

**INTERNATIONAL
AND
COMPARATIVE
CRIMINAL
LAW
SERIES**

Editorial Board

Series Editor

M. Cherif Bassiouni

President, International Human Rights Law Institute, DePaul University
President, International Institute of Higher Studies in Criminal Sciences, Siracusa, Italy,
President, International Association of Penal Law, DePaul University
Professor of Law, DePaul University, Chicago, IL, USA

Diane Amann

Professor of Law
University of California
School of Law
Davis, CA, USA

Christopher L. Blakesley

J.Y. Sanders Professor of Law
Louisiana State University Law Center
Baton Rouge, LA, USA

Roger S. Clark

Board of Governors Professor
The State University of New Jersey
School of Law
Camden, NJ, USA

John Dugard

Member, International Law Commission,
Geneva; Emeritus Professor of Law,
University of Witwatersrand, South
Africa; and Professor of Public
International Law, University of Leiden,
The Netherlands

Albin Eser

Professor of Criminal Law, Albert
Ludwig University; Director, Max-
Planck Institute for International and
Comparative Criminal Law
Freiburg, i. B., Germany

Alfredo Etcheberry

Professor of Criminal Law,
National University of Chile; President,
Chilean Lawyers' Association, Santiago,
Chile

Jordan Paust

Professor of Law
University of Houston Law Center
Houston, TX, USA

Mario Pisani

Professor of Criminal Procedure
Faculty of Law, University of Milan
Milan, Italy

William Michael Reisman

Myers S. McDougal Professor of Law
and Jurisprudence, Yale Law School
New Haven, CT, USA

Leila Sadat

Professor of Law
Washington University in St. Louis
School of Law
St. Louis, MO, USA

Michael P. Scharf

Professor of Law
New England School of Law
Boston, MA, USA

Kuniji Shibahara

Professor Emeritus
University of Tokyo, Faculty of Law
Tokyo, Japan

Brigitte Stern

Professor of International Law
University of Paris I
Panthéon, Sorbonne
Paris, France

Otto Triffterer

Professor of International Criminal Law
and Procedure, Faculty of Law,
University of Salzburg
Salzburg, Austria

REDRESSING MISCARRIAGES OF JUSTICE

Practice and Procedure
in National and International
Criminal Law Cases

GEERT-JAN ALEXANDER KNOOPS



T r a n s n a t i o n a l P u b l i s h e r s

S d u U i t g e v e r s

Published and distributed by
Transnational Publishers, Inc.
410 Saw Mill River Road
Ardsley, NY 10502

Phone: 914-693-5100
Fax: 914-693-4430
E-mail: info@transnationalpubs.com
Web: www.transnationalpubs.com

For sales in the Benelux (Belgium, Netherlands and Luxemburg) only:
Sdu Klantenservice
Postbus 20014
2500 EA Den Haag

Phone: (070) 37 89 880
Fax: (070) 37 89 783
Email: klantenservice@sdu.nl
Web: www.sdu.nl

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Knoops, Geert-Jan G. J.

Redressing miscarriages of justice : practice and procedure in
national and international criminal law / Geert-Jan Alexander Knoops.

p. cm.—(International and comparative criminal law series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Judicial error. I. Title.

K5560.K59 2006 345'.01—dc22

2006044689

Transnational ISBN: 1-57105-368-9
Sdu Uitgevers ISBN: 9012115809

Copyright © 2006 by Transnational Publishers, Inc.

All rights reserved. This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that copying permitted by U.S. Copyright Law in Section 107, “fair use” in teaching and research, Section 108, certain library copying, and except in published media by reviewers in limited excerpts), without written permission from the publisher.

Manufactured in the United States of America

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>About the Author</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
Chapter 1: The Need for Effective Retrial Procedures in International Criminal Cases	1
A. Wrongful Convictions and Their Inter-Relationship with the Nature of the Criminal Justice System	1
B. Effective Retrial or Review Procedures: Protection of the Integrity of Criminal Trials	3
Chapter 2: Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice Within International Criminal Law: An <i>Erga Omnes</i> Obligation	5
A. Introduction: The Applicability of the Doctrine of State Responsibilities <i>Erga Omnes</i>	5
B. The Genesis of the <i>Erga Omnes</i> Doctrine: The U.S. Innocence Protection Act	9
C. State Responsibilities <i>Vis-à-Vis</i> The Protection Against Miscarriage of Justice: The ILC Articles on State Responsibility	12
Chapter 3: Causes and Pre-Disposing Factors of Miscarriages of Justice: A Legal Overview	17
A. Clear and Present Dangers	17
Chapter 4: Miscarriages of Justice Originating from Disclosure Deficiencies in Criminal Cases	23
A. Disclosure Failures as Ground for Retrials: Common Law Standards and Examples	23
1. Disclosure Requirements Set Forth by the U.S. Supreme Court	23
2. Basic Disclosure Conditions Under U.K. Law	24
B. The Extent of Disclosure Obligations in Criminal Cases: <i>R. v. Ward</i>	27
C. Judicial Relationship Between Disclosure of Evidence and Miscarriages of Justice	30

