

Unravelling Unlawful Confinement in Contemporary Armed Conflicts

International Humanitarian Law Series

Editor-in-Chief

Professor Timothy L.H. McCormack

Editorial Advisory Board

Professor Georges Abi-Saab – H.E. Judge George H. Aldrich
Madame Justice Louise Arbour – Professor Ove Bring
Professor John Dugard – Professor Dr. Horst Fischer
Dr. Hans-Peter Gasser – Professor Christopher Greenwood
Professor Ruth Lapidot – Professor Gabrielle Kirk McDonald
H.E. Judge Theodor Meron – Captain J. Ashley Roach
Professor Michael Schmitt

VOLUME 60

The International Humanitarian Law Series is a series of monographs and edited volumes which aims to promote scholarly analysis and discussion of both the theory and practice of the international legal regulation of armed conflict.

- The series explores substantive issues of International Humanitarian Law Including,
- Protection for victims of armed conflict and regulation of the means and method of warfare
 - questions of application of the various legal regimes for the conduct of armed conflict
 - Issues relating to the implementation of International Humanitarian Law obligations
 - national and international approaches to the enforcement of the law and
 - the interactions between International Humanitarian Law and other related areas of international law such as Human Rights, Refugee Law, Arms Control and Disarmament Law, and International Criminal Law.

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/ihul

Unravelling Unlawful Confinement in Contemporary Armed Conflicts

*Belligerents' Detention Practices in
Afghanistan, Syria and Ukraine*

By

Jelena Plamenac



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Cover illustration: Copyright ANP/Eyeem, Rattanakun Thongbun.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Plamenac, Jelena, author.

Title: Unravelling unlawful confinement in contemporary armed conflicts : belligerents' detention practices in Afghanistan, Syria and Ukraine / by Jelena Plamenac.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill Nijhoff, [2022] | Series: International Humanitarian Law Series, 1389-6776 ; volume 60 | Based on author's thesis (doctoral - Université de Genève, 2019) issued under title: Security detention in non-international armed conflict : a qualitative study on conflict-related detention practices in Afghanistan, Syria and Ukraine. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021043575 (print) | LCCN 2021043576 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004470538 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004470552 (ebook)
Subjects: LCSH: Civil war--Protection of civilians. | Non-state actors (International relations) | Detention of persons. | Prisoners of war--Legal status, laws, etc. | Syria--History--Civil War, 2011--Law and legislation. | Ukraine Conflict, 2014--Law and legislation. | Afghan War, 2001--Law and legislation.

Classification: LCC KZ6397 .P53 2022 (print) | LCC KZ6397 (ebook) | DDC 341.6/8--dc23/eng/20211004

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021043575>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021043576>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 1389-6776

ISBN 978-90-04-47053-8 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-47055-2 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Jelena Plamenac. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau Verlag and V&R Unipress.

Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgments	XII
Abbreviations	XIV
List of Figures	XVI
Introduction	1
1 The Existing Non-International Armed Conflict Internment “Dilemma”	2
2 Terminology	5
3 Analytical Parameters	6
3.1 <i>The Book’s Aims and Theoretical Approach</i>	6
3.2 <i>Research Questions</i>	8
3.3 <i>The Scope of Findings</i>	9
4 Structure	11
1 Introducing the Legal Quandary about Internment in Non-International Armed Conflict	13
1 Formation of International Humanitarian Law Norms	14
1.1 <i>State-Centric Formation of IHL</i>	15
1.2 <i>Role of Armed Non-State Actors in the Development of IHL Rules</i>	18
2 International Legal Framework Applicable to Detention in International Armed Conflict	21
2.1 <i>International Human Rights Law</i>	21
2.1.1 Grounds for Internment	22
2.1.2 Procedural Guarantees Applicable to Internment	23
2.1.2.1 <i>Notice of Reasons for Detention</i>	23
2.1.2.2 <i>Judicial Review</i>	24
2.1.2.3 <i>Access to Third Parties</i>	25
2.1.3 Exceptions to the IHRL Rules on the Right to Liberty	26
2.1.4 Detainee Transfers to Third Parties	27
2.2 <i>IHL Rules on Detention in International Armed Conflict</i>	29
2.2.1 Internment of Enemy Combatants	29
2.2.2 Internment of Civilians	30
2.2.3 Detainee Transfer	32

