

THE SOCRATIC PROBLEM

PHILOSOPHICA

EDITED BY
MARIO MONTUORI

VOLUME IV

MARIO MONTUORI
THE SOCRATIC PROBLEM

MARIO MONTUORI

THE SOCRATIC PROBLEM
THE HISTORY - THE SOLUTIONS

FROM THE 18TH CENTURY TO THE PRESENT TIME
61 EXTRACTS FROM 54 AUTHORS IN THEIR
HISTORICAL CONTEXT

J.C. GIEBEN, PUBLISHER
AMSTERDAM 1992

No part of this book may be translated or reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm, or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

© by J.C. Gieben / ISBN 90 5063 048 0 / Printed in The Netherlands

To my Son

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
--------------	---

A. THE HISTORY

A1	<i>A problem as old as Socrates</i>	7
	Introductory note	9
A1.1	M. MONTUORI, <i>Il 'problema Socrate', nella storia della cultura occidentale.</i>	10
	1. Agrafia e agiografia socratica.	10
	2. Prodromi della storiografia socratica nella ricerca illuminista.	28
	3. La storiografia moderna e la rinascita del mito socratico.	36
	4. La crisi del problema socratico e la sopravvivenza del mito.	60

B. THE SOLUTIONS

B1	Note	77
B2	<i>Socrates "the man" in the research of the Age of Enlightenment.</i>	79
	Introductory note	80
B2.1	N. FRÉRET, <i>Les causes de la condamnation de Socrate.</i>	82
B2.2	S.F. DRESIG, <i>Socrates iuste damnatus.</i>	91
B2.3	GARNIER, l'Abbé, <i>Platon ou Xénophon a le mieux rendu Socrate?</i>	100
B2.4	A. STAPFER, <i>Das Sokratische Problem als ein Kulturhistorisches Problem.</i>	101
B3	<i>Socrates "the philosopher" in the age of history.</i>	105
	Introductory note	105
B3.1	G.W.F. HEGEL, <i>Sokrates: der Mensch, der Philosoph.</i>	109
B3.2	F. SCHLEIERMACHER, <i>Sokrates als Philosophen.</i>	110
B3.3	G. GROTE, <i>Xenophon and Plato as witnesses.</i>	113
B3.4	E. ZELLER, <i>Sokrates nach dem Bericht des Xenophon, Plato und Aristoteles.</i>	116
B3.5	A. FOUILLÉE, <i>Le témoignage décisif d'Aristote.</i>	123

C. THE DEBATE ON THE SOURCES

C1	<i>Xenophon "l'unique source historiquement certaine".</i>	129
	Introductory note	130
C1.1	A. LABRIOLA, <i>Niente che non sia in Senofonte.</i>	132
C1.2	E. BOUTROUX, <i>Xénophon en premier ligne.</i>	133
C1.3	A. DÖRING, <i>Xenophon 'ein Spediteur'.</i>	135

C1.4	L. ROBIN, <i>Xénophon témoin ni intelligent ni fidèle.</i>	138
C2	<i>Aristoteles und Aristoteles allein.</i>	141
	Introductory note	142
C2.1	K. JOEL, <i>Der Sokrates des Aristoteles.</i>	144
C2.2	T. GOMPERZ, <i>Die Zeugnisse des Aristoteles knapp aber verlässlich.</i>	150
C2.3	K. PRAECHTER, <i>Die Aristotelische Angaben in erster linie.</i>	154
C2.4	TH. DEMAN, <i>Aristote témoin de Socrate.</i>	155
C3	<i>Plato, 'our best authority'.</i>	162
	Introductory note	162
C3.1	A.E. TAYLOR, <i>Aristotle not a historical source.</i>	164
C3.1/2	A.E. TAYLOR, <i>Plato's informations as historical facts.</i>	166
C3.2	J. BURNET, <i>The Platonic Socrates as "the historical Socrates".</i>	170
C3.2/2	J. BURNET, <i>Socrates in Plato's Dialogues.</i>	180
C3.3	H. MAIER, <i>Das Sokratesproblem als Problem der Sokratik.</i>	188
C4	<i>The testimony of the comic poets as 'Archimedischen Punkte'.</i>	195
	Introductory note	196
C4.1	A. CHIAPPELLI, <i>Socrate naturalista.</i>	198
C4.2	H. RÖCK, <i>Sokrates der Atheist.</i>	200
C4.3	H. GOMPERZ, <i>Sokrates der Kiniker.</i>	205
C5	<i>The oracle to Chaerephon as 'témoignage d'un fait historique'.</i>	207
	Introductory note	208
C5.1	M. MONTUORI, <i>Un luogo comune della storiografia socratica</i>	209
C6	<i>Socrates iuste or iniustissime condemned.</i>	215
	Introductory note	216
C6.1	P. FORSCHHAMMER, <i>Sokrates gesetzlich zum Tod verurteilt.</i>	219
C6.2	C. THIRLWALL, <i>Sokrates unjustly condemned.</i>	219
C6.3	G. GROTE, <i>One of the misdeeds of intolerance.</i>	220
C6.4	R. PÖHLMANN, <i>Eine Tragödie die sich wiederholt bis zum heutigen Tag.</i>	221
C6.5	J.B. BURY, <i>Socrates not unjustly condemned.</i>	222
C6.6	H. MAIER, <i>Mit der Verurteilung ist Rechte geschehen.</i>	224
C6.7	P. MARTINETTI, <i>Gli accusatori di Socrate: un fascio di interessi politici.</i>	231