D.	Judicial and Legal-Ethical Implications of Non-Disclosure of Forensic Evidence for Miscarriages of Justice.	31
E.	Practical Implications of Non-Disclosure of Forensic Evidence for Miscarriages of Justice: The Principle of Equality of Arms.	33
F.	Disclosure Obligation Standards	34
1.	General Guidelines	34
2.	Attribution of Non-Disclosure by Police and Scientists to the Crown.	35
3.	“Reasonable Probability Test” as Ground for Retrial	35
G.	Disclosure Obligations Under ECHR Case Law Relevant to Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice.	36
1.	Competing Interests: Protection of Society Versus Protection of Individuals	36
2.	ECHR Disclosure Criteria and Their Transposition onto Retrial Proceedings in Criminal Cases	37
Chapter 5: Miscarriages of Justice Originating from False or Unreliable Confessions and Plea Agreements		41
A.	Introduction.	41
B.	The Role of False Confessions in International Criminal Cases	41
C.	Retrial Grounds Relative to False Confessions in Criminal Cases	43
1.	False Confessions: Basis for Retrial?	43
a.	False Confessions Revealed by DNA Evidence	43
b.	False Confessions and Mental Retardation	45
2.	The Importance of Disclosure of Forensic Evidence for the Determination of False Confessions: <i>R. v. Ward</i>	46
3.	The Admissibility of Evidence of Psychiatrists and Psychologists as to an Accused’s Reliability	48
D.	Involuntary Statements Within International Criminal Proceedings: Retrial Consequences.	50
1.	Judicial Supervision of Involuntariness of Accused’s Statements	50
2.	Procedural Safeguards to Prevent Involuntary Statements	54
E.	Unsafe Guilty Pleas in Criminal Cases: Retrial Ground on the Basis of Investigative Misconduct	58
F.	Conclusion.	58

Chapter 6: Miscarriages of Justice Originating from Unsafe Identification Evidence in Criminal Cases	59
A. The Fallibility of “Human Perception and Recollection:” Identification Standards of International Tribunals	59
B. Retrial Standards Within Common Law	60
C. Retrial Standards Based on Identification Evidence in International Criminal Cases	62
D. Prevention of Unsafe Convictions Due to Identification Evidence in International Criminal Cases	64
E. Conclusions	68
 Chapter 7: Retrial Standards and Procedures in International Criminal Cases	 71
A. Introduction	71
B. Judicial Review Based on “New” Evidence	71
1. The Approach of the U.S. Supreme Court	71
2. The Approach of the U.K. Courts and the British Criminal Cases Review Commission (CCRC)	72
a. Toward a New Perception of Miscarriages of Justice: The <i>Birmingham Six</i> Precedents	72
b. The Inception of a Specialized Investigative Body for Review Cases	74
i. The CCRC’s Procedures	75
ii. Stage 1: Initial Assessment	75
iii. Stage 2: Substantive Review	76
iv. Stage 3: Appointment of an Investigating Officer	76
c. The CCRC Review System	77
3. The Approach of the Dutch Supreme Court	83
4. Retrial Standards Before the International Criminal Tribunals	84
a. ICTY-ICTR Criteria	85
b. ICTY-ICTR Case Law on Review Proceedings	86
c. ICTR’s Extensive View on the “New Fact” Criterion	87
d. The Revision System Under the ICC Statute	88
C. The Determination and Standard of “New Evidence” in Criminal Cases: Toward a Uniform Model	89
D. Judicial Review Based on “New” Defenses or Arguments	90