2.3	<i>Interplay between IHL and IHRL on Detention in International Armed Conflict</i>	33
3	International Legal Framework Applicable to Detention in Non-International Armed Conflict	35
3.1	<i>Power to Detain in Non-International Armed Conflict</i>	35
3.1.1	IHL Does Not Authorise Warring Parties to Detain	35
3.1.2	IHL Authorises Warring Parties to Detain	37
3.1.3	IHL Does Not Prohibit Warring Parties to Detain	39
3.2	<i>IHL Rules on Detention in Non-International Armed Conflict</i>	40
3.2.1	Grounds and Procedural Guarantees	41
3.2.2	Detainee Transfer	43
3.3	<i>Interplay between IHL and IHRL on Detention in Non-International Armed Conflict</i>	44
2	Exploring the Legal Approaches to Internment in Armed Conflict	45
1	Analogical Approach	46
2	Human-Rights Based Approach	48
3	Complementary Approach	51
3	Initiating the Empirical Quest: Methodology	58
1	The Three Case Studies	58
1.1	<i>Afghanistan Case Study</i>	61
1.1.1	Legal Classification of the Situation in Afghanistan	61
1.1.2	Contextualisation of the Analytical Framework	62
1.2	<i>Syria Case Study</i>	63
1.2.1	Legal Classification of the Situation in Syria	63
1.2.2	Contextualisation of the Analytical Framework	65
1.3	<i>Ukraine Case Study</i>	65
1.3.1	Legal Classification of the Situation in Eastern Ukraine	65
1.3.2	Contextualisation of the Analytical Framework	67
2	Sources of Conflict-Related Detention Practices	68
3	Data Collection	69
3.1	Access	69
3.1.1	Interviews and Questionnaires	70
3.1.2	Document Studies/Review	72

3.1.3	Secondary Data	73
3.1.4	Ethics	73
3.1.4	Language	74
3.1.5	Source Evaluation	74
4	Data Analysis	74
5	Limitations	76
5.1	<i>Research Bias</i>	77
5.2	<i>Deviations from the Original Sample</i>	78
5.3	<i>Difficulties throughout Data Collection</i>	79
4	The Hidden Dimension of States' Detention in Non-International Armed Conflict	81
1	Overall Findings on the State Normative Double Negative	81
1.1	<i>States First Normative Negation</i>	82
1.2	<i>States Second Normative Negation</i>	83
2	State Detention Practice in the Afghanistan Armed Conflict	84
2.1	<i>Afghan Domestic Laws Applicable to Conflict-Related Detentions</i>	85
2.1.1	Constitutional Guarantees	85
2.1.2	Grounds and Procedural Guarantees for Conflict-Related Detention under Domestic Criminal Law	87
2.1.3	Exceptional Legislative Measures for Conflict-Related Deprivation of Liberty	90
2.1.3.1	<i>Conflict-Related Detention Regime under Presidential Decrees</i>	90
2.1.3.2	<i>Conflict-Related Regime under Bilateral Agreements with Other State Warring Parties</i>	93
2.2	<i>Afghanistan Operational Practice</i>	98
2.2.1	Persons Belonging to Belligerent Party	99
2.2.2	Persons Not Taking Active Part in the Hostilities	100
2.3	<i>Internal Laws and Practice of States Deployed Extraterritorially</i>	100
2.3.1	Detention Standards under the US Military Model	102
2.3.1.1	<i>Internment under the Enduring Freedom Operation</i>	103
2.3.1.2	<i>The US Transfer Standards</i>	106

