say in ice.
From what I've tasted of desire
I hold with those who favor fire.
But if I had to perish twice,
I think I know enough of hate
To say that for destruction ice
Is also great
and would suffice.

Robert Frost (1874-1963).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	xvii
Preface	xxi
I. Introduction	1
II. Current Law on Cross-Border Environmental Harm	9
III. Instrumental Analysis of Environmental Liability	67
IV. Civil Liability of the State	155
V. Public and Private Law Instruments	201
VI. Key Elements of an Environmental Liability System	259
VII. Current Issues in National and International Environmental Law	375
VIII. Market and Government Failure	471
Bibliography	567
Table of Legislative Instruments	631
Table of Cases	643
Summary	659
About the Author	661
Index	663

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	xvii
Preface	xxi
I. Introduction	1
II. Current Law on Cross-Border Environmental Harm	9
A. Types of Environmental Harm and Related Complications	9
B. Principles of International Environmental Law and Policy	13
C. Expanding Regulatory Regimes	20
1. Scope and Depth of Environmental Law and Regulation	20
2. Environmental Permits: Procedure and Standards	25
D. International Environmental Treaties and Liability Regimes	29
1. The Lugano Convention	29
2. Other Treaties	33
3. Basel Convention Liability Protocol	35
E. Proposed International Liability Regimes	37
1. The Proposed EC Environmental Liability Regime	37
2. The UN Biodiversity Convention	40
F. National Environmental Liability Regimes	52
1. General Trends	52
a. Expanding Liability Regimes	52
b. Fault's Revival?	56
2. Dutch Case Law: The Alsacian Potassium Mines, Cockerill Sambre, and Sopar	58
G. The Polluter Pays Twice	63
III. Instrumental Analysis of Environmental Liability	67
A. Liability's Objectives	70
1. Compensation and "Victim Protection"	70
2. Increasing Efficiency	73
a. Cost Internalization	73
b. Minimizing Total Cost	75
c. Maximizing Efficiency	76
d. Substituting for Efficient Contractual Exchange	82
e. Coordination of Behaviour	84
3. Deterrence	86
a. Economic and Moral Underpinnings	86
b. Liability's Deterrent Effects in	

	Practice	88
	c. Deterring Environmental Damage	90
4.	Risk or Loss Spreading	96
	a. Simple Risk Spreading	96
	b. The Benefits of Insurance	97
	c. First and Third Party Insurance	99
	d. Environmental Risk Spreading	104
5.	Wealth Redistribution ("Deep Pocket")	108
6.	Corrective Justice	111
7.	Justice and Economics	114
8.	Mixed Objectives	116
B.	Specific Justifications for Strict Liability	119
	1. Control Theory	120
	2. Causation Theory	121
	3. Risk Theories	122
	a. Creating Danger	122
	b. Non-Reciprocal Risk	124
	c. Risk and Benefits Linkage	125
	4. Legal Responsibility	127
	5. Other Economic Justifications	129
	a. Reduce Activity Level and Slow Down Innovation	129
	b. Incentive to Research and Develop Safety Measures	134
	6. Corrective Justice	139
	7. Distributive Justice	142
	8. Protecting Entitlements	146
	9. Reducing Administrative Cost	147
	10. Easing the Plaintiff's Burden of Proof	148
C.	Conclusions	150
IV.	Civil Liability of the State	155
	A. Liability under International Law	155
	1. Trail Smelter	160
	2. Recent Developments	161
	3. Scope and Substantive Standards	163
	4. Liability for Lawful Acts	168
	B. Liability Under EC Law	170
	1. Effects of EC Law	170
	a. Introduction	170
	b. Direct Effect	170
	c. Indirect Effect	175
	2. State Liability	176
	a. Francovich	176
	b. The Limits of State Liability	178

	c.	Further Observations	185
C.		Liability under National Law	187
	1.	Some General Principles	187
	2.	Foreign Sovereign Immunity	193
	3.	The Act of State Doctrine	195
D.		Conclusions	198
V.		Public and Private Law Instruments	201
	A.	The State and Its Institutions	201
		1. State Intervention	201
		2. Institutions and Competences	204
	B.	Public and Private Law Instruments	208
		1. Environmental Control Through Public and Private Law	208
		2. Civil Liability and Regulation Compared .	211
		3. Other Alternatives to Liability	218
		a. Environmental Taxes	218
		b. Tradeable Pollution Rights	221
		c. Voluntary Agreements	223
		d. Risk Spreading and Compensation-Alternatives to Liability	225
		4. Instrument Choice and the Relative Merits of Environmental Liability Rules .	231
		a. General Observations	231
		b. The Balance Between Liability and Public Law	233
		c. The Choice Between Instruments in An International Context	236
	C.	Compliance with Public Law As Preclusion or Defense	239
		1. The Concept: The Polluter Pays ... Once	239
		a. Policy Arguments Supporting the Regulatory Compliance Defense	243
		b. Possible Objections	249
		c. Application of Regulatory Compliance Defense	253
		2. Transboundary Pollution and the Regulatory Compliance Defense	255
		a. Foreign Regulation As a Defense	255
		b. Open Issues	257
VI.		Key Elements of a Environmental Liability System	259
	A.	The Fallacy of Strict Environmental Liability . . .	260
	B.	The Anatomy of Fault	264
		1. Fault's Flexibility and Objectivity	264