Chapter 8: Forensic Sciences to Protect Against and Remedy Miscarriages of Justice.	97
A. Introduction: The Evolution of Forensic Genetics in Criminal Cases	97
B. The Advent of Forensic Genetics in the Context of Reopening International Criminal Cases.	98
1. Increasing DNA Exonerations	98
2. Technical Evolution of Forensic Genetics.	99
3. Practical Problems and Complications of Assessing the Evidentiary Weight of DNA Evidence	104
4. Future Forensic Genetics Developments and Miscarriages of Justice.	107
C. Forensic Evidence Standards to Prevent Miscarriages of Justice in Criminal Trials	108
1. Introduction	108
2. Forensic Science Errors in the Diagnosis of Guilt or Innocence in Criminal Cases	109
a. The Reality of Contemporary Forensic Science Errors.	109
b. 11 Factors	110
c. Forensic Science Errors: The <i>Brandon Mayfield</i> Case	112
D. Scientific Error: A Potential Retrial Argument.	114
E. Forensic Standards and Principles to Be Applied by National and International Criminal Courts: The Approach of the U.S. Supreme Court.	119
F. The Right to Hear and Challenge Defense Expert Witnesses Under the ECHR	124
G. Toward a Legal Standard to Review Forensic or Expert Witness Evidence in Criminal Cases.	126
 Chapter 9: Expert Evidence Requirements and Standards Within International Criminal Cases: Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice.	 129
A. Introduction.	129
B. General Principles Pertaining to Adducing Expert Witness Evidence	130
1. Purpose of and Requirements as to Expert Witness Qualifications	130
a. Common Law Approach.	130
b. The Approach of International Criminal Tribunals	131
2. Practical Guidelines as to Qualifying and Examining Expert Witnesses	134

3. The “Ultimate Issue” Rule Within the Practice of International Criminal Tribunals	135
4. The Applicability Scope of the Ultimate Issue Rule Under International Criminal Law: Individual Criminal Responsibility	143
C. Conclusion: The Ultimate Issue as an Instrument in the Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice	145
Chapter 10: New and Changing Expert Evidence: Basis for Retrials in International Criminal Cases?	147
Chapter 11: Procedural Mechanisms <i>Sui Generis</i> Against Miscarriages of Justice.	149
A. Balancing the Prevention of Wrongful Conviction: Judicial Economy and Equality of Arms Within International and Internationalized Criminal Trials	149
1. Introduction: Converging Objectives Before International Criminal Tribunals	149
2. Ensuring Equality of Arms on the International Plane: Defense Scope and Limitations	150
3. Concurrence of Equality of Arms and Judicial Economy in the Law Practice of the International Criminal Tribunals	152
a. The Practice of the International Criminal Tribunals: A Shift to Controlling the Effectiveness of the Proceedings	152
b. Challenging Judicial Economy and Prioritizing Equality of Arms: The <i>Oric</i> Case	156
c. Equality of Arms as a Human Rights Protection Against Judicial Economy Before International Criminal Tribunals	159
d. Equality of Arms: Practical Consequences for the Position of Defense Before International and Internationalized Criminal Tribunals	160
4. Equality of Arms <i>Vis-à-Vis</i> Investigation and Documentary Evidence	164
a. Equality in Resources, Logistics, and Investigations: Practical Consequences for Defense Before International Criminal Tribunals	164
b. Equality of Arms and Access to Documents of Governmental or International Organizations.	170
5. Pitfalls and Dangers of Judicial Economy Within International Trials	171

6. Equality of Arms Before International and Internationalized Courts: A Structural Inequality?	173
7. Conclusions: Safeguard Against Politically Motivated Application of Judicial Economy and Wrongful Convictions	174
B. The Abuse of Process Doctrine in International Law: A Prospective Remedy to Protect Against Miscarriages of Justice	175
1. Introduction	175
2. The Abuse of Process in the Practice of International Criminal Courts	176
3. The Abuse of Process Doctrine in Relation to Miscarriages of Justice in International Criminal Law Practice	179
4. Conclusions	181
C. Cross-Examination Instead of Written Evidence in International Criminal Cases as Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice: The ICTY Example	182
D. Contemporary International Law Development on Redressing Miscarriages of Justice	184
Chapter 12: Recommendations and Future Guidelines as to the Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice	189
A. Toward a Uniform System of Judicial Supervision of Miscarriages of Justice	189
1. Disclosure as Principal Procedural Remedy	189
2. Future Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice: Enhancing Judicial Supervision of Prosecutorial Conduct	190
3. Proper and Timely Engagement of Expert Witnesses	194
4. Minimizing the Inherent Risks in Forensic Evidence: Proactive Tasks for Defense Lawyers	196
5. Statutory Obligation as to Recording Police Interviews	196
6. Improvement in Police Training and Awareness	197
7. Refining the Laws on Review of International Criminal Cases: A Uniform Provision	198
B. Concluding Recommendation: The Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice as an <i>Erga Omnes</i> Obligation	200
<i>Table of Authorities</i>	201
<i>Table of Cases</i>	205
<i>Index</i>	209