- 2.3.2 Detention Standards under the ISAF Military Model 107
 - 2.3.2.1 *Internment under the ISAF Mission* 108
 - 2.3.2.2 *The UK as a Foreign Warring Party with Central Role in the Armed Conflict* 109
 - 2.3.2.3 *Transfer Standards Developed by the ISAF States* 111
- 2.4 *Detainee Transfers in State Practice* 113
- 3 State Detention Practice in the Syria Armed Conflict 116
 - 3.1 *Syrian Domestic Laws Applicable to Conflict-Related Detentions* 116
 - 3.1.1 Constitutional Guarantees 116
 - 3.1.2 Grounds and Procedural Guarantees under Domestic Criminal Law 117
 - 3.1.3 Exceptional Legal Framework for Internment Prior to the 2011 Non-International Armed Conflict 118
 - 3.1.4 Exception Legislative Measures in Response to the 2011 Non-International Armed Conflict 121
 - 3.1.4.1 *Grounds for Detention under the Counter-Terrorism Law* 122
 - 3.1.4.2 *Procedural Guarantees before the Counter-Terrorism Court* 123
 - 3.2 *Syria Operational Practice* 123
 - 3.2.1 Impulsive Phase (2011–mid-2012) 124
 - 3.2.2 Controlled Phase (mid-2012–Ongoing) 124
 - 3.2.2.1 *Persons Belonging to the Belligerent Party* 127
 - 3.2.2.2 *Persons Not Taking Active Part in the Hostilities* 129
- 4 State Detention Practice in the Ukraine Armed Conflict 131
 - 4.1 *Ukrainian Domestic Law Applicable to Conflict-Related Internment* 132
 - 4.1.1 Constitutional Guarantees 133
 - 4.1.2 Grounds and Procedural Guarantees under Domestic Criminal Law 133
 - 4.1.2.1 *Grounds for Conflict-Related Detentions* 134
 - 4.1.2.2 *Procedural Guarantees* 134
 - 4.1.3 Exceptional Legislative Measures in Response to Non-International Armed Conflict 136

- 4.2 *Ukraine Operational Practice* 139
 - 4.2.1 Persons Belonging to a Belligerent Party 139
 - 4.2.2 Persons Not Taking Active Part in the Hostilities 140
- 5 States' Formal Rejection of Internment in Non-International Armed Conflict 143
- 5 **The Plurality of Armed Non-State Actors' Detention in Non-International Armed Conflict** 146
 - 1 **Armed Groups' Lens Look at Detention** 147
 - 1.1 *Secular Armed Groups* 149
 - 1.1.1 **Kurdish Non-State Armed Actors** 149
 - 1.1.1.1 *Conflict-Related Detentions in the Course of Military Operations* 149
 - 1.1.1.2 *Conflict-Related Detentions within the Controlled Territory* 150
 - 1.1.2 **Syrian Opposition Armed Groups** 152
 - 1.1.3 **Armed Groups in Eastern Ukraine** 153
 - 1.1.2.1 *The DPR Legislative Measures on Conflict-Related Detentions* 154
 - (a) "Administrative Detention" 155
 - (b) "Administrative Arrest" 156
 - (c) Preventive Detention 157
 - 1.1.2.2 *The LPR Legislative Measures on Conflict-Related Detentions* 158
 - 1.2 *Anti-Government Jihadist Armed Groups* 160
 - 1.2.1 **Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan** 162
 - 1.2.1.1 *Code of Conduct* 162
 - 1.2.1.2 *Other Normative Measures* 166
 - 1.2.1.3 *Structural Regulation of Detention* 166
 - 1.2.1.4 *Implementation of the Code of Conduct Rules on Detention of Belligerents* 168
 - 1.2.2 **Anti-Government Jihadist Armed Groups in Syria** 171
 - 1.2.2.1 *Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham (ISIS)* 172
 - 1.2.2.2 *Hayat Tahrir al-Sham (HTS)* 173
 - 1.2.2.3 *Implementation of Internal Norms on Detention of Belligerents* 173