2.	The Ex Ante Perspective and State of the Art	268
3.	The Relevance of Regulatory Compliance	271
a.	Public Law's Significance: Deference to the Legislature	271
b.	The Polluter Should Not Pay Twice	272
4.	Objective Fault and Ex Ante Standards	273
a.	Regulatory Compliance and Fault	273
b.	Non-Compliance and Fault Per Se	275
5.	Acceptable Risk	276
6.	Contributory Negligence, Victim Fault, and Consent	278
C.	Causation and Foreseeability	280
1.	Cause in Fact	281
2.	Cause in Law	285
a.	Causal Theories	285
b.	Probabilistic Causation	287
c.	Foreseeability	291
3.	Conclusions	297
D.	Liable Persons	298
1.	Joint and Several Liability	298
a.	Concerted Action and Indivisible Harm	299
b.	Disadvantages of Joint and Several Liability	300
c.	Environmental Harm and Causal Uncertainty	303
d.	Conclusion	306
2.	Shareholder Liability (Piercing the Corporate Veil)	306
a.	Veil Piercing Distinguished	308
b.	Veil Piercing Applied	312
c.	Alter Ego	314
d.	Fraudulent Conveyance	316
e.	Inadequate Capitalization	317
f.	Negligent Governance	319
g.	Rationale and Justification of Limited Liability	320
h.	Unlimited Liability for Corporate Torts	324
i.	Conclusions	327
3.	Owners, Generators, and Other Non-Polluters	329

E.	Damage Concepts and Environmental Harm	331
1.	Scope	331
2.	Natural Resource Damage	332
a.	Categories of Natural Resource Damage	333
b.	Valuation Methodologies	338
3.	Pure Economic Loss	346
F.	Governing Law and Forum	350
G.	Implementing State Liability: The State As Intellectual Polluter	355
1.	The Concept	355
2.	Limiting Discretion and Interference with Public Policy	358
3.	Omissions and the Problem of Limited Resources	359
4.	Other Objections to State Liability	362
H.	Conclusions	366
VII.	Current Issues in National and International Environmental Law	375
A.	Cross-Border Externalities and International Trade	375
B.	Centralization versus Decentralization	383
C.	Direct Command and Control Regulation and Market-Based Instruments	388
D.	From Emission Control to Consumption Control .	391
E.	From Confrontation to Cooperation	394
F.	Distributional Consequences	401
1.	Wealth and Environmental Benefit	401
2.	Sustainable Development	406
G.	Rationality, Science and Uncertainty	411
1.	The Concept of Reason	411
2.	Facts and Values	414
3.	Natural and Social Science	418
a.	Man As A Subject and An Object	418
b.	The Limits of Science	421
c.	Common Pitfalls in Statistics . . .	425
4.	Concepts of Rationality	432
a.	Cartesian Constructivism	432
b.	Values, Ends, and Rationality . .	434
5.	Rationality and Information Cost	437
6.	Rational Decisionmaking, Science, and the Search for Objective Truth	438
7.	Rationality in Government Decisionmaking	441
a.	The Precautionary Principle . . .	445
b.	Risk Assessment	450

	c.	Cost/Benefit Analysis	454
	d.	Rational Law and Risk Regulation	459
	8.	Uncertainty and Its Sources	465
VIII.	Market and Government Failure		471
	A.	The Public-Private Law Divide Revisited	471
	1.	Public Law in the Welfare State	471
	2.	Common Objectives?	473
	3.	Private and Public Law and Discretion	474
	B.	Civil Liability's Role in a Regulated Market Economy	479
	1.	Collectivistic and Atomistic Approaches	479
	a.	Liberty	481
	b.	Harm to Others	486
	c.	The Market Paradigm	491
	d.	Market and Insurance	495
	e.	Market Failure and Externalities	497
	f.	Correcting Market Externalities	501
	g.	Principles for Government Action	504
	h.	Correcting Government Failure	515
	i.	Markets or Governments?	518
	2.	Liability's Proper Scope	523
	3.	The Default-Displacement Model	526
	a.	Giving Effect to Public Law	526
	b.	Statutory Interpretation	528
	c.	Liability and Judiciary	538
	d.	Liability in the Minimal Regulatory State	546
	4.	Environmental Regulation and Liability	552
	C.	Final Observations	556
	Bibliography		567
	Table of Legislative Instruments		631
	Table of Cases		643
	Summary		659
	About the Author		661
	Index		663