

**FROM ADMINISTRATIVE AUTHORISATION
TO PRIVATE LAW**

FROM ADMINISTRATIVE AUTHORISATION TO PRIVATE LAW

A Comparative Perspective
of the Developing Civil Law
in the People's Republic of China

by

JIANFU CHEN
La Trobe University



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 0-7923-3200-8

Published by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers,
P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Academic Publishers,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Academic Publishers Group,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1995 Kluwer Academic Publishers
Kluwer Academic Publishers incorporates the publishing programmes of
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

This book is dedicated to Professor Eugene Kamenka, from whom I learnt the meaning of kindness and generosity, the value of knowledge and independent thinking, and the responsibility and pride of being an academic.

CONTENTS

Preface	vii
Acknowledgements	xv
Abbreviations	xvii
Table of Major Civil Codes	xviii
Table of Major Statutes, Regulations and Documents	xix

INTRODUCTION

1. The Nature of Civil Law and Its Development in the PRC	1
2. The Structure of the Present Study	3

CHAPTER ONE

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND: THE DEVELOPMENT OF CIVIL LAW IN CHINA BEFORE 1949

1. Introduction	7
2. Civil Law in Traditional China	7
3. The First Attempt to Make a Civil Code in China	9
4. Reform of Law under the <i>Kuomintang</i> Government	14
4.1. The Making of the First Civil Code in China	14
4.2. An Overview of the KMT Civil Code	17
5. Concluding Remarks: The Significance of the Late Qing and the KMT Legal Reforms	30

CHAPTER TWO

THE DEVELOPMENT OF CIVIL LAW AND CHANGING CONCEPTIONS OF CIVIL LAW IN THE PRC

1. Introduction	33
2. The Abolition of the KMT Legal System and KMT Codes	33
3. Three Attempts to Make a Civil Code in the PRC	35
3.1. The First Attempt	35
3.2. The Second Attempt	41
3.3. The Third Attempt	44
4. Conceptions of Civil Law in the PRC in the Eighties: Initial Academic Discussions and Debates	50
4.1. Towards a 'Commodity Relations Theory' of Civil Law	50
4.2. Public Law? Private Law?	52
4.3. Civil Law v. Economic Law	56
5. Concluding Remarks: Problems Underlying Theories and Practice	66

CHAPTER THREE

ECONOMIC REFORM, ADMINISTRATIVE AUTHORISATION AND LEGAL PERSONALITY OF ECONOMIC ENTITIES

1. Introduction	69
2. The Problem of Terminology	71
3. A Brief Historical Account of the Development of the Concept of Legal Person in China	72
4. Evolution of Economic Reform Policies	75
4.1. SOEs Before Economic Reforms	75
4.2. Theoretical Basis of SOE Reform in Post-Mao China	77
4.3. The Evolution of Economic Reform Policies in Post-Mao China	79
5. Legal Responses to Economic Reform Policies	87
5.1. The Re-emergence of the Notion of Legal Person During Economic Reform	87
5.2. The Emergence of a New Legal Concept - <i>Jingyingquan</i> ('Right of Operation')	90
6. Concluding Remarks: Utilitarianism in Action	92

CHAPTER FOUR

LEGAL PERSONS IN CHINESE CIVIL LAW AND JURISPRUDENCE

1. Introduction	94
2. Definition of Legal Person and Requirements for Being a Legal Person Under Chinese Civil Law	94
3. Classification of Chinese Legal Persons	96
4. Requirements of Being a Chinese Legal Person	98
4.1. Establishment in Accordance with the Law	98
4.2. Possession of Necessary Property or Funds	100
4.3. Possession of Its Own Name, Organisational Structure and Premises	101
4.4. Capacity Independently to Bear Civil Liability	102
5. The Nature of Legal Personality	103
5.1. An Overview	103
5.2. Central Issue Regarding the Nature of Legal Personality during Western Doctrinal Development	104
5.3. Chinese Approach to the Nature of Legal Personality	106
6. Concluding Remarks: A First Step Towards Legal Formalism	107

CHAPTER FIVE
BETWEEN THE OLD AND THE NEW: EQUALITY AMONG UNEQUALS
AND THE BATTLE FRONTS OF CIVIL LAW DEVELOPMENT IN THE
PRC