- 2 Detention of Belligerents by Armed Groups Other Than Anti-Government Jihadists 174
 - 2.1 *Secular Armed Groups* 174
 - 2.2 *Pro-Government Faith-Based Armed Groups* 176
 - 2.3 *Pro-Government Faith-Based Armed Groups Deployed in Extraterritorial Operations* 177
 - 3 Armed Groups' Detention of Persons Not Belonging to the Adversary 179
 - 3.1 *Security Detention* 180
 - 3.1.1 Concealment Phase 181
 - 3.1.2 Exposition Phase 183
 - 3.2 *Disciplinary Detention* 184
 - 3.3 *Vindictive Detention* 186
 - 4 Transfer Practices 187
 - 5 The Problem with Armed Groups' Regulatory Diversity 189
- 6 Objectivising Internment 191**
- 1 Governance and Detention 192
 - 1.1 *Detention as an Expression of Statehood* 192
 - 1.1.1 Monocentric Detention Regimes 194
 - 1.1.2 Polycentric Detention Regimes 195
 - 1.2 *Internment as a Means of Maintaining Control over the Local Population* 197
 - 2 Re-Evaluating the Notion of Unlawful Detention in Non-International Armed Conflict 198
 - 2.1 *Divergence in Conflict-Related Detention Practices of States and Non-State Armed Groups* 201
 - 2.2 *Similitude in Conflict-Related Detention Practices of States and Non-State Armed Groups* 204
 - 2.2.1 Detention of Persons Taking Direct Part in the Hostilities 204
 - 2.2.2 Detention of Persons Not Taking Direct Part in the Hostilities 206
 - 2.2.2.1 *Security Detention* 206
 - 2.2.2.2 *Disciplinary Detention* 207
 - 2.2.2.3 *Vindictive Detention* 208
 - 2.3 *Unpredictable Practice of Detainee Transfers by States and Armed Groups* 209
 - 2.3.1 Recommendations for Conflict-Related Detainee Transfers 211

2.3.2	Recommendations for Natural Detainee Transfers	213
3	Proposal for Minimum Legal Standards for Internment of Persons Not Taking Direct Part in the Hostilities	214
3.1	<i>Grounds and Evidentiary Threshold for Internment</i>	216
3.2	<i>Procedural Guarantees for Internment</i>	218
3.2.1	Technical Implementation Measures	219
3.2.2	Notice-Based Procedural Guarantees	220
3.2.3	Review Procedure	222
3.2.3.1	<i>Review Body</i>	224
3.2.3.2	<i>Detainees' Rights</i>	226
3.2.3.3	<i>Periodic Review</i>	227
3.2.4	Access-Based Procedural Guarantees	228
3.2.5	Communication with the Outside World	230
4	Conclusion	232
7	Epilogue: The Roadmap to Legislating Unlawful Confinement in Non-International Armed Conflict	233
1	Summary of Main Findings	233
2	Contributions	236
3	Implications	237
	Bibliography	241
	Annex I – Interview Questionnaire	270
	Index	271

Acknowledgments

This book is based on my doctoral thesis accepted by the Faculty of Law at the University of Geneva on 20 September 2019. Throughout the making of this work, I have had the honour to receive unreserved support and true encouragement from good people to whom I want to devote these words of thanks:

Professor Marco Sassòli – my doctoral thesis' supervisor and professor of international humanitarian law who has been inspiring me to continuously perfect my knowledge of the law and to passionately protect it since the very first moment I entered into his classroom at then the University Centre for International Humanitarian Law in October 2006. I have been privileged and fortunate enough to have his abundant support, extraordinary diligence, and undivided attention to every detail of my writings. Thanks to this great teacher's patient guidance, I have concluded the work on this book with expanded intellectual horizons and deeper understanding of highly complex issues related to security detention in non-international armed conflict.

Professors Bénédicte Foëx, Sandesh Sivakumaran, Andrew Clapham, and Michelle Cottier – for their immensely relevant remarks and engaging discussions. I am in particular grateful to Professor Cottier for her instructive and most helpful comments on the earlier drafts of the Methodology part, which considerably improved since then. This Chapter also benefited from useful conversations on the sampling process with the specialist *Miloš Mojsilović*.

