

THE LEGAL LIABILITY
OF HOSPITALS

THE LEGAL LIABILITY OF HOSPITALS

by

Marésa Cronjé-Retief



KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 90-411-1450-5

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America
by Kluwer Law International,
675 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 2000 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands.

*This book is based on an unpublished
thesis approved for the LL.D. degree
in the Faculty of Law, Criminal Law
and Medical Law Department at the
University of the Orange Free State.
Promotor: Prof. Dr. T. Verschoor*

Maresa Cronjé-Retief

2000

*Every man has an absolute right
to the absolute security of his own person
by the hand of every other man
except the Higher Hand*

‘... the right of absolute security of the person.’
Stoffberg v. Elliott 1923 CPD 148, Watermeyer J.

Table of Contents

Preface	xv
Acknowledgements	xvii
Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
Chapter 2	
Health-Care Systems	7
2.1 INTRODUCTION	7
2.2 NATIONAL PERSPECTIVE ON HEALTH-CARE SYSTEMS	8
2.2.1 Universal and Particular Determinative Factors	8
2.3 COMPARATIVE INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE ON HEALTH-CARE SYSTEMS	10
2.3.1 Relevance of the Discussion	10
2.3.2 Models on the Classification of Health-Care Systems	11
2.3.2.1 <i>Roemer's Model</i>	12
2.3.2.2 <i>Field's Classification</i>	14
2.3.2.3 <i>Conclusion</i>	16
2.4 CONCLUSION	16
Chapter 3	
Hospitals	
The Hospital in Perspective	19
3.1 THE HOSPITAL	19
3.2 THE HOSPITAL WITHIN THE HEALTH-CARE SYSTEM	22
3.3 THE HOSPITAL INDUSTRY	22
3.4 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND	23
3.4.1 An Outline of the History of Medicine and Hospitals	23

3.4.2	The History of the Law Pertaining to Medical Liability	43
3.5	HOSPITAL LAW	56
Chapter 4		
Hospital Liability		57
4.1	CHARITABLE IMMUNITY TO HOSPITAL LIABILITY	57
4.2	LEGAL GROUNDS OR THEORIES OF HOSPITAL LIABILITY (IN GENERAL)	61
	Introduction	61
	Summary	62
4.2.1	Indirect or Vicarious Hospital Liability	62
4.2.2	Direct or Primary or Corporate Hospital Liability	62
4.2.3	Hospital Liability in Terms of the Non-Delegable Duty	63
4.2.4	Doctrines Invoking Hospital Liability	63
4.2.5	Breach of Contract	63
4.2.6	Strict Hospital Liability	63
4.3	GENERAL DISCUSSION	64
4.3.1	Indirect or Vicarious Hospital Liability	64
	4.3.1.1 <i>Indirect and direct liability</i>	64
	4.3.1.2 <i>Medical malpractice</i>	64
	4.3.1.3 <i>Vicarious hospital liability</i>	65
	4.3.1.4 <i>Application in legal systems</i>	65
	4.3.1.5 <i>Origin</i>	66
	4.3.1.6 <i>Joint liability</i>	67
	4.3.1.7 <i>Strict liability</i>	68
	4.3.1.8 <i>Traditional requirements</i>	69
	4.3.1.9 <i>Comment</i>	73
	4.3.1.10 <i>Justification</i>	78

4.3.2	Direct Hospital Liability	80
	Direct or Primary or Corporate Hospital Liability	80
4.3.3	Hospital Liability in Terms of the Non-Delegable Duty	85
	4.3.3.1 <i>Vicarious liability or not</i>	85
	4.3.3.2 <i>Primary liability or not</i>	88
	4.3.3.3 <i>Other relevant aspects</i>	89
	4.3.3.4 <i>Justification for imposing non-delegable duty</i>	95
4.4	A COMPARATIVE DIAGRAM: HOSPITAL LIABILITY	96
	SUMMARY	97
 Chapter 5		
The English Law		99
5.1	HEALTH CARE IN THE UNITED KINGDOM	99
	5.1.2 Health Care System	99
	5.1.3 Health Financing	100
5.2	INTRODUCTION	100
5.3	INDIRECT OR VICARIOUS HOSPITAL LIABILITY	101
	Introduction	101
	5.3.1 English Case Law	102
	5.3.1.1 <i>English case law discussion</i>	102
	5.3.2 Conclusion	126
	5.3.3 Private Medical Care	127
	5.3.4 The General Practitioner	128
	5.3.5 The Health Authorities: Appropriate Defendants	130
5.4	DIRECT OR PRIMARY OR CORPORATE HOSPITAL LIABILITY	133
	Introduction	133
	5.4.1 English Case Law	134
	<i>Miscellaneous</i>	134