1. Introduction	109
2. Differentiated Structure for Business Entities	111
3. Ambiguous Legal Status of Many Economic Entities	113
3.1. The 'Individual Households' (<i>Getihu</i>)	113
3.2. Private Enterprises (<i>Siying Qiye</i>)	115
3.3. Collective Enterprises (<i>Jiti Qiye</i>)	116
3.4. The State	118
4. Inequalities Among Economic Entities	121
5. Independent Property for SOEs as Legal Persons	123
5.1. An Overview	123
5.2. Property of SOEs as Legal Persons in Comparative Law	124
5.3. The Chinese Dilemma in Ideology and in Practice	126
6. Concluding Remarks: Fundamental Obstacles to Civil Law Development in the PRC	132

CHAPTER SIX
CHANGING CONCEPTIONS OF PROPERTY RIGHTS IN THE PRC
IN A COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

1. Introduction	136
2. The Civil Law System of Property Rights	137
3. The Common Law System of Property Law	141
4. The Socialist System of Property Rights	144
5. The Chinese Conception of Property Rights	150
5.1. Property Rights in Traditional China	150
5.2. Property Rights under the KMT Civil Code	151
5.3. Concepts and Conceptions of Property Rights in the PRC	151
6. Concluding Remarks: An Elementary System with Mixed Influences	159

CHAPTER SEVEN

CHINESE THEORIES ON THE RIGHT OF OPERATION: THE SEARCH FOR A SOCIALIST SOLUTION

1. Introduction	160
2. Chinese Theories in Detail	162
2.1. The Soviet-Style Administrative-Economic Law Approach	162
2.2. Re-defining or Re-formulating Ownership Rights	166
2.3. A Romanist Civil Law Approach	176
2.4. A Common Law Approach?	186
3. Legal Theories and Legal Developments	188
4. Concluding Remarks: Towards a Consensus among Scholars	194

CHAPTER EIGHT

SECURITISATION: A CAPITALIST TOOL FOR A SOCIALIST SOLUTION?

1. Introduction	197
2. Experimenting with Securitisation in the PRC	198
3. The Early Proposal of the World Bank	204
4. The Ideological and Politico-Economic Debate	207
5. The Legal Debate	212
5.1. An Overview	212
5.2. The 'Theory of Dual Ownership Rights' (<i>Shuangchong Suoyouquan Shuo</i>)	213
5.3. 'Theory of Legal Person's Ownership Rights' (<i>Faren Suoyouquan Shuo</i>)	214
5.4. The 'Theory of Shareholder's Ownership Rights' (<i>Gudong Suoyouquan Shuo</i>)	218
5.5. The Rejection of All Ownership Rights Theories	219
6. Difficulties in Using Capitalism for Socialism	220
7. Towards a 'Social Ownership' Theory?	224
8. Towards a Second 'Separation of Two Rights'	230
9. Concluding Remarks: Securitisation Is Only a Partial Solution	234

**CHAPTER NINE
ENTERPRISE GROUPING: AN INDIRECT SOLUTION
TO A FUNDAMENTAL PROBLEM?**

1. Introduction	236
2. Enterprise Groups in a Comparative Perspective	237
2.1. The Legal Reality of Enterprise Groups and Its Challenge to Legal Science	237
2.2. Legal Responses to the Reality of the Enterprise Group	240
2.3. The Fate and Role of Enterprise Groups in the Former Socialist Countries	250
3. Challenges to Chinese Civil Law Science in the Development of Joint Operations and Enterprise Groups	252
3.1. An Overview	252
3.2. The Emergence of Enterprise Groups in the PRC	253
3.3. Legal Framework Governing Joint Operations and Enterprise Groups	258
3.4. Theoretical Controversies Relating to Joint Operations and Enterprise Groups	260
4. Concluding Remarks: Towards the Core of the Problems Impeding the Development of Civil Law in China	269

CONCLUSION AND FUTURE PROSPECTS

1. Chinese Civil Law at the Crossroads	273
2. The Future: A Civil Code for a Socialist Market Economy?	280
Selected Bibliography - Materials in English	289
Selected Bibliography - Materials in Chinese	299
Index	316