Professor Tim McCormack, Brill's Editor-in-Chief of International Humanitarian Series, and *Lindy Melman*, Brill's publisher – who deserve all my appreciation for accepting my manuscript into this prestigious publishing house with extraordinary kindness and trust.

My dear *friends* who gave me their unconditional support and believed in me at every stage of this exciting intellectual journey. My special thanks go to my rocks: *Omar Mekky, Candice Lorfing, Yasmina Khalife, Dražan Djukić, Georgette Anastas, Nadine Sohouri, Azra Kuči, Anastasia Kushleyko, Giulia Chiara, and Andjelija Ćorković* – for their advice, joyful conversations, and endless inspiration; and to *Nicolas Masson, Hiba Kchour* and *other powerful connectors* – for their trust and generous help to open the toughest doors.

My *family* – as it has been the case with all my major life endeavors, this book's stronghold found its center in the unconditional faith, support and love of my parents *Koviljka* and *Miloš*, and brother *Dejan*, to whom I dedicate this book and remain forever grateful.

Finally, this work is devoted to all persons who have been unlawfully and arbitrarily deprived of their liberty in contemporary armed conflicts, and who are entitled to have their freedom and sense of justice restored and protected.

Abbreviations

AAN	Afghanistan Analyst Network
AfCHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AIHRC	Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission
ANDF	Afghan National Detention Facility Parwan
API	Additional Protocol I
APII	Additional Protocol II
APS	Additional Protocols
BTIF	Bagram Theater Internment Facility
CAT	Convention against Torture
COMISAF	Commander International Security Assistance Force
CSRT	Combatant Status Review Tribunal
CTC	Counter-Terrorism Court
DFIP	Detention Facility in Parwan
DOD	Department of Defense
DPR	Donetsk People's Republic
ECHR	Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (European Convention on Human Rights)
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
FIDH	International Federation for Human Rights
FSA	Free Syrian Army
GCIII	Geneva Convention III
GCIV	Geneva Convention IV
GCs	Geneva Conventions
HIG	Hezb-e-Islami Gulbuddin
HM	Her Majesty
HR	Hague Regulations
HRC	Human Rights Committee
HRMMU	Human Rights Monitoring Mission in Ukraine
HTS	Hayat Tahrir al-Sham
IAC	International Armed Conflict
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICG	International Crisis Group
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICL	International Law Commission
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross

ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IHAT	Iraq Historic Allegations Team
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
IHRL	International Human Rights Law
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force
ISIS	Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham
IS-K	Islamic State Khorasan
ISN	Internment Serial Number
JCIP	Justice Center in Parwan
LPR	Luhansk People's Republic
MOD	Ministry of Defence
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NDS	National Directorate of Security
NIAC	Non-international Armed Conflict
OCG	Operational Coordination Group
OEF	Operation Enduring Freedom
OSCE	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PKK	Kurdistan Workers' Party
POW	Prisoner of War
PW	Protected Witness
RULAC	Rule of Law in Armed Conflict
SDF	Syrian Democratic Forces
SMM	Special Monitoring Mission
SOP	Standard Operating Procedure
SSSC	Supreme State Security Court
SSU	State Security Unit
UECRB	Unlawful Enemy Combatant Review Board
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNAMA	United Nations Assistance Mission
US	United States
USFORA	United States Forces Afghanistan
VRS	Bosnian Serb Army
YPG	Kurdish People's Protection Units

Figures

- 1 State normative double negative 84
- 2 Syria operational practice—Impulsive phase 131
- 3 Syria operational practice—Controlled phase 132
- 4 Secular armed groups' conflict-related detention behaviours 185
- 5 Detention of persons belonging to the belligerent party by States and armed groups 204
- 6 Detention of persons directly participating in the hostilities by States and armed groups 205
- 7 Typology of detention of persons not taking direct part in the hostilities by States and armed groups 209
- 8 Conflict-related detention behaviors of States and armed groups 210
- 9 Notification system 223
- 10 Relationship between the access-based and communication-based safeguards: Scope of obligations 231