	<i>Cases discussed</i>	134
	<i>Direct hospital liability</i>	134
	<i>Allocation of resources</i>	134
5.4.1.1	<i>English case law discussion</i>	135
5.4.2	Secretary of State	144
	<i>A. Statutory duty and breach thereof</i>	145
	<i>B. Negligence</i>	148
5.4.3	The National Health Service and its Contracts	151
5.4.4	Conclusion	151
5.5	HOSPITAL LIABILITY IN TERMS OF THE NON-DELEGABLE DUTY	152
	Introduction	152
5.5.1	English Case Law	153
	<i>5.5.1.1 English case law discussion</i>	153
5.5.2	The Statutory Duty	156
	<i>The non-delegable duty: enforced</i>	157
5.5.3	Part of the English Law or Not	159
	<i>In the past</i>	160
5.5.4	Conclusion	161
5.6	APPORTIONMENT OF LIABILITY	162
Chapter 6		
The Australian Law		167
6.1	HEALTH CARE IN AUSTRALIA	167
	6.1.1 Health Care	167
	6.1.2 Health Care System	167
	6.1.3 Health Financing	168
6.2	THE HOSPITAL IN AUSTRALIA	170
6.3	LEGAL GROUNDS OF HOSPITAL LIABILITY IN AUSTRALIA	171

6.3.1	Indirect or Vicarious Hospital Liability	171
6.3.1.1	<i>Traditional requirements of vicarious liability</i>	172
6.3.1.2	<i>Vicarious liability on the basis of agency</i>	186
6.3.1.3	<i>Private practice</i>	186
6.3.2	Direct Hospital Liability	187
6.3.3	Hospital Liability in Terms of the Non-Delegable Duty	188
6.3.3.1	<i>Policy justifications for the duty</i>	190
6.4	CONTRIBUTION AND INDEMNITY	192
6.4.1	Relevant Legislation	196
6.5	AUSTRALIAN CASE LAW	196
6.6	CONCLUSION	226

Chapter 7

The Canadian Law 229

7.1	HEALTH CARE IN CANADA	229
7.1.1	Health Care	229
7.1.2	Health Financing	230
7.1.3	Health Care System	231
7.2	THE HOSPITAL IN CANADA	232
7.3	LEGAL GROUNDS OF HOSPITAL LIABILITY IN CANADA	233
7.3.1	Indirect or Vicarious Hospital Liability	233
7.3.1.1	<i>Traditional Requirements of vicarious liability</i>	234
7.3.1.2	<i>Other instances of vicarious liability</i>	252
7.3.1.3	<i>Conclusion on vicarious liability in Canadian law</i>	253
7.3.2	The Doctrine of Ostensible or Apparent Agency	253
7.3.3	Direct (or) Corporate Hospital Liability	256
7.3.3.1	<i>The hospital's direct duties</i>	258

7.3.3.2	<i>Categories</i>	258
7.3.3.3	<i>Conclusion on direct or corporate hospital liability</i>	265
7.3.4	Breach of Contract	266
7.3.5	The Non-Delegable Duty	268
7.3.5.1	<i>Non-delegable duties</i>	271
7.3.6	<i>Yepremian v. Scarborough General Hospital (1980):</i>	272
7.4	CONTRIBUTION AND JOINT LIABILITY	285
7.5	CONCLUSION	286
Chapter 8		
The Law in the USA		289
8.1	HEALTH CARE IN THE USA	289
8.1.1	Health Financing	289
8.1.2	Health Care System	289
8.1.3	The Health Care Industry	290
8.1.4	National Health Care Spending	291
8.1.5	Health Care Costs	292
8.1.5.1	<i>Health care planning</i>	293
8.1.5.2	<i>Antitrust</i>	294
8.1.5.3	<i>Health Maintenance Organization</i>	294
8.1.5.4	<i>Preferred Provider Organizations</i>	295
8.1.5.5	<i>Medicare</i>	296
8.1.5.6	<i>Medicaid</i>	296
8.1.5.7	<i>Private Insurance</i>	297
8.1.5.8	<i>National health insurance</i>	297
8.1.5.9	<i>Licensure and accreditation</i>	298
8.1.5.10	<i>Conclusion</i>	303