D. THE CRISIS

D1	<i>Socrates 'ein Problem hoffnungsloses'.</i>	235
	Introductory note	236
D1.1	A. LABRIOLA, <i>Ricerca inesauribile.</i>	237
D1.2	V. BROCHARD, <i>Une énigme à déchiffrer.</i>	237
D1.3	L. ROBIN, <i>Un héros de légende.</i>	237
D1.4	H. MAIER, <i>Eine ungelöste Frage.</i>	237
D1.5	K. JOËL, <i>Wir wissen daß wir nichts wissen.</i>	237
D1.6	H. KUHN, <i>Skepsis hinsichtlich des Quellenproblems.</i>	238
D1.7	A. BANFI, <i>Socrate: un 'ipotesi.</i>	239

D1.8	L. ROBIN, <i>Pas de témoignages historiques.</i>	239
D2	<i>The failure of the traditional solution of the problem of the sources.</i>	240
	Introductory note	241
D2.1	E. DUPRÉEL, <i>Socrate fiction littéraire.</i>	243
D2.2	O. GIGON, <i>Die sokratische Literatur als Dichtung.</i>	247

E. THE REPRISE

E1	<i>In search of a δεύτερος πλοῦς.</i>	289
	Introductory note	290
E1.1	V. DE MAGALHÃES VILHENA, <i>Etat présent du problème.</i>	293
E1.2	R. MONDOLFO, <i>Condiciones para la solución del problema socrático.</i>	298
E1.3	G. CALOGERO, <i>Ripartire da Gigon.</i>	302
E1.4	A. CAPIZZI, <i>Battere Gigon sul suo stesso terreno.</i>	305
E1.5	M. MONTUORI, <i>Oltre Gigon.</i>	309
E1.6	J. HUMBERT, <i>Rien laisser tomber de toutes les légendes.</i>	312
E1.7	F. ADORNO, <i>Collocare ogni testimonianza nel suo tempo.</i>	315
E1.8	A.R. LACEY, <i>No source can be trusted or ignored.</i>	315
E1.9	G. GIANNANTONI, <i>Tutte le fonti senza privilegiarne alcuna.</i>	315
E2	<i>Le débat renait mais il n'est plus le même.</i>	316
	Introductory note	317
E2.1	V. DE MAGALHÃES-VILHENA, <i>Platon et l'admiration pour Socrate.</i>	320
E2.2	A.H. CHROUST, <i>Policrates and the Κατηγορία Σωκράτους.</i>	327
E2.3	M. MONTUORI, <i>Aristofane e Socrate.</i>	335
E2.4	A. CAPIZZI, <i>Platone e i personaggi filosofi dei Dialoghi.</i>	355
E2.5	F. SARRI, <i>Isocrate e Socrate.</i>	367
E2.6	L. ROSSETTI, <i>Euripide e Socrate.</i>	379
E2.7	M. MONTUORI, <i>I Comici e Socrate.</i>	384
E2.8	M. MONTUORI, <i>Atene e Socrate.</i>	392

F. TOWARDS A HOLISTIC SOLUTION OF THE PROBLEM

F1	<i>The Socratic problem as a problem of historical method.</i>	417
	Introductory note	418
F1.1	M. MONTUORI, <i>Le ragioni della morte di Socrate come limite storico delle fonti.</i>	420

Indices

Index librorum	433
Index nominum	461