8.2	THE HOSPITAL IN THE USA	303
8.2.1	The Hospital	303
8.2.2	The American Hospital Industry	305
8.2.3	Hospital Organization	306
8.2.4	The Legal Basis	306
8.3	HOSPITAL LIABILITY	307
8.3.1	Charitable Immunity in the USA	307
8.4	LEGAL GROUNDS OF HOSPITAL LIABILITY IN THE USA	309
8.4.1	Indirect or Vicarious Hospital Liability	309
8.4.1.1	<i>Respondeat superior</i>	309
8.4.1.2	<i>Background</i>	311
8.4.1.3	<i>Traditional elements of vicarious liability</i>	313
8.4.1.4	<i>No-fault or strict liability</i>	325
8.4.1.5	<i>Exceptions</i>	325
8.4.1.6	<i>Expansion</i>	326
8.4.1.7	<i>Intentional acts</i>	326
8.4.1.8	<i>The decline of 'Captain-of-the-Ship' and 'Borrowed-Servant' doctrines</i>	327
8.4.2	Hospital Liability in Terms of the Doctrines of Apparent (Ostensible) Agency and Agency by Estoppel	330
8.4.2.1	<i>Apparent agency</i>	332
8.4.2.2	<i>Agency by estoppel</i>	334
8.4.2.3	<i>Relevant case law</i>	335
8.4.2.4	<i>Discussion</i>	337
8.4.2.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	346
8.4.3	Hospital Liability in Terms of the Non-Delegable Duty	347
8.4.3.1	<i>The inherent function test</i>	351
8.4.4	Direct or Corporate Hospital Liability	352

8.4.4.1	<i>The hospital as corporate institution</i>	352
8.4.4.2	<i>Hospital liability</i>	353
8.4.4.3	<i>The concept of duty</i>	354
8.4.4.4	<i>The hospital's direct duties</i>	356
8.4.4.5	<i>Standards to determine corporate liability</i>	364
8.4.4.6	<i>Direct or corporate liability duties: non-delegable or not</i>	369
8.4.4.7	<i>Justification</i>	373
8.4.4.8	<i>Other relevant case law</i>	374
8.4.4.9	<i>Conclusion on direct or corporate liability</i>	386
8.4.5	<i>Strict Liability</i>	386
8.5	JOINT AND SEVERAL LIABILITY	387
8.6	CONCLUSION	389
 Chapter 9		
The South African Law		391
9.1	HEALTH CARE IN SOUTH AFRICA	391
9.1.1	The New National Health System	391
9.1.2	New Legislation	394
9.1.3	Health Financing	395
9.2	THE HOSPITAL IN SOUTH AFRICA	396
9.3	LEGAL GROUNDS OF HOSPITAL LIABILITY IN SOUTH AFRICA	396
9.3.1	Indirect or Vicarious Hospital Liability	396
9.3.1.1	<i>Strict liability</i>	398
9.3.1.2	<i>Traditional requirements of vicarious liability</i>	399
9.3.1.3	<i>Comment on the master-servant relationship and the control test</i>	405
9.3.1.4	<i>Justification</i>	411

9.3.1.5	<i>The 'Borrowed-Servant' and 'Captain-of-the-Ship' doctrines</i>	412
9.3.1.6	<i>Res Ipsa Loquitur</i>	413
9.3.2	Hospital Liability in Terms of the Doctrines of Apparent Agency and Agency by Estoppel	414
9.3.3	The Non-Delegable Duty	415
9.3.3.1	<i>English law</i>	416
9.3.3.2	<i>Australian law</i>	416
9.3.3.3	<i>USA law</i>	417
9.3.3.4	<i>South African law</i>	417
9.3.4	Hospital Liability in Terms of Breach of Contract	421
9.3.5	Direct or Corporate Hospital Liability	424
9.3.5.1	<i>Categories</i>	425
9.3.5.2	<i>Relevant case law</i>	431
9.3.5.3	<i>Conclusion on direct liability</i>	439
9.3.5.4	<i>Requirements for direct liability</i>	439
9.3.5.5	<i>Exclusion of liability</i>	440
9.4	SOUTH AFRICAN CASE LAW	441
9.5	CONCLUSION	454
Chapter 10		
Conclusion		457
10.1	THE RIGHT TO HEALTH CARE	457
10.2	THE HOSPITAL	458
10.3	HOSPITAL LIABILITY	458
10.3.1	Differentiation between Legal Grounds	458
10.3.2	Effective Hospital Liability System	459
10.3.3	Legal Grounds and their Requirements	461

10.3.3.1	<i>The employer-employee requirements in terms of vicarious liability</i>	461
10.3.3.2	<i>The non-delegable duty, vicarious liability and direct liability</i>	462
10.4	LIABILITY OF AIRLINE(S)	463
10.5	LIABILITY OF SHIPPING COMPANIES	465
10.6	LIABILITY OF OTHER GROUPS	465
10.7	CONCLUSION	466
Summary		467
Opsomming		469
Bibliography		471
Table of Cases		493
I	ENGLAND	493
II	AUSTRALIA	496
III	CANADA	497
IV	THE USA	500
V	SOUTH AFRICA	506
Subject